Mediating Tradition in Traditional Jazz as a Scholar-Performer

by

Zachary Thomas Wiggins

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy

Approved April 2021 by the
Graduate Supervisory Committee:

Christi Jay Wells, Chair
Kay Norton
Ted Solis

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

May 2021

ABSTRACT

Traditional jazz refers specifically to iterations of New Orleans style jazz since its beginnings in the early 20th century. It has been labelled "Dixieland," "Classic Jazz," "New Orleans jazz," "Trad," or "Our Kind of Music (OKOM)" among other names. As a scholar-performer, I learned this style of music in my undergraduate studies in Provo, Utah and later taught it as a graduate student in Phoenix, Arizona. This research grows out of the challenges I encountered mediating between the academic institution, the non-academic tradition, and student needs. Combining musicological methods such as historiography and artifact analysis with reflexive ethnography and performance pedagogy more typical of other disciplines, I consider how educators might represent traditional jazz in a more culturally responsible way. To begin, I reference historical newspapers and oral histories to show how the labels of “Dixieland” and “traditional jazz” have evolved over time and taken on a variety of associations. Specifically, I note how the word “Dixieland” is problematic for the ways it reinforces nostalgic fantasies of the “old south” and prevents African Americans from participating without the oppressive and offensive stereotypes created by white minstrel entertainers. I then consider how prominent figures have established their authority to speak for traditional jazz by looking at several pedagogical artifacts for the style of traditional jazz drumming. I highlight how each of these artifacts’ authors present the subject and color their audience’s view of traditional jazz. Having analyzed these methods of genre definition, I discuss the tenuous place of traditional jazz within university jazz programs and its potential futures through interviews I conducted with jazz educators. These interviews focus on teaching traditional jazz within the academy and the potential for the jazz

ensemble as a site of scholar-performer interdisciplinary collaboration. Finally, following models of reflexive ethnography established by ethnomusicologists leading world music ensembles, I analyze my own experience teaching traditional jazz ensembles. My synthesis of methods from musicology, ethnomusicology, music education, and jazz performance departments serves as an important bridge between these disciplines, and in turn, improves jazz instruction, offers insight into genre definition, and illuminates how institutional structures shape the subject.

DEDICATION

For all those who love traditional jazz.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work would not have been possible without my faculty mentors at Arizona State University: Christy J. Wells, Kay Norton, Ted Solis, Michael Kocour, Jeff Libman, Dom Moio, Peter Schmelz, Chris Stover, Catherine Saucier, Sabine Feisst, and Robert Oldani. I also wish to thank my colleagues with Maricopa Community Colleges for giving me the opportunity to develop my research further through teaching alongside them—Eric Rasmussen, Rose French, Karl Schindler, Keith Kelly, Chris Scinto, Ben Hedquist, Ryan Anthony, Wes Hawkins, and Mary Petrich. Thanks to local musicians who helped sustain my enthusiasm for traditional jazz—Wen Wu, Joe Goglia, and Isaac Wisdom. Beyond the Phoenix area, I must acknowledge Steve Call for setting me on this path during my undergrad studies at BYU-Provo. Also, my former bandmates Austie Robinson, Jory Woodis, Jesse Quebbeman Turley, Zoe Jorgenson, Marcus Voght, Brady Bills, and Brian Woodbury for inspiring me with their music making and blessing my life with their friendship. Thanks specifically to Jory for hosting my family in visiting and moving out to New Orleans. Thanks to my New Orleans mentors Tom McDermott, Jon Cleary, Kevin Clark, Jon Royen, David Boeddinghaus, James Singleton, Joe Krown, Richard Scott, Aurora Nealand, Rickie Monie, and Shannon Powell for welcoming me to the city and sharing their time and wisdom with me when I visited as an MA student. Thanks to Karista Filopoulos and her family as well as George Oliver for hosting me on that trip. I greatly appreciate scholars John Joyce, David Ake, Mark Burford, Sherrie Tucker, Ken Prouty, and Brian Wright for helping me on my professional journey and taking time to help me develop my ideas. I owe the seeds of my research to Dave Robinson for his efforts to disassociate traditional jazz from the term “Dixieland” in a time when few

recognized the problematic connections of the word. As a new teacher I also benefitted from Robinson's work in establishing the Traditional Jazz Educators Network and creating teaching materials. I also would not have arrived at this point without the wonderful experiences I had at the Sacramento Traditional Jazz Youth Band Festival as a student. The mentorship I received from musicians like Eddie Ericksen, Jason Wanner, and Bill Dendle was very important for my development as a musician and nurtured my enthusiasm for the music. I was able to ground my research in contemporary issues with jazz education through interviews with David Ake, Ken Prouty, Dave Robinson, Jeff Kidwell, Gordon Towell, Dan Barrett (University of Maine), Dan Barrett (jazz trombonist), Steve Call, Kristen Bromley, John Abigana, Brian Wright, Jackie Lamar, Colin Hancock, Steve Roach, Bill Dendle, Bill Prince, Banu Gibson, Mike Kocour, and Louis Nash. I am tremendously grateful to them for freely shared their time and insights. I also wish to thank all the students I worked with in traditional jazz ensembles for their musicianship and for choosing to take my classes. Through working with you all I was able to more further develop my research, grow as an educator, and make some great music. I am also very grateful to the ASU graduate college for offering me a dissertation completion fellowship to finish this work. Finally, I wish to thank my family—specifically, my parents for encouraging me in my education (musical and otherwise). I would not likely have pursued this level of education without their encouragement. Most of all, thanks to my wife, Amy Drew-Wiggins for her encouragement, patience, and sacrifice as I completed this degree. I couldn't have done it without you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

LIST OF FIGURES ix

CHAPTER

INTRODUCTION 1

Chapter Outlines 7

Chapter One 7

Chapter Two 10

Chapter Three 13

Chapter Four 15

Literature Review 18

Tradition 18

Revival 25

Folk Authenticity 29

Jazz Historiography 31

Ethnography in Jazz Studies and New Orleans Studies 34

Pedagogy in University Jazz Education 40

1 DEFINING DIXIELAND 47

Minstrel Origins – Playing With Masks 55

Dixieland the Brand – Comforting Stereotypes 61

Hot Collectors – Defining Separate Racial Histories of Jazz 70

"Braying and Squawking California Fundamentalists" 76

CHAPTER Page

British "Trad" Revival – A Trans-Atlantic Fantasy 84

The Many Faces of New Orleans Tourism 89

Redneck Dixie – Encoding and Burying Racism 94

Is Dixieland Racist? 98

So… Is Dixieland Racist? 107

2 THE NEW ORLEANS DRUMMING TRADITION: MASTERS, CULTURAL MIDDLEMEN, AND AUTHORITY. 111

Baby Dodds – Preserving a Historical Snapshot 120

Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress – Borrowing Successful Narratives From Jazz History 136

Antoon Aukes – Borrowing and Conversing With Rhythms 147

The Balance of Objectified VS Social Tradition 159

Coda: Imitating Baby Dodds 163

3 TRADITIONAL VS MODERN JAZZ IN THE UNIVERSITY CURRICULUM 173

Pathways for Learning Traditional Jazz 184

Wide Variety in Performance Jazz Studies Programs 190

Developing a Jazz Curriculum: Selecting from Many "Worthwhile Subjects" 197

Jazz Studies: New, Old, and Blending the Two 211

Who is a Jazz Scholar? 225

Combining History and Performance in the Ensemble Rehearsal 236

CHAPTER Page

Let Traditional Be Traditional 239

4 TEACHING TRADITIONAL JAZZ ENSEMBLES AS A PERFORMER SCHOLAR: LESSONS LEARNED FROM ETHNOMUSICOLOGY 241

Defining the Subject Aesthetically Through Pedagogy 248

Paying Homage to the Gods: Canon Construction, Transcription, and Imitation ... 263

Institutional Accomodation, Theoretical Approaches, and Adapting to Student Needs 275

Representing Tradition 286

Being and Authority and Directing the Ensemble 289

Do Blind Men Have Anything Valuable to Say About Elephants? 297

Conclusion 301

REFERENCES 302

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure Page

1. The Southern Girl 63

2. Display Ad 87 – No Title 65

3. Ching a Ling’s Jazz Bazaar 65

4. Cast of “Club Dixieland” to Be Given By Pupils of the Northwest School Today 67

INTRODUCTION

As an undergraduate jazz studies student, I was thrilled to be invited to join the "Brigham Young University Jazz Legacy Dixieland Band." I had just learned the basics of stride piano left hand from my teacher (tuba/euphonium professor Steve Call) and the music evoked nostalgic memories for me of visiting Disneyland's New Orleans Square as a child. I went on to perform and study traditional New Orleans jazz in this group for several years, forming deep friendships with other band members around our shared repertoire and musical aesthetics (in retrospect this would prove a significantly different undergraduate jazz school experience). After one festival performance, the other band members and I were surprised at the serious insistence of one adjudicator that the band members should not be wearing straw hats while performing. I don't remember much explanation of his objections other than an emphatic "we are trying to get away from that!" As our group particularly enjoyed the novelty hats, we dismissed him as a buzzkill. My understanding as a student was that this adjudicator thought the hats were corny and diluted the artistry of traditional jazz. Years later I connected with the adjudicator (Dave Robinson) again and discussed his concerns with the label of "Dixieland." Beyond the corny hats, he explained that many African American musicians felt the term reinforced racist stereotypes and did not want the label applied to their music.

As I began directing my own traditional jazz ensembles, this critique of the term "Dixieland" sparked serious reflection on how I was defining and portraying the style in the classroom. Because I had replicated traditional jazz more or less as I had learned it from Steve Call, I saw how my students would likely replicate many of the same aesthetics I taught them. As the name itself suggests, "traditional" or "early" jazz

ensemble offers a clear opportunity to talk about history and redirect students to lost cultural connections that may nurture an interest in neglected musical aesthetics or prompt discussions of ownership and musical appropriation across racial boundaries. I believe that by understanding the historiographic issues involved with defining and curating traditional jazz as a concept and subgenre we can offer students a more nuanced view of jazz music which will ultimately make them stronger musicians. I can attest to these benefits from personal experience: as a performer, I have grown in many new directions as I think critically about my music-making, rehearsal practices with ensembles, and choices about repertoire. Seeing contemporary developments around the removal of Civil War monuments and the name changes of bands like Lady Antebellum and the Dixie Chicks (both in 2020), I feel that the labels and historical narratives we use to describe traditional jazz reflect ongoing problems of racial inequality. Our choices in how to represent subjects and how to educate students carry important societal consequences.

As my opening anecdote illustrates, this research developed out of my own experience learning and teaching traditional jazz ensembles in the university setting. My anxiety over teaching in the most ethical or "correct" way was intensified by my outsider status as a white guy from Oregon, and I set about trying to ground my pedagogy in what I considered to be "authentic" recordings. I soon realized from my scholarly studies, however, that any stable notions of "authenticity" had long been debunked by scholars in early music studies, folk music studies, and ethnomusicology. Initially, I felt I had to justify my authority to jazz faculty and students through a strong emphasis on appropriate musical vocabulary. As I reviewed other traditional jazz pedagogical materials which I

utilized for my class, I noticed that each of the authors also had to find ways to construct their own authority as reliable sources and their various strategies colored the subject in different ways. Though some were only slight variations on a theme, others seemed entirely contradictory. As an educator relying on these teaching materials, I saw the traditional jazz that I taught as an amalgamation of these various authoritative perspectives. I tried to express disagreement with these definitions (for example, in the messy interactions of commercialism, art, and culture), yet the limited class time in our rehearsals often required distilling the nuance and contradiction down to more generalized broad tenets of the style.

As I got deeper into my scholarly studies, I began to question how traditional jazz groups differed from other jazz groups within the university. I had read many accounts regarding the historical tension between traditional and modern jazz and saw how many people regarded traditional jazz as an easier, less complex, lighter artform. Some regarded it as a novelty or merely a convenient point of entry for those just getting into improvisation. As I planned how to present my ensemble, I wondered how it might fit in with the existing curriculum and realized that the faculty members who supervised my work in performance and scholarly settings often emphasized different priorities in curriculum curation.

Jazz studies as a discipline has historically been divided into two separate branches. Ken Prouty has written about this divide in jazz studies noting that many performance departments are entirely unaware that there are scholars in non-music

departments who study jazz.[1] Tony Whyton suggests that the scholarly jazz studies tends toward a socio-critical perspective while performance departments focus on repertoire studies and an Aebersold/Baker/Coker approach.[2] Taking into account my own experiences with academic classes and performance education, I had experienced these perspectives as deconstructing (scholarly) and constructing (performance) approaches to the jazz canon. For every academic exploring an alternative approach to the jazz canon, there are an abundance of practitioners teaching private lessons, ensembles, and jazz history classes preaching the established jazz canon. Thus, jazz studies as a discipline, comprised of both performance and academic branches, in some ways plays out the same discursive binaries established by jazz criticism. Whyton suggests that properly utilized, jazz education has the potential to bring about powerful social change: "By exposing the embodied dualisms—the polarities of power—within the wider social order, jazz education can clearly perform a number of roles, from the critical to subversive, creative to political. In this sense, jazz pedagogy has the potential to embed itself in the realities of the social, whilst exposing ideologies that support the romanticised conception of jazz culture."[3] With these goals in mind, many scholars have advocated for interdisciplinary cooperation. Mark Tucker called for this kind of cooperation as far back as 1998 and Sherrie Tucker reiterated the thought in 2012: "What might that look like? What if we actually held workshops where musicologists and nonmusicologists paired off and—if we

---

[1] Ken Prouty, *Knowing Jazz* (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2011), 10.
[2] Tony Whyton, "Birth of the School," *Music Education Research* 8, no. 1 (March 2006): 76-77. Jamey Aebersold, David Baker, and Jerry Coker are three prominent jazz educators who created popular instructional materials and theoretical approaches to learning jazz.
[3] Whyton, "Birth of the School," 80.

didn't kill each other first—actually made papers together?"[4] Education clearly has the power both to reinforce problematic narratives and to uproot them. By engaging in this type of cross-disciplinary research and encouraging dialogue between the bifurcated field of jazz studies, my research helps create pathways for the collaborative relationships needed to enhance the quality of jazz education and address the legacies of inequality embedded in both the subject of jazz itself and its institutional privilege in university music schools. In the ensemble classroom specifically, historical/cultural context has the potential to spark students' curiosity and invite reflection about their own musical aesthetic choices.

While this type of interdisciplinary collaboration is difficult to facilitate under the current framework of academia, my personal interdisciplinary training had allowed me to both prepare students for a polished performance and motivate students to critically examine the music's cultural context; I feel this combination is vitally important in developing the next generation of musicians. Reflexively analyzing my own teaching to note how I was aesthetically shaping the instruction led me to realize that I was dealing with many of the same issues in my traditional jazz ensemble as ethnomusicologists encounter teaching non-western music in the university. Writing about their experiences directing ensembles, these scholars have valuable insight into the challenges of cultural representation in the institution, establishing instructor authority, simultaneously teaching

---

[4] Sherrie Tucker, "Deconstructing the Jazz Tradition: The 'Subjectless Subject' of New Jazz Studies," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 219. Sherrie Tucker quotes Mark Tucker's review: Mark Tucker, "Musicology and the New Jazz Studies," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 51, no.1 (Spring 1998): 148.

performance and cultural/historical context, and setting achievable and meaningful goals for their students.[5] Just as non-western ensembles must fit into an institutional framework designed to showcase western classical music, traditional jazz (and other jazz subgenres) must carve out an existence in jazz education departments which have historically been molded to appeal to "high art" aesthetics.

Responding to these developments in my work as a performance instructor, my dissertation combines traditional musicological methods such as historiography and artifact analysis with reflexive ethnography and performance pedagogy more typical of other disciplines. I consider how we might represent traditional jazz in a more culturally responsible way, allow for both musical and social diversity, and find a way to teach traditional jazz within the institution with a balanced approach considering both the non-academic tradition and students' development. I believe these issues are important topics for scholar performers like myself and will only become increasingly relevant with need for more interdisciplinary study in jazz.

In this project, I reference historical newspapers and oral histories to show how the labels of "Dixieland" and "traditional jazz" have evolved over time and taken on a variety of associations. Specifically, I note how the word Dixieland is problematic for the way it reinforces nostalgic fantasies of the old south and prevents African Americans from participating free from oppressive and offensive stereotypes created by white minstrel entertainers. I then consider how different figures establish their authority to speak for traditional jazz by looking at several pedagogical artifacts for the style of

---

[5] *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004).

traditional jazz drumming. I highlight how each of these authors make choices about how to present the subject which colors our view of traditional jazz. Having discussed genre definition from these angles, I interviewed educators for their perspectives on teaching traditional jazz within the academy and explored the potential for the jazz ensemble as a site of scholar-performer interdisciplinary collaboration. Finally, following models of reflexive ethnography established by ethnomusicologists leading world music ensembles I analyze my own experience of teaching traditional jazz ensembles at the college/university level. This synthesis of methods from musicology, ethnomusicology, music education, and jazz performance departments will serve as an important bridge between these disciplines and ultimately improve the quality of instruction. As part of a new generation of scholar-performers, I see unique potential for faculty with hybrid performance/academic training to address some of the prominent issues within jazz education.

Chapter Outlines

Chapter One: Defining Dixieland

Prompted by a 2019 argument in *The Syncopated Times* that the label of "Dixieland" is racist, I began investigating the usage of the word in historical newspapers from its popularization as a result of the minstrel tune "I Wish I Was In Dixie" (written and performed by the blackface minstrel, Daniel Decatur Emmett in 1859) and continuing on through the present day. Dixieland subsequently evolved as a carefree fantasy designed to cater to white desires. In time, it would develop into a popular

entertainment theme employed in restaurants, revues, theme parks, social events, etc. The articles I found in reference to Dixieland frequently portrayed African-Americans through demeaning and dehumanizing stereotypes. Beyond these stereotypes, African American involvement was generally either exoticized or minimized as harmless. I believe these limited avenues of participation in the Dixieland fantasy are an important factor in establishing the predominantly white audience for traditional jazz moving further into the 20th century. My research suggests that perpetuating the Dixieland terminology makes it difficult for African Americans to participate as musicians or fans in this community as equals.

After the Original Dixieland Jass Band's 1917 recordings, many historians took Dixieland to refer to a white New Orleans music tradition and continued to segregate the music into separate racial histories.[6] Looking at the terminology used to describe these genres and musicians reveals a trend of white musicians depicted as bold and creative individuals, while black musicians are lauded for their natural genius and their noble preference for the collective; and this language springs from the folk idealism of the early hot record collectors. These aesthetic contrasts (individual vs. collective, white vs. black) would result in the 1950s Dixieland style—a popular amalgamation of early jazz styles with a heavier emphasis on the string of soloists. Reacting against 1950s Dixieland, white trombonist Turk Murphy and other revivalists based out of San Francisco are credited with promoting the term "traditional jazz," encouraging a return to the collective aesthetic and digging back into earlier repertoire from the turn of the century (particularly

[6] Bruce Boyd Raeburn, *New Orleans Style and the Writing of American Jazz History* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2009), 68.

from African American sources).[7] This resurgence of the term "traditional" juxtaposed against the innovations of modern jazz led to an aesthetic split where "traditional jazz" came to refer broadly to many pre-bop jazz styles. This broad reference to early jazz styles is reflected in today's audience for the music—*The Syncopated Times* a contemporary periodical which advertises itself as "Exploring the Worlds of Hot Jazz, Ragtime, and Swing."[8] Moving into the 1960s, I show how "Dixieland" was claimed by those with white supremacist sentiments and took on more overtly racist overtones as artists like Johnny Reb explicitly communicated southern white resentment in alarming clarity. When these views became socially unacceptable, they were buried and encoded into other aesthetic formations that revolved around southern (white) masculine privilege and Confederate heritage. I argue that even if traditional jazz fans do not share these same sentiments, they cannot hope to use the word "Dixieland" devoid of these associations.

Considering its historical usage," Dixieland" is certainly a racially problematic label, yet fans argue with well-worn responses they have no racist intentions using the word and that this criticism is merely political correctness, that "Dixieland" is the most accurate descriptor for this style of music, and that discontented fans are simply trying to change history. In contrast, many white artists and fans who oppose the term express their racial advocacy as a means of constructing a "good white self" or appearing "woke." I discuss these responses in the context of contemporary scholarship on racism and critical race theory to highlight the difficulties in labelling racism, strategies of moral

[7] "Turk Murphy," *The San Francisco Traditional Jazz Foundation Collection: The Charles N. Huggins Collection,* Accessed Feb 24th, 2021, https://exhibits.stanford.edu/sftjf/feature/turk-murphy.
[8] *The Syncopated Times,* accessed Feb 24th, 2021, https://syncopatedtimes.com.

disengagement used by racial aggressors, the omnipresence of structuralized racism, and the dynamic of interest convergence for whites who appear to be racial advocates.[9] Though my research has emphasized the racially problematic elements of Dixieland, my personal interactions with musicians and fans have suggested to me that the most positive change comes from open discussion and education rather than an insistence on specific terminology.

Chapter Two: The New Orleans Drumming Tradition: Masters, Cultural Middlemen, and Authority.

This chapter interrogates how historical performance practice is made available to performers and how an author of a pedagogical text colors our interpretation through the choices they make in describing a tradition. While traditional jazz is typically defined by a front line of collectively improvising horns, I feel this particular framework is somewhat limiting as it does not describe any of the rhythm section instruments. Traditional jazz drumming both addresses this gap and is an interesting case study because of its relationship with second line parades, as well as later grooves in R&B and funk. The three sources I consider in this chapter—recordings of the New Orleans

---

[9] See: Lawrence Blum, "*I'm Not a Racist, But…" The Moral Quandry of Race* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2015), 2. Nicholas Faulkner and Ana-Maria Bliuc, "'It's okay to be racist': moral disengagement in online discussions of racist incidents in Australia," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 39, no. 14 (2016): 2546. Derek Bell Jr., Brown v. "Board of Education and the Interest-Convergence Dilemma," *Harvard Law Review* 93, no. 3 (Jan 1980): 518-533. Rachel Alicia Griffin, "The Disgrace of Commodification and Shameful Convenience:
A Critical Race Critique of the NBA," *Journal of Black Studies* 43, no. 2 (2012): 161-185.

drummer Baby Dodds made by revivalists Frederic Ramsey and Bill Russell in the 1940s; *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming* book and DVD (1995) by Herlin Riley, Johnny Vidacovich, and Dan Thress; and Antoon Aukes's book *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming* (2003)—illustrate the ambiguous mix of styles and techniques with which a student of traditional jazz may be confronted. These sources prompt a discussion on defining "tradition" in a more objectified way (such as identifying specific techniques and musical vocabulary; tradition that can easily be bought, sold, or shared), vs. the social relationships of local New Orleans drummers and a legacy of influence throughout time. These different conceptions of tradition play a significant role in determining how one moves from outsider to insider status.

My study of authority was motivated by Benjamin Filene's concept of "cultural middlemen" in folk and roots music. These are figures who, while seeking to deliver "pure" folk music, "made judgements about what constituted America's true musical traditions, helped shape what 'mainstream' audiences recognized as authentic, and, inevitably, transformed the music that the folk performers offered."[10] As an example, Filene points out how John Lomax's marketing strategy with the folk singer Leadbelly (depicting him as a "savage, untamed animal" though this was not an accurate description of his temperament) laid the groundwork for modern conceptions of authenticity that privilege unrestrained emotional expression.[11] I consider how the preservationist focus advanced by the revivalists working with Baby Dodds creates the illusion of objective

---

[10] Benjamin Filene, *Romancing the Folk* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000), 5.
[11] Ibid, 59-61.

documentation but upon closer investigation reveals a very experimental and idiosyncratic recording session. In *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming*, Dan Thress (an author and drummer who helps famous drummers produce pedagogical texts) interviews New Orleans drummers Herlin Riley and Johnny Vidacovich and forms a cohesive evolutionary narrative regarding a New Orleans style of drumming. I argue that this move is meant to elevate New Orleans drumming style through a comparison with the more broadly known and respected consensus narrative of jazz history.[12] While Riley and Vidacovich derive their authority from their upbringings in New Orleans, their virtuosic drumming abilities, and their social relationships with important musicians and tradition bearers, Antoon Aukes (from the Netherlands) must focus more on his mastery of the musical vocabulary in recordings, his extensive research, his oral history study, and his endorsements from local musicians in order to establish himself credibly.

The different frameworks these authors employ (historical preservation, genre as an evolutionary tradition, or documenting musical vocabulary) are certainly all valuable perspectives in understanding the subject of traditional jazz drumming. The sources occasionally seem contradictory in the ways they define tradition, but each perspective provides a new layer of understanding. At the same time, each source colors the subject through their perspective and adds challenges for those who desire to learn the style. A preservationist mindset, for example, privileges strict imitation (down to playing on vintage drum sets), while Aukes's focus on musical vocabulary directly addresses the

[12] Scott DeVeaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition: Jazz Historiography," *Black American Literature Forum* 25, no. 3 (Autumn, 1991): 530. John Gennari, *Blowin' Hot and Cool: Jazz and Its Critics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), 152.

reader and encourages them to take what speaks to them from the book and make it their own. I close out the chapter discussing in detail how drummers have approached the challenge of imitating Baby Dodds in order to illustrate how a preservationist mindset shapes the subject more explicitly.

Chapter Three: Traditional vs Modern Jazz in the University Curriculum

For this chapter, I interviewed prominent traditional jazz educators to get a better sense of how these specialty ensembles fit into the curriculum of a jazz studies degree. I found most of the educators with whom I spoke through my own professional networking or from a list kept by the Traditional Jazz Educators Network organization.[13] Some teach ensembles at the college level, others run weeklong camps open to the general public, and some are known primarily as performers and guest clinicians. To understand how these groups fit within jazz studies departments more broadly, I also spoke with individuals who are more involved with administration and curriculum design such as a directors of jazz studies programs. Because my project is specifically focused on understanding how one might combine historical/cultural context within the ensemble rehearsal, I also interviewed several individuals who hold academic positions in musicology and jazz history. I asked these educators questions about their experiences with traditional jazz in the university, their approaches to curriculum design and how this related to canon construction, and the possibilities for more interaction between jazz scholarship and performance studies (specifically in the ensemble classroom).

[13] "List of Educators," *Traditional Jazz Educators Network*, copyright 2015, accessed Feb 25th, 2021, http://prjc.org/tjen/listing.htm.

As Bernard Gendron's research on jazz criticism shows, exponents of traditional and modern jazz frequently emphasized different aspects of modernism with the goal of elevating their preferred type of jazz over others. Since modern jazz eventually prevailed over traditional jazz in ascending to the status of "art music," justifying traditional jazz in the university curriculum means that aesthetic oppositions to modern jazz often must be reconfigured. Singer Banu Gibson credited Wynton Marsalis for his important impact in raising the profile of traditional jazz by presenting polished virtuosic performances of New Orleans style in the Jazz at Lincoln Center concert series and emphasizing the importance of this music in his highly visible role.[14] While I think these efforts are valuable, I also believe that if we focus on adapting music to the already valued aesthetics of the institution, we are ultimately missing much of the depth and variety of jazz genres. This type of canon construction tends to produce homogeneity.

As I mentioned previously, I suggest that historians often discuss music that is sidelined by the jazz canon while performance programs reinforce the mainstream. In order to address issues of canon construction and create a program where we can study different subgenres of jazz with a less hierarchical view of jazz aesthetics, I believe it will be important to address the fragmented nature of jazz studies as a discipline. I thus revisit Ken Prouty's 2011 description of a separation between "New Jazz Studies" scholarship and performance departments and note the disagreement among the individuals I interviewed about who qualifies as a jazz scholar.[15] Through this analysis, I attempt to find productive paths forward for future collaboration between scholars and performers.

---

[14] Banu Gibson, interview with the author, November 31st, 2020.
[15] Prouty, *Knowing Jazz*, 10.

Analyzing the various functions historical presentation fulfilled for my interviewees and discussing what kinds of scholarly work they found personally valuable reveals that these preferences are quite unique to each individual and often based on personal connection with a particular scholar. Further complicating the issue of collaboration, the institutional evaluation frameworks to which performance educators, scholars, and students are accountable do not currently incentivize collaboration. It seems that this type of interdisciplinary collaboration may have to come from those who make it a personal priority or those with a combination of performance and "New Jazz Studies" scholarly training.

Chapter Four: Teaching Traditional Jazz Ensembles as a Performer Scholar: Lessons Learned from Ethnomusicology

My work in this chapter involves an analysis of my own experiences teaching traditional jazz ensembles (specifically at Arizona State University, Maricopa Community Colleges, and workshops for a local nonprofit group). It is my attempt to reconcile the conclusions of my research with the real-world practical demands of leading an ensemble and preparing students for an end of semester performance. As a traditional jazz ensemble director functioning within a jazz studies program which emphasized more modern forms, I felt inspired by scholarship from ethnomusicologists leading non-western ensembles in academia and looked to their examples of balancing scholarship and performance in a noncanonical university ensemble for insight. Like the scholars who wrote essays for the landmark edited collection *Performing Ethnomusicology: Teaching and Representation in World Music Ensembles,* I felt a responsibility to

represent the non-academic version of traditional jazz in my teaching but also to balance my instruction by maintaining institutional standards of performance rigor.

As the musical genres and traditions performed by most ethno-ensembles are unfamiliar to students, ethnomusicologist Ted Solis terms them "experience ensembles," where students enroll for "mind-opening cultural experiences." In contrast, he labels the canonical university groups (orchestra, band, choir) as "realization ensembles," for the way students realize performances using pre-existing musical skills.[16] While it would be difficult to categorize a jazz ensemble as 100% realization or experience, I think this distinction is a useful tool for thinking about how we present our courses and frame our goals. A jazz big band made up primarily of jazz majors would likely take on more of a realization format, while the students who enrolled in traditional jazz groups had to intentionally choose *not* to play the bebop vocabulary they had studied previously. For those in my group who were crossing over from a classical background or playing a secondary instrument (clarinet, banjo, tuba), this experience format was even more appropriate.

Learning from the examples of ethno-ensemble directors, I developed academic reflexivity in order to make sense of my patchwork of experience in traditional jazz (lessons, mentors, performances, listening, teaching experience, etc.) and distill that knowledge into pedagogical strategies to serve students.[17] As I progressed through my PhD coursework, my academic studies motivated me to significantly refine the ways in which I defined the subject of traditional jazz. While I began teaching with the goal of

---

[16] Solis, "Introduction…," 6-7.
[17] Ibid, 9.

fitting traditional jazz to the same standards I had learned in mainstream jazz education, I came to see how traditional jazz was different in many ways (in the valuation of singing for example), and when appropriate, emphasized those aspects. I had also begun with the expectation that I might teach students an "authentic" tradition which reflected famous recordings and contemporary performances of traditional jazz. Reading about the ways scholars like Anne Rasmussen, Michelle Kisliuk, and Kelly Gross have problematized the notion of authenticity and imitation made me recognize that recordings are only a snapshot of a broader musical culture and that by focusing so heavily on them I was selectively disregarding many elements of my subject.[18] This opened my eyes to the ways that in imitating we try to suppress and erase elements of difference. While recordings are a valuable resource, there is no reason for any jazz educator to pretend that there isn't distance temporally, musically, geographically, or culturally from the artists who initially recorded/arranged the music we rehearse with our ensembles. By transparently teaching from my own experience and acknowledging my role in curating traditional jazz for my students, I felt more freedom to adapt the music to best fit students' learning. I even rewrote arrangements to be easier for students and expanded existing theoretical frameworks for traditional jazz (like the roles of the collectively improvising horns) by having horn players swap roles or engage the rhythm section in conversation.

Applying my research from the previous chapters, I conclude by analyzing how I represented traditional jazz with terminology in the classroom, justified my own authority

[18] Michelle Kisliuk and Kelly Gross, "What's the 'It' That We Learn to Perform?: Teaching BaAka Music and Dance," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), 252.

as a teacher, and tried to integrate scholarly perspectives into rehearsal. While I had done extensive work researching and writing a dissertation on topics related to traditional jazz, making my insights relevant to students in the classroom often involved addressing the "so what" questions more explicitly. For example, even after I had explained the problematic nature of the "Dixieland" label some students continued to use the term in the same fashion. In order to reach students, I could not simply impose my authority as an expert. I found Ricardo Trimillos's characterization of the ethnomusicologist as a mediator helpful in finding the best way to frame my goals.[19] I believe that reflexively studying one's own pedagogy to inform a productive balance between the institution, the subject, and the students is a valuable practice which would serve jazz education well.

Literature Review

Tradition

The concept of "tradition" more broadly is too contested a concept for a single clean definition. Though many define tradition through historical preservation, Eric Hobsbawm asserts that revival movements claiming this basis of tradition "common among intellectuals since the Romantics, can never develop or even preserve a living past (except conceivably by setting up human natural sanctuaries for isolated corners of

---

[19] Ricardo Trimillos, "Subject, Object, and the Ethnomusicology Ensemble: The Ethnomusicological "We" and "Them," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 40-45.

archaic life), but must become 'invented tradition'."[20] Hobsbawm and Ranger's edited volume on "invented tradition" involves present-day practices which reference earlier traditions in order to support an authority or ideology with the strength of historical precedent (for example, Scottish Highland traditions and tartan kilts – reference to old clans – were not developed until after Scottish union with England).[21] Since the original publication in 1983, other scholars have praised the high level of scholarship in *The Invention of Tradition* but some have pointed out that it would be very difficult to draw such hard lines on invented vs "genuine traditions." Peter Burke has suggested: "Given that all traditions change, is it possible or useful to attempt to discriminate the 'genuine' antiques from the fakes? 'Invention' is a process which may be more or less deliberate, more or less sudden."[22] Burke's point that all traditions are to some degree invented is important as the cases studied in *The Invention of Tradition* focus on traditions contributing to nationalism and imperialism. Along similar lines, Brian Singleton suggests that "tradition…is a powerful ruling weapon on which colonialism depends, on which the post-colonial world feeds, but which is ultimately a fabrication, and which blocks the formation and emergence of new narratives."[23] As tradition is often deeply entwined with political, ideological, or financial motives, most scholars dismiss the

[20] Eric Hobsbawm, "Introduction: Inventing Traditions," in *The Invention of Tradition,* ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 8.
[21] Hugh Trevor Roper, "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland," in *The Invention of Tradition,* ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 15.
[22] Peter Burke, "Review," review of *The Invention of Tradition,* ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, *The English Historical Review* Vol. 101, No. 398 (Jan., 1986), 316-317.
[23] Brian Singleton, "Introduction: The Pursuit of Otherness for the Investigation of Self," *Theatre Research International* Vol. 22, No. 2 (January 2009): 95.

notion of a pure or genuine tradition and attribute this purity discourse to folk idealism. My study of traditional jazz reflects all of these elements to some extent. While the roots of traditional jazz are speculative, New Orleans revivalists and collectors have sought diligently to preserve as much history as they could through oral history, collections, and recordings. Scholars such as Bernard Gendron, John Gennari, and Bruce Raeburn have analyzed their writings more closely to understand how they shaped aesthetics of New Orleans style and jazz more broadly.[24]

As musicians study and perform a tradition, a preservationist framework aimed at "purity" can be both beneficial and stagnating. Preservation Hall in New Orleans has clearly done many wonderful things for the local music scene, yet in more recent years the Preservation Hall Jazz Band has branched out to collaborate with other artists in popular music and explore Latin roots by visiting Cuba. Michelle Kisliuk and Kelly Gross maintain the importance of this type of forward-looking innovation noting that in world music performances, they require student groups to make the tradition their own rather than trying to assimilate themselves into an existing culture. To fail to distinguish oneself individually would be to take on an "aesthetic of disregard," which allows us to objectify tradition and erase evidence of our recontextualization in performance. They write:

> These performances suppose unproblematically to represent the "Other" in usually rigid, museumlike, and ill-at-ease kinds of displays that ironically impede the very respect for the tradition that performers were seeking. From a political standpoint this impediment is not only ironic, but also perhaps tragic in terms of

[24] Bernard Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," *Discourse*, Vol. 15, No. 3 (Spring 1993), http://www.jstor.org/stable/41389289. John Gennari, *Blowin' Hot and Cool: Jazz and Its Critics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006). Raeburn, *New Orleans Style*.

> lost opportunities for intercultural learning, creative self-understanding, and deep fun. Performers and audiences find themselves within a socioaesthetic context where they can be neither fully "themselves" nor "the other."[25]

Kisliuk and Gross make excellent arguments here concerning the potential for intercultural learning and self-understanding that I apply in my work with jazz.

Few scholars agree on the exact defining qualities of a tradition. While some hold to musical vocabulary as an indicator of tradition, others place more emphasis on social connections. In speaking with John Joyce (professor at Tulane University and drummer for the Louisiana Repertory Jazz Ensemble,) I came to the conclusion that one might frame tradition in terms of teacher-student relationships rather than shared stylistic features. Certainly, with the wide diversity of music one might hear performed live in New Orleans and the wide variety of styles attributed to New Orleans (traditional jazz, rhythm & blues, funk, and brass bands,) this characterization seems to be more persuasive.

Though definitions of tradition and genre may change depending on who you talk to, they play a strong role in identity formation. While largely associated with New Orleans, traditional jazz scenes exist in other cities across the country and globe that have their own relationship to the music. The global traditional jazz community is—like the amorphous and unstable "jazz community" that Ken Prouty has described in *Knowing* Jazz—in fact many communities with diverse perspectives and experiences.[26] While some may refer to the music as "traditional jazz," others prefer the geographic

---

[25] Kisliuk and Gross, "What's the 'It' That We Learn to Perform?, 252.

[26] Prouty, *Knowing*, 18-43.

designation of "New Orleans jazz." More controversial is the racially charged "Dixieland" label—a term which SherriLynn Colby-Bottel notes cannot be easily discarded because it is an integral part of the tradition as experienced by audiences who came to the music via Disneyland shows and sing-along pizza parlors across the country.[27] To many, Dixieland has represented carefree nostalgia, the good ol' days, and family-friendly entertainment. Considering these factors, I think it is valuable to consider who are the most greatly impacted "communities" in this discussion: 1. New Orleans locals who identify with or create the local culture. 2. Culture producers and workers (musicians, chefs, club owners, service staff). 3. Tourism industry and other related businesses. 4. Traditional jazz fan societies and scenes outside of New Orleans (San Francisco, New York City, and London) all have strong scenes including resident bands and local performance venues. Other areas have a local jazz society which sponsors performances such as the Arizona Classic Jazz Society or Austin, TX, Traditional Jazz Society.) 5. Jazz education institutions which produce more musicians, sponsor performances, and represent high levels of achievement in the arts locally. Each individual who participates in the music or interacts with it on any significant level may shape their identities and actions in connection with values and ideas associated with the music.

Regardless of whether traditional jazz as a "genuine" tradition has been corrupted or if we can agree on its definition, it is clear that describing it as "traditional" imbues it

[27] SherriLynn Colby-Bottel, "Transposing the Tradition: The Social Production of Authenticity and Sincerity in Post-Katrina New Orleans Jazz" (PhD diss., University of Virginia, 2012), 150-151.

with cultural capital and implies an authentic historical precedent (though we may have no clear agreement as to its exact definition).[28] As Scott DeVeaux points out, jazz historians have often drawn on the power of a "traditional" narrative to connect disparate styles of jazz using the metaphor of a tree with branches and roots where all parts connect back to an undefinable essence.

> To search for this essence, then, one looks not at any one style or cultural or historical context, but for that which binds all these things into a seamless continuum. The disparate styles must be understood not as isolated expressions of particular times and places, but as organically connected, as branches of a tree — the individual parts relating more to each other than to the world outside of art. The process of growth is ineffable, internal, and curiously static: the variegated manifestation over the course of time of a central, unchanging essence.[29]

Like DeVeaux's "social history" of bebop, my work on traditional jazz explores the separateness and connectedness of this musical style with other forms of jazz music and New Orleans regional styles. This type of nuanced discussion of genre blending in African American music is important because in many cases the music is oversimplified in efforts to promote organic connectedness. Mark Burford's study of Mahalia Jackson's participation in the Fall 1951 "Definitions in Jazz" roundtable at the Music Inn of Lennox, MA shows that Jackson did not subscribe to the narrative of connectedness between black music genres (jazz, blues, gospel, swing, etc.) The blues musician Big Bill Broonzy echoed this sentiment claiming that mixing jazz with spirituals was "just killing the whole feeling of the people." Burford suggests that:

---

[28] Pierre Bourdieu describes "cultural capital" as an immaterial form of capital which a person might possess in an embodied, objectified, or institutionalized state. See Pierre Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," in *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education,* ed. J. Richardson (New York, Greenwood, 1986), 241-258.
[29] Scott DeVeaux, *The Birth of Bebop: A Social and Musical History* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002), 6.

> Explaining gospel music as a stylistic cousin to jazz and blues by emphasizing its production within African American culture and understanding gospel singing as a vocal, professional, religious, institutional, and social practice are, of course, not mutually exclusive. But we may be at a point where we can appreciate and historically contextualize the political projects of the former, critically assessing the strategic necessity and political efficacy of such stories and definitions of black music, while also identifying their blind spots.[30]

As we have tended to emphasize the interconnectedness of diverse styles of jazz, I am particularly curious about how things might change for the better if we were to emphasize how these genres diverge. Interconnectedness has often led to greater homogeneity (a common critique of jazz education). What if we went the other direction?

In my research, I discuss how different terminology and authority figures have shaped traditional jazz as a concept, yet when I refer to "the tradition" of traditional jazz, I use it in precisely the same way that such a phrase is typically used: as an ambiguous reference to an evolutionary narrative which encompasses many interconnected (yet diverse) musicians, recordings, musical practices, audiences, and aesthetics. The "tradition" of traditional jazz encompasses all the things which we imagine go together, until we reach a point where another term seems more descriptive. I see no reason to propose a new way to define the concept of "tradition" because my research demonstrates quite clearly that it is a contested concept.

---

[30] Mark Burford, "Mahalia Jackson Meets the Wise Men: Defining Jazz at the Music Inn," *The Musical Quarterly* 97, No. 3 (Fall 2014): 471-472.

Revival

Traditional jazz shares ground with many other music subcultures from around the world which have been revived and reimagined as sociopolitical frameworks change with the passing of time. Though musical styles may be quite unrelated musically or geographically, Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill's *Oxford Handbook of Music Revival* shows how music revivals play out in similar dynamics around the globe in many different cultures (from Vietnamese *ca tru* singing and dancing to Transylvanian string band music).[31] Some of this is commercially motivated: John and Jean Comaroff quote Chief Setumo Montshiwa of the Tswana people in Africa saying that "'ethno-nations' – had to 'join the modern world,' to 'become business-like,' to 'market' themselves, to 'manage' their symbolic and material assets."[32] Such groups attempt to convert their cultural capital into economic capital through the production of cultural heritage tourism. This has been a major topic in New Orleans as tourism has replaced oil as the city's largest economic resource. Other revivals are more ideologically focused: Charles Seeger described the mission of the Communist Party's Workers Music League as "the development of music as a weapon in the class struggle."[33] Many of the hot record collectors who wrote about New Orleans jazz in the 1930s were of similar political leanings, and they sought to emphasize folk qualities in the music.

---

[31] Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill, ed., *Oxford Handbook of Music Revival* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013).
[32] John L Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, *Ethnicity, Inc.* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2009), 8.
[33] Stephen Petrus and Ronald D. Cohen, *Folk City: New York and the American Folk Music Revival* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), 39.

The New Orleans jazz revival of the 1940s follows many of the general observations in Bithell and Hill's introduction such as the tendency for revivalists to organize around a particular person, method of doing things, group of objects, or set of ideas to establish authenticity and ground themselves in the past in order to become a rallying point for fans.[34] Bruce Raeburn shows that the New Orleans revivalists rallied around informants like Bunk Johnson or Kid Ory and constructed their histories based on their eyewitness accounts (even though the informants sometimes flouted the revival ideology).[35] For instance, in putting together a brass band for a recording session, Bill Russell did not hire any saxophonists on Johnson's recommendation although most bands at the time used saxophones. The resulting recording session is more accurately described as a reimagining of history.[36]

The historically informed performance movement in western classical music (beginning in the 1970s) emphasizes the importance of period instruments (objects) in order to achieve authenticity, some so much so that Thomas Forest Kelly describes ensembles drawing from wide repertoire such as the New York Pro Musica Antiqua as "the big-hardware model (lots of impressive instruments)."[37] This was a concern of mine in teaching traditional jazz ensembles as I have frequently had to adapt to the available instrumentation. For example, as jazz clarinet is not a common major in the university, I am faced with the choice of a jazz saxophonist doubling on clarinet who was struggling

---

[34] Caroline Bithell and Juniper Hill, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Revival* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 20-21.
[35] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 134.
[36] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 140-141.
[37] Thomas Forest Kelly, *Early Music: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 98.

to learn the instrument or a classical clarinetist who was less familiar with improvisation and was conditioned to avoid the wailing tonal qualities of New Orleans clarinet players on record. While I chose to adapt the instrumentation of my ensemble, some traditional jazz clarinetists take things a step further and insist that the more common Boehm style clarinet will not produce the same tone New Orleans clarinetists made famous with Albert style instruments.[38]

While unconventional instruments are attractive enough simply because of their novelty, some insist that period instruments simply "sound better."[39] Such subjective claims have prompted serious debate and called into question the competing aesthetics at play. Commenting on Laurence Dreyfuss's descriptions of early music's dissatisfaction with the modern orchestra, Kailan Rubinoff describes these competing aesthetics: "here in the Musical Mainstream 'the conductor is the symbol of authority, stature, and social difference', in the Early Music world, 'the conductor is banished'; while the Mainstream orchestra 'is organized in a hierarchy' with labour strictly divided among musicians, Early Music performers have a more egalitarian relationship."[40] Thomas Kelly suggests that this type of counterculture resistance to authority and emphasis on participation (citing

---

[38] Capion Larsen, "The Albert System," *Capion Larsen New Orleans Jazz,* copyright 2014, accessed Oct 23rd, 2019, http://capionlarsen.com/the-albert-system/.
[39] Kailan R. Rubinoff, "Orchestrating the Early Music Revival: The Dutch baroque orchestras and the mediation of commodification and counterculture," *Tijdschrift van de Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis*, Deel 63, No. 1/2 (2013): 169. Quoting: John Rockwell, "Concert: Orchestra of 18th Century at Tully", in New York Times, 23 November 1987.
[40] Rubinoff, "Orchestrating the Early Music Revival…," 170. Quoting: Laurence Dreyfus, "Early Music defended against its devotees. A theory of historical performance in the twentieth century," *Musical Quarterly* 69 (1983): 317-318. Drey

the many early music summer workshops and interest from amateur performers) reflects similar ideals expressed by those in the New York City folk revival.[41]

As I mentioned previously regarding the aesthetic debates in jazz criticism, Bernard Gendron suggests that this framing "propagated discursive opposition" by establishing binary arguments where people had to pick a side.[42] Whether the binary arguments be authoritarian/egalitarian and interpretation of text/transmission of text as in in the historically informed performance or folk culture/European culture and art/commerce as in early jazz criticism it seems to have the same effect of division on both parties. Amid fierce "battles" over authenticity in historically informed performance, Richard Taruskin concluded that "historical performance is not really historical;… a specious veneer of historicism clothes a performance style that is completely of our own time."[43] He argues that our attempts to piece together historical evidences and create what we imagine to be historical cannot be proven accurate by any positivistic standards. In fact, the choices we make about which musical aspects to focus on reflect our own present values and approaches more accurately than any composer's intentions. These revivalists, Taruskin claims, were piecing together fragments of the past attempting to document an imagined ideal that validated their personal preferences and ideas.

My work on traditional jazz explores how the music can be presented in institutions of higher education as a living artform. I feel this is important to avoid stagnation (Taruskin points out that Edgard Varèse once gloomily predicted that "it will

---

[41] Kelly, *Early Music: A Very Short Introduction, 3.*
[42] Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists," 150.
[43] Richard Taruskin, *Text and Act* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1995), 102.

not be long before some musical mortician begins embalming electronic music in rules.")[44] Having an awareness of the ideological forces invested in traditional jazz performance aesthetics, as well as the cultural capital bound up in our musical representations, how do we choose to reimagine traditional jazz for ourselves? My research provides a model for jazz studies scholars and performers to consider their roles in the continuous reimagining and revival of jazz past.

Folk Authenticity

Many of the traditional jazz revivalists sought to portray jazz as pure American folk music, and for this reason I draw on discussions of authenticity in other music which falls into this same category (bluegrass, for example). Though scholars such as Benjamin Filene and Charles Keil have concluded that notions of folk music as pure, non-commercial, or isolated from urban experience are unrealistic criteria and that most "folk" genres are quickly disqualified from any idealized definition with close study, folk idealism continues to persist (and why wouldn't it? It is an attractive fantasy). [45]

Perhaps because of this emphasis on folk purity, genres like bluegrass and traditional jazz develop more militant preservationists who hope to defend the style as they know and define it from encroaching new trends. Joti Rockwell suggests that fan discussions about what qualifies as "bluegrass" play an important role in the musical culture and studies internet forum comments to show how participants define the genre in

---

[44] Ibid, 97.
[45] Filene, *Romancing the Folk.* Charles Keil, "Who needs 'the folk'?" *Journal of the Folklore Institute* 15, no. 3 (1978): 263.

both strict "classical" guidelines (IS or ISN'T bluegrass) and more flexible "prototypical" mindsets which break down a list of values and attributes particular to examples of the genre and show how a piece of music can fit enough of the qualifications to be labelled as such.[46] This type of thinking allows us to continue talking about music using pre-existing vocabularies but also to talk about music that does not fit the established definitions. Along similar lines, Donald Depoy suggests that bluegrass music carries both an Adornian "authentic" meaning (meaning that reflects the purpose and context of the culture for which the music was created) as well as a "transauthentic" meaning (ideas associated with the pre-digested form of bluegrass as defined by essential elements).[47] Allowing these multiple layers of meaning and authenticity to coexist may seem to fly in the face of both preservationist and modernist ideals, but examining this tension between definitions ultimately provides a clearer understanding of the contested nature of music and culture.

Such a multifaceted view of culture and music-making is likely not as profitable in a capitalist mindset where authenticity, nostalgia, and roots are essential packaging for music products. Lee Bidgood gives examples of how this type of nostalgia leads Czech communities in the Czech Republic to create imagined ideal versions of "Amerika" involving an American rural landscape but also blending in Czech landscape and language. Some enjoy this fantasy so much that they choose not to visit the real America

---

[46] Joti Rockwell, "What is Bluegrass Anyway? Category Formation, Debate, and the Framing of Musical Genre," *Popular Music* 31, no. 3 (2012): 372-376.
[47] Donald Depoy, "Cultural Context of Bluegrass Music: Preference, Familiarity, and Stereotypes" (PhD diss., University of Maine, 1996), 56-59.

to keep their imagined world intact.[48] I can empathize with this sort of thinking as I enjoyed the fantasy nostalgia world of New Orleans in my mind with my only reference to the real city being Disneyland's New Orleans square. When I finally came to visit the real city, I found my charmed fantasy evaporating when I experienced the real-life odors of Bourbon street. For better or worse folk fantasy and nostalgia play an influential role in these genres. While it might lead to problematic fantasies, it can also be a powerful and generative source for creativity as evidenced by Disneyland and the Czech communities.

Jazz Historiography

Noting the pattern of canon construction in jazz, Scott DeVeaux shows how jazz historians and critics have reinforced jazz as an "autonomous art of some substance, the culmination of a long process of maturation" which parallels western art music.[49] While this is a neatly packaged narrative useful for educational purposes, the canon becomes a tug-of-war over representation. For every canonical assertion, there are many who feel their favorite musician or style has been marginalized. Geoffery Jacques's critical responses to the Ken Burns documentary *Jazz* (2000), for example, suggest that Burns's portrayal of jazz "dying" in the 1970s and being resurrected in the '80s by neo-traditionalists was simply not an accurate portrayal of the music scene at the time.[50]

---

[48] Lee Bidgood, "The Americanist Imagination and Real Imaginary Place in Czech Bluegrass Songs," *Popular Music and Society* 41, no. 4 (2018): 403.

[49] DeVeaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition," 526.

[50] Geoffrey Jacques, Bernard Gendron, Sherrie Tucker, Krin Gabbard, and Scott DeVeaux "Call and Response: A Roundtable on Ken Burns Jazz," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 13, 2 (2001): 209-210.

Looking specifically at canon deconstruction in traditional jazz, many scholars have worked to unearth neglected narratives. Raeburn's study of Italian and Jewish immigrants in New Orleans jazz, Sherrie Tucker's report on women in New Orleans jazz, William Pryor's article on the San Francisco traditional jazz revival, or Charles Suhors' book on post World War II jazz in New Orleans are just a few examples.[51]

Mario Dunkel reinforces the fact that early jazz historiography—specifically the work of Marshall Stearns (1908-1966)—was politically motivated. Jazz-as-art conceptions sought to "improve the social status of African Americans in U.S. society and … support black musicians in their daily grappling with a racist music industry by demonstrating the ingenuity and respectability of African American musical achievements."[52] Stearns was also the architect of our modern consensus view of jazz history advancing the notion of an evolutionary tree with branches and roots, yet united by their essence. Though many positive developments have come out of politically motivated jazz history, the narratives were often oversimplifications. For these reasons, DeVeaux issued the challenge that our future histories be "less invested in the ideology of jazz as aesthetic object and more responsive to issues of historical particularity."[53]

---

[51] Bruce Raeburn, "Stars of David and Sons of Sicily: Constellations beyond the Canon in Early New Orleans Jazz," *Jazz Perspectives* 3, no. 2 (2009): 123-152.
Sherrie Tucker, "A Feminist Perspective on New Orleans Jazzwomen," *New Orleans Jazz National Historical Park*,
https://www.nps.gov/jazz/learn/historyculture/upload/new_orleans_jazzwomen_rs-2.pdf.
William Pryor, "San Francisco and the Revival of New Orleans Jazz," *IAJRC Journal* 45, no. 3 (Sept 2012): 28-31.
Charles Suhor, *Jazz In New Orleans: The Postwar Years Through 1970* (Lanham, MD: The Scarecrow Press, 2001)
[52] Mario Dunkel, "Marshall Winslow Stearns and the Politics of Jazz Historiography," *American Music* 30, no. 4 (Winter 2012): 498.
[53] DeVeaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition," 553.

More than 20 years later after DeVeaux's charge, Sherrie Tucker addresses the work of scholars who have explored many of those neglected points of view and questions our intentions in tearing down the canon: "We had the jazz tradition as a canon; now we have it as an outmoded idea to repudiate. What shall we do for an encore?"[54] Tucker suggests that canon deconstruction has fueled just as many scholarly careers as the jazz tradition itself did and that academics must cultivate greater awareness of their power. Drawing parallels to gender, race, and American studies, she highlights the challenges of engaging with an object of study which is so diverse and powerfully contested that it becomes an undefinable "subjectless subject." Instead of repudiating the established narratives, she calls for an interdisciplinary examination of the dissonances between our desires. Returning to the subject of Ken Burns's documentary *Jazz*, Tucker suggests that the omission of jazz in the 1970s is not merely about marginalizing that style of music, but about presenting a comfortable narrative concerning race and gender equality by sidestepping the social revolutions of that era and beyond:

> In the Burns's not jazz cosmology, black/white integrationism is as far as we get, race-wise. We don't learn from black power, we don't get the contradictions of the construction of race in America along a black/white binary, we don't discover the limitations of mainstream integrationism, and we don't get the failure of white liberals to recognize those limitations. Instead, we get integration for integration's sake-a black and tan fantasy of jazz as race-transcendent.[55]

While DeVeaux suggested that historiography should not serve ideology, Tucker responds that we cannot possibly capture every detail of history (and why would we want

---

[54] Sherrie Tucker, "Deconstructing the Jazz Tradition: The 'Subjectless Subject' of New Jazz Studies," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 210.
[55] Jacques, Gendron, Tucker, Gabbard, and DeVeaux "Call and Response," 212.

to) but rather that we should turn our attention back to ideology and study how history has been used to validate desires and authorities. She continues:

> What if we look at *Jazz* as a skillfully constructed text that succeeds, in large part, precisely because it fulfills the desires of more lucratively demographically situated audiences and sponsors than (I'm just guessing) the films we would make? What that tells us about Ken Burns is far less important than what that tells us about the political and ideological stakes of all those other people and institutions that invest meaning, viewing time, and actual funds into the rather ubiquitous narrative *Jazz* represents.[56]

In other words, what are we trying to accomplish with history and what does that say about us? Whether we are trying to objectively record the past, give credit where credit is due, champion a specific musical aesthetic, advance racial equality, or subconsciously validate our desires for an individually comfortable existence; writing our history is just as much a reflection of the present as it is a record of the past. Having taken two jazz history courses as an undergraduate, worked as a jazz history TA for several semesters, and completed a master's degree in jazz performance, I find it concerning that I was never confronted with the issues of historiography these scholars raise until I became a musicology PhD student. My work aims to bring more of these discussions into performance departments and to stimulate interdisciplinary cooperation among faculty.

Ethnography in Jazz Studies and New Orleans Studies

Ethnographies of jazz scenes describe the complex worlds of music-making as they address locally cultivated evaluative criteria in jazz. Differing opinions in the various jazz communities (sometimes reflecting racial boundary lines) often lead a

[56] Ibid, 219.

subsection of the community to feel that the encroaching ideology of the other threatens their musical style, professional livelihood, way of life, or prestige as part of the tradition (as recognized by the community at large). Sarah Suhadolnik has studied place in New Orleans not as a clearly defined entity but as a contested landscape: "a musical sense of place that grows out of, but can subsist apart from, its physical counterpart."[57] Considering place as a combination of many imagined places existing in the minds of various groups makes room for a wider interpretation and allows for significant genre boundary blurring. Suhadolnik claims this is why bands and audiences accept a wide variety of genres ("southern folk songs, gospel tunes, nostalgic New Orleans pop hits, Mardi Gras anthems, and more universal jazz standards") as a unified New Orleans music tradition.[58]

Sherrilyn Colby-Bottel's ethnography engages directly with New Orleanians who fulfill different musical roles to understand how these parties recognize authenticity and sincerity in their conception of musical tradition. Her subjects include the community of staff and volunteers at the New Orleans radio station WWOZ, the social networks of three established gigging musicians in the city, and a collective of street musicians and dancers who relocated to New Orleans after the destruction caused by Hurricane Katrina. She addresses how those who participate in these musical communities prove their local-ness as established New Orleanians and negotiate situations where contradictory versions of authenticity emerge (such as performers accommodating requests to hear "Hello

---

[57] Sarah Suhadolnik, "Navigating Jazz: Music, Place, and New Orleans" (PhD diss., University of Michigan, 2016), 12.
[58] Ibid, 12.

Dolly" even though the tune was written for Broadway in 1965).[59] Colby-Bottel's dissertation highlights individual musicians' perspectives well, and her discussion of sincerity offers another framework for reconciling the wide-ranging repertoire of working musicians in the New Orleans music scene.

Considering jazz at large, Travis Jackson's ethnographic work studying jazz aesthetics among working musicians in New York City draws attention to the frequent mistake of conflating race with culture. In an effort I perceive as shifting the discussion from generalized racial binary characteristics (black music vs. white music), he proposes a new "blues aesthetic" to address qualities that musicians from different backgrounds (black, white, university trained, not university trained, musically conservative, and more avant-garde) strive for, such as finding an individual voice, soulfulness, and describing the spiritual experience of improvisation.[60] I see both Jackson's and Colby Bottel's ethnographies attempting to synthesize a more nuanced and inclusive description of tradition. As seen with arguments over jazz canon generally, tensions over isolating the tradition within a specific set of parameters (e.g., race, culture, musical style markers, location) can easily tip the value scales out of balance for the previously mentioned stakeholders.

Concerns about preserving the authentic New Orleans were especially intensified after the destruction brought by Hurricane Katrina. Colby-Bottel describes many local residents' anxiety that rebuilding efforts would not support the local music traditions and

---

[59] Colby-Bottel, "Transposing the Tradition," 59-64.
[60] Travis Jackson, *Blowin' the Blues Away: Performance and Meaning on the New York Jazz Scene* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 125-135.

culture. Many scholarly studies echo this fear, addressing issues such as the loss of public housing, privatization of education, state reliance on faith-based charity work to rebuild, and profiteering on recovery efforts. Together these works describe the distressing trend of those in government positions failing the populations they served by privatizing recovery efforts and public services resulting in higher costs for the poor and greater profits for the rich. [61] Many longtime local residents continue to be forced out as rents rise and new construction projects cater to tourists and those with higher incomes. As the music scene encompassing brass bands, second-line parades, and jazz have long been rooted in these communities, many fear that the local music scene and culture will become a minstrelized imitation, or as Tom Piazza puts it: "a giant Disney-fied theme park called Jazzworld!"[62] This is certainly a valid concern considering the scant financial subsistence of many musicians. With an average income of $17,800 a year, New Orleans musicians share the same economic precarity as other service workers in New Orleans who face rising rents, lack of healthcare, and lack of local music education in schools.[63]

Such a tremendous focus on music in tourism promotion with meager economic support for local musicians has led many culture bearers to feel exploited by culture

---

[61] John Arena, *Driven from New Orleans: How Nonprofits Betray Public Housing and Promote Privatization* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2012).
Vincanne Adams, *Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013).
Cedric Johnson, *The Neoliberal Deluge: Hurricane Katrina, Late Capitalism, and the Remaking of New Orleans* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2011).
[62] Tom Piazza, *Why New Orleans Matters* (New York: Reagan Books, 2005), 155.
[63] Jan Ramsey, "By the Numbers: Sweet Home New Orleans Releases 2012 State of the New Orleans Music Community Report," *Offbeat Magazine,* accessed June 27, 2019, http://www.offbeat.com/news/sweet-home-new-orleans-releases-2012-state-new-orleans-music-community-report/.

producers. In Helen Regis and Shana Walton's study of the New Orleans Jazz and Heritage Festival they describe the working conditions for social aid and pleasure club performers at the festival: "They have no changing rooms, privacy, air conditioning, or refreshments other than a water dispenser. And they are paid at a rate that amounts to less than fifty dollars per person. They have no choice about what brass band will play during their parade. The festival gives them access to the world at the same time that it keeps them in their place."[64] In contrast, the festival regularly books headlining acts such as Sting or the Dave Matthews Band who get paid thousands more for their performances, creating an extreme wage gap and negating the value produced by authentic culture bearers.

To put this in perspective, Matt Sakakeeny explains that New Orleans brass band musicians have a "commodified persona" as a result of their branding as authentic culture bearers: "It is their very identity as black New Orleanians, and their socialization in distinctive traditions, that enables musicians to access a host of other staged contexts in which they not only supplement their earnings from community performances, but also accumulate symbolic capital."[65] Sakakeeny argues that New Orleans musicians harness this symbolic capital to brand their music and further their careers as ambassadors of authentic culture. Sarah Benet Weiser writes that "brands are actually a story told to the consumer. When that story is successful, it surpasses simple identification with just a

---

[64] Helen Regis and Shana Walton, "Producing the Folk at the New Orleans Jazz and Heritage Festival," *The Journal of American Folklore* 121, no. 482 (Fall, 2008): 415.
[65] Matt Sakakeeny, "Playing for Work: Music as a Form of Labor in New Orleans," *Oxford Handbooks Online,* accessed June 27, 2019, 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199935321.013.23.

tangible product; it becomes a story that is familiar, intimate, personal, a story with a unique history.[66] One need only consider the success of Mac Rebennack in constructing his voodoo persona Dr. John to recognize the cultural appeal of an authentic New Orleans brand. New Orleans culture producers in the tourism industry are therefore marketing a path for tourists to create their own connection with an authentic New Orleans and local culture. While institutions such as the Jazz and Heritage festival are certainly not in the same category as for-profit companies, these larger entities control the "exchange rate" for the cultural products created by locals and carry the potential for exploitation and minstrelization of local culture.

My ethnographic interviews with university jazz performance educators broadens discussion about how we recognize the broader cultural and historical details of the music we perform. As the ethnographic studies I have mentioned show, jazz scenes are defined by continual conflict between individuals and organizations. The university is another powerful organization which holds influence over how traditional jazz is studied, valued, and appreciated. To say that the school simply provides musical training ignores the ways that the institution shapes our music making. In my interviews with jazz educators, I found that each educator held their own priorities and approached the subject differently. Their personal choices in how to design curriculum and which aesthetics to emphasize ultimately shaped jazz programs around a unique focus.

[66] Sarah Banet-Weiser, *Authentic^{TM}: The Politics of Ambivalence in a Brand Culture* (New York: New York University Press, 2012), 4.

Pedagogy in University Jazz Education

In the past, jazz education has often been criticized for removing the music from its social context and attempting to synthesize it in the sterile laboratory of the university classroom. Common problems discussed in academic literature include: the lack of diversity in academia, general disconnectedness from black culture, selective emphasis on musical elements that fit conveniently and neatly into the box of quantifiable/gradable elements (and neglect of those that don't).[67] These problems are concerning for the ways that we self-replicate in education. Jazz program graduates will go on to become culture bearers and will likely teach what they were taught. Ake notes the tremendous influence of college-based programs as they have taken the place of "the proverbial street" where jazz musicians are educated and become the "main professional homes for hundreds of jazz performers and composers."[68] This centralizing of jazz instruction and performance in university programs means adapting the artform in new ways leading some to mourn the loss of essential jazz elements born out of experiential learning and on the job training. Anthropologist Eitan Wilf points out that arts education in general is fraught with tension between the duality of codified reason and structure associated with modern

[67] For discussion on separation from black culture see: Damani Phillips, *What is This Thing Called Soul: Conversations on Black Culture and Jazz Education* (New York, NY: Peter Lang Publishing, 2017), 15-18. For discussion of selective musical elements which get emphasized and others which are neglected in jazz education see: David Ake, *Jazz Cultures* (Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2002), 112-113. For discussion of competing value systems of various "jazz communities" and the difficulties in grading student improvisation efforts see: Prouty, *Knowing Jazz,* 18-21 and 55-62.
[68] David Ake, "Crossing the Street: Rethinking Jazz Education," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 188.

schooling vs unpredictable experience-based creativity we associate with the arts.[69] He concluded from his field work at Berklee College of Music and the New School that jazz educators often created new teaching strategies which contest "a number of traditional binary oppositions, such as spontaneous/ rule-governed social action, creative practice/institutionalized rationality, and informal/formal learning"[70] but that they simultaneously sustained binary oppositions "such as aurality/literacy, blackness/whiteness, intuition/theory, lowbrow/highbrow, and associate creativity in jazz with the terms occupying the left side of these oppositions, and institutionalized rationality with the terms occupying the right side of these oppositions."[71] In other words, university jazz educators continue to struggle with the same binaries created by early jazz critics and revivalists and are major gatekeepers in transmitting knowledge, practice, traditions, and ideas about jazz to future generations.

Many of these modern-day jazz discussions mirror historical debate; they are power struggles between people who are oriented to jazz in different ways and thus define the music and their own identities differently. Performers outside of academia have a different set of concerns than college educators. Jazz educators must negotiate their priorities in academic environments that prioritize western classical music, and students must balance their own interests while also satisfying the requirements of various musical aesthetics imposed by their professors. Ken Prouty points out that these power struggles extend further up into the academic structure as well:

---

[69] Eitan Wilf, *School for Cool: The Academic Jazz Program and the Paradox of Institutionalized Creativity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2014), 6-12.
[70] Ibid, 14.
[71] Ibid.

> [T]eachers in turn are assessed by administrators who judge their relative effectiveness as performers and educators. Institutions exercise power because they make decisions on whether someone is hired or earns tenure. Boards of trustees and state agencies have power because they set funding priorities, and so on. All this may seem to get far away from jazz improvisation, but in the final analysis, discourses about jazz education are deeply informed by such discussions of power.[72]

Just like the previous discussion of New Orleans traditional music and tourism, jazz education involves governing powers and frameworks that have far reaching consequences for the way music is taught and made and the lives of those who participate in the musicking. In the same way that the New Orleans jazz and heritage festival bears the responsibility of ethically serving stakeholders in local culture and traditional music, I believe jazz education ought to bear some degree of responsibility to the variously defined "jazz communities."

Regarding reciprocity between research and community collaborators, Kay Shelemay advocates for John Dewey's ecosystem concepts, suggesting that "individual and communal self-realization are…mutually interdependent." She outlines her own methods of attempting to establish some form of reciprocity with her Ethiopian-American cultural informants by facilitating educational opportunities and professional recording, recommending artists for more prestigious performances, helping them find grants and funding, and smaller gestures such as gift certificates to restaurants.[73] In the case of jazz education, the parties deserving of reciprocity are often demographic groups rather than singular individuals. Prouty describes prominent criticisms of college jazz education

---

[72] Prouty, *Knowing Jazz,* 68.
[73] Kay Shelemay, "The Ethics of Ethnomusicology in a Cosmopolitan Age," in *The Cambridge History of World Music*, ed. Philip Bohlman (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 799.

including a lack of real world playing experience for white academics with advanced degrees, barriers to hiring exceptional working professionals who do not have degrees, the predominantly white and male students and faculty, cultural disconnect between practitioners and academics, problematic curation of jazz history curriculums, varying criteria for evaluating improvisation, justifying jazz by making it conform to western art music standards, stylistic homogenization or lack of individuality in school-trained musicians, and the abundance of method books turning jazz into a written rather than aural tradition.[74] These elements suggest inaccurate representation and recognition of currently working jazz musicians, faculty and student diversity unreflective of the general population, and transforming the aesthetics of jazz to serve the academic community rather than the non-academic culture which created it.

Educators must decide for themselves how to wield their power to cultivate musical tastes through curriculum and occasionally may even make decisions to push back on cultural informants for one reason or another. For example, Anne Rasmussen writes about her disagreement with an invited guest artist who insisted on the authenticity of a particular recording while working with her middle eastern ensemble (while she felt that no such "authenticity" exists in performance practice).[75] In such a situation, pitting the "university expert" against the "native performer expert" is a complex situation where a researcher's decision on how much to trust the experience of a cultural informant has consequences for all involved. On the side of greater cultural reflection, Damani Phillips

---

[74] Prouty, *Knowing Jazz,* 44-69.

[75] Anne Rasmussen, "Bilateral Negotiations in Bimusicality: Insiders, Outsiders, and the 'Real Version' in Middle Eastern Music Performance," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), 223.

attributes much of the emotional power of jazz to the aesthetics of black culture and interviews many prominent artists and educators to illustrate. He quotes Stefon Harris, insisting that "We can no longer afford to 'proliferate the culture of the institution and not the culture of the people.'"[76] In his study, Phillips reinforces the importance of "street" education, emotional relevance in jazz music, communication with an audience, aural learning, and emotional expression. He calls for greater cultural diversity in academia, more focus on cultural immersion, and greater prioritization of authentic source culture as faculty members make adjustments to how they conceive, teach, and represent music in the institution.[77]

While representing the non-academic community is important, ethnomusicologist John Murphy proposes that educators must also consider the experiences of the student body and their preparation for success after graduation. His interviews with jazz students at the University of North Texas (One of the largest university jazz education programs in the country where Murphy is also faculty) show that most students supplement their classroom education with outside gigs, jam sessions, listening to records, and hanging out.[78] These activities have a profound impact on students' development as they are free to apply, alter, or ignore techniques practiced in the classroom, and Murphy's findings shift the goal of jazz education from replicating the apprenticeship or "street" education

---

[76] Phillips, *What is This Thing Called Soul,* 235.
[77] Ibid, 231-235.
[78] John Murphy, "Beyond the Improvisation Class: Learning to Improvise in a University Jazz Studies Program," in *Musical Improvisation: Sound, Education, Society,* ed. Gabriel Solis and Bruno Nettle (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2009), 179-180.

of the past to considering the university as entirely different environment with alternative strengths and weaknesses for jazz education.

Just as jazz historians framed bebop as a more advanced evolution of jazz and the threshold of jazz-as-art, university programs have largely passed over earlier forms of the music in performance training. DeVeaux suggests that the New Orleans style "was long ago ceded to enthusiastic and atavistically minded amateurs. Even the most accomplished modern jazz repertory groups only drive home how difficult it is for a contemporary musician to inhabit the musical sensibility of King Oliver, Jelly Roll Morton, or Jimmie Lunceford."[79] This type of selective focus in jazz education allows us to sustain the notion that jazz is a smoothly packaged evolutionary line, and (as the critics of the Ken Burns *Jazz* documentary point out) we create a version of the artform which facilitates self-congratulatory praise of our culture while simultaneously erasing the underprivileged and the problematic. In response to New Orleans trumpeter Nicholas Payton's rejection of the word "jazz," David Ake suggests that rather than using our authority to create a consistent narrative:

> We should highlight, not bury, the strands that would denounce jazz. We should encourage our students to ponder why certain musicians, even highly successful ones, would choose to avoid or reject the jazz label. In this way, students learn that jazz isn't all good; it fights with itself; it even tries to destroy parts of itself at times. All of this goes to show us that it remains very much alive. And once teachers introduce their students to the jazz spaghetti bowl, or whatever metaphor they want to use, they also have the duty to ask those students to consider which jazz strand or strands they would embrace or embody, and which they would oppose. Teachers even have the obligation to ask their students— particularly

[79] DeVeaux, *The Birth of Bebop…*, 2.

> those who may wish to pursue music as a career— if climbing into this messy bowl is really what they want to do. After all, jazz is not for everyone.[80]

Ake's suggestion here paves the way for students to study different styles of jazz within the university in a more diverse manner. In my research, I highlight the ways that I found traditional jazz to follow different aesthetics from the modern jazz which comprised the typical university jazz curriculum. Critically considering the differences in various jazz genres allows us to get to know them more deeply and be inspired in new directions rather than force them into an evolutionary narrative. I look forward to seeing the future of jazz in academia as I believe the field is ready for this change. In my interviews, I noted that educators were for the most part very open to new perspectives on the music.

---

[80] David Ake, "On the Ethics of Teaching "Jazz" (and "America's Classical Music," and "BAM," and "Improvisational Music," and…), in *Improvisation and Music Education,* ed. Ajay Heble and Mark Laver (Oxford: Taylor and Francis, 2016), 28.

CHAPTER 1

DEFINING DIXIELAND

Beginning in 1989, pianist and bandleader Tex Wyndham wrote a number of columns for the *West Coast Rag* and *The American Rag* (special interest regional magazines focusing on early jazz) in which he attempted to define the term "Dixieland." As an advocate for "Dixieland" as a genre label, he expressed frustration about fans who viewed the word as pejorative but were unable to explain their reasoning. He writes: "It's as if they are saying: 'I recognize that music which is heavily informed by devices used by jazzmen during the twenties may be categorized into several styles. I know which of these styles I enjoy. The other styles are 'Dixieland.'"[81] Wyndham explored the issue further in several follow up articles attempting to analyze why some bands performing in straw hats and striped vests or novelty costumes had made "Dixieland" a corny association. Ultimately, he concluded that these were not valid reasons to avoid "Dixieland" as a genre label and that those who oppose the term "really, deep down inside, want to be part of an elite in-group that can congratulate itself on appreciating some music known by a term only they understand."[82] As this topic was so central to my research, I was puzzled at how Wyndham could have written extensively about Dixieland jazz and made absolutely no mention of race. Apparently, I was not the only one who had this reaction. In September 2019, Joe Bebco, associate editor and webmaster for the

---

[81] Tex Wyndham, "Texas Shout #1 'Dixieland'", The Syncopated Times, accessed Jan 31st, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/tex-wyndham-texas-shout/. Originally published in *West Coast Rag,* November – December 1989.

[82] Tex Wyndham, "Texas Shout #67 Dixieland Revisited, part 2" The Syncopated Times, accessed Jan 31, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/texas-shout-68-dixieland-revisited-part-2/. Originally published in *The American Rag,* December 1995.

Syncopated Times (successor of the *American Rag* where Wyndham's articles had been digitally reproduced), addressed the issue marveling, how not only Wyndham, but entire generations of fans and musicians in the (mostly white) traditional jazz society scene seemed to have glossed over any racial associations with Dixieland:

> It is an omission that frankly shocks me. As organizations fretted over the music dying and removed "Dixieland" from the names of festivals the most common reasoning was that it had "corny" associations, not racist ones. It seems to be a cultural blindspot among the devotees of that generation… It also indicates just how overwhelmingly white the scene had become.[83]

Bebco's own 2019 article "Reconsidering 'Dixieland Jazz': How the Name Has Harmed the Music" explores in a thoughtful and approachable manner the difficulties of defining Dixieland. He addresses the claim that Dixieland is a white genre, the notion that fans who continue to use the word are not doing anything wrong because they have not racist intentions, and the suggestion that Dixieland reinforces oppressive myths of slavery such as the benevolent white master and devoted slave. Yet reactions to Bebco's article hardly represented universal agreement.

Reader responses ranged from "a personal note of thanks and congratulations for your very thoughtful, well-researched and heartfelt article" to "the longest diatribe of verbal bs that I have ever read in your Rag."[84] On one side, many traditional jazz lovers feel that anyone who enjoys this music owes a debt of gratitude to African Americans

---

[83] Joe Bebco, "Reconsidering "Dixieland Jazz", How The Name Has Harmed The Music," The Syncopated Times, Sept 27th, 2019, accessed June 14th, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/reconsidering-dixieland-jazz/.

[84] David Limburg and Wayne Pauli, "Reader Responses to 'Reconsidering Dixieland Jazz: How the Name has Harmed the Music,'" The Syncopated Times, Oct 18th, 2019, accessed Jun 14th, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/reader-responses-to-reconsidering-dixieland-jazz-how-the-name-has-harmed-the-music/.

and has a responsibility to combat prejudice and racial inequality in the present. On the other side, some insist that music is by nature apolitical (none more so than the "good time" music of Dixieland) and detest any "political correctness" policing to ensure that their manner of "letting the good times roll" is in accordance with culturally respectful and socially responsible guidelines.

Far from apolitical, the two conflicting stances of racial advocacy vs. "colorblindness" have long been respectively associated, respectively, with the political left and right in the United States through issues such as multiculturalism, affirmative action, and equal rights.[85] This division is not a clear split though; Meghan Burke showed how whites across the political spectrum have claimed colorblindness as a strategy for constructing a "good white self" in response to racial issues.[86] Growing out of Martin Luther King Jr.'s famous plea to judge by the content of a person's character (or in musical circles, judging a musician by their playing abilities), colorblindness takes the initial sentiment of avoiding racial judgement to the level of denying racial differences altogether. While this appears to be an obvious positive step in the direction of transcending racism, it also has the potential to make racism invisible.[87] Critical race

---

[85] Kat Chow, "'Politically Correct': The Phrase Has Gone From Wisdom To Weapon," *NPR,* posted Dec 14th, 2016, accessed Aug 3rd, 2020, https://www.npr.org/sections/codeswitch/2016/12/14/505324427/politically-correct-the-phrase-has-gone-from-wisdom-to-weapon.

[86] Meghan Burke, "Racing Left and Right: Color-Blind Racism's Dominance Across the U.S. Political Spectrum," *The Sociological Quarterly* Vol 58, Issue 2 (2017), accessed Sep 3rd, 2020, https://doi.org/10.1080/00380253.2017.1296335.

[87] Leonard Feather championed racial integration and conducted his "blindfold tests" of musicians to dispel the notion that one could hear a distinct racial quality in the music. See: John Gennari, *Blowin' Hot and Cool,* (Chicago: University of Chicago press, 2006), 56.

theorists like Rachel Alicia Griffin suggest that colorblindness claims often have the effect of obscuring the omnipresence of racism and white power structures rather than dismantling them.[88] Following this perspective, an ideological stance like "music is apolitical" denies the complexity of the issue and obscures any racially problematic practices.

In the Dixieland debate, fans with opposing philosophies often accuse others of revising history to suit their interests. The pro-Dixielanders suggest that tearing down terminology (like Civil War monuments) is an effort to pretend it did not happen, while those who reject the "D-word" insist that we should not perpetuate a historical narrative that doesn't address racial and social contexts. Like historians involved with the controversy over Civil War monuments, I seek to provide context for the genre labels of Dixieland jazz in order to understand the complex interactions of race, fantasy, and white guilt. Unfortunately, this is not a straightforward process of drawing a line designating the non-racist things from the racist. Regarding the legacy of Civil War monuments, historian James Grossman asks, beyond the most famous figures of the conflict, "Where does our line fall with regard to innumerable others who are part and parcel of the long and complex history of American racism?"[89]

---

[88] Rachel Alicia Griffin, "The Disgrace of Commodification and Shameful Convenience: A Critical Race Critique of the NBA," *Journal of Black Studies* 43, no. 2 (2012): 175.
[89] James Grossman, "Whose Memory? Whose Monuments? History, Commemoration, and the Struggle for an Ethical Past," *Perspectives on History* 54, no. 2 (2016), accessed Aug 3, 2020, https://www.historians.org/publications-and-directories/perspectives-on-history/february-2016/whose-memory-whose-monuments-history-commemoration-and-the-struggle-for-an-ethical-past.

Taking on the challenge of sorting through this complex history, my research in this chapter focuses on the evolution of genre labels and how they express our personal desires through music and ideology. My intention is to explore the discursive history of stylistic labels (such as "Dixieland," "Trad," "Traditional," and "New Orleans Jazz") using language drawn from historical newspapers, periodicals, oral histories, books, and other media in order to show how these labels have been applied and associated. "Dixieland" specifically takes a special focus given recent controversy over the word. I note the ways which Dixieland reinforces nostalgic interpretations of the antebellum American south and contributes to racist views and oppressive stereotypes. Nostalgic and exotic interpretations of the American South were and are a widely appealing, powerful marketing aesthetic. The many interpretations of "Dixieland" among fans signal that the varied fantasies of Dixieland, New Orleans, and traditional jazz have been appropriated in diverse ways to suit a variety of unspoken desires.

In the minstrel show era of the 19th through early 20th centuries, songs of the carefree plantation "darky" longing for the good old days in the south validated notions that black people were not prepared for individual freedom and that southern whites had provided them a happy existence as benevolent slave masters. In order to justify slavery, George Fitzhugh argued that "'the Negro slaves of the South are the happiest, and in some respects, the freest people in the world,' spending 'the balance of their time… in perfect abandon,' enjoying 'contentment with the present, and confident assurance of the future.'"[90] As the immense popularity of minstrel shows suggests, these stereotypes were

[90] Fitzhugh, 1806-1881, quoted in James Cobb, *Away Down South: A History of Southern Identity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 46.

clearly attractive to the American public regardless of their truthfulness. Whether out of a personal longing for release from the cares of the world or a validation of white supremacy, Karl Hagstrom Miller adds that audiences were hungry for these types of narratives: "Minstrel authenticity was not rooted in history, heritage, or collective memory. It was founded on consensus. Like visitors to P.T. Barnum's museum, minstrel fans decided to embrace the blackface humbug. It was real to the extent that those present were willing to call it so."[91] In other words, early descriptions of black culture and black music were constructed most prominently from what audiences wanted to hear and what they found entertaining. Minstrelsy would curate appealing fantasies of Dixieland as the sunny south full of friendly people, beautiful landscapes, indulgent lifestyles, and carefree days. These highly marketable aspects which made the Southern experience a travel fantasy which could be sold in shows, revues, restaurants, literature, and of course, music. Many of these portrayals utilized comfortable stereotypes of southern gentlemen, lovely ladies, happy and harmless slaves in order to sell many of the positive characteristics of white aristocratic life without the guilt of human enslavement.[92]

As American folklorists gained more prominence in the 1920s, New Orleans jazz came to be seen as an isolated folk culture; a prehistory of the nation's current popular music. In New Orleans jazz, hot record collectors heard reflections of their desires for a simpler, more emotional approach to life (folk-like qualities) as opposed to the onslaught

---

[91] Karl Hagstrom Miller, *Segregating Sound: Inventing Folk and Pop Music in the Age of Jim Crow* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010), 5.

[92] Eileen Southern notes that at the time of the Civil War only about a quarter of southern whites held slaves. The wealthy planter class was therefore an elite white minority. See Eileen Southern, *The Music of Black Americans,* 3d ed. (New York: Norton, 1997), 151.

of swing modernity. While on the surface, folklore studies were much more credible than blackface performers, folklorists' notions about authentic folk music were not factually based. The port city of New Orleans was anything but an isolated folk culture, and New Orleans musicians were no less interested in commercial profit from their art than musicians in any other city.[93] Through their writings, hot record collectors would attempt to shape jazz music into the folk past they desired, music made by humble, community-minded black men, playing a raw emotional music which could aesthetically counter the modernism of the day.

This opposition of "traditional" music against "modern" bebop in the 1940s and '50s along with revivals based in San Francisco and Great Britain would further curate/complicate the concept of "traditional jazz." Individual artists and communities reemphasized certain aspects of folk culture and imaginatively reinvented others. With bebop's rise to "art music" status, pre-bop styles which were previously maintained as separate aesthetics and communities became lumped together in the jazz press under the "traditional" label in such a way that the term becomes overly broad. More than the terminology they used, these revivals are more important for the way that they shape the rules of participation in the music. The dynamics of who is allowed to reinvent the music, how it is used, and how liberal one can be came to be defined once again primarily by white men. In some ways this circumscribes the ideal "traditional" artist in a narrow category which I believe can be a barrier to black musicians.

[93] Bruce Boyd Raeburn, *New Orleans Style and the Writing of American Jazz History* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2009), 134.

The association of jazz with New Orleans (beginning with the ODJB in 1917) also carried a host of new possibilities as the city carried extensive exotic potential—so much so that the tourism industry could cultivate both a thriving reputation for sexual promiscuity (in the 1930s) and a family-friendly Disneyland attraction (in 1959). Racism figured in all of these settings presenting highly curated images of black people to enhance their exotic appeal, minimize them as a threat, and downplay their role in the economic infrastructure of the city. Building on the earlier fantasies of Dixieland, New Orleans tourism manufactures experiences of a city with old world charm, opulent lifestyles, and exotic wonders.

While many of the historical examples of racism in Dixieland might be easier to dismiss, "Dixieland" was more explicitly employed during the civil rights era (specifically 1966-71), in expressing white resentment and racism through the broader category of southern pride. Regardless of their stances on racial issues, musicians recognized that harnessing white resentment and the rebel spirit was financially lucrative. While some like Johnny Rebel would express racist ideas explicitly, others like Lynyrd Skynyrd and Hank Williams tapped the white southern male market by encoding appealing (not necessarily racial) aspects of Dixieland into their music.

Considering how terms like "Dixieland" and "traditional jazz" shifted in meaning through the 20th century, my goal is not necessarily to define these genres objectively. Rather, I am concerned with how these labels function as Benjamin Filene's "ciphers waiting to be filled" with predominant desires and narratives.[94] For instance, I believe my

---

[94] Benjamin Filene, *Romancing the Folk: Public Memory & American Roots Music* (Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press, 2000), 3.

research shows how "Dixieland" has offered greater (and more harmful) access to romanticized southern pasts than have related terms such as "traditional jazz" or "New Orleans jazz?" This being said, all of the labels carry limiting and racist potential and simply determining the most ethical language does little to address the underlying tensions of race and community. By highlighting the way these words have been used and discussing the contexts or their curation, I aim to inspire greater awareness of how these genre labels portray traditional jazz and encourage greater social responsibility and diversity.

Minstrel Origins – Playing With Masks

Musicologist Hans Nathan pinpoints the minstrel Dan Emmett (who supposedly authored and performed the tune "Dixie's Land" in 1859) as the figure who "circulated [the term 'Dixie'] widely and thus persuaded all Americans to include it in their vocabulary."[95] My own study of historical newspapers supports Nathan's claim, as prior to 1859, references to Dixie are merely personal names. With the immense popularity of Emmett's tune throughout the nation, southern secession beginning in 1860, and the adoption of "Dixie" as the de facto anthem of the confederacy (played at Jefferson Davis's inauguration), usage of the word "Dixieland" to designate the entire south

[95] Hans Nathan, *Dan Emmett and the Rise of Early Negro Minstrelsy* (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1962), 266. I say "supposedly" here because other scholars have investigated the claim that Emmett merely learned the tune from Ben and Lew Snowden, two black musicians who were based in rural Ohio. See Howard L. Sacks and Judith Rose Sacks, *Way Up North in Dixie* (Chicago, Il: University of Illinois Press, 2003).

becomes increasingly common.[96] Given the tune's great popularity and the widespread adoption of the term, many have speculated that the word initially referred to the ten dollar note (or "dix" per the inscribed French name) issued by the bank of *Banque des Citoyens de la Louisiane*.[97] Another theory springs from a story about a wealthy slaveowner in Manhattan named "Dixy" with too many slaves and little work to be done on his farm who ended up selling his slaves off to labor on plantations in the south. Subsequent longing for "Dixie's land" was said to be common among these slaves who yearned for their carefree lives up north.[98] Such longing was also taken to mean, according to *The Hartford Courant*, a general "negro idea of Heaven."[99] Nathan held little faith in these explanations and explored other trails such as the phrase "I wish I was in Dixie's land" being a common saying among travelling showmen heading south for the winter before 1859, "Dixie" as a foolish and unintelligent negro character stereotype in minstrel shows, A New York children's game of tag known as "Dixie's land" which

---

[96] "News Items," *Hartford Daily Courant,* Dec 6th, 1860, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant, pg 2 mentions "I wish I was in Dixie!" (chorus to Emmett's tune) as a popular "Yell and Frenzy" in New Orleans. Christian McWhirter, *Battle Hymns: The Power and Popularity of Music in the Civil War* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2012), 66-67 suggests that the song initially came to New Orleans with the burlesque *Pocohontas* in 1860. The song was chosen for Davis's inauguration not by Davis himself, but the bandmaster Herman F. Arnold. "Arnold recalled that, after the ceremony, Davis told him 'he wanted to make Dixie the national air of the South.'"
[97] "Term 'Dixie' Debated Once More; New Orleans Calls Origin French," *The New York Times,* Sep 25th, 1927, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The New York Times, pg XX11. Hans Nathan finds this particular origin story improbable as all the other bills issued by the bank also had French names and the lesser amounts had greater circulation than the ten dollar note. Nathan, *Dan Emmett and the Rise of Early Negro Minstrelsy*, 264.
[98] Ibid.
[99] "News Items," *Hartford Daily Courant,* Dec 6th, 1860, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant, pg 2

may have existed prior to Emmett's publication, and potential connection with the Mason-Dixon line as it was integral in the debates leading to the Missouri compromise in 1820.[100]

While none of these origin stories can be corroborated with substantial evidence, I think it a valuable takeaway to note that "Dixie" and "Dixieland" have taken root in our national vocabulary through portrayals of black people in unflattering terms designed to entertain a white public. For example, one newspaper article addressed the "remarkable age attained by negroes" in Dixieland offering the explanation that they simply did not know how to do arithmetic and were overcalculating their ages.[101] Minstrels played off these public attitudes to design their acts. In Dan Emmett's words, his walk-around songs (such as "Dixie") were an imitation of "the habits and crude ideas of the slaves of the South' whose 'knowledge of the world at large was very limited."[102] Matthew Morrison writes that such minstrel imitations were usually gross exaggerations that helped cement negative stereotypes of black people in society at large:

> [W]hen the ethnic white gaze, on and off the stage, connected (vaguely) similar performance scripts of blackface to the actual bodies of African Americans, these racialized scripts became conflated with the real lives of blacks in America. The stereo- typed performance of the 'plantation darky' was grafted onto the ontology of blackness within the structures of antebellum American slave society.[103]

---

[100] Nathan, *Dan Emmett and the Rise of Early Negro Minstrelsy,* 262-266.
[101] "It's all in the Count," *The Washington Post,* April 12, 1903, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post, pg E6.
[102] Clayton Henderson, "Minstrelsy, American," *Oxford Music Online,* Jan 20th, 2001, accessed Jun 14th, 2020, https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.18749.
[103] Matthew Morrison, "Race, Blacksound, and the (Re)Making of Musicological Discourse," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 72, no. 3 (2019): 800.

Stereotypes of the past like "Mammy, Sapphire, Jezebel, Jim Crow, Sambo, Zip Coon, pickaninny, and Stepin Fetchit," helped engrain social prejudice and sustain modern racial stereotypes such as "welfare queen, prostitute, rapist, drug addict, prison inmate, etc" which propagate "physical violence, poverty, institutional racism, and second-class citizenry for blacks."[104]

Beyond propagating such stereotypes, these songs also downplay the horrors inflicted upon enslaved people and minimize their human needs. Lyrics such as "Sugar in de gourd, an' stony batter - De whites grow fat, an' de niggars fatter" and "In Dixie lann de darkies grow - If white foax only plant dar toe"[105] portray a carefree existence of all-you-can-eat pancakes and a natural ability to thrive in inhumane circumstances.[106] An article from the *Washington Post* in 1905 entitled "Ways of the Pickaninny – Always Fat and Happy and Fond of White Folks" offers more insight into how black people were seen as naturally hardy and lacking compassion citing that black mothers train their children from an early age to "thrive on neglect" with their lack of concern for their offspring. Their natural self-sufficiency, the *Post* article claims, allows a white audience to simultaneously be concerned for the suffering black child but also not assume responsibility for their well-being. "No one has ever heard of a delicate little negro. Occasionally one dies, to be sure, but neglect cannot be ascribed as the cause of its

---

[104] Ibid, 799. Morrison is quoting Patrick E. Johnson, *Appropriating Blackness: Performance and the Politics of Authenticity* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003), 4.
[105] Ibid, 251-2.
[106] I interpret the phrase "plant dar toe" figuratively in equating providing for slaves with caring for low maintenance plants, yet the literal interpretation of cutting off a person's toe for any reason is also a disturbing possibility.

demise, for if neglect could kill them, there would be no pickaninnies in Dixieland today."[107] White masters who provided for a slave's minimal needs (planting their toe) are depicted as subsidizing a supposedly carefree existence (as in the Dixy legend) and reaffirming the ideology that slaves were content with their situation (a perspective which was crucial in validating slavery as an acceptable and humane practice).[108]

While these stereotypes are problematic, many at the time viewed minstrelsy as though it was an authentic reflection of African-American experience. Nineteenth-century intellectual and religious minds borrowed from minstrel stereotypes when they proclaimed inherent biological differences between the races and portrayed black men in the same emotional terms as women: primarily emotional. Historian Eric Lott analyzes the mild, gentle, and self-sacrificing traits of black characters in Harriet Beecher Stowe's *Uncle Tom's Cabin* and Mark Twain's *Huckleberry Finn* to show how even the most prominent antislavery rhetoric of the time was primarily based on black people as they existed in the white imagination.[109] Even figures like W.E.B DuBois and James Weldon Johnson considered minstrelsy a valuable contribution to American music. Speaking of their endorsements, Lott adds:

> These judgments appear terribly misguided now, given that blackface minstrelsy's century-long commercial regulation of black cultural practices stalled the development of African-American public arts and generated an enduring narrative

---

[107] "Ways of the Pickaninny – Always Fat and Happy and Fond of White Folks," *The Washington Post,* Jan 10th, 1905, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post, pg 14.

[108] Cobb suggests that Harriet Beecher Stowe's *Uncle Tom's Cabin* was influential for the way "she confronted southern whites with the reality that their slaves might indeed feel kindly toward them and still yearn passionately to be free"—a philosophy which would not have been entertained in public southern society. Cobb, *Away Down South*, 32.

[109] Eric Lott, *Love and Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2013), 33-34.

> of racist ideology, a historical process by which an entire people has been made the bearer of another people's "folk" culture. We ought nonetheless to know how such positive assessments of the minstrel show were possible as well as wrong. Without a fuller understanding of blackface performance, one that includes the intensely conflicted set of responses it called forth, we miss the part it played in the racial politics of its time— the extent to which, for that matter, it was the racial politics of its time[110]

These stereotypes then, however flawed, would have been considered accurate depictions for many of the common public leading to the further perpetuation of the negative stereotypes Morrison identified.

In reality, what posed as an authentic portrayal was much more accurately a reflection of the flights of white imagination. Lott suggests that "The black mask offered a way to play with collective fears of a degraded and threatening— and male— Other while at the same time maintaining some symbolic control over them."[111] Assuming masks also allowed white men to play with behaviors and emotions outside the accepted realm of masculinity (as evidenced by situations ranging from cross-dressing as black wenches on the stage or blackening their faces before riotous displays of emotion and political violence).[112] While I previously outlined the ways in which unflattering black stereotypes reaffirmed a southern slaveholding white perspective, it was actually Northern working-class white masculine culture (with its distance from southern plantations) which sustained and developed the minstrel industry.[113]

These minstrel origins highlight the ways in which "Dixie" and "Dixieland" entered the common usage of the American public. Their unflattering portrayals of

---

[110] Ibid, 17.
[111] Ibid, 26.
[112] Ibid, 28-30.
[113] Ibid, 39.

African-Americans—though masquerading as authentic—were constructed unscientifically by white working-class entertainers playing with underlying fears, longings, and curiosities which resonated with their white audiences. The minstrel tradition carried extensive consequences in problematic representation, yet as we shall see, these entertainers cleared ground for Dixieland as a land of fantasy, indulgence, and exoticism which many could appropriate to their desires.

Dixieland the Brand – Comforting Stereotypes

"Dixie" the song was freely adapted to many different identities, a process which would transform minstrel crafted Dixieland into a more malleable nostalgic product for white audiences to consume. While the song is perhaps best known as the anthem of the Southern Confederacy, English scholar Coleman Hutchison shows how the tune was just as popular in the Northern states (a favorite of Abraham Lincoln,) and endless variations on the song lyrics were invented. In particular, Hutchison argues that these revisions were made possible by an 1860 New Orleans publication which replaced black minstrel dialect with more standardized anglicized words (circulated before Emmett secured copyright), effectively whitewashing the lyrics and weakening the connection between the verses and chorus so that subsequent arrangers might be free to take or leave whatever served their ideological focus.[114] This malleable view of "Dixieland" as the south in general

---

[114] Coleman Hutchison, "Whistling Dixie for the Union (Nation, Anthem, Revision)," *American Literary History* Vol 19, no. 3 (2007): 615. Hutchison references: Nathan, *Dan Emmett and the Rise of Early Negro Minstrelsy,* 260.

potentially appropriates the appealing aspects of "the negro idea of Heaven" (where there is no work to be done and food is abundant) inviting all to partake in nostalgic longing for the past of our choosing. Furthermore, "in attempting to erase the racialized setting and personae of the song, this revision allowed (white) audiences to make a much broader set of identifications with the first verse and chorus's sense of longing: 'I wish I was in the land of Dixie . . . To live and die in Dixie's land.' In this articulation, one need not be either a minstrel or of African descent to participate in such a sense of place."[115] Such a path of nostalgic appropriation is not one many people would publicly admit following, yet the unconscious construction of our desires and fantasies has likely led many of us there in one form or another. Using a tune as raw material to express our own ideas is a powerful concept and carries no requirement that we resolve every underlying association (yet we can never prevent listeners from making associations with the past work). Other scholars have described the conversation between past and present works of art as "pentimento" (painting over an existing painting) or "palimpsest" (recycling parchment for a new manuscript).[116] To illustrate this concept, Abraham Lincoln's famous request for the band to play "Dixie" at the end of the Civil War builds on the significance the tune gained as an anthem for the confederate army (with lyrics such as: Southrons, hear ye Country call ye! Up! Lest worse than death befall you! To arms! To arms! To arms! In Dixie!). Through many different versions of the lyrics—sung on both

[115] Ibid.
[116]Faithe Barrett, *To Fight Aloud is Very Brave* (Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 2012), 19.

sides of the war—the song grew to symbolize competing brands of patriotism and ideology layered over its minstrel origins.

Ultimately, the Civil war intensified regional differences and paved the way for a more clearly defined (and marketable) Dixieland with a distinct southern character. Indeed, writer/critic Robert Penn Warren (writing in 1980) identified "the moment where Lee handed Grant his sword" as the moment where "Southern identity truly blossomed."[117] Developing out of the "Lost Cause" ideology, a broader notion of Southern identity nurtured stereotypes such as the pure, beautiful, and sweetly naïve Southern girl, and the honorable Confederate patriot. A few examples from newspapers include: an article by novelist Julia Magruder on traits of the southern woman, a report of a southern girl saving a man's life with her smile, an obituary for Confederate General John B. Gordon, and a Georgia sheriff who was moved to tears and a patriotic speech by a performance of "Dixie" while abroad in London.[118] Marion Clifford Harrison's 1921 dissertation on "Social Types in

THE SOUTHERN GIRL

Julia Magruder, the Clever Novelist of Dixie-land,

Tells of the Sweet-voiced Damsels of Her Sunny Southern Home.

More Beauty if Less Style—Sweeter, Though not so Learned—Compared with Girls of Other Sections.

Figure 1. Julia Magruder, "The Southern Girl," *Los Angeles Times,* Nov 11th, 1894, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times, pg 19.

[117] Cobb, *Away Down South,* 60. Cobb is quoting: Robert Penn Warren, *Jefferson Davis Gets His Citizenship Back* (Lexington, KY, 1980), 59.

[118] Julia Magruder, "The Southern Girl," *Los Angeles Times,* Nov 11th, 1894, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times, pg 19. Alan S. Rogers, "How a Girl Who Smiled Saved a Young Man's Life," *The Atlanta Constitution,* July 27th, 1903, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Atlanta Constitution, pg. 4. "Vale, General Gordon," *The Atlanta Constitution,* Jan 13th, 1904, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Atlanta Constitution, pg. 4. Allan Rogers, "The Georgia Sheriff hears "Dixie" in London," *The Atlanta Constitution,* May 16th, 1903, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Atlanta Constitution, pg. 2.

Southern Prose Fiction" offers a detailed discussion of literature which features the "local color" of distinctly southern characters (pioneers, Indians, landed aristocrats, negros, creoles, crackers, mountaineers, and confederate soldiers). He comments on the "nation-wide appeal" of these stories and highly appraises their value: "No one can ask that this literature be decolorized. 'No national point of view,' writes Montrose J. Moses, should take from the South its characteristics or individuality, due to environment and inheritance; the broader culture should only deepen and enrich those permanent traits which must be protected and nurtured for years to come."[119] While minstrelsy offered a flexible framework for creatively reimagining Dixieland, these stereotypes played to the emotions of the public and created a grander scaffolding paving the way for Dixieland tourism.

The development of the unique character of Dixieland coincides with what tourism scholar David Bruce refers to as "the golden age of cultural tourism" (specifically the century between 1814-1914). While the wealthy had long been able to afford and enjoy travel, these years mark a transitional period where the aristocratic tradition of a Grand Tour of the high culture through continental Europe became more accessible to less wealthy patrons through railways, steamships, guidebooks, and tourism packages like Thomas Cook's continental tours.[120] Such an increase in affordable tourism also spurred an increase in exotic representations of other cultures as those in the

---

[119] Marion Clifford Harrison, "Social Types in Southern Prose Fiction" (PhD diss., University of Virginia, 1921), 193.

[120] David Bruce, "The Ninteenth-Century 'Golden age' of Tourism: How the Beaten Track of the Intellectuals Became the Modern Tourist Trail," in *The Routledge Handbook of Cultural Tourism* ed. Melanie Smith and Greg Richards (London: Taylor & Francis Group, 2013), 11.

entertainment industry saw an opportunity to sell travel without the travelling. Contemporary bandleader Vince Giordano described a similar trend based on his extensive work with music of the 1920s:

> There was a lot of that dreaming and thinking about going to exotic places. There was a Hawaiian movement at the time, you know, where - not a movement but just the whole slew of songs about going to dreamy Hawaii and, you know, everything is so calm. And the ukuleles are playing and possibly people aren't wearing too many clothes… You know, and that excited people. And then there was a Mideast period where people were going, you know, to the sheik of Arabi, you know, with Rudolph Valentino. I think people had all these little fantasies of what it was like to be in another place to get away from their boring lives… I mean, when I met Irving Caesar who wrote "Swanee," you know, which was a big hit for Al Jolson and George Grisham, and he says as far south as I've got was Atlantic City. He says I've never been down South. But here he is writing about the South. And I think they were trying to get the imagination of people, of the folks listening to this, going and all excited about a new exotic place.[121]

Special SUNDAY DINNER $1.50
AND AN EXCEPTIONAL BEEFSTEAK DINNER $1.50
SERVED FROM 6 TO 9 P. M.
With Elaborate Entertainment Features, Including
SERVED IN THE "400 CLUB" ROOM.
The First Eastern Appearance of the
FAMOUS ORIGINAL DIXIELAND
"JAZZ BAND"
Untuneful Harmonists Playing "Peppery" Melodies
NIGHTLY AT MIDNIGHT GUS EDWARDS' INTERNATIONAL REVUE
With Mons. Vilani, Lillian Boardman and 8 Beauty Roses
GUS EDWARDS' NEWEST REVUE "ROUND THE CIRCLE"
Featuring Ruby Norton and Sammy Lee and a Company of 30
TWICE NIGHTLY AT 7:30 AND MIDNIGHT
JONIA and her SISTER Heavenly Hawaiian Twins with their South Sea Troubadours
Private Dining Rooms, Banquet Halls, Ball Rooms, Beefsteak Grill for Socials, etc. Catering.
REISENWEBER'S
NEW YORK'S NEWEST, LARGEST AND BEST EQUIPPED RESTAURANT.
COLUMBUS CIRCLE & 58TH STREET

Figure 2. "Display Ad 87 – No Title," *New York Times,* Feb 4th, 1917, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: New York Times, X9.

Following this trend, when the Original Dixieland Jass Band (ODJB) became a sensation in 1917, their advertisements at Reisenweber's in New York pair them with a "Special Southern Dinner" as well as other geographical novelties such as an "international revue" and the "Heavenly Hawaiian Twins with

Figure 3. "Ching A Ling's Jazz Bazaar," *Gonzaga Digital Archives,* 1920, accessed July 27th, 2020, https://digital.gonzaga.edu/digital/collection/p15486coll3/id/10136/.

[121] "Vince Giordano: The Fresh Air Interview," WUWF: NPR for Florida's Great Northwest, Nov 6th, 2013, accessed Feb 1st, 2021, https://www.wuwf.org/post/vince-giordano-fresh-air-interview#stream/0.

their South Sea Troubadours."[122] Ken Burn's *Jazz* documentary mentions that the ODJB recordings spawned a great number of tunes grafting in a "jazz" seasoning in hopes of latching onto the public craze. "Ching a Ling's Jazz Bazaar" for example, offers a cultural mashup of stereotyped Chinese and black exotic appeal.[123] Thus, entertainers of the era freely combined and re-combined the elements of difference they felt would make their acts stand out while simultaneously shaping public notions of the Other. Miller attributed "the very idea of southern musical distinctiveness" to "the movements of southern migrants and northern touring shows, the actions of northern scholars and southern informants, and the visions of racial and cultural differences culled from New York and Atlanta, China, and Mexico."[124] Along similar lines as minstrelsy, this robust early-twentieth-century entertainment and tourism industry continued to shape ethnic stereotypes into the most attractive forms for the American public to consume in support of their business interests.

In order to sell these exotic cultural products, the exciting and appealing elements of culture are exaggerated and celebrated, while the undesirable elements are minimized or eliminated altogether. Applying this business plan to Dixieland, the obvious dilemma is the same as minstrelsy: how to sell the experience of the south without guilt over slavery. Reaching further into the twentieth century, the desirable elements of Dixieland themed attractions are legible to the public as an entertainment aesthetic; a fantasy of a natural paradise with friendly faces, and lack of worldly stresses. While some nightclub

[122] "Display Ad 87 – No Title," *New York Times,* Feb 4th, 1917, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: New York Times, X9.
[123] *Jazz,* "Episode 1 – Gumbo," directed by Ken Burns, PBS, 2001, film, 1:17:02.
[124] Miller, *Segregating Sound,* 8.

entertainment promoted blackness as exotic and somewhat dangerous, many of these attractions feature a more family-friendly context where black people are portrayed as novelty, yet do not threaten the carefree fantasy with their presence. Examples featured in the newspapers through the 1920s and 30s include: dancing, dinner, and entertainment venues such as “Dixieland” in Connecticut or Florence Mills “Moonlight in Dixie” revue at the Plantation Club of New York; Tuesdays becoming “Dixieland Night” at Chevy Chase Lake amusement park (complete with “bright little colored entertainers” who are “real magnets for the crowd”); and an old south “all day and evening affair” sponsored by the United Daughters of the Confederacy (complete with a bake sale booth operated by a “black mammy of Dixieland” impersonator).[125] Seeing the rows of smiling faces (black and white) from a Connecticut school play entitled “Club Dixieland” suggests an

Cast of ‘Club Dixieland’ to Be Given By Pupils of the Northwest School Today

Courant Photos.

Above is shown a part of the cast appearing in the dramatic production, "Club Dixieland," to be given today at 3:30 p. m. in the Northwest School auditorium by pupils of the schools under the auspices of the Parent-Teacher Association and repeated Saturday at 8 p. m.

Back row, left to right: Herbert Sleeper, Myrtle Dohm, Jane DiAngelo, Josephine Rombole, Joseph Lombardo, Herbert Leibert, Michael DiBello, Gordon Pearl, Irving Philips, Lena Toscano, Ethel Gorfin, Fae Ell'n, and James Butler.

Middle row, left to right: Joyce Fraser, Shirley Welson, Mildred Rutt, Janet Cooley, Ethel Lutwack, Muriel Hess, Ida Freedman, Irma Malley, Janet Barton, Millicent Bolling, Dorothy Lopez, Marjorie Gross, Delores Paulsen and Frank Golden.

Front row, left to right: Angelo Paranes, Paul Daviduke, Arthur Wasserman, Seymour Weingroff, Myrin Levine, Irving Bernstein, Marion Levy, George Ellingwood, Jane Wilsen, Roslyn Kruh, John Shaw, Ethel Freeman and Ethel Melicovski.

Figure 4. “Cast of ‘Club Dixieland’ to Be Given By Pupils of the Northwest School Today,” *The Hartford Courant,* Feb 21st, 1936, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant, Pg. 14.

[125] “Dixieland Ideal Place for Impromptu Parties,” *The Hartford Courant,* May 16th, 1926, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant, Pg. C4. “Moonlight in Dixie,” *The Chicago Defender,* Mar 11, 1922, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Chicago Defender, pg. 9. “Chevy Chase Lake,” *The Washington Post,* Aug 2nd, 1925, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post, Pg. F3. “United Daughters of the Confederacy,” *Los Angeles Times,* April 15th, 1924, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times, Pg. A7.

evolving audience beyond the largely male working-class audiences of minstrelsy.[126] While none of these events demonstrate that the fear and fascination with black people Lott described had become sufficiently tame, the greater representation of Northern women and children both black and white enjoying an imagined Dixieland suggests that nostalgia and fantasy had sufficiently dissociated Dixieland from slavery and interracial conflict to place greater focus on a carefree land of milk and honey.

As businesses were able to remove blackness from figuring prominently in a Dixieland fantasy, they created a broadly appealing product but also made racial injustice comfortably invisible for white audiences. For instance, the lyrics of the 1936 #1 hit for Jimmy Dorsey's band (Bob Eberly – vocalist) "Is it True What they Say About Dixie?" present the South as a nostalgic canvas onto which Americans could project their dreams and idealizations that is notably absent of any lyrical or visual references to African-Americans:

> Is it true what they say about Dixie?
> Does the sun really shine all the time?
> Do the sweet magnolias blossom at everybody's door?
> Do folks keep eating possum
> Till they can't eat no more?
> Is it true what they say about Swanee?
> Is a dream by that stream so sublime?
> Do they laugh, do they love, like they say in every song?
> If it's true, that's where I belong.

Blackface star Al Jolson's (white) recording of the song in 1948 near the end of his life, featuring the Mills Brothers quartet (black), shows a seemingly race-transcendent version

[126] "Cast of 'Club Dixieland' to Be Given By Pupils of the Northwest School Today," *The Hartford Courant,* Feb 21st, 1936, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant, Pg. 14. As opposed to: Lott, *Love and Theft,* 8.

of Dixie.[127] Alan Lefkowitz's celebratory YouTube comment "no racism here!" stands out affirming this mixed-race artistic collaboration (and mixed representation of black music from minstrel to modern swing) as a window into a Dixie where all are welcome to enjoy the sunny south.[128] The racial representation is further complicated by how Jolson (white) sings the lead vocal in a minstrel-style black dialect while the Mills Brothers (black) provide a sophisticated acapella-plus-guitar background with tight vocal harmonies imitating horns. Though Jolson's minstrelsy might seem racist to our modern perception, film, media, and theater scholar Charles Musser's research clarifies that Jolson was known for his preferences to work with and support black artists and his performances were well-received in black communities.[129] The recording in many ways seems to have overcome the racial difficulties of the past, yet the commercial branding of Dixie as disassociated from race often only masks racism rather than addresses it. The *Baltimore Afro-American* reported on this tension in 1933 pointing out how headlines playing up the picturesque "Smiling Cotton Fields Way Down in Dixieland," ignore the nightly raids of the Klu Klux Klan in Tuscaloosa, Alabama.[130] In this context, visions of

---

[127] lennon1252, "AL JOLSON & THE MILLS BROTHERS - IS IT TRUE WHAT THEY SAY ABOUT DIXIE?," YouTube Video, 2:43, July 28th, 2017, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iIZp1dqiQv8. User CarlDuke notes that this recording was recorded during the 1948 AFM recording ban and was made possible because it was mostly acapella (Norman Brown, the Mills Brothers guitarist was considered a stage performer rather than a musician and granted an exception).
[128] Alan Lefkowitz, 2019, comment on: lennon1252, "AL JOLSON & THE MILLS BROTHERS…"
[129] Charles Musser, "Why Did Negroes Love Al Jolson and The Jazz Singer?: Melodrama, Blackface and Cosmopolitan Theatrical Culture," *Film History: An International Journal* 23, No. 2 (2011): 204-212.
[130] Geraldine Sartain, "Smiling Cotton Fields Way Down in Dixieland," *Baltimore Afro American,* Dec 2nd, 1933, Proquest Historical Newspapers: The Baltimore Afro-American, pg 17.

race-transcendent Dixieland were partially responsible for sweeping such violence and discrimination under the rug until the Civil Rights movements began more than 20 years later. The Jolson-Mills Brothers performance of "Dixie" also illustrates the culturally acceptable frameworks for blackness: though not in blackface, Jolson assumes the established black minstrel stereotype of Dixieland, while the Mills Brothers perform a more "respectable" style. Judging from contemporary comments like "No saggy trousers or F-bombs here! Thanks for a breath of fresh air from one of the classiest families of music in history," I believe that these same expectations of appropriate participation continue to resonate.[131] While seemingly offering a compliment, the commentor actually reiterates judgements about the preferred bounding of black culture. In this particular race-transcendent Dixieland fantasy, black people are welcome only if they behave as white people believe black people should.

Hot Collectors – Defining Separate Racial Histories of Jazz

While the tourism and entertainment industries were capitalizing on the Dixieland fantasy, young white men at Ivy League college campuses in the 1920s had started collecting hot records and writing about jazz music (which led to early definitions of jazz and the beginnings of jazz criticism). Hot collecting was appealing for a number of reasons: Firstly, Raeburn notes that records were "the perfect fetish objects because they provided access to 'forbidden' music without necessitating risky personal contact and

[131] John D, 2019, comment on: lennon1252, "AL JOLSON & THE MILLS BROTHERS…"

were a commodity that could be possessed."[132] Secondly, this thrilling novelty was ennobled with the idea that New Orleans style jazz "represented the unmediated creative potency of an underclass whose cultural products 'trickled up' from the bottom of society, reversing the flow of cultural dynamics as it was then conceived. Jazz came to be regarded as 'folk' music, despite its emergence in a market-driven urban environment."[133] Folk culture's draw stemmed from Herderian philosophy, which Benjamin Filene explains as offering "a way to escape the Enlightenment's stifling emphasis on reason, planning, and universalism in cultural expression. Folk forms could cleanse culture of the artificiality, that he [Johann Gottfried von Herder] felt, was poisoning eighteenth-century modern life."[134] For these hot collectors, their obsession with the music became a pathway for anti-capitalist ideology; an expression of their desires for power outside of the typical pursuit of wealth. Thirdly, hot collecting was a social activity around which collectors bonded through shared connoisseurship. It also offered a chance to impress others with one's expertise. As Krin Gabbard suggests, a "commanding knowledge" of hot records and black artists (knowledge which could not be found in established "bureaucratized institutions") is "a well-established sign of masculine power in contemporary American culture."[135] The social scene established by these collectors and the discourse they molded through their writing is important for the way it established the aesthetic values out of the interests of young white men to define

---

[132] Raeburn, New Orleans Style, 40.
[133] Ibid, 4.
[134] Filene, *Romancing the Folk,* 10.
[135] Krin Gabbard, *Black Magic: White Hollywood and African American Culture* (New Brunswick and London: Rutgers University Press, 2004), 204. Quoted in Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 35-36.

the music of older black men as a distinct genre. Critical analysis of these aesthetic systems helps to expose what Christopher Wells describes as "deeply embedded layers of raced and gendered privilege within jazz's aesthetic system and historical narratives."[136]

As these writers began to construct the history of jazz, there were differing opinions on which race deserved credit for creating the music. Many young white men initially got exposed to jazz through the ODJB recordings of 1917, which sparked their interest and led them to seek out other white artists playing similar styles. As collectors learned more about the music and discovered more artists, records from black artists often became their central focus. Mario Dunkel highlights Marshall Stearns' 1936 "History of Swing" column in *Downbeat* as a pivotal point in the historical narrative balance towards crediting African American sources.[137] The onset of the swing era emphasized the artistry of black artists more prominently, as hot collectors recognized the overblown genius status assigned to white swing bands by the mainstream media. Dunkel notes how the hot collectors' commanding knowledge and connoisseurship gave them greater perspective: "To a minority of jazz aficionados, however, it was obvious that the apparently new music was a mere variation of the 'hot jazz' of the 1920s, which to their knowledge had been pioneered by African American musicians."[138] Much contention would follow as writers attempted to hash out who deserved credit for the music. Responding to writers who favored a black origin like Marshall Stearns and William

---

[136] Christopher Wells, "'A Dreadful Bit of Silliness': Feminine Frivolity and Ella Fitzgerald's Early Critical Reception," *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 21 (2017): 45.
[137] Mario Dunkel, "Marshall Winslow Stearns and the Politics of Jazz Historiography," *American Music* 30, no. 4 (Winter 2012): 473-474.
[138] Ibid, 476.

Russell, ODJB cornetist Nick LaRocca notably asserted: “Many writers have attributed this rhythm that we introduced as something coming from the African jungles and crediting the Negro race with it. My contention is that the Negroes learned to play this rhythm from the whites. The Negro did not play any kind of music equal to white men at any time.”[139] The polarizing debate would lead jazz critics and scholars to perpetuate white, black, and mixed origin stories in jazz.

Significantly, when the first full length critical work on jazz origins (*Jazzmen* 1939) was published by Charles Edward Smith, William Russell, and Frederic Ramsey Jr., Smith wrote an entire chapter entitled “White New Orleans,” where he designated “Dixieland” as the white New Orleans jazz tradition which began with Jack Laine’s Ragtime Band and achieved national fame with the ODJB in 1917-19 (though the term was used loosely).[140] Historically, Laine operated multiple bands which at times included Creoles, Sicilians, light-skinned African Americans, and men with Latin American heritage, choosing to hire them for their playing ability rather than skin color.[141] Accordingly, Smith held the view that jazz in New Orleans had always been multi-racial, though this was not consistent with the African American origins most jazz writers of the time emphasized (his co-authors included). The notion of racially segregated origins for jazz in New Orleans appears to have caught on for some. In 1940, a writer for the *Baltimore Afro-American* proclaimed “There are no colored Dixieland bands, incidentally. Now and then, a colored pick-up unit records in the early N’Orleans style

---

[139] *Jazz,* “Episode 1 – Gumbo,” directed by Ken Burns, PBS, 2001, film, 1:20:31.
[140] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style*, 68.
[141] Ibid, 68-71.

and that's about as close to Dixieland as our musicians ever get."[142] With the precedent of *Jazzmen,* some authors would segregate the history of jazz into a polygenesis of white early jazz = Dixieland and black early jazz = jazz—a lexical dichotomy that would prove impossible to maintain as the music evolved.

As newer styles of jazz were created by musicians and jazz critics sought to define the music and its aesthetics, the genre labels of "jazz" and "Dixieland" would become more hotly contested and would give way to a larger framework of "modern" vs "traditional" jazz. Writers in the jazz press would debate and defend terminology beginning in 1942 with a "war" between swing vs. New Orleans style, and again in 1946, when swing fans found themselves in league with the New Orleans traditionalists as bebop arrived as the new face of modernism. Bernard Gendron outlines the methods of traditionalists as they attempted to exclude swing:

> Wanting the word 'jazz' all to themselves, the revivalists sought to hammer out a precise formula which would clearly oppose jazz to swing. Though they bickered incessantly about the fine details of the proper definition, they agreed that no music could be called 'jazz' which was not collectively improvised, and whose melodies, rhythms, phrasings, and timbres were not primarily derived from African-American sources.[143]

While Gendron focuses on the conflict over the term "jazz," he uses the term "Dixieland" uncritically throughout his article to refer to New Orleans style jazz fans. Actual usage of Dixieland among writers in the 1940s was not so clear cut. Alma Hubner embraced the term in 1944: "Of course we're lunatics, but we like our jazz the way it is. We'll continue

---

[142] "'Dixieland Jazz' Album Released," *Baltimore Afro-American,* Sep 14, 1940, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Baltimore Afro-American, pg. 14.
[143] Bernard Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," Discourse, Vol. 15, No. 3 (Spring 1993): 134, http://www.jstor.org/stable/41389289.

enjoying two-beat Dixieland, and we'll need no progress. Jazz doesn't need it as much as some jazz critics do."[144] In the same year, John Lucas rejected Anton Stepanek's suggestion that "Dixieland" might be a better label for a band like George Lewis's New Orleans Stompers to avoid confusion with more modern styles of jazz, noting that he preferred the language of the Hot Collectors ("the usage to which I am accustomed.")[145] As bebop rose to prominence in 1946 the modernists shifted discussions on jazz aesthetics to accommodate the new music and the foundational schism of "jazz as black New Orleans style" vs "Dixieland as white New Orleans style" began to melt. Fans of pre-bop jazz styles were forced to band together as they defined their preferred aesthetics in relation to bop. Paul Sampson's December 1954 record review column gives some practical advice to family and friends: "It has been a rich year for jazz lovers, with a flood of new records and a number of good reissues. But in choosing Christmas gifts for jazz addicts, make sure of the taste of the intended recipient. Many traditional jazz [fans] detest the modern versions—and vice versa. The decision should not be too difficult, as most jazz fans are quite outspoken about their likes and dislikes."[146] As bebop marked a transition to a higher level of virtuosity and attained status as "art music", the resulting poles of "modern" vs "traditional" would remain an important aesthetic line going forward. However, even as jazz historians had begun to tell the story of jazz through a chronological evolutionary narrative encompassing early jazz through swing and the

---

[144] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 167.
[145] Ibid, 168.
[146] Paul Sampson, "Traditional or Modern: Jazz Records Offer Rich Field," *The Washington Post,* Dec 5, 1954, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post, pg. L6.

modern period, subgenres within the category of “traditional jazz” still remained unresolved and fans each held onto their favorite aesthetics.

Considering the motivations of collectors and revivalists, I find it surprising that white writers preached the African-American origins of jazz so passionately while also asserting their own positions of authority on the music. In my survey of term usage, I find the shifting genre labels and their associations interesting, but I am even more intrigued by the personal stakes of the collectors in preserving jazz as a segregated black folk form. Judging by the motivations of the hot record collectors I identified previously, it seems logical that jazz made by black musicians appealed to their emotions and psychology on a deeper level than mere musical enjoyment. Was it maintaining their hard-won masculine authority on hot music? Celebrating what they felt was an authentic American folk music? Dreading the encroaching taint of modernity which they had initially fled in taking up an interest in hot records? Though Dixieland and jazz would be folded into a broader “traditional” category in juxtaposition to bop, musicians would continue to find inspiration by looking to early tunes by overlooked African-American musicians.

“Braying and Squawking California Fundamentalists”

Adapting to the tastes of modern jazz, many musicians had naturally blended more modern elements and polished instrumental virtuosity into their sound, but the California musicians chose a more retrospective approach. My title here is a quote from a 1956 record review juxtaposing some “Nice Dixieland Stuff” (referring to a more polished Wilbur de Paris recording) with the more retrospective rougher San Francisco

revivalists like Lu Watters and Turk Murphy.[147] To provide some context for the California revivalists I must skip backwards in the timeline once again. In reaction to the homogeneity of the swing era Lu Watters took inspiration from King Oliver's Creole Jazz band (first recorded in 1923) in putting together his 1938 Yerba Buena Jazz Band in San Francisco. His trombonist Turk Murphy said of their origins:

> We were all professional musicians and we were making a living… but we weren't satisfied with what we were doing. We could do casual work and commercial jobs for the rest of our lives, but we were young and full of fire. We thought we should take one longshot at something that needed a shot—the New Orleans jazz of King Oliver and Louis Armstrong and Jelly Roll Morton, which nobody was playing then. So we started this do-or-die attempt to revive the music.[148]
>
> We worked it around to the point where we got something called San Francisco jazz. We use the same instruments they used in New Orleans: cornet, trombone, clarinet, piano, banjo, and tuba. We figured this was a form of music that wasn't basically dependent on solos, the way Dixieland is. There was a spirit of doing things together in the early New Orleans bands—ensemble playing—that's been lost. Each musician is forced to listen to the other to embellish or add to what's being played. There's no spirit of competition. It's one of cooperation.[149]

While the Watters band enjoyed considerable local success, Murphy grew frustrated with Watters's reluctance to go on the road and eventually started his own group in 1949. As the above quotations make clear, Murphy developed some basic style tenets and philosophy trends such as the emphasis on historic instrumentation, the group aesthetic as

---

[147] Maitland Zane, "The Jazz Scene," *The Hartford Courant,* Feb 26, 1956, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Hartford Courant, pg. 12E.
[148] John Wilson, "Turk Murphy to Perform At Carnegie," *New York Times,* Jan 9, 1987, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The New York Times, pg. C20.
[149] Gilbert Millstein, "Turk Murphy, Out of New Orleans Via San Francisco, Reshapes Old Style," *New York Times,* Oct 10, 1954, ProQuest Historical Newspapers; The New York Times, pg. X9.

opposed to a string of solos, and the personal initiative to seek out older New Orleans tunes and rags rather than play standard repertoire warhorses.

The "string of solos" approach Murphy was reacting against had developed in the looser jam session-like format of "Chicago style" jazz groups (Robinson identifies early Chicago style beginning in the late 1920s with stylistic shifts in the 30s and further development through later decades).[150] While difficult to define, the geographical shift from New Orleans and the musical success of young white groups imitating the black musicians they heard on Chicago's South Side distinguish the style from others. On a utilitarian level, some quantify the difference between New Orleans and Chicago in the practical terms of mobile street performance vs nightclub performance. Leaving behind the tuba and banjo (instruments which could easily fit in an advertising truck or wagon), Chicago style rhythm sections of these groups were organized with string bass, guitar, piano, and new drum set innovations.[151] Guitarist and club owner Eddie Condon also emerges as an important figure around whom the looser jam session style of playing developed. While a revivalist appeal to historic instrumentation was certainly valuable in establishing the authenticity of San Francisco groups, I find Murphy's individual vs

---

[150] Definitions of "Chicago Style" have slight variations among fans. I base my conceptions in the following descriptions: David Robinson Jr., "A Traditional Jazz Style Guide," *Traditional Jazz Educators Network,* posted in 2014, http://prjc.org/tjen/styleguide.htm. Also see: Scott Yanow, "Reader Responses to 'Reconsidering Dixieland Jazz: How the Name has Harmed the Music'," *The Syncopated Times,* Oct 18th, 2019, accessed Jun 14th, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/reader-responses-to-reconsidering-dixieland-jazz-how-the-name-has-harmed-the-music/.
[151] Bruce Chidester, "What is the Difference Between New Orleans and Chicago Dixieland Jazz," *The Trumpet Blog,* posted Feb 6, 2015, accessed Aug 10, 2020, http://www.thetrumpetblog.com/what-is-the-difference-between-new-orleans-and-chicago-dixieland-jazz/

group effort ideology much more provocative. Ideologically positioning the collectively improvising ensemble against the personal expression of an individual soloist constructs another aesthetic binary argument with deep ideological potential (like those which Gendron describes). Murphy's call for a spirit of cooperation in the ensemble is essentially a reassertion of the folk ideology of the 1930s. His ideal for traditional jazz is akin to Cecil Sharp's imagined Appalachian mountain folk: "Here no one is 'on the make'; commercial competition and social rivalries are unknown. In this respect, at any rate, they have the advantage over those who spend the greater part of every day in preparing to live, in acquiring the technique of life, rather than its enjoyment."[152] Murphy's traditionalism shows a return to the early hot collector's desire for an anti-capitalist masculinity exemplified by black New Orleanians who exhibited an unpretentious attitude of "playing for the benefit of the band."[153]

Looking at the characterization of soloists from New Orleans to Chicago in jazz history, the jazz not only develops in a variety of directions but is also grounded in established racial differences. Armstrong's individuality, for example, arises from within the framework of a black band working as a collective under Joe Oliver's seniority. When Gary Giddens describes how Armstrong is "assigned" the first solo on Chimes Blues (1923), he describes the musical result as Armstrong's humble transcendence over the collective. His words are less descriptive of Armstrong's individuality than focused

---

[152] Filene, *Romancing the Folk,* 24.
[153] Antoon Aukes, *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming* (Oskaloosa, IA: C.L. Barnhouse Co., 2003), xv.

on projecting his personal perception of history in the making to the viewer through second-person narration:

> He's not required or asked, nor do they desire him to improvise a single note. But he plays this trio strain with such bravura and such rhythmic intensity that when you listen to it, you hear the future. It's more intense and exciting than all the improvisation that the entire ensemble is doing around. And that might, that holy sound that he has—at that moment you know that something is in the works, and it's never going to be contained. And it's only two years later that he finally goes into the studio under his own steam and virtually codifies what jazz is going to be for the next half century.[154]

Despite Giddens's high praise, his description of Armstrong's moment in the spotlight primarily presents him as an object which the viewer experiences, not as an individual they can relate to emotionally. In contrast, Ken Burns' *Jazz* designates the term "Chicago Style" as the innovation of "young white musicians who had ventured to the South Side" of Chicago to hear bands like King Oliver's. Their music is described as "a more agitated, aggressive, northern sound" based "their own idiosyncrasies… stylistic gambits… feeling and energy." Giddens describes them as active agents exercising free will: "they were wild men. Eddie Condon said, 'when we came to town the Republicans ran for cover.' But when they were young, they were among the first to explore this black music and try to claim it for themselves."[155] With the young white groups developing this aggressive northern sound further into what would become known as "Chicago style" the "string of soloists" approach developed as a chance for each individual to actively seize their expressive moment and compete for the affections of the crowd.

---

[154] *Jazz,* "Episode 2 – The Gift," directed by Ken Burns, PBS, 2001, film, 55:44.
[155] *Jazz,* "Episode 2 – The Gift," directed by Ken Burns, PBS, 2001, film, 1:21:06.

Though I am juxtaposing descriptions of musicians from different time periods, I believe the description of white musicians as actors and black musicians as objects is thought provoking. In many ways, these characterizations of white and black musicians reflect notions of hard-won, learned European white genius vs naturally inherent black genius that do not equally honor the efforts and achievements of black artists. Stemming from old racial stereotypes, Eubie Blake described how black musicians in James Reese Europe's Clef Club were excellent readers, yet they had to memorize all their music for performances because of the white expectations for which they performed: "All the high-toned, big time folks would say, 'Isn't it wonderful how these untrained, primitive musicians can pick up all the latest songs instantly without being able to read music?"[156] While Armstrong's genius is heavily emphasized in Ken Burns' *Jazz,* "genius" is portrayed uncritically without the distinctions I identify above. Emphasizing the heroic natural genius of historical figures—while crafting an appealing narrative for audiences—ultimately diminishes their contributions by de-emphasizing the complexity of their experience. Sherrie Tucker describes this unfortunate irony:

> It seems to be a part of the Burns's oeuvre, that the more attention he grants a talking head or topic, the less remarkable they appear.
>
> A similar strategy operates in Burns's Women's Movement (*Not For Ourselves Alone*, 1999), in which a mass movement is rendered smaller through a repetitious heroic epic about Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton. This narrative was similarly simple, seductive, repetitive, and nostalgic and can be paraphrased as, 'One upon a time in America, there were two women; one tall, childless, and morose, the other matronly and jolly; and their friendship was so great that

---

[156] David Gilbert, *The Product of Our Souls: Ragtime, Race, and the Birth of the Manhattan Musical Marketplace* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2015), 158.

> without them there would be no women's movement.' No narrative rips the power from the people quite so well as the heroic epic.[157]

In a historical sense, the Chicago style shift towards soloists and individuality brings a greater emphasis on individual expression, a strong aesthetic aspect which continues in modern jazz. Yet, the racial differences in categorizing genius and celebrating the individuality of an improvisor raise important questions about how genre aesthetics can potentially favor white musicians. Though they may be lauded as geniuses, do black musicians receive equal credit for developing their craft as white genius musicians? Within the historically defined genres like "Dixieland" and "Chicago style," are black musicians able to participate and be successful on the same level? The examples I have outlined above suggest not.

Following the segregated history of early jazz genre terminology I have been discussing, "Chicago Style" is to some degree a midway point between the white genres of early "Dixieland" established by the ODJB and the popular 1950s "Dixieland" to which the San Franciscans were responding. Given Murphy's descriptions, the 1950s varieties of Dixieland can be seen as as extensions of the earlier instrumentation and concepts of individual expression prevalent in Chicago style. Scott Yanow notes the popularity of 1950s Dixieland attracted "an awful lot of amateur and sometimes corny musicians… emphasizing fast tempos and too many notes (sometimes played out of tune) over lyricism and making a coherent statement."[158] In other words, the string of solos had

---

[157] Geoffrey Jacques, Bernard Gendron, Sherrie Tucker, Krin Gabbard, and Scott Deveaux "Call and Response: A Roundtable on Ken Burns Jazz," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 13, 2 (2001): 213.
[158] Yanow, "Reader Responses to 'Reconsidering Dixieland Jazz…," The *Syncopated Times.*

developed in its celebration of the individual improvisor to a point of excess (in some cases becoming an intense contest of technical skill and in others a venue for amateurs). Yanow's description of Dixieland-gone-wrong suggests an overblown masculine contest of virtuosity where the priorities of higher, faster, and louder have made the music too showy to be taken seriously in an emotionally impactful manner.

Within this context, Murphy's traditional revival is aligned with the sentiment of the 1930s anti-capitalist hot collectors searching for an alternative to wealth to articulate their masculinity. While showy technical virtuosity and the genius of the individual improvisor were strongly associated with jazz modernism, both Murphy's and the hot collectors' tastes reject the dead ends of modernity in favor of the folk aesthetic. At the same time, we must remember that these stances are based on binary arguments which do not reflect the diversity of real life. Turk Murphy was certainly not anti-capitalist; he worked tirelessly to keep his band busy for many years and operated his own venue "Earthquake McGoon's." In regards to instrumental virtuosity, Murphy may not have sought musicians with overly flashy technical skill, but he was very interested in those who closely matched his musical vision. Leon Oakley recounts how he was invited to join Murphy's band because of his improvisational abilities and his demonstration of familiarity with Murphy's catalog as well as the Armstrong Hot Five recordings. Oakley mentions that he replaced Don Kinch in the band, an excellent pit musician who could read anything but did not improvise.[159] With these qualifications (professional level

[159] "Turk On His Own," The San Francisco Traditional Jazz Foundation Collection: The Charles N. Huggins Project, 11:07, created Sept 2018, accessed Sept 8th, 2020, https://purl.stanford.edu/dq777fd7798.

reading and improvisational skills as well as an interest in common repertoire) it seems Murphy's ideal "traditional jazz" musician actually possesses a highly curated virtuosity.

Murphy's legacy lives on for shaking up the scene of 1950s Dixieland, grounding it in historical sources, and paying tribute to African American sources once again. At the same time, his emphasis of the collective over the individual raises questions about the boundaries of acceptable participation in traditional jazz. Can we imagine Giddens's description of wild men who sent the republicans running for cover referring to black musicians without a police force or mob rising up to counter the threat? How might a virtuosic and unabashedly individual sound like Sidney Bechet's be valued in an ensemble which prioritizes the collective? Too narrow a stylistic prescription always carries the potential to do more harm through exclusion than it does through advocacy.

British "Trad" Revival – A Trans-Atlantic Fantasy

Beginning in the mid 50s, "traditional jazz" seems to refer to all pre-bop jazz in juxtaposition with "modern jazz," but it was also used to describe the California revival movement led by Murphy. These genres were further complicated by another revival in the decades following WWI taking place in Great Britain, which also used the terminology "traditional jazz" or, more commonly, "Trad" for short. Barry Martyn paints an evocative scene of postwar British youth culture embracing romantic notions of New Orleans jazz to escape a dreary existence.

> For young people growing up at that time, the years between childhood and adulthood were a strange kind of limbo. Young people were pretty much left to get on with it, which is precisely what they did, inventing their own youth culture in the process. Sartorial mainstay was the duffle coat—on any given Saturday afternoon, the average English town center looked like the embarkation point for

> a North Sea convoy. Venue of choice was one of the growing number of coffee bars, and the hip drink was cappuccino.
>
> For thousands of these youngsters, preferred listening was the sound of New Orleans jazz on records. It was an honest preference—these records weren't advertised widely or given extensive airplay. In retrospect, it's difficult to see why so many kids all over the country wound up listening to Louis Armstrong, Sidney Bechet, George Lewis, and Bunk Johnson. It's probably got something to do with the emotional impact and joyousness of the music, both qualities which were notably missing from an average English existence. The sounds that came out of the record player sounded to us like the voice of God, compared to the banality of the homegrown product.
>
> We had all a romantic idea of New Orleans in our heads (and hearts) but this was as remote from the real place as Tennyson's Camelot, or the image broadcast by the city's tourist authority. Over the course of time, some people acquired musical instruments and tried to copy the sounds they had heard on the records. Bands emerged in which enthusiasm outweighed expertise in a ratio of about ten to one. Over the course of a few years, the musical standards and popularity of these British bands improved and attracted the attention of agents, promoters, record companies, and the media, including radio and television.
>
> The original New Orleans model was dumbed down harmonically and rhythmically to an almost nursery rhyme level. All the bands sounded pretty much the same and tried to create an identity by using silly stage clothes—Confederate soldiers or eighteenth-century costume—and outlandish material ("Teddy Bears' Picnic" or Prokofiev's "Peter and the Wolf"). This music became known as "trad"—shorthand for "traditional jazz." The showbiz era that surrounded it, in which some people made a lot of money, was called the "trad boom."
>
> Meanwhile, on the other side of the Atlantic, the real city of New Orleans had its own social and musical preoccupations.[160]

Martyn's description of the British revival is very much rooted in a tourism fantasy due to the great distance from New Orleans. He describes how he and his teenage buddies in 1957 used to sit around and "talk about Bunk Johnson and George Lewis until 4:00am" even though they had never met them.[161] Before New Orleans revival artists like George

[160] Barry Martyn and Mick Burns, Walking With Legends: Barry Martyn's *New Orleans Jazz Odyssey* (Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press, 2007), 3-4.
[161] Ibid, 9.

Lewis started touring internationally, English musicians had little besides the imported records to inform their understanding of the music. Martyn describes a black man from New Orleans living in London who "was like the oracle" to the young musicians: "We would buy him meals and drinks; he probably lived off us kids. But whatever he said, we believed, because we were interested in absorbing that culture. He was actually a bullshit artist of the first order."[162] British trumpeter Ken Colyer received similar reverence when he travelled to New Orleans in 1953. According to singer and critic George Melly "Ken Colyer came back from New Orleans like Moses coming down from Mt. Sinai with the tablets of the Law… To the growing number of New Orleans purists he trailed clouds of glory and every note he blew was sacred."[163] Due to the limited information and geographical distance British fans enthusiastically gobbled up the few clues to which they had access.

By contrast, revivals in the United States were centered in California, Chicago, and New York, areas with significant African American communities and established patterns of migration from the southern United States. Record collectors willing to invest their time and money in research were able to find many informants. These collectors went to great lengths to factually document early New Orleans jazz, and this resulted in the creation of library archives like the Hogan Jazz Archive oral history collection (Tulane University), the Institute of Jazz Studies at Rutgers University's Newark campus,

---

[162] Ibid, 12.

[163] Melly is quoted in: Brian Goodey, "New Orleans to London: Twenty Years of the New Orleans Jazz Revival in Britain," *Journal of Popular Culture* 2, no. 2 (Fall 1968): 177.

and the Charles Huggins Great Revival Project at Stanford University.[164] The geographical distance across the Atlantic ocean meant British musicians were forced to work with less cultural and historical reference. Martyn's experiences suggest that the lack of reliable information about New Orleans jazz in 1950s England made it easier for amateur musicians to reimagine the music in accordance with their desires for an entertaining and joyful outlet of expression. Though his descriptions of silly costuming and repertoire suggest that British bands took things too far, the associations of Dixieland and corniness that Yanow and Wyndham described suggest that Americans were likewise guilty excessive creative license. Though white Americans had comparatively greater access to knowledge of New Orleans jazz, this did not prevent them from reimagining the music drawing on minstrel tropes and Dixieland fantasies.

I am not advocating the need for an authentic or historically informed performance in these situations (scholars have demonstrated how these notions inevitably project our own modern desires rather than provide access to a virtuous past). Rather, I am interested in the particular work of translating a historical referent into a new performance and how that process can potentially carry negative consequences for others. Lee Bidgood addresses such work through his study of Czech bluegrass audiences who create an imagined "Amerika" based on their understanding of American bluegrass music. This Czech bluegrass is not merely an imported "canned product" but has

[164] The Institute of Jazz Studies was initially started at Marshall Stearns's Greenwich village apartment in 1952 which he opened to jazz researchers once a week, it was moved to Rutgers University in 1967.

undergone extensive revision to become relevant and attractive to local audiences.[165] To describe this re-imagining, Bidgood draws on Ruth Ellen Gruber's notion of "'real imaginary places' in which 'real' and 'imagined' elements are sometimes difficult to distinguish" and "a creation of 'new authenticities,' in which 'the inauthentic dream becomes a new, authentic reality.'"[166] In this context, British trad jazz musicians constructed their own authentic reality of New Orleans music by adapting their sources to the culture which surrounded them. For example, Melly notes that Ken Colyer may have been a vital source and inspiration for the British trad revival but "It needed prettifying before it could catch on." A feat accomplished by the more commercial and approachable band of Chris Barber.[167] Though Barber's band achieved great success and broadened the framework of trad jazz to include early Ellington, gospel, and blues singers, Brian Goodey (professor emeritus – Oxford Brookes University) suggests that the music still had to compete with young pop singers and the evolving youth culture in order to remain relevant. "Fancy dress, droll stage antics, and musical tricks became part of the stock in trade of bands such as those led by Terry Lightfoot, Kenny Ball, and Acker Bilk."[168] This tension between purists and commercial adaptations connects to my earlier discussion of Dixieland as a brand in adapting attractive novelty elements to create a product for public

---

[165] Lee Bidgood, "The Americanist Imagination and Real Imaginary Place in Czech Bluegrass Songs," *Popular Music and Society* 41, no. 4 (2018): 403.
[166] Ibid, 392, quoting Ruth Ellen Gruber, "Beyond Virtually Jewish: New Authenticities and Real Imaginary Places in Europe," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 99, no. 4 (2009): 497-498. Bidgood's alternate spelling of "America" is specifically because of the Czech population he's working with.
[167] Melly quoted in: Goodey, "New Orleans to London…,"178.
[168] Goodey, "New Orleans to London…,"180

consumption and commercial gain. Martyn's comment that "some people made a lot of money" in the trad boom begs the question: who received that money, and was anyone exploited in the process?

The Many Faces of New Orleans Tourism

New Orleans has been re-imagined both within the city itself and outside of it, in a wide variety of approaches, to cater to diverse clientele. Consider Disneyland's first new "land," the New Orleans Square, which opened in 1966. The twelve-page press document prepared for the opening of the new attraction offers a window into what Disney considered the most marketable and appealing aspects of New Orleans:

> She was the nation's most colorful and exciting city…a proud cosmopolitan center that had already established a lasting cultural heritage…America's capital of aristocracy…seat of commerce and industry…a bristling port exporting more commodities than New York. Cotton was king, and the Good Life was his decree.
>
> She was a city of contrasts.
>
> Magnificently gowned ladies, genteel and gracious, strolled past benign Indian squaws selling sassafras root…
>
> Impeccably groomed gentlemen in bright brocade waistcoats had their quiet conversations interrupted by the cries of hawkers echoing through the narrow streets…
>
> Iron-lace balconies seemed even more delicate against stretches of ashened walls…
>
> Intimate courtyards were lazy counterpoints to crowded street markets…
>
> Some of the world's finest restaurants offered gourmet menus while vendors sold jambalaya and shrimp from carts…
>
> Theatres provided the most sophisticated entertainment as domestics danced the ritualistic bamboula and colinda at stage doors…

> The Mississippi, noisy with riverboats, opposed the serenity of colonnaded plantation houses and maisons de ville near the crescent-shaped harbor…
>
> This was New Orleans in the mid-Nineteenth Century.
>
> Its unique atmosphere, drama and gaiety lives again in New Orleans Square at Disneyland.[169]

In contrast to the contemporary New Orleans tourism industry's focus on black music, second line funerals, and mardi gras Indians, the Disneyland New Orleans square frames the city as a center of European aristocracy. From a modern perspective, this framing is problematic for its glorification of white luxury and economic prosperity while almost entirely avoiding mention of the slavery and oppression which made it possible. This brand of tourism also offers visitors a taste of the white southern American dream of wealth, culture, privilege, and luxury while reducing the presence of other cultures to a "benign" local color in the scenic backdrop. In keeping with the tradition of emphasizing the perceived positive impacts and downplaying the negative, former New Orleans mayor Victor Schiro (in office from 1961-69) described the New Orleans Square as "just like the real thing," to which Walt responded aside "Only cleaner."[170] Applying this concept to a particular fantasy portrayal of the city, a Disneyland New Orleans Square which erases the contributions of African-Americans is not only physically cleaner than the real city, but appears morally absolved of the guilt of slavery.

---

[169] Matterhorn 1959, "SOP Saturday – Profile New Orleans Square," Stuff From the Park, posted March 24th, 2007, accessed Jul 27th, 2020, http://matterhorn1959.blogspot.com/2007/03/sop-saturday-profile-new-orleans-square.html.

[170] Jim Korkis, "Profile of Disneyland's New Orleans Square 1966," *Mouse Planet,* posted Feb 20, 2019, accessed Jul 27, 2020, https://www.mouseplanet.com/12309/Profile_of_Disneylands_New_Orleans_Square_1966.

These advertisements and commercial products are curated fantasies which draw upon elements of history to cater to the desires of their clientele and de-emphasize others, yet historically, New Orleans has been spun many ways as a tourist destination. In a notable contrast to the Disneyland version, Emily Clark has deconstructed the myth of the quadroon woman as seductress—another aspect of New Orleans's nineteenth century appeal.[171] While her research suggests that quadroon women preferred marriage and secure relationships, elaborate tales of their promiscuity and the interracial quadroon balls (where white men could form relationships with light-skinned mixed-race women) began to dominate tourism narratives of the mid-nineteenth century and had by the 1930s developed into an economy which "sold a taste of New Orleans naughtiness to all comers."[172] Clark further suggests that this type of tourism marketing was highly successful not only because it catered to male sexual fantasy, but also because it "kept the quadroon at an imaginative distance from the nation's heart and heartland" and reduced anxieties about potential slave revolts as white men dominated these women. This narrative also allowed Americans from both North and South to bind sexual promiscuity and racial mixing to New Orleans while ignoring the realities of interracial sex around the nation.[173]

---

[171] The term "quadroon" was used to describe some who came from ¼ African ancestry. Such a term was typically applied more on a person's general appearance rather than their actual ancestry.

[172] Emily Clark, *The Strange History of the American Quadroon: Free Women of Color in the Revolutionary Atlantic World* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2013), 172. Mentioned in review by Nazera Sadiq White, review of *The Strange History of the American Quadroon: Free Women of Color in the Revolutionary Atlantic World,* by Emily Clark, *Early American Literature* 49, no. 1 (2014), 259.

[173]Clark, *The Strange History of the American Quadroon,* 6. Mentioned in White, review of *The Strange History of the American Quadroon,* 258.

To better categorize these tourism re-imaginings, Echtner and Prasad present three rough categories for grouping tourist fantasies: the unchanged – a timeless place with exotic architecture, legends, and local populations which seem to be "exotic remnants from another time"; the unrestrained – "places where nature is pristine and never harsh, where the people are friendly and never unwilling to cater to every tourist need, and where the resorts offer amenities to satisfy every sensual desire"; and the uncivilized – a setting with harsh nature and primitive and unpredictable local people offering an opportunity to explore the untamed.[174] Previous examples suggest that New Orleans (and Dixieland more broadly) can be reshaped to cater to any of these categories. They are unchanged places of southern plantation architecture, shotgun homes, and wrought iron balconies. They are unrestrained places with sunshine, fried food, lots of alcohol, southern hospitality, and dance music. They can also be uncivilized places due to interracial mixing, black cultural elements, poverty, and swamps with alligators.

As attractive as these features are to tourist audiences, all of these strategies exploit the legacy of slavery or exoticize black communities in problematic ways. Visiting New Orleans and the south, one can expect to see reminders of slavery in architecture, service staff, and entertainment. The fantasies of indulging in luxurious riches or being happy despite their absence, the practice of idealizing genteel women, idealizing promiscuous women, enjoying black culture from a safe distance, and reaping the benefits of slavery without the guilt of enslaving others could just as easily describe

---

[174] Charlotte Echtner and Pushkala Prasad, "The Context of Third World Tourism Marketing," *Annals of Tourism Research* 30, no. 3, 669, 672, 675, accessed Aug 11, 2020, doi:10.1016/S0160-7383(03)00045-8.

the American dreams of the plantation masters prior to the Civil War as fitted to modern aspects of tourism. While slavery was abolished, the aristocratic pleasures the slaveholding planter class had enjoyed were fitted to new contexts and reimagined as marketable fantasies. In fact, W.J. Cash , in his 1941 landmark book *The Mind of the South* suggested that the grandeur of the Old South was itself a fantasy to begin with: "a sort of stage piece out of the eighteenth century, wherein gesturing gentlemen move soft-spokenly against a background of rose garden and dueling grounds, through always gallant deeds, and lovely ladies, in farthingales, never for a moment lost that exquisite remoteness which has been the dream of all men and the possession of none."[175] Cobb adds further perspective: "The entire span from the invention of the cotton gin to the Civil War had been less than seventy years, and many who as children 'had heard the whoop of the Cherokee in the Carolina backwoods' were still around to hear the guns at Vickburg.' In reality, the Old South had been no more than 'a few steps removed from the frontier stage at the beginning of the Civil War.'"[176] Cash's revelation that our glorified perception of the southern plantation fantasy likely never even existed might serve as a warning to us when we insist that our own re-imaginings are well-intentioned and therefore not harmful. Such a daisy chain of fantasies built upon fantasies spanning more than a century eventually becomes taken as truth.

[175] W. J. Cash, *The Mind of the South* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., 1941), ix.
[176] Cobb, *Away Down South…, 169.*

Redneck Dixie – Encoding and Burying Racism

Throughout the 1960s, while white middle class families were enjoying theme park fantasies, black people in the south were embroiled in the violence of the civil rights era. James Cobb describes how "'Dixie' soon evoked a vision, not of happy darkies on the plantation but of decidedly unhappy rednecks waving the Confederate flag and spewing contempt for national authority."[177] Artists like C.J. Trahan, a Cajun musician known by his pseudonym "Johnny Rebel" wrote new pro-segregationist lyrics to Dan Emmett's "Dixie" like "Dixieland will never be free to a nigger and the NAACP. Get away! Get away! Get away from Dixieland!"[178] Trahan recorded this tune along with other threatening and vulgar compositions on an album entitled "For Segregationists Only" which catered to the resentful white southern public. His recordings did not bring him extensive royalties as much of this music was sold through bootlegs, but Johnny Rebel's recordings are now seen as a forerunner to the modern hate rock movement.[179] Trahan himself pushed back on this racist forefather legacy in a 2003 interview for the alternative New Orleans newspaper *Gambit* saying he only wrote the songs for the money, was merely channeling popular sentiment of the times, and feels that his sentiments towards blacks were never really hateful and have changed over the years.[180]

---

[177] Cobb, *Away Down South*, 1.
[178] Jewtube69, "Johnny Rebel – Stay Away From Dixie," *Bitchute,* published September 16th, 2018, accessed July 27th, 2020, https://www.bitchute.com/video/ahABXhaSXf50/.
[179] Johnny Rebel was regarded as a god-father of hate rock by Ian Stuart Donaldson (lead singer of British punk band "Skrewdriver"). Donaldson is responsible for popularizing his music with other hate-groups internationally. Michael Wade, "Johnny Rebel and the Cajun Roots of Right-Wing Rock," *Popular Music and Society* 30, 4 (2007): 502.
[180] Nick Pittman, "Johnny Rebel Speaks," *Gambit,* June 9th, 2003, accessed Jul 27th, 2020, https://www.nola.com/gambit/news/article_463c487d-1c52-50ea-9721-7faa207733ca.html.

Though he may have chosen to backpedal notions of black inferiority, Trahan continued to express resentment:

> I don't care about black. Black don't rub off. There's not a black in this country that has to be black. There's not a white that has to be white. They just came here like that. They were born that way, but they didn't develop the damn attitude. Whites didn't develop that attitude. Blacks develop an attitude towards the whites, and they won't let it go. They won't let go of what happened… Why should we pay reparations for things that happened 200 years ago? ... I was run out of my country ... my ancestors were run out of Nova Scotia.[181]

Whites who experienced discrimination frequently expressed similar resentment towards other minority groups. Nick LaRocca's refusal to credit the origins of jazz to black musicians makes more sense to some, considering the violent discrimination Italian Americans faced in the late 19th century.[182] While they stop short of proclaiming the innate superiority of the white race, the antipathy and bigotry such voices express are no less a threat to freedom and safety of minorities. Hearing Trahan's lyrics from the 1960s, most would agree that they are without a doubt explicit and offensive regardless of his intentions or the cultural zeitgeist he inhabited.

Johnny Rebel's recordings fell out of popularity a short time after release because overtly racist speech became unacceptable in politics and casual conversation. Michael Wade describes how segregationists had to resort to more coded expressions of their beliefs. Many turned to southern rock bands like the Allman Brothers and Lynyrd Skynyrd or country musicians like Hank Williams Jr. for music that celebrated a southern way of life which was less overtly hateful towards black people and more centered on

---

[181] Pittman, "Johnny Rebel Speaks."

[182] Michael Patrick Welch, "Jazz's Great White Hype," *Narratively,* published Aug 25, 2014, accessed Aug 13, 2020, https://narratively.com/jazzs-great-white-hype/.

personal freedom and connection with the land. Recognizing that the topic of Southern pride is complex, I don't mean to assert that the Allman Brothers, Lynyrd Skynyrd, Hank Williams, or white southerners in general were racist. Many songs have a somewhat open-ended interpretation which allows a diverse group of listeners to connect with the music.[183] Though an artist may not share an audience member's racist or otherwise controversial views, a listener is free to interpret as they please.[184] Expressing racist sentiments through a more abstract concept like Southern pride might be seen as a musical parallel to the Republican party "southern strategy" outlined by Lee Atwater:

> You start out in 1954 by saying, "Nigger, nigger, nigger." By 1968 you can't say "nigger"—that hurts you, backfires. So you say stuff like, uh, forced busing, states' rights, and all that stuff, and you're getting so abstract. Now, you're talking about cutting taxes, and all these things you're talking about are totally economic things and a byproduct of them is, blacks get hurt worse than whites.… "We want to cut this," is much more abstract than even the busing thing, uh, and a hell of a lot more abstract than "Nigger, nigger."[185]

Looking deeper at songs that express southern pride, Lynyrd Skynyrd's hit song "Sweet Home Alabama" is undoubtedly a retort to Neil Young's songs "Southern Man" and "Alabama" (accusatory songs criticizing the south, segregation, and violence against black people). Yet, Lynyrd Skynyrd's response to Young is not necessarily an opposing

---

[183] In Lynyrd Skynyrd's "Sweet Home Alabama" for example, Theodore Gracyk discussed how the listener would need to know both the political context of the song and hear the song as a response to Neil Young's criticism of the South in order to piece together a position on racial issues. Even taking this into account, it is hard to infer a clear political stance from the song. See: Theodore Gracyk, *I Wanna Be Me: Rock Music and the Politics of Identity* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2001), 48-50.
[184] Ibid, 36-37. See also: Wade, "Johnny Rebel and the Cajun Roots of Right-Wing Rock,"502.
[185] Rick Perlstein, "Exclusive: Lee Atwater's Infamous 1981 Interview on the Southern Strategy," *The Nation,* Nov 13, 2012, accessed Sept 13th, 2020, https://www.thenation.com/article/archive/exclusive-lee-atwaters-infamous-1981-interview-southern-strategy/

political retort, rather a call to the Canadian artist to mind his own business.[186] With the context of Skynyrd often performing with the Confederate flag on stage, these expressions of rebel spirit shape the message of Southern pride in such a way that racist listeners could find an outlet for their sentiments. Along similar lines, Hank Williams' "If Heaven Ain't a Lot Like Dixie" does not speak to segregation at all, but champions a man's connection with landscape, beautiful women, whiskey, and country music to the point of rejecting a heaven that doesn't contain these things. Considering Williams's emphasis of white male privilege and antipathy towards the North ("Take me to hell or New York City, it'd be about the same to me"), these sentiments would likely resonate with the subsection of Southerners who expressed their regional pride in through white supremacy and lost cause ideology.

Such emphasis on white masculine privilege and the natural landscape has deeper roots in Southern patriarchy beyond differences between the North as an industrial economy and the South as agrarian. Bertram Wyatt-Brown argued that northern concepts of honor were more dependent on puritan ideals, personal conscience, and guilt, while southern honor was "ratified by community consensus."[187] In this context, shameful

---

[186] Music scholars disagree on whether the lyrics are meant to be taken literally or ironically. Though living band member Gary Rossington explained the disapproving "boo boo boo" is an expression of their disapproval of the pro-segregation Birmingham governor George Wallace, three members of the bands including Ronnie Van Zant (lead singer) died in a plane crash three years after the song was released who may or may not have had differing political opinions. Felix Contreras, "Unfurling 'Sweet Home Alabama,' A Tapestry Of Southern Discomfort," NPR, posted December 17th, 2018, accessed Jul 28th, 2020, https://www.npr.org/2018/12/17/676863591/sweet-home-alabama-lynyrd-skynyrd-southern-discomfort-american-anthem.

[187] Cobb, *Away Down South,* 1. Quoting Bertram Wyatt-Brown, *Southern Honor: Ethics and Behaviour in the Old South* (New York, 1982), xv, 20-22.

admonition from outside authority would encounter strong resistance in a Southern community. Neil Young's accusations, government mandated black/white integration, and legislated social restructuring in all of its forms from civil war reconstruction through the present are perceived as grave threats from prejudiced cultural outsiders to the status quo.

These elements of "redneck Dixie" illustrate how the terms have been appropriated to serve a variety of causes which are even at times contradictory. As the Republican party harnessed the power of a white southern voting base to achieve larger political goals, country music artists who were not explicitly or intentionally racist were able to harness Dixieland fantasy, southern masculine honor, and confederate rebel spirit to create successful music careers. While appeals to racist resentment and white masculine privilege made these movements possible, these socially unacceptable attitudes are buried and encoded into other less offensive behaviors. Knowing that these aspects of Dixieland exist, musicians are presented with numerous ethical dilemmas as they negotiate the complex web of associations in Dixieland inflected music.

Is Dixieland Racist?

Though modern artists and fan communities may bear little in common ideologically with slaveholders, segregationists, white power groups, or self-proclaimed rednecks, my research suggests that these groups also have a strong influence on the collectively-constructed meaning of "Dixie" from which Dixielanders cannot hope to entirely distance themselves. Regardless of an individual's racial intentions, the distance between these groups and their mutual use of the word "Dixieland" are worth

interrogating. Returning to the Dixieland fan discussions in the *Syncopated Times,* the strong negative reactions from some fans begin to make more sense when one recognizes that those who wish to categorize "Dixieland" as a racist word are (perhaps unintentionally) casting shame and moral reproach in the direction of other fans who claim no ill feeling towards black people. For fans who have invested much of their time and money in a Dixieland jazz society focused on wholesome and uplifting entertainment such accusations threaten a way of life that, from their perspective, has been constructed and has operated well-enough for many years without input those they perceive as politically correct language police. Such accusations even seem ridiculous and easily dismissible for fans who have welcomed black people into their homes and families and consider themselves advocates for racial equality. This tension among fans of the same music signals that the sunny south fantasy of Dixieland has been appropriated in diverse ways to suit a variety of unspoken desires but also raises questions about the ways we categorize and label racism: should actions be condemned as morally reprehensible if they were not intentionally committed with antipathy? In a binary system of racist/not-racist, how do we appropriately distinguish between racist acts, the impact of those acts, racist intentions, resentment towards another race, and ideology that endorses racial superiority?

Lawrence Blum offers one approach for addressing the intentions of racial aggressors noting that our vocabulary has become "conceptually inflated" as we overuse the words "racist" and "racism" in reference to all "morally suspect behavior, attitude, and social practice regarding race. The result is that either something is racist or it is

morally in the clear."[188] Blum adds that our definitions of racism crystallized in the wake of the Nazi Holocaust and was founded on an ideological basis of biological superiority which does not reflect the modern mainstream of racially problematic interactions. Blum suggests that we might address these issues by broadening our vocabulary to utilize words like "racial insensitivity, racial conflict, racial injustice, racial ignorance," and "racial discomfort" to describe situations which do not merit the intense shame and reproach of being labelled a racist.[189] Even as these strategies may be useful to avoid offending white people who feel they have been incorrectly censured, they can also shift the focus away from the omnipresence of structural and institutional racism.[190]

Rather than focus on affixing an appropriate amount of shame to a correct level of racial offense, Nicholas Faulkner and Ana-Maria Bliuc focus their analysis on identifying the strategies of moral disengagement used by racial aggressors. They argue that "milder forms [of racism] could alter social norms of race communication by normalizing the expression of 'moderate' racist views in online contexts, and potentially achieve wider social support."[191] They point to four categories of moral disengagement developed by Albert Bandura which might be used to categorize and analyze racial aggressions: reframing harmful behavior through justification, advantageous comparison, or euphemistic labeling; obscuring the perpetrators role by displacing or diffusing

---

[188] Lawrence Blum, "*I'm Not a Racist, But…" The Moral Quandry of Race* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2015), 2.
[189] Ibid, 8.
[190] Richard Delgado, Jean Stefancic, *Critical Race Theory: An Introduction* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2012), 10-12.
[191] Nicholas Faulkner and Ana-Maria Bliuc, "'It's okay to be racist': moral disengagement in online discussions of racist incidents in Australia," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 39, no. 14 (2016): 2546.

responsibility; "ignoring, minimizing, avoiding, or disbelieving that the pernicious conduct actually caused harm"; and blaming or dehumanizing the victims.[192]

I believe that applying these frameworks to pro-Dixieland reader comments from *The Syncopated Times* article might allow fans and musicians to converse about the music in a more respectful way and define their music making with social values that will ensure an inclusive and just environment. In some cases, it may be helpful to consider Blum's approach. Take, for example, Wayne Pauli's comment: "If you pretend that black musicians were not taken advantage of – again – shake your head. Of course they were. But where did some of this terrific music come from? The blacks. The slaves. Oh, I'm sorry, I guess you are not supposed to say 'blacks.'"[193] Here, Pauli exhibits a level of racial insensitivity about terminology and the way words and labels affect others. While Pauli's other comments clearly suggest he is not a racist in the sense of exhibiting bigotry or racial supremacy, he is clearly frustrated with using sensitive terminology in order to avoid offending others. On the other hand, Kurt Nauck's comment that, "No one ever used the term Dixieland with the intent to be either racist or offensive, and plenty of black men played it as well. This is a political agenda, pure and simple. These folks need to grow a pair and learn to live in a pluralistic society where we mutually respect one another" might be analyzed with Bandura's third and fourth strategies of moral disengagement (disbelieving that harm was caused and blaming the victims). [194] In either case, identifying the specific harmful behaviors exhibited within the Dixieland

---

[192] Ibid, 2548.
[193] "Reader Responses to 'Reconsidering Dixieland Jazz…,'" *The Syncopated Times.*
[194] Ibid.

community is likely to lead to a more honest and specific conversation about racial inequality and hopefully create an environment where more black musicians and fans feel comfortable participating – a key concern for traditional jazz societies which hope to reach younger and more diverse audiences to refresh the music and ensure the music will continue.

While fantasies have their place in our lives, as an educator, I am particularly concerned about creating an inclusive learning environment, equal access to the arts, and accurate representations of culture. In my experience, the genre label of "Dixieland" has been a significant impediment to diversity. For example, I frequently hear anecdotes of black musicians rejecting the name and taking it upon themselves to educate others about its oppressive associations. For example: Delfeayo Marsalis agreeing to perform as a guest artist with the Central Arkansas University Dixieland band on the condition that they drop the word "Dixieland" from their name for that concert; Trombonist Lucien Barbarin as a young man being offered a job by a white bandleader only to find later his role was to re-enact a minstrel trope by performing the song "I Wish I Was in Dixie" as a solo; Trumpeter Greg Stafford recounting how he—as the only black member of a band—would choose to leave the stage when the band indulged audience requests to "play Dixie" (with the permission of an understanding bandleader); Shannon Powell educating his audience during a concert a Preservation Hall saying "Nowhere in this hall will you see the word 'Dixieland' anywhere. We Play New Orleans music."[195] These

[195] Dave Robinson, email message to the author, 2017. Lucien Barbarin and Greg Stafford, audio recording by Nate Campbell from a guest artist residency with BYU Jazz Legacy Dixieland Band, 2018. Paul Morris, recounted experience in email to the author, 2020.

stories clearly illustrate that many black jazz performers do not wish to be labelled by the term. Dixieland glorifies something they are not a part of unless they choose to participate under the oppressive frameworks established with slavery, minstrelsy, and segregation.

As a call to artists making music in the present, Adam Arredondo claims, "I think it is the duty of everyone involved in the business of playing pre-swing jazz to be engaged with these topics."[196] Returning to the concept of pentimento or palimpsest, modern music making is unavoidably tethered to the associations of the past (both consciously or not) and performers must make choices about how they present themselves in conversation with what has come before. In Darin Kerr's study of Rufus Wainwright's recreation of Judy Garland's Carnegie Hall concert, he illustrates the complexity of representation in Wainwright's homage to Judy Garland's cover of Al Jolson's "Rockabye Your Baby With a Dixie Melody" which Wainwright ambiguously describes as exemplifying "a whole hundred years of questionable behavior" (to which the audience cheers and a lone voice shouts "Part of our heritage!"). While a "gay empowerment" narrative might seem to describe Wainwright's performance, Kerr argues that the deeper layers of Garland's femininity and her status as a gay icon; Jolson's Jewishness and his career in blackface; and the way each of these performers exploit cultural capital and audience's collective memory of what has gone before in service of their own performance are:

> fraught with a multiplicity of vying ideologies, one layered on top of the other, but none ever completely effaced. Indeed, Wainwright's tribute to Garland (and Jolson) powerfully invokes that "whole hundred years of questionable behavior"

---

[196] Ibid.

> (and beyond) without ever fully identifying or coming to terms with exactly what "part of our heritage" it means to privilege or condemn, ultimately doing neither.[197]

Thus, modern performers negotiate complex sites of meaning and identity. Their artistic models (raw materials with which to build something new), personal interpretation of the past, and the interpretations and collective memory of their audiences all interact to form a particular statement (or lack thereof).

The moral argument implied behind framing "Dixieland" as racially problematic is that artistic communities should be more socially responsible about the ways that they utilize cultural capital and collective memory. Measured by this standard, the Wainwright/Garland/Jolson example (which ambiguously appropriates but does not take a moral stance on which "part of our heritage" we wish to embrace or reject) would be unacceptable.[198] However, this is certainly not a universally agreed upon standard of social justice. Connecting music with a political or ideological stance draws more support from those who resonate with the message and irritates those who disagree to the point where they choose to spend their money and time in other ways. For example, New Orleans traditional jazz group Tuba Skinny's Facebook posts supporting the Black Lives Matter movement generated intense arguments/insults among fans over the question of whether New Orleans jazz should be drawn into politics.[199] In response to the long

---

[197] Darin Kerr, "'A Whole Hundred Years of Questionable Behavior': Wainwright/Garland/Jolson and Performance as Palimpsest," *Theatre Annual* 62 (2009): 17.
[198] Ibid.
[199] Though these arguments maintain that jazz is apolitical, Raeburn outlines how historically, the folk qualities of early jazz were frequently referenced by early jazz writers in service of a leftist political agenda: Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 23-37.

threads on their page, bandmember Shaye Cohn responded that she was surprised to find that "white supremacists" were fans of their music and argued that "If you love New Orleans, know that the city is hugely what it is because of the rich cultural legacy of black folks."[200] Considering the established framework of discursive binaries in jazz such as art/commerce, black/white, and modern/traditional, arguments where fans vehemently judge and dismiss each other are a direct continuation of our established pathways for thinking about jazz. Surely, the distance from white supremacist to social justice advocate is a wide (and not necessarily linear) spectrum upon which we all struggle to securely ground ourselves at times?

Take the recently resurfaced debate about Robert Downey Jr.'s blackface performance in the 2008 movie *Tropic Thunder*. Downey Jr. defends his actions under the exception that his role was a satire on "the insane self-involved hypocrisy of artists and what they think they're allowed to do" while simultaneously acknowledging that "having a moral psychology is job one. Sometimes, you just gotta go, 'Yeah I effed up.'"[201] If appropriation, dehumanization, and negative stereotypes of black culture are the "eff ups" in the creation of Dixieland, it seems logical that the opposite approaches of crediting, empathizing, and honoring will likely begin to address the wounds of the past. Yet contemporary actions of white artists like Downey Jr. and Tuba Skinny are still a social negotiation of personal gain and cultural capital. Downey Jr. admits that he was

---

[200] Tuba Skinny's Facebook page, "Greetings everyone, Shaye here," posted June 4th, 2020, accessed July 11th, 2020. https://www.facebook.com/groups/tubaskinny.
[201] Zack Sharf, "Robert Downey Jr. Has No Regrets Over 'Tropic Thunder' Blackface: 'It Blasted the Cap on the Issue,'" *Indiewire* Jan 21st, 2020, accessed July 12th, 2020, https://www.indiewire.com/2020/01/robert-downey-jr-tropic-thunder-blackface-regrets-1202204722/.

selfishly motivated by his excitement to "be black for a summer" and the overwhelmingly positive fan responses to Shay Cohn's post further cement her credibility as an authentic musician and a good person. The complexity of intentions in each situation makes it sufficiently difficult to contain within a racist/not racist binary.

To help deconstruct some of this complexity, Derek Bell advances the notion of "interest convergence" wherein white people conditionally give support to black interests but only because it serves their well being also.[202] Rachel Alicia Griffin describes how the Institute of Diversity and Ethics in Sport at University of Central Florida consistently awards the NBA an A+ rating in diversity due to its integration of many highly paid black players, yet the higher level officials and team owners who make policy decisions and receive the industry profits are predominantly white.[203] In a musical parallel, the 2020 Black Lives Matter protests following the death of George Floyd prompted the country groups Lady Antebellum and The Dixie Chicks to announce that they were changing their names to "Lady A" and "The Chicks" respectively in order to avoid associations with the old south. The Chicks had previously spoken out politically against President George W. Bush in 2003 and endured tremendous backlash from their country music fanbase. Having evolved musically as a result, their name change and recent CD release seem congruous with a progressive ideology. In contrast, Lady Antebellum's case has received significantly more skepticism and accusations of "jumping on the

---

[202] Derek Bell Jr., Brown v. "Board of Education and the Interest-Convergence Dilemma," *Harvard Law Review* 93, no. 3 (Jan 1980): 518-533.

[203] Rachel Alicia Griffin, "The Disgrace of Commodification and Shameful Convenience: A Critical Race Critique of the NBA," *Journal of Black Studies* 43, no. 2 (2012): 161-185.

bandwagon." Ironically, their intentions to support black lives led them harm a black artist: the name "Lady A" was already in use by the black blues singer Anita White. Lady Antebellum sought a legal solution which would allow them both to continue using the same name, and Anita White responded asking for $10 million dollars ($5 million for herself to rebrand her own career and help her community, and $5 million for the Black Lives Matter movement). Lady Antebellum felt this request was outrageous and rather than counter-offer with a lower amount, chose to sue White not for damages but for a declaratory judgement on the name release. Lady A (who works in social justice in her day job) voiced her perspective of the situation:

> I'm not going to do this song and dance for you to make you woke, then when the smoke clears I still have nothing… Because that is what happens to us and that wasn't going to happen. Everybody needs to be forgiven, they need to change their name. Everybody makes mistakes, I am not perfect. If they can do that? Sure, I would love… I don't hold any animosity towards them, I am just going to hold their feet to the fire of their statement.[204]

While this story is currently unfolding and the artists are operating from very different perspectives, the "Lady A" name change battle illustrates a clash of ideology and economics. At what cost threshold do white interests consider it "worth it" to support black interests? At what cost are white musicians safely assured a "good white self?"

So… Is Dixieland Racist?

Taking into account the associations of Dixieland over the past 150-plus years I feel that the word definitely conjures a fantasy which is dependent on racial inequality,

---

[204] Gil Kaufman, "8 Things Lady A (The Singer) Needs You to Understand About the Name Feud," *Billboard,* posted Aug 3, 2020, accessed Aug 16, 2020, https://www.billboard.com/articles/columns/pop/9427755/lady-a-interview-name-battle.

and at the same time denies awareness of it. Minstrelsy, hot record collecting, jazz criticism, and jazz revivalism all sustain (to varying degrees) a very unfair situation in which white men maintain control over the definition of black music and its important aesthetic values. Dixieland thus emerges as a construct which serves white interests, caters to white fantasies, and minimizes anything potentially uncomfortable in relation to race. Throughout this narrative, whites are also free to reinvent the music and play with black representation. Playing out through tourism, entertainment, and politics, the depth of this white privilege (and its invisibility) is quite troubling and suggests that we still have a long way to go as a society to address our collective racism. This historical survey of genre terminology reveals that "Dixieland" is deeply entwined with racist fantasies and anti-black stereotypes. As much as these fantasies and stereotypes have been tweaked over the years, I personally do not believe that we can ever fully shake such precedents and participate in a guilt-free Dixieland fantasy.

Yet, categorizing the word itself as racist or not racist does little to address racist attitudes and structures in our lives. Unless we cultivate greater awareness of racism and educate our society about racial inequality, changing offensive names does little more than sweep the issues under a rug. The Dixieland debates I opened with illustrate that policing terminology is, in some cases, counterproductive in changing hearts and minds. Even if we all agree to call the music something else less problematic, this does not really address the underlying problems of genre definition. Furthermore, if I, a white man, take the role of defining the ethical guidelines for traditional jazz am I not actually continuing the same pattern of defining black music? I prefer instead to share my discoveries, but let others form their conclusions.

On a more personal note, I have contemplated whether this research would motivate me to turn down a steady paying gig in great band if their name included a variant of the word "Dixieland." As a young jazz musician, could I afford to take an ideological stance and sacrifice a great career opportunity? As a scholar, I empathized with Matt Sakakeeny's suspicion of staged jazz parades at Harrah's casino in New Orleans:

> as a card-carrying anthropologist, the casino environment represents the farthest reaches from what I imagine to be the authentic and the real. If all parage exhibitions, on some level, are a minstrelization of community-based parades, then witnessing a cherished tradition performed within a space set aside solely for monetary exchange can only conjure images of slave auctions and slumlords in my mind.[205]

Yet, Sakakeeny found that the musicians playing this gig were some of the best players in the city. They were also paid well, had long breaks between sets, and were very pleased to work there four nights a week. For any academic, such incongruence would leave one questioning what they had missed in their study. With such a precedent, I feel I could consider taking certain Dixieland gigs. While my research has illuminated that there are numerous ways to fall into racist patterns, I see more reason to engage with the music and community than to judge it from afar, and having studied the music through performance and academic scholarship, I do feel qualified to reinvent traditional jazz with the best of intentions. After all, my journey in the music began in a "Dixieland" band. Who is to say that taking a "Dixieland" gig might not allow me to engage my fellow bandmembers and audiences in conversations about the discursive history of Dixieland? Personally, I feel it

---

[205] Matt Sakakeeny, *Roll With It: Brass Bands in the Streets of New Orleans* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013), 105

is important to advocate for greater equality through educating others and see my choice to engage, yet disagree, as more powerful than refusing on principle.

CHAPTER 2

THE NEW ORLEANS DRUMMING TRADITION: MASTERS, CULTURAL MIDDLEMEN, AND AUTHORITY.

> Many times I had experienced the rhythmic force, catalyzed by drumming a solid two-beat, or a New Orleans shuffle. I felt how 'everybody just floats on top of that rhythm,' as a New Orleans trumpeter once expressed. And its power lay not so much in my personal interpretation, as it lay in the music itself: in the rhythms I made use of, and the patterns I chose. Only when I realized how old some of these rhythm patterns were – some over seventy years – I started wondering: where does this all come from, how did these old guys do that?
> -- Antoon Aukes, *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming*

When I first read this quote from Antoon Aukes describing an innate power in specific rhythmic pattern of New Orleans drumming, it resonated strongly with me as a piano player trying to teach drummers how to play in a traditional jazz group. Yet in my experience, defining tradition as an objectified musical vocabulary can be overly simplistic (I use the term "objectified" here to describe the bounding of more abstract elements of tradition—social relationships, cultural heritage, musical influences, shared practice—within a more concrete object which can be bought, sold, taught, shared, or displayed easily). While learning patterns and licks is a concrete and easily evaluated educational objective, deeper engagement with traditional music and musicians reveals that there are many different elements involved in defining a musical tradition. Motivated by the limitations of the musical vocabulary-focused model, I wanted to explore the variety of ways traditional jazz became defined as a genre and consider who had the authority to define it. At the same time, I also wanted to be able to identify key ingredients in making good traditional jazz and emphasize those to my students. As I considered available authoritative models of traditional jazz drumming (recordings and

method books), I critically examined how each of these publications theorized drumming styles in their own terms and used varying strategies to cement their own authority.

While there are many ways of defining a tradition—organizing around a particular ideology, philosophy, person, or way of doing things are just a few possibilities—I focus here on the roles of authors, musicians, and producers as they become cultural authorities. Depending on their role in creating music, level of insider or outsider status, musical abilities, experience, and geographic location, one might describe these individuals with an appropriate label such as masters, elder, legend, scholar, teacher, promoter, or activist. I am particularly interested in how some of these roles might follow Benjamin Filene's description of cultural middlemen in folk music: figures who, while seeking to deliver "pure" folk music, "made judgements about what constituted America's true musical traditions, helped shape what 'mainstream' audiences recognized as authentic, and, inevitably, transformed the music that the folk performers offered."[206] Filene points to the example of John Lomax and his use of mass media to exaggerate the image of the folk singer Leadbelly, which laid the groundwork for modern conceptions of authenticity that privilege unrestrained emotional expression. Lomax wrote about Leadbelly in the press, depicting him as a "savage, untamed animal," insisting that he perform in his convict clothes, and emphasizing his record as a murderer (though testimony from Pete Seeger and others present a markedly more gentle and civilized man).[207] In the present, we recognize Lomax's perceptions of how best to

---

[206] Benjamin Filene, *Romancing the Folk* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000), 5.
[207] Ibid, 59-61.

market black masculinity in the 1930s as intentional distortions of reality aimed to fulfill American audiences' fantasies of "purity and character" distanced from the "corrupt mainstream of society."[208] While this specific example of Lomax's impact is focused on racially insensitive distortion, I think it valuable to consider cultural middlemen not only in terms of their problematic influence, but simply their broader influence in defining a genre.

New Orleans jazz has had many important defining middlemen, but I will offer two as an example to show how the style is generally defined. In his 1936 *Hot Discographie,* Charles Delauney isolated the various roles of a traditional New Orleans "front line"—trumpet playing embellished melody, trombone playing a lower countermelody, and clarinet playing a higher obbligato—as a tenet of early jazz which had grown out of military march composition style. This texture became known as "collective improvisation" (as opposed to mainstream jazz practice where soloists take turns in the spotlight).[209] In my own experience, Delauney's collective improvisation framework is often cited as traditional New Orleans jazz's key style ingredient, an educationally enriching exercise for horn players, and a metaphor for American democracy.

Wynton Marsalis also had an important impact on the artistic profile of New Orleans jazz in his position as director of Jazz at Lincoln Center. Singer Banu Gibson emphasized how he brought a changing attitude of seriousness to the music which opened

---

[208] Ibid, 65.
[209] Bruce Raeburn, *New Orleans Style and the Writing of American Jazz History* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2009), 47.

up new opportunities for her band: "When Wynton came along and started saying 'Hey, no, we gotta go back and listen to that stuff again' it gave it some street cred… and then we were getting booked at Snug Harbor… we weren't the enemy, it was just another style of early jazz, or style of music."[210] Beyond modelling traditional jazz in performance at a high level, Lincoln Center has also produced educational videos with their Youtube channel *Jazz Academy* to illustrate and teach Delauney's framework of collective improvisation.[211] With over 175,000 subscribers, *Jazz Academy* and the accompanying Lincoln Center youth band competition *Essentially Ellington* continue to grow each year offering additional free resources. Band director John Abigana describes their tremendous influence on high school programs: "For us we had no budget for anything… we just had maybe about $700 to buy music for the entire music – choir, band, orchestra, jazz band – program, so that's not going to last very long at all… so when Essentially Ellington, when they were going to give us 6-7 charts a year for free… you can't turn that down."[212] Widely distributed free resources have the potential to redefine jazz education in many positive ways. Delauney's framework was clearly helpful to many musicians learning to play traditional jazz, and Lincoln Center's performances and educational efforts have opened many new doors of opportunity for jazz musicians young and old. Yet, these authoritative representations of traditional jazz are not without oversights or generalizations.

[210] Banu Gibson, in conversation with the author, November 2020.
[211] Jazz at Lincoln Center's JAZZ ACADEMY, "Collective Improvisation in New Orleans Jazz," YouTube video, 5:37, Jan 11, 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EadpcjMB_2s.
[212] John Abigana (retired high school band director) in conversation with the author, October 2020.

For example, such an emphasis on a trumpet, clarinet, and trombone front line glosses over the rich variety of instrumentation and approach in early New Orleans groups as described by Raeburn:

> [M]any configurations were possible, such as the accordion, cornet, clarinet, and valve trombone in the Accordiana band (1899); or a pianist accompanied by a drummer; or string bands engaging in improvised (or not) polyphony without brass and reeds, such as the Six and Seven-Eighths String Band (1913), Gilbert 'Bab' Frank (ca. 1870-1933) played hot piccolo as leader of the Peerless Orchestra in 1905; in that same year his brother Alcide (ca. 1875-1942), a violinist, led the Golden Rule Orchestra, which Johnny St. Cyr (1890-1966) described as 'hotter' than Bolden's Band.[213]

This sidelining of non-front-line instruments came to my attention when I was putting together a summer traditional jazz workshop in Phoenix, Arizona where one of my co-instructors suggested that traditional jazz was "kind of a horn player's game." While I acknowledge the value of collective improvisation as an indicator of the style and a valuable framework for understanding early jazz, I believe my colleague's remark indicates that we are at risk for losing much of the musical richness and variety in early jazz instrumentation and rhythm section timekeeping as we focus on a front line of improvising horns to evoke the style. Indeed, over the years many groups have mixed and matched the New Orleans front line with all ranges of purist to modern rhythm section grooves.[214] Adapting this practice to our educational curriculum, I notice how certain

---

[213] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 8.

[214] The Dukes of Dixieland in later years worked with rhythm sections with a more mainstream aesthetic. See: The Dukes of Dixieland, *The Dukes at Disneyland Vol. 1,* Columbia 1966, accessed via Spotify Nov 18, 2020, https://open.spotify.com/album/7uIuREmiKkyosSchLSWEVB?si=Uhliui4kTQy5V505LZiTgw. Wynton Marsalis also recorded an album of Jelly Roll Morton compositions with his septet blending older aesthetics with the new throughout. See: Wynton Marsalis, *Mr. Jelly Lord – Standard Time Vol. 6,* Columbia 1999, accessed via Spotify Nov 18, 2020,

musicians and techniques become essential while others are merely nice flavors to include if a student is interested. For example, it would be quite unlikely for a jazz trumpet student to graduate without studying Louis Armstrong, while a jazz pianist who spent any significant amount of time studying Jelly Roll Morton or Fats Waller would be considered a novelty. As I showed in the last chapter how the label of "traditional" jazz came to apply to a wide variety of pre-bop styles, this means most rhythm section jazz students are generally focused on emulating later models in schools.

With the concept of collective improvisation marking polyphonically improvising horns as the most important trait of traditional jazz it is easy to separate and distinguish this style from later evolutions (swing and bebop). In contrast, a rhythm-centric approach emphasizes the interconnectedness of styles across time periods which blend and recombine in endless variations. Early recordings may have led Delauney to overlook the importance of the rhythm section, yet later generations of New Orleans music show an increasing emphasis on the rhythm section. Aukes points out that, "Although Louis Armstrong, Sidney Bechet, Dejan's Olympia Brass Band, Fats Domino, The Meters, The Neville Bros., Harry Connick Jr., and The Dirty Dozen Brass Band represent a kaleidoscope of styles, they are all connected by the one element: The Rhythm."[215] While preservationist sensibilities often give the impression that later New Orleans styles are wholly separate from early jazz and it would be musically inappropriate to mix them, the

---

https://open.spotify.com/album/50ypDiqIDdNl9biyTbsEDe?si=V5ZHoOrsQmmqtKqQwrRlig.

[215] Antoon Aukes, *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming* (Oskaloosa, IA: C.L. Barnhouse Co, 2003), xviii.

more contemporary authors and drummers I have studied here consistently emphasize an evolving rhythmic DNA in New Orleans drumming and local music genres.

In this chapter, I sidestep the traditional emphasis on horns collectively improvising altogether to consider how one might define traditional jazz through drumming pedagogy. As few jazz educators are proficient on all instruments, these kinds of pedagogical materials are essential tools which model techniques and stylistic features for students. Authors who create pedagogical materials recognize the niche market for their services but also know they must find a way to justify their authority and their unique perspective on drumming styles and traditions in a way which meets the needs of their target audience. In order to be successful, author's must situate their methods advantageously within discourses on New Orleans tradition, jazz history more broadly, and authenticity. To this end, I analyze pedagogical texts featuring drummers Baby Dodds, Herlin Riley, Johnny Vidacovich, and Antoon Aukes and consider their roles in shaping our conception of a cohesive tradition through their publications. I chose these sources based on my own experience working with them in my ensembles, and I believe their various relationships with New Orleanian tradition (progenitor, home-grown heirs, and foreign enthusiast) make for valuable comparisons of authority and experience, but also contribute valuable different perspectives on the subject. They are also all commercially available to an interested student without extensive effort. These sources do not necessarily lie along a linear spectrum of authoritativeness. One might be more authoritative because of the author's reputation, while another text may be more pedagogically useful or show up higher in a google search leading to greater authority as a result of its popularity.

Their varied backgrounds show that there is not a pure tradition which is twisted and manipulated by a cultural middleman focused on financial gain. The situation is much more complex. Historically, categorization as a form of folk-art with roots in the African American culture of New Orleans proved a worthy cause for early jazz record collectors focused on preservation. Yet, despite the dedication of jazz revivalists, it was difficult to preserve something which was not a clearly defined object to begin with. Early recording technology could not capture the full sound of jazz drumming until electrical recording was invented in 1925, so many drummers had to keep rhythm on a woodblock or minimal setup.[216] Even after these recording innovations allowed clarity in recording bass drums and cymbals, many traditional New Orleans drummers did not have opportunities to record music in the style of the 1920s until the 1940s when the hot record collectors came to revive the style. Therefore, efforts to document and preserve drumming in the early 20th century were informed by recollections made significantly after the fact. Further complicating the preservation aesthetic, the artists/authors who I consider in this chapter led musical careers which were not built solely on traditional jazz. Their work as professional musicians engaging with a variety of styles and influences to make a living breaks down the concept of tradition as an entity with clear

[216] Early jazz fans dispute the firsts of recording and a full investigation of this is beyond the scope of my study here. That being said, with the invention of electrical recording in 1925, most credit Gene Krupa as the first drummer to have the full set recorded with the McKenzie-Condon Chicagoans in 1927. See: Thomas Schultz, "A History of Jazz Drumming," Booklet from *PASIC* conference 1979, pg. 116, accessed Nov 2, 2020, http://www.brad-meyer.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/History.pdf

boundaries. The real-life experiences and perspectives of these drummers show how the music functions both in the commercial marketplace and in preserved cultural heritage.[217]

Considering the intentions and motivations of those who seek to preserve/enshrine/celebrate traditional jazz allows us to understand their ideological priorities and personal stake in the music. We can then see how the various perspectives of each of these authors are in conversation with each other and offer greater detail through their inevitable contradictions. While Dodds's interviews with revivalists Frederic Ramsey and Bill Russell are focused on preservation of a specific style in history, the Riley and Vidacovich book adapts the prestige of the evolutionary jazz history narrative to New Orleans styles, and the Aukes book emphasizes musical vocabulary as a path to acceptance in the New Orleans tradition. The authors emphasize different aspects of binary oppositions like: preservations vs. evolution, insider vs. outsider, and distinctive personal techniques vs. generic musical vocabulary. Their combined vantage points do not offer a clean and easy definition of traditional jazz, rather they expand the discussion of genre definition I began in chapter one by addressing the stakes of individuals in that definition, and highlighting how the educational materials and media they produce continues to shape our modern conception of tradition.

---

[217] Matt Sakakeeny suggests that discussions of cultural capital in music often romanticize the individual and do not consider the full field of culture production. For example: ignoring the economic precarity New Orleans brass band musicians face in order to earn their cultural capital. Matt Sakakeeny, "Playing For Work: Music as a Form of Labor in New Orleans," *Oxford Handbooks Online,* 2015, 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199935321.013.23.

Baby Dodds – Preserving a Historical Snapshot

Warren "Baby" Dodds (1898-1959) is one of the few early jazz drummer names which make it into jazz history textbooks for his recorded performances with King Oliver's Creole Jazz Band and Louis Armstrong's Hot Seven. In later years, he was interviewed notably by Larry Gara who published his biography *The Baby Dodds* Story. New Orleans revivalists Bill Russell and Frederic Ramsey also recorded Dodds in the forties for the American Music label, and it is on these recordings that I will focus here. Dodds's recordings for American Music give the clearest surviving representation of Dodds's drumming style, and they also made him one of the first musicians to record on the drum kit unaccompanied.[218]

Dodds's appearance on famous and influential Armstrong and Oliver records alone is enough to justify his authority as a pedagogical source for drummers and a representative of traditional jazz style. Regarding the Armstrong Hot Five and Hot Seven recordings, Danny Barker recalled that "all the alert jazz musicians and local music lovers waited anxiously for each of Louis Armstrong's latest releases, as there was much to learn from these classics."[219] Additionally, the New Orleans revivalists were very interested in Dodds's role in educating the next generation of musicians. Frederic Ramsey describes how Dodds modestly would not take credit for teaching other drummers but was known to have been an important mentor to Gene Krupa, Dave Tough

---

[218] Baby Dodds, "Drums in the Twenties – 1. Jazzin' Babies Blues 2. Wild Man Blues," 1951, on *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos,* accessed Nov 28, 2017.
[219] Brian Harker, *Louis Armstrong's Hot Five and Hot Seven Recordings* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 4.

(Eddie Condon Band), George Wettling (Paul Whiteman Band), Ray Bauduc, Wally Bishop, and Ben Pollack.[220] Nat Hentoff recounts how Max Roach was "struck with the range and constant shifting of tonal colors Baby Dodds himself displayed as he moved all over his set, and how he continued to vary the sound of his beat according to soloist, development of solo, and other changing contextual needs within a single piece."[221] Countless other drummers have offered their tributes to Dodds as a forefather of the evolutionary tree of jazz drumming.

In the case of Dodds's solo recordings with the American Music label, Dodds himself would likely be considered a cultural master, while the revivalists who organized the session—Bill Russell and Frederic Ramsey, in their efforts to document and preserve early jazz drumming fit the role of cultural middleman (as described by Filene). Russell and Ramsey were by this time deeply entrenched in jazz revivalism, having published their book *Jazzmen* in 1939 (the first detailed book length study about early jazz based on interviews with New Orleans musicians dispersed around the country). They had also recorded other New Orleans musicians like Bunk Johnson with similar preservationist intentions. The first track on the Dodds recordings features the revivalists talking with Dodds about the project and their intentions. Russell and Ramsey ask Dodds to demonstrate his techniques and instruments, and they inquire about changes to his drumming style over the past several decades. Several voices can be heard on the

---

[220] Frederic Ramsey, liner notes for *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos,* accessed Jan 17th, 2020, https://folkways-media.si.edu/liner_notes/folkways/FW02290.pdf.
[221] Nat Hentoff, "Warren 'Baby' Dodds," in *The Jazz Makers,* ed. by Nat Shapiro and Nat Hentoff (New York: Rinehart & Company, Inc, 1957), 18.

recording, and it is difficult to clearly identify who else is in the room besides Dodds. In response to Dodds's assertion that Bunk Johnson's style had changed from the old days, one of the interviewers (I suspect the voice of Frederic Ramsey Jr. as he is credited on the album) responds that they hope to make "historical sides" and asks if it would be possible to "create a feeling that you [Dodds] had during, let's say, the Louie days…" to which Dodds begins to reply hesitantly "Well now that…" but gets cut off as the interviewer continues "if not, let's forget it… I just want to… you know… just if it's possible."[222] This exchange conveys a longing that was common among revivalists during the 1940s. Having fallen in love with specific early New Orleans music, they wanted to preserve that sound before it disappeared forever. This enchantment would eventually give way to grief as the old timers passed away. In 1961 when English drummer Barry Martyn came to New Orleans looking to record authentic New Orleans jazz, Russell told him, "Golly, there's nothing worth recording here—you'd be throwin' your money away."[223]

Despite his earlier assertions about how musicians had changed their styles, Dodds neither confirms nor denies the possibility of recreating his drumming from twenty-plus years earlier. Instead, he jumps right in saying that he still uses the same press roll to keep time as he did back then. He also explains that King Oliver preferred the bass drum in two as opposed to Louis Armstrong who wanted a consistent four-beat. Taking seriously the revivalist's request – to recreate a feeling from two decades back (if

[222] Ramsey, liner notes for *Footnotes to Jazz*.
[223] Barry Martyn and Mick Burns, *Walking With Legends Barry Martyn's New Orleans Jazz Odyssey* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2007), 32.

possible) or forget the whole thing – suggests that the revivalists already had a strong preconception of the elements they were looking for.

Notably, by trying to replicate and preserve the earlier style of drumming they also designate Dodds's recordings with the Hot 5 as stylistically *more* valuable than the other work of Dodds's career (a judgement I don't think Dodds shared). The revivalists do not need to assert their own authority or judgement in the choice of recording Dodds or focusing on the Hot 5 recordings because that music was famous and influential. By listing the record in Dodds's name, they effectively erase their own influence in the equation, though they most certainly played a large role in choosing what to record and how to present it. Thus, they were trying to create a historical snapshot without recognizing the impact that their own desires had in coloring the "history" they captured on record. Dodds's navigation of this unique circumstance begs the question: was Dodds giving the revivalists what they wanted in order to keep the gig?

Given the limited scope his patrons' concern, would Dodds have lost the recording session if he had answered that it was not possible to recreate the music of 20 years ago? Judging from the revivalists' fascination with anyone who had "been there," I don't think it likely. Raeburn suggests that New Orleans revivalists looked with reverence to older musicians like Bunk Johnson and Kid Ory with the hope that they could reconstruct "an example of what jazz must have sounded like prior to its commercialization."[224] Though such a reconstruction may not have been possible, this

---

[224] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style*…. 111. Though this pursuit of a pure and non-commercialized music is in line with folk music revival trends of the time, Gendron suggests that early jazz never would have satisfied this fantasy: "Showcased in night clubs, disbursed through records and promoted in newspaper advertisements, this brand

exchange between Dodds and the revivalists suggests to me that they clearly had different, albeit unspoken, priorities. For the revivalists, why were they seeking a non-commercial folk fantasy and to what extent did it color their preservation efforts? For Dodds, what interests or priorities did he express financially, musically, or culturally? Listening to oral history interviews taped by Russell and his collaborators at Tulane's Hogan Jazz archive, I often get the sense that in their efforts to document "the way things were," they ended up pursuing details about early jazz pioneers that would support their own pre-conceived notions. For example, in his 1958 interview with Dodds, Russell asks such questions as: How did Joe Oliver dress? What hobbies did he have? Did he play pool in Chicago much? Did he carry a jug of sugar water with him on the bandstand? Frequently, these questions are attempts to redirect the conversation to Joe Oliver as Baby Dodds pursues others tangential topics such as the acoustics of different venues he played at and the challenges of being a versatile percussionist playing different styles of music. Dodds seems somewhat annoyed with the excessive emphasis on Oliver and points out that the band followed a much more egalitarian approach in their initial recordings. He insists: "I can't be no band by myself… and nobody else can. In regards to how much he can do or what solos he does, he still ain't the band!"[225] Dodds's apparent

---

of jazz was clearly produced within the confines of, and transmitted by, the culture industry – and thus incontrovertibly a commercial music, though belonging to a less successful secondary market." See: Bernard Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," *Discourse*, Vol. 15, No. 3 (Spring 1993): 138, http://www.jstor.org/stable/41389289.

[225] Warren Baby Dodds, "Warren 'Baby' Dodds 1958-05-31," interview by William Russell, *Music Rising at Tulane: The Musical Cultures of the Gulf South,* May 31, 1958, audio, 26:58, https://musicrising.tulane.edu/listen/interviews/warren-baby-dodds-1958-05-31/.

irritation in these remarks, as his ideas about music are sidelined by Joe Oliver's sugar water, is important to consider. Vanessa Blais-Tremblay notes that such moments in oral history interviews are themselves a "rich repository of the kinds of hesitations, strategies, and refusals that surface in the process of navigating a gendered, racialized, classed, ethnicized, and linguistic relationship between interviewer and interviewee"[226] Blais-Tremblay's makes this comment regarding the tension in an interview with Daisy Peterson Sweeney (sister of Oscar Peterson) in which the interviewer hopes to glean information from Peterson Sweeney about her famous brother's origins but encounters significant resistance when Peterson Sweeney insists on answering all of the interviewer's questions by talking about her own musical career. In situations such as the Dodds-Russell interaction I described, comments should be understood in the context that the interviewer is mining a person's memory for information the interviewer deems valuable while perhaps not taking their informant as seriously as they express their own values and priorities.

Though Dodds's comments about the collective group are interpreted by critics/early jazz historians as a humble attitude of "playing for the benefit of the band" common among early New Orleans musicians, this situation seems to me a plea to tone down the King Oliver hero worship and see the larger picture. Regarding the Oliver band's recording sessions, Dodds claims that the arranging and recording process early on was collaborative but that Oliver reaped the majority of the fame. He explains that in these recordings, "Everybody, whatever you could say, whatever you could do, you put it

[226] Vanessa Blais-Tremblay, "'Where You Are Accepted, You Blossom': Toward Care Aesthetics in Jazz Historiography" *Jazz and Culture,* Vol 2 (2019): 69.

in. That's when it was our band." After the records were made and became big hits, it became "King Oliver's Band" and "That's the way it busted up."[227] Bill Russell's transcript takes Dodds's phrase about "busting up" to mean not just that by luck the fame fell to Oliver but that this unequal distribution of fame was what led to the band's breakup. Considering Dodds's comments alongside other tales of New Orleans musicians competing in cutting contests to assert musical superiority and publicly humiliate rivals leads me to believe that generalized statements from white revivalists and critics about the non-pretentious, humble attitudes of New Orleans musicians were likely a folk-idealization that did not accurately represent the community.[228] Dodds's craftsmanship-oriented philosophy of music-making lies somewhere in between the self and the collective. Speaking of his experience playing in a wide variety of formats, he says "I can't see why one guy can break up a band, he can't… Not if you don't want it broke up."[229]

Listening to both the Dodds drumming recordings as well as Russell's oral history with Dodds it is clear the revivalists were eager to hear certain narratives. Information that might validate their perception of New Orleans musicians as cooperative, group minded, and friendly was received with enthusiasm because it fit with the ideology of folk cultures. In this aspect we might characterize the way the jazz revivalists looked to jazz pioneers as "living embodiment[s] of origin myths" (to use Mark Burford's term) as

[227] Warren "Baby" Dodds, Interview by William Russell, 36:24.
[228] Thomas Brothers, *Louis Armstrong's New Orleans* (New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company, 2006), 202-207.
[229] Warren "Baby" Dodds, Interview by William Russell, 28:11.

part of their impact as cultural middlemen.[230] Burford looks specifically at the example of scholars Marshall Stearns, Richard Waterman, and Willis James who hoped to explore the roots of jazz music by tying them to the blues and to black church music through testimony from Mahalia Jackson and Big Bill Broonzy. Burford highlights how these scholars, in their efforts to create a larger narrative about African American music, selectively received statements that served their purpose while disregarding the strong sacred/secular divide clearly felt by Jackson ("who implored the professors to 'stop talking about 'it's [religious music's] blues,'') and Broonzy, (who felt that "commingling spirituals and jazz was tantamount to 'killing the whole feeling of the people' who "really believe in those songs").[231] New Orleans revivalists, in this respect, asserted their own values in defining traditional jazz based on their idealizations of black jazz musicians.

Undoubtedly, the Herderian notion of "the folk" as passionate, wild, and free people certainly would have colored the perceptions of New Orleans revivalists who saw early jazz as a type of folk music. Filene describes how folk song collectors such as Cecil Sharp fell into similar idealizations of the people they studied as he travelled throughout the Appalachian mountains collecting "love ballads": "The early collectors depicted the mountaineers as still living in a rosy distant past in which plain-speaking farmers with upstanding values occupied quaint log cabins, worked in harmony with nature to feed their families, and entertained themselves by dancing old-time steps to old-time ballads."[232] The middleman legacy of Sharp's collecting became apparent later as his

---

[230] Mark Burford, "Mahalia Jackson Meets the Wise Men: Defining Jazz at the Music Inn," *The Musical Quarterly,* Vol. 97, No. 3 (2014): 438.
[231] Ibid, 472.
[232] Filene, *Romancing the Folk,* 24.

records would ultimately become an important source for scholarly work on folk music, and scholars would draw on his work for years to come. For instance, Kay Norton notes that despite Sharp indicating the contrary in his preface, many scholars were led to believe that the mountaineers did not sing any religious music as Sharp was more inclined toward love ballads.[233] Filene also notes that Sharp's characterizations of mountain folk were quite common among folk song collectors so it comes as no surprise that the early jazz record collectors who characterized early jazz as folk music, would search for similar idealized qualities in the musicians they met. Charles Edward Smith, another prominent revivalist described jazz as a "righteous cause" and spoke of the "spirituality found in sincere improvisation—the expression of feeling from the heart."[234] Though some jazz musicians may have felt this way, others—like Dodds—do not typically speak of jazz music in overly spiritual or emotional terms.

While difficult to discern their exact motivations for preserving New Orleans jazz, the revivalists enthusiasm and dedication is unquestionable. Raeburn describes Charles Edward Smith's feeling that "geography, chronology, and personality had intersected to create a rare musical beauty, worthy of commitment."[235] Along with Ramsey and Russell, the three committed themselves to supporting, preserving, and protecting the folk-jazz music and musicians from the encroaching forces of commercialization and intellectualization even when their own views came into occasional conflict with the musicians they were trying to help.[236] This difference in attitudes towards

[233] Kay Norton, "Who Lost the South?" *American Music* 21, No. 4 (Winter 2003): 406.
[234] Filene, *Romancing the Folk,* 24. Also see: Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 26.
[235] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style,* 35.
[236] Ibid, 80.

commercialization has led a number of scholars to analyze the motivations of white collectors and critics more deeply: Christopher Wells points out how many early white jazz critics frequently challenged "the prevailing relationship between manhood and wealth by repositioning commercial success as a feminine goal for the weak-willed" even though many artists were understandably interested in commercial success.[237] In other words, non-performing white writers may have been seeking a vicarious experience of masculinity (by supporting emotionally driven jazz performance free from the constraints of the market) to compensate for an experience or way of living which was inaccessible to them personally due to their privilege. Others have taken this in a more Freudian direction. As John Gennari has put it: the activity of record collecting (or the lack of a complete collection) was a "displacement of an anxiety over the wholeness of the body (and of the psychosexual emotional balance that goes with it)."[238] Though often described as "nerds" or "white guys without dates," (Bill Russell himself was not known for his romantic pursuits - one obituary names his pet parakeet "Pretty Boy" as the love of his life) Gennari admits that he is reluctant to attribute the whole body of jazz criticism to some sort of sexual disfunction or repression.[239] I see such theories of sexual repression as too speculative for my taste, yet I am very intrigued about what fueled their personal

[237] Christopher J. Wells, "A Dreadful Bit of Silliness: Feminine Frivolity and Ella Fitzgerald's Early Critical Reception," *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture,* Vol. 21 (2017): 46
[238] John Gennari, *Blowin' Hot and Cool: Jazz and Its Critics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), 398.
[239] Ibid, 65. See also: "Obituary: Bill Russell" Independent, posted August 11th, 1992, accessed Sept 29th, 2020, https://www.independent.co.uk/news/people/obituary-bill-russell-1539621.html.

dedication to the cause of early jazz and how their personal convictions shaped its history.

I read Bill Russell's emotional investment in the aforementioned community folk values (humility, playing for the benefit of the band), not as a clear reflection of Baby Dodds or any other New Orleans musician, but certainly of Russell himself. His obituary from *Jazz Journal International* reads: "Bill Russell was a gentle and selfless man with no interest in fame or financial gain. He lived very simply in a small French Quarter apartment that had no telephone, no air conditioning and a door bell that did not work."[240] His nephew Ben Wagner wrote of him:

> Russell freely and generously shared his knowledge and his collection with all who wrote him or came to visit him. He paid even the most famous musicians for anything that they did for him, eschewing any significant financial gain from his interest in jazz. Later in life, he was a fixture at Preservation Hall in New Orleans: taking tickets, selling records, conversing with anyone interested in jazz, working on writing projects, and above all simply listening to the music; he has been called the club's spiritual godfather. After his death, over 36,000 items from his personal collection—reported to weigh eighty-six tons—were transferred to the Williams Research Center of The Historic New Orleans Collection.[241]

In his own recorded oral history as part of the Yale project "Major Figures in American Music," Russell often speaks in a humble and self-deprecating manner of his own abilities as a musician and composer. He mentions one of the reasons he gave up composing was specifically because he felt that the music he heard improvised in New Orleans and Cuba was more exciting than whatever he could write in a "high-brow

[240] F. Levin, "Bill Russell [Obituary]," *Jazz Journal International* 45 no. 10 (1992): 15.
[241] Ben Wagner, "William Russell: Jazz Lover, Collector, Musicologist An Annotated Bibliography" Historic New Orleans Collection, accessed Sept 29th, 2020, https://www.hnoc.org/sites/default/files/file_uploads/russell_biblio.pdf. Wagner cites H. Reich, "Saving Grace: New Orleans Violin Repairman's Collection Is Rewriting the History of Jazz," *Chicago Tribune*, November 9, 1997.

style."[242] Hearing about his experience of tracking down early jazz musicians and documenting their music making, I get the sense that Russell found the process of discovery fascinating work. One can hear the thrilling excitement in his voice as he shares an anecdote about visiting Roy Carew's widow in order to purchase some Jelly Roll Morton manuscripts and discovering a trove of Morton's letters which were to be thrown out.

Russell would later become the first curator of the Hogan Jazz Archive at Tulane University and interview many New Orleans musicians for the oral history archive. Though well-intentioned, Russell was selective in what he chose to emphasize in interviewing jazz musicians. In introducing the oral history archives, Bruce Raeburn illustrates Russell's interview agenda by referring to an interview Russell taped with New Orleans trumpeter Kid 'Punch' Miller: "In the course of the interview, he tells Bill Russell, he says 'Look man, I can play some bebop, let me show you,' and the next thing you hear is 'click'… Bill Russell turned off the tape recorder because he did not want to be hearing about Punch Miller playing any bebop."[243] Such a clear example of curating/policing our received narrative about tradition is quite egregious in contrast to the best practices of modern oral history. Donald Ritchie writes that "A true test of both the interviewer and the oral history project is whether they conducted interviews with

---

[242] "Russell, William, 1984, August 18", *Oral History of American Music – Yale,* interviewed by Vincent Plush, accessed Sept 30, 2020, 16:00-18:00, https://yalemusiclib.aviaryplatform.com/collections/931/collection_resources/25270/file/91091.

[243] "Getting to know the Hogan Jazz Archive," Music Rising at Tulane: The Musical Cultures of the Gulf South, accessed Jan 16, 2020, audio, 2:36, https://musicrising.tulane.edu/listen/.

representatives of all sides of an issue, including those whom they considered less than admirable."[244] Cathy Courtney of British National Life Stories adds that in oral history "we want the ramble, the anecdote, the digression."[245] Russell's curation suggests that he may have been more invested in preserving New Orleans jazz as he imagined it rather than documenting the untidiness of the lived tradition.

To greater gauge the impacts of selectively emphasizing details which fit with a cultural middleman's personal agenda, consider Filene's discussion of the A&R man Ralph Peer. Travelling to the south to record early "hillbilly" music, Peer was working for little compensation, but retaining copyright to all the songs he recorded. Therefore, he insisted that artists file copyright for all their songs even if they were old enough to be in the public domain. Additionally, he encouraged artists he considered star material, such as the Carter Family and Jimmie Rodgers, to compose "original songs that sounded like the old ones."[246] Peer's 1927 recordings in Bristol, Tennessee earned the town the reputation as the birthplace of country music, and Peer became a very rich man from the royalties on the songs he recorded. Russell's decisions diverge in similarity from Peer's as they were not overtly profit-motivated, yet a record company which offers distribution and broad exposure to an artist is quite similar to a university jazz archive with power to preserve the legacy and memory of a musician. Were it not for Russell and the other revivalists, Punch Miller would likely have been forgotten. In addition to the oral history

---

[244] Donald A. Ritchie, *Doing Oral History: A Practical Guide* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 95.
[245] Ibid, 73.
[246] Filene, *Romancing the Folk*, 37-38.

program, Russell also recorded musicians on his American Music label and narrated the film "Till the Butcher Cut Him Down," a film about Punch Miller's later career.

These examples of selective emphasis might also be compared with transcription strategies for studying non-western music. Glenda Goodman describes how the transcribing efforts of early European explorers were significantly flawed if taken as accurate representations of the music they encountered. She identifies practices such as forcing non-western music into a western system of notation, creating a transcription from memory recalling performances after the fact, and composing a transcription as an amalgamation of multiple witnessed performances which contributed to a less-than-scientific final product.[247] Additionally, many of the early explorers carried bias against cultures they perceived as inferior and lacked sufficient musical training to represent what they heard accurately. Despite these flaws, accuracy was not necessarily the goal of the transcribers. Rather, their motivations were often extra-musical. As Goodman explains:

> it is interesting that many of these transcriptions were printed in books that were not otherwise about music, books that contained information that was meant to advance the goals of European empires. In these books, music was more akin to maps, descriptions of fortifications and cities, outlines of political power structures, and accounts of local customs for anything from medicine to child-rearing—all of which were meant to help future travelers and enlighten metropolitan readers[248]

Goodman's analysis suggests that even if the revivalist's preservation attempts had been hopelessly inaccurate, they still show a deliberate investment. As ethnomusicologists

---

[247] Glenda Goodman, "Sounds Heard, Meaning Deferred: Music Transcription as Imperial Technology," *Eighteenth Century Studies* 52, no. 1 (Fall 2018), 41-42.
[248] Ibid, 40.

grapple with the complexity of musical communities and styles, they might use a transcription method to limit/capture music in a fixed state in order to better understand it. Jeff Todd Titon explains that in early ethnomusicology studies, “Transcription told us what we could know about music and how we could know it. Music was objectified, collected, and recorded in order to be transcribed; and transcription enabled analysis and comparison.”[249] By transcribing, we are attempting to circumscribe musical meaning within a bounded single entity. Comparatively, the revivalists’ “transcriptions” are the recording sessions they produced, films they made, collections they curated, careers they revived, etc. While these efforts on face value are an intent to preserve and document the music, they seem that way precisely *because* that was the revivalists’ intention. In reality the recordings were much more curated and experimental.

While the revivalists shaped the recordings by what they chose to record and the questions they asked, Dodds himself took opportunities to talk about those things he felt mattered and that best showcased his innovations. For example, Dodds was known for his “shimmy beat”: a shaking dance move inspired by a French soldier visiting New Orleans around 1918. Dodds imitated the soldiers’ dance while playing his press roll and keeping time, and he found it was very popular with audiences.[250] As one of the revivalists begins to suggest that the shimmy beat might be equivalent to a more modern technique, Dodds insists: “I’m the only one doin’ it yet. That’s how it works. They [other drummers] are still trying very hard to do this press roll, but they use it different. [plays another version]

---

[249] Jeff Todd Titon, “Knowing Fieldwork,” in *Shadows in the Field: New Perspective for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology,* ed. by Gregory Barz and Timothy Cooley (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 25.
[250] Nat Hentoff, “Warren ‘Baby’ Dodds”*,* 27.

That is wrong."[251] Dodds quickly runs through a number of different press roll variations and explains that other drummers have mistaken his ¾ roll for a ¼ roll. As this terminology is not standard among drummers today it is difficult to decipher exactly what Dodds means. While Dodds's commentary at times emphasizes a strict observance of traditional jazz style (as demonstrated by his emphatic insistence on the correct way to perform his press roll), he also chose to subvert the purist mentality with his own curiosity. In an interesting conflict with Frederic Ramsey's initial vision, he also revealed that on "Careless Love," he chose to use brushes, "just to see what it would sound like all alone."[252] Dodds describes the experience:

> When the lights came on they asked me what I was going to do and I told them I didn't know. They told me to go ahead and work it out my own way. When I had finished each number they asked what I wanted to name it and I gave them a name for each one as I went along. I didn't plan anything for fear that I wouldn't carry out just what I had planned. That would throw the whole thing off. And, of course, none of the solos were rehearsed. But I liked those solos very much. To tell the truth about it I was as much surprised as anyone else.[253]

Such description doesn't seem to portray an intentionally documented "historical side." If anything, isolating the drums from any melodic context seems have created a dramatically different musical context for Dodds where he was curious to explore and try out new sounds. His choice to name his drum solos "Spooky Drums" to describe the unnatural context of hearing drums all alone suggests to me that this experience was very different from anything he had experienced in his 30-plus years of performing.

---

[251] Baby Dodds, "Shimmy Beat and Press Roll Demonstration," recorded 1946, on *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos,* accessed Nov 28, 2017, https://open.spotify.com/track/4wpsOQAalyAGbmrokPZOGQ
[252] Ibid.
[253] Ibid.

Though recordings may seem much more descriptive and scientific than simple attempts to notate early jazz on paper, the revivalists (and Dodds himself) still made distinct choices about what to record and how to record it which shape our contemporary understanding of traditional jazz. While the revivalists' wanted to "bring back the beat" of a very particular moment in history, Dodds was interested in showcasing his unique techniques, recording his music in an unusual context, talking about his experience, and preserving his legacy. While the end product is somewhat of a mix of these purposes, I doubt many would realize just how strange and specific it is as a representation of early jazz. As musicians study these recordings and attempt to reproduce some of the magic in their own playing, likely still approach them under the same pretense that they are authentic preserved exhibits of the most authoritative of the early jazz drummers captured by well-intentioned, passionate jazz preservationists. With greater context about the sessions and recognizing the motivations of the parties involved, we can see how these recordings were not quite the objective historical documentation they appear to be, rather, they are a fascinating collaboration between the revivalists' strong emotional attachment to the hot 5 recordings and Dodds's contemporary musicianship.

Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress – Borrowing Successful Narratives From Jazz History

In their 1995 book *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming*, Drummers Herlin Riley (born 1957) and Johnny Vidacovich (born 1949) describe a newer generation of drummers in the New Orleans drumming tradition. While it seems strange that this topic would remain unaddressed for forty-plus years after the 1951 Dodds

recordings, it is important to remember that the city of New Orleans was very slow to embrace the title of "birthplace of jazz" and to recognize the music as an artform. Raeburn notes that the *Times-Picayune* was actively trying to suppress the music and its connections with New Orleans until 1961.[254] Indeed, when the book was published in 1995, there was clearly a dearth of information on the subject. On the back cover of the book, Zigaboo Modeliste (the influential drummer of the funk band "The Meters") testifies that "Even growing up in New Orleans it was difficult to get this information."[255] Though Riley and Vidacovich are foregrounded as authors, the book is actually an edited collection of interviews and articles by Dan Thress, a drummer based in Columbus, Ohio who has written/edited a number of books in which he interviews famous drummers. Outside of the instructional method books he helped produce, Thress has surprisingly little online presence for a professional musician. It seems that he found a niche in packaging the insights of professional drummers into instructional materials. Jazz drummer John Riley (no relation to Herlin Riley) also wrote books with Thress and details how they came to work together:

> I was motivated to publish my books by a drummer named Dan Thress. Dan had been taking lessons from me over the course of a couple of years, and at one point Dan said to me, "I really like these lessons, I don't think there's anything like it on the market, why don't you think about putting a book together?" So he encouraged me to do it and had access to a publisher. That's how the books began. [256]

---

[254] Raeburn, *New Orleans Style…,* 19.
[255] Herlin Riley, Johnny Vidacovich, and Dan Thress, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming* (Van Nuys, CA: Alfred Music, 1995), back cover.
[256] Ben Scholz, "John Riley: Inspiring Innovation," All About Jazz*,* published July 23, 2014, accessed Nov 4th, 2020, https://www.allaboutjazz.com/john-riley-inspiring-innovation-by-ben-scholz.php

As a student of the New Orleans drumming himself, Thress noticed a viable business opportunity and saw value in collaborating with professional drummers both to reach a broader audience and to lend credibility to his projects.

In contrast to the revivalists—who hoped to preserve a very specific snapshot of Dodds's playing—Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress describe not only early New Orleans jazz as a broader genre, but situate it within an evolution of New Orleans drumming style extending beyond jazz, and running throughout various stylistic and generic evolutions of the 20th century. The chronological layout of the book is significant as it traces this evolutionary narrative. Riley and Vidacovich both speak about their personal experiences (through interviews with Thress), and Thress supplements their comments with material about other influential drummers in the city lineage to tie their comments together. The evolutionary narrative seems to be welcomed, unquestioned, and supported by the book's contributing musicians. Modeliste gives his endorsement "This book is a solid piece of work and I'm glad to see these influential players getting the recognition they deserve."[257] This suggests that a lineage of New Orleans drummers may have existed in the minds of players previously but that this was perhaps the first publication to draw such a sweeping arc of drumming evolution linking ragtime, traditional jazz, second line parades, gospel, R&B, funk, bebop, and modern jazz.

A closer look at the historical narrative reveals that these genre labels are fluid and constantly shifting. Earl Palmer explains that initially there was very little difference between his jazz drumming and rhythm & blues styles: "There wasn't any rhythm &

---

[257] Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming,* back cover.

blues! We were just able to adapt, make things a little funky, play a shuffle instead of a jazz feel—which is how rhythm & blues, rock 'n' roll, whatever you call it came about. People *called* it rhythm & blues. I just called it doing the job."[258] While Palmer saw very little distance from jazz to rhythm and blues, other musicians perceived a widening gulf between the styles. Writing from a bird's eye view of New Orleans drumming over a century's worth of history, Thress describes New Orleans drummers of the 1960s as a "new type of player, proficient in various musical dialects." Smokey Johnson—whom Thress identifies as one of these players—carefully notes the differences between himself and the younger drummer Zigaboo Modeliste. He says: "Zig knows all my old tricks… We were tight. Zig is a good drummer. But he's not a jazz drummer. he doesn't play jazz."[259] These genre labels diverged than from roughly the same thing for Palmer (b. 1924), two different dialects for Johnson (b. 1936), and became entirely different things for Modeliste (b. 1948).

This type of historiography runs parallel to many of the tropes one finds in jazz historiography. Both frequently include references to trees, roots, branches, and a constant unchanging essence that links disparate grooves and patterns together. Deveaux suggests that emphasizing the continuity and legacy of "the jazz tradition" offers augmented cultural capital: "Without the sense of depth that only a narrative can provide, jazz would be literally rootless, indistinguishable from a variety of other 'popular' genres that combine virtuosity and craftsmanship with dance rhythm."[260] This larger

---

[258] Ibid, 8.
[259] Ibid, 96.
[260] Scott Deveaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition: Jazz Historiography," *Black American Literature Forum* 25, no. 3 (Autumn, 1991): 530.

evolutionary narrative allows contemporary musicians to position themselves as part of jazz history and tradition rather than just a limited sub-style. As John Gennari wrote of critics like Marshall Stearns, “what was important was jazz’s fundamental identity as an American tradition, not the critical factionalism instigated by the music’s stylistic variations.”[261] Gennari identifies Stearns as an architect of the “consensus” view of jazz history. In this view “jazz—as a symbol of freedom, democracy, and interracial communication—became that much more potent an ideological tool in the world at large.”[262] Subsequently, musicians who are able to strategically graft themselves into the evolutionary tree of an artform which represents such potent ideological associations are able to draw on that cultural capital for their own music making.

Given the strong associations of jazz and New Orleans, it makes sense that musicians in the city would be familiar with the aesthetic framework critics used to elevate jazz to art music status and would follow similar paths to distinguish and enhance their art by drawing on the added cultural capital of tradition and heritage. More specifically, New Orleans musicians are able to derive great value from positioning themselves in a lineage of musical families, mentorships, communities, and influences. In this sense, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming* follows a “great man” narrative because a great man narrative is clearly valuable in the minds of the authors and drummers involved with the project. Living drummers like Zigaboo Modeliste are “glad to see these influential players getting the recognition they deserve”[263] because they

[261] Gennari, *Blowin’ Hot and Cool,* 152.
[262] Ibid.
[263] Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming,* back cover.

recognize the valuable cultural capital created by their forebears, yet also derive value themselves from being associated with a rich tradition. For another example, Wynton Marsalis speaks of the "trumpet lineage" that began with Buddy Bolden and subsequently passed to Freddie Keppard in the Ken Burns documentary *Jazz* noting that Keppard was known for his laughing techniques with the wah wah mute. He then picks up his trumpet to demonstrate and says "This is a laugh that I use all the time, I got this from a Freddie Keppard record."[264] By positioning himself within this lineage, Marsalis is not just a talented musician, but also a vessel containing a centuries-worth of trumpet playing knowledge and social experience. Paul Berliner describes how the act of learning solos from recordings also offers young improvisers a valuable personal connection to the musicians they admire: "Breathing together, following the same line of musical thought, and experiencing the same sense of urgency and shades of feeling that motivated the soloist's initial expressions, young performers become engaged in an intimate union with their idols."[265] Tapping the cultural capital of a traditional legacy representing desirable nationalistic virtues is a powerful context for Thress, Riley, and Vidacovich, such a framework did not yet exist in Dodds's time. While New Orleans revivalists including Ramsey and Russell were trying to trace the careers of pre-Dodds musicians by piecing together memories from elderly New Orleanians, Riley and Vidacovich are able to speak about their own practices with reference to generations of nationally known and extensively recorded New Orleans musicians.

---

[264] *Jazz,* "Episode 1 – Gumbo," directed by Ken Burns, PBS, 2001, film, 1:10:29.
[265] Paul Berliner, *Thinking in Jazz: The Infinite Art of Improvisation,* (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1994), 97.

Herlin Riley is most powerfully positioned within the social tradition given his upbringing, surrounded by important New Orleans musicians such as Frank and Walter Lastie, James Black, Smokey Johnson, Vernel Bagneris, Al Hirt, Danny Barker, Professor Longhair, Dr. John, and Ellis Marsalis. Thress begins the book asking Riley to identify some of the stylistic elements of drumming from periods like ragtime, brass band, and gospel music in order to "trace some of [Riley's] influences."[266] Here Thress uses the basis of Riley's longtime New Orleans musical family to suggest that he can accurately speak about musical time periods even before his birth. Riley seems to embrace this perspective as well. For the gospel drumming examples in the book he is joined by his mother Betty Ann Lastie Williams to perform "Will the Circle Be Unbroken" and "Glory, Glory Hallelujah." Introducing them, he says:

> What I'd like to say about these two tunes and the feeling of what were going to play, it that this is pretty much what went on in our house. We always got together on holidays or any given weekend or day, and we played music. There was a piano, and my grandfather had some drums there, and I had a couple other uncles who played sax and trumpet and they would come together and we'd all usually jam on gospel tunes.[267]

Riley's authority is further bolstered by his intimate knowledge of individual drummers and their idiosyncratic techniques. Describing his grandfather Frank Lastie's peculiar press roll grip, Riley explains:

> Now, conventional grip is where you place the stick between your middle finger and your fourth finger, and it goes between the thumb and the index finger as well. The grip that my grandfather used was a grip where he laid the sticks across

[266] Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming,* 12.
[267] Ibid, 33. Thress notes specifically the uncles Riley mentions are trumpeter Melvin Lastie and saxophonist David Lastie emphasizes the genre crossover as these musicians "toured and record with numerous R&B bandleaders throughout the '50s and '60s."

> his fingers—not between his fingers—and then he covered it and balanced it with his thumb, which allowed more freedom for the stick to rebound.[268]

Presenting himself as someone who absorbed years of New Orleans musical tradition through childhood nurture also allows Riley to discuss musicians in the past with a less detail-oriented attitude. Many of the things he demonstrates are preceded by phrases like "The older musicians would say…," "they would play…," or "a lot of the guys…."[269] More generally throughout the book, none of the authors offer specific dates or careful source citations which would lend credibility in an academic context. The drummers' personal experiences, formative years, and demonstrable musical vocabulary comprise the main body of material. To me, hearing how the authors feel confident enough in their knowledge of the music scene and their perception of history that they can generalize freely actually makes them seem more believable. Their expertise seems based on their life experience rather than the thoroughness of their research.

Within this broad evolutionary narrative, many of the drummers seem motivated to theorize a golden thread of New Orleans drumming tradition distilling the local tradition into particular techniques and rhythms. Riley claims, "You know, that's what's most significant about drummers who come from New Orleans is the different patterns that they play on the bass drum, and how the bass drum is applied to the music."[270] Later, Smokey Johnson reinforces this idea discussing how he took over the drum tracking at Motown: "Those drummers up there didn't play much bass drum. A drummer from

---

[268] Ibid, 13.
[269] Ibid, 12-13.
[270] Ibid, 17.

around here plays the full set."[271] More broadly, he suggests that New Orleans players develop their bass drum beat from playing Dixieland or New Orleans swing music as young kids. "I can play with (bassist) George French and he'll be playing the same thing on his bass that I'm playing on my bass drum, with no rehearsal. It just comes out that way."[272] Johnny Vidacovich noted a similar effect: "I draw from everything that I've learned—Dixieland stuff, funny stuff. I'm always applying these street claves to everything that I play. Because it's so innate. When it comes to playing be-bop, I strongly relate to my Dixieland roots."[273] These bass drum techniques and shared repertoire become powerful differentiating markers setting New Orleans drummers apart from others outside the city.

Bringing star drummers together who can speak authoritatively on New Orleans drumming, capitalizing on meanings created within the established framework of jazz historiography, and attempting to describe a collectively shared New Orleans rhythmic language set *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming* apart as a defining text in these genres. Riley and Vidacovich are masters of the tradition in a different sense than Dodds. Being positioned at the top of the evolutionary tree rather than the bottom, and their approach to traditional jazz drumming is not necessarily preservation based. Riley and Vidacovich are both professionally active and continue innovating/creating music which references traditional techniques, but also blends in modern jazz and a many other stylistic influences. While the revivalists were specifically interested primarily in

[271] Ibid, 96.
[272] Ibid, 97.
[273] Ibid, 102.

Dodds's activities 20 years prior and seemed less interested in his current musical philosophies, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming* includes full transcriptions of Riley and Vidacovich playing their own modern compositions. Their wide range of musical activities testifies to the evolutionary New Orleans tradition and 25 years after the publication of the book, newspaper articles still feature them and the book continues to appear at the top of google searches. This enduring relevance testifies to me of how Riley's and Vidacovich's experiental mastery, and positioning within an evolutionary stylistic narrative resonates with contemporary audiences in a stronger way than the revivalists' preservation approach.

Filene notes a similar precedent for authority through popularity and relatability in the folk song collector Carl Sandburg who re-published old song collections with new evocative written introductions and catchy titles. He also cultivated marketable self-image as a "plain speaking common man—the 'voice of the middle west,'… who 'had learned his country by heart.' He travelled the country on his lecture tours, spouting homespun yarns, poems, Lincoln anecdotes, and, of course, songs."[274] Sandburg's popularity and authority led President Lyndon B. Johnson to remark on his death "Carl Sandburg was more than the voice of America, more than the poet of its strength and genius. He was America."[275] Clearly, in such a discussion of pedagogical authoritativeness, it would be important to acknowledge the impact of reputation and accessibility for students. Riley and Vidacovich (living drummers who have worked with

---

[274] Filene, *Romancing the Folk,* 45-46.
[275] North Callahan, *Carl Sandburg: His Life and Works* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010), 233.

many famous New Orleans musicians and recorded in a wide variety of formats) are likely easier for modern students to relate to and emulate than Baby Dodds or Antoon Aukes. The book also presents full tune transcriptions of Riley and Vidacovich applying the concepts they discuss so students can see how the techniques work in the context of a tune (something none of the other sources do). Dan Thress also produced an accompanying DVD which can be found streaming online for students who are more visually oriented.[276] I am confident that a student could study the first few sections of the book and get the basics of playing drums on a few tunes with a traditional jazz band because I have done it myself and loaned the book to several of my students to get them started.

The argument of authority through popularity assumes that Riley's and Vidacovich's brand of authority appeals to the public and fulfills reader expectations about what qualifies as authoritative. These authors situate New Orleans drumming in an evolutionary narrative and establish their experiential authority and social connection to the tradition in ways that echo the "street" education of jazz masters.[277] I know this appealed to me as a student of the style. Riley's and Vidacovich's virtuosity as players, experiential knowledge of New Orleanian culture, and association with famous musicians are all qualities I prioritized as I searched for mentors as a masters student visiting New Orleans. *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming* is constructed with this type of

---

[276] Herlin Riley and Johnny Vidacovich, *New Orleans Drumming Vols I, II, and III,* Alfred Music, DVD.

[277] For more on "street" education vs the alternative authority of the university see: David Ake, "Crossing the Street: Rethinking Jazz Education," In *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 187-206.

appeal to authority in mind. It is an appeal to trends in jazz history more broadly. Just as these drummers/authors recognize the value of positioning themselves within a consensus narrative like that of jazz history more broadly and mold themselves to meet that demand, jazz students and fans seek authoritative models who can effectively fit within the popular historical legacy.

Antoon Aukes – Borrowing and Conversing With Rhythms

Taking a slightly different angle, Antoon Aukes's *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming* expands the evolutionary narrative addressing how traditional jazz relates to the New Orleans parade drumming, R&B, and funk styles. His books is not based on interviews, but rather his transcriptions of recordings, associations with New Orleans drummers, and research at Tulane University's Hogan Jazz Archive. As I indicated in this chapter's epigraph, Aukes emphasizes the power of specific rhythmic patterns and musical vocabulary in defining genres and linking genres more than the previous sources. Being a foreigner (Aukes is from the Netherlands), I suspect the idiomatic New Orleans drumming vocabulary take on a higher value without the cultural context that comes from living in the city. Having received endorsements from important New Orleans musicians, Aukes's experience stands as a testament to other drummers that the New Orleans drumming tradition is open to all those who put in the work to learn the musical language.

Aukes's features those local recommendations right at the beginning of the book to establish his authority. New Orleans pianist Dr. John's opening forward testifies that the book "follows the branches of the trees of New Orleans drumming straight from the

roots" and is accompanied by a smiling photograph of Aukes and Dr. John pointing at each other signaling mutual admiration.[278] Dr. John proclaims his book is "essential to any drummer interested in New Orleans drumming" and testifies that "there's a great understanding in Aukes's writing."[279] Aukes also took lessons with local New Orleans drummers Johnny Vidacovich, Fred Staehle, and Barry Martyn "to show them my chops and check my thoughts" noting he would not be personally satisfied until he heard them say "Well…, yeah. You got it."[280] From my own experience travelling to New Orleans to study with local pianists, I am impressed with Aukes's persistence (with many of the pianists I approached, it was a significant challenge to get them to agree to teach a lesson). His purposes of "showing his chops" and "checking his thoughts" function as two separate processes here. Showing chops gives the impression that Aukes had already done such significant work independently transcribing New Orleans drummers that these musicians would be impressed with his skills from the beginning. Indeed, in his introduction he hints at this, saying "Many hours I spent under the headphone, trying to transcribe that Earl Palmer fill in Let the Good Times Roll' (Shirley & Lee), which is, I admit, impossible."[281] At the same time, he is not showboating his prowess as a drummer; he adds this disclaimer to his accompanying CD where he demonstrates the notated examples in the text: "I do not claim to have recreated the original feel of these authentic examples. Best listen to the old recordings, or follow a real second line."[282]

---

[278] Antoon Aukes, *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming* (Oskaloosa, IA: C.L. Barnhouse Co., 2003), xiii.
[279] Ibid, xii.
[280] Ibid, xiv.
[281] Ibid, xiv.
[282] Ibid, xx.

Aukes's comments about feel in this chapter's epigraph describe and innate power of New Orleans rhythmic patterns reads as contradictory when considered alongside his description of drumming feel. Riley also emphasizes the importance of an undefine-able feel in the music saying "It's not the technique or playing a lot of notes. It's more about knowing when and where to drop it."[283] I don't think that Aukes would disagree with Riley, but I do see the differing word choice as thought provoking. Are we saying that the micro-rhythmic differences (or participatory discrepancies as Charles Keil would say) are what really *make* these grooves powerful (in that case, no written notation in Aukes' book would be sufficient to convey the source of their power,) or are we saying that the basic rhythms and patterns are innately powerful and that being able to perform them with any range of interpretation will suffice to keep the band afloat? The tension in Aukes's treatment of this discussion is notable as his book is clearly very focused on documenting rhythmic patterns and making the tradition available to others through those patterns, yet he forgoes the claim that he has intuitively mastered the micro-rhythmic feel himself. As a foreigner, it seems that Aukes sees value in the rhythmic patterns and documents them as a pathway of entry to the tradition, but does not dare place his own interpretation on par with local figures. Such an attitude demonstrates his submission to the established social order described by SherriLynn Colby Bottel:

> Unsurprisingly, many of the established traditional jazz musicians I spoke to feel they have something to protect and preserve—for insiders and outsiders alike. Accordingly, these musicians expect newcomers to first learn to play traditional jazz in the "New Orleans way": To know the city's musical lore, to learn the songs and aesthetics that comprise the core of the musical tradition, and to respect those New Orleanian musicians who came before. Established musicians often

[283] Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming,* 96.

> tell me that newcomers must learn the local way before expecting to contribute their artistic mark on the scene.[284]

Even though Aukes spent time "showing his chops" and "checking his thoughts" until receiving the approval of established New Orleans masters, offering his own recordings as a model of New Orleans feel would be presumptuous and go against social pecking order within the tradition. In this sense, Aukes's does not pretend to claim the authority of a master of the style, but rather that of a credible reporter.

For many jazz researchers, the option to draw upon a performance background is very valuable in gaining the trust and confidence of the professional musicians they hope to work with. When Ingrid Monson began her dissertation research, she leaned heavily on her reputation as a trumpet player at the New England conservatory as most musicians seemed to have little regard for scholarly writings about improvisation.[285] She also notes that musicians seemed to categorize her work as a type of journalism that was not likely to get them wide exposure on any reasonable timeline.[286] As a professional drummer who has studied the idiom in depth, Aukes is able to relate to his informants more as a colleague rather than as a subordinate in the "peculiar type of asymmetrical relationship" James Kippen describes as typical of the master-apprentice in ethnomusicological fieldwork ("in which we cannot participate as equals, or share our songs and stories

---

[284] SherriLynn Colby-Bottel, "Transposing the Tradition: The Social Production of Authenticity and Sincerity in Post-Katrina New Orleans Jazz" (PhD diss., University of Virginia, 2012), 62-63.
[285] Ingrid Monson, *Saying Something: Jazz Improvisation and Interaction* Chicago (IL: University of Chicago Press, 1997), 11.
[286] Ibid, 17.

around campfires, or enter into a mutually revelatory dialogue."[287]). Aukes is able to gain the support of his informants through his drumming expertise but also offers them exposure both internationally (through Aukes's career in Europe) and across generations by featuring these musicians as masters in an accessible workbook with potential to reach younger musicians.

Much more so than previous sources, Aukes's writing is openly inviting to a reader and functions like a workbook: it is laid out in such a way that readers might pick and choose what they wish to absorb. As an outsider to the tradition, Aukes shifts the focus from tradition bearers who have been the music makers in the past to allow any interested party to join in and make music themselves. He suggests that his book was "not designed to be studied on your desk but to be played from, from your music stand."[288] In this design, short musical examples are frequently interspersed in the writing and function much more like exercises than full pieces. Aukes establishes the baseline of the New Orleans tradition via historical examples of second-line tradition as practiced by the old timers he heard through oral histories (i.e. transcribing Baby Dodds stop time on "Tain't Nobody's Business if I do" – the first recorded drum solo in New Orleans brass band tradition), but he expects students of varied backgrounds to expand on the recordings in whatever direction they choose. He writes: "For SECOND LINE does not want you all to play strictly second line music now. Take from these pages what is useful for your own rhythm section work, either swing or rock type. Get some of that rhythm

---

[287] James Kippen, "Working with the Masters," in *Shadows in the Field: New Perspective for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology,* ed. by Gregory Barz and Timothy Cooley (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 126.
[288] Aukes, *Second Line*, xv.

language into your own musical speech."[289] This experimental attitude stands in sharp relief to revivalists in the 1930s trying to preserve and document Baby Dodds's techniques. Aukes has taken the evolutionary tradition narrative built on teacher-student mentorships described by Thress, Riley, and Vidacovich and re-organized it for export across geographical boundaries.

To this end, Aukes's invitations to readers frequently employ second person narration, addressing the audience directly throughout the book. For instance, he describes a second line saying "There is such a natural sway to it, your limbs seem to step by themselves. To me it always feels as if the rhythms and the tempos were tailored to the size of my body. If you have not yet experienced this sensation, jump to page 9 for your first dance lesson. Soon you will be second lining around your room."[290] This style of second person narration, of directly addressing the reader as "you," invites them to share this experience. As Magdalena Rembowska-Pluciennik, a literary scholar who studies the recent popularity of second person narration, explains, this mode of address draws them into "the dynamics of thought processes, decision-making and action."[291] For an outsider to tradition, Aukes functions as a bridging figure. He is a musician who honors the established masters but also provides evidence to others that they too can play this music and express themselves through it regardless of their ties to New Orleans.

Though Aukes presents his book as a workbook rather than an academic study, he also utilizes scholarly sources in his work. He incorporates much of the social context he

---

[289] Ibid, xv.
[290] Ibid, xviii.
[291] Magdalena Rembowska-Pluciennik, "Second Person Narration as a Joint Action," *Language and Literature* 27, no. 3 (2018): 167.

gained from listening to older musicians talk about their craft through oral histories at Tulane's Hogan Jazz Archive, and his book was proofread and annotated by Bruce Rae Raeburn (former curator of the archive). Displaying these aspects of intellectual rigor allows Aukes to back his authority not only with testimony from a lineage of traditional drummers, but also with the institutional capital of Tulane University. The blend of street smart and book smart Aukes presents is a specifically tailored show of authority similar to the New Orleans practice of dubbing an accomplished pianist a "piano professor." When I visited New Orleans, I had a conversation with bass player James Singleton in which he described his admiration for pianist Steve Pistorious's playing saying "When he performs, school is in session." This appeal to institutional capital seems a bit ironic, because if Aukes's book were to read more like a scholarly text, it would likely feel too thick or too pretentious to some audiences.[292]

Theorizing the evolutionary narrative of New Orleans drumming, Aukes defines "second-line" as a distinct musical and social practice (through parading) which overlaps with traditional jazz but is not necessarily the same. Aukes describes second-line influence in terms of two-bar phrasing, accenting (especially with bass drum), rolling, [and] timing with the snare. The existing tradition provided a framework for new innovations as "syncopation becomes a musical goal in itself."[293] Alexander Stewart suggests that the two-bar phrasing of second line could be double-timed into a one measure sixteenth-note "rhythmic cell" in funk music which offers "a repeating 'open'

[292] I base this assertion of amazon user reviews for a variety of scholarly texts on jazz music. Users frequently comment on overly technical, cold, or overly-analytical language talking over their head, and poor resolution in notated musical examples.
[293] Ibid, 41.

and 'closed' foundation that oscillates between downbeats and syncopation. This kind of asymmetrical time cycle is also suggestive of West African drumming."[294] Given these connections, it makes sense that Aukes concludes that New Orleans drummers, with their second line drumming and creation of the drum set, "provided us with the rhythmic DNA to all the various 20th century drum styles."[295] Such a conclusion, however, seems to me to push the limits of the evolutionary tree narrative. Can we really definitively pinpoint New Orleans drummers as the origin point of syncopation in modern music? Certainly, the city served as an important port of cultural exchange, and the local drummers were responsible for many important innovations, but I am confident that many rhythms and syncopations could be traced to other parts of the world presenting syncopation as the product of many musical exchanges. For example, John Storm Roberts notes how the habanera rhythm became all the rage in New Orleans after it was introduced by the band of the Eighth Regiment of Mexican Cavalry during their visit for the World's Industrial and Cotton Centennial Exposition which New Orleans hosted in 1884-85.[296] Considering an evolutionary narrative of music history we eventually reach a point of sweeping generalization where its usefulness and accuracy becomes questionable. With this kind of approach, I don't see Aukes's use of the evolutionary narrative bringing the same kind of prestige other musicians enjoyed from positioning themselves within the evolutionary

---

[294] Alexander Stewart, "'Funky Drummer': New Orleans, James Brown, and the Rhythmic Transformation of American Music," *Popular Music* 19, No. 3 (October 2000): 305.
[295] Aukes, *Second Line,* xix.
[296] John Storm Roberts, *The Latin Tinge: The Impact of Latin American Music on the United States* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 35-36.

narrative. Rather than place himself in line with those who have gone before, he develops his authority through extensive documentation and analysis of other artists.

Most notably in comparison to the other sources, Aukes devotes a lot of space in his book to the two-person parade drumming style (One on bass drum/cymbal and another on snare) and showing how their parts were reconfigured to be played by one person in early drum set techniques. While other drummers had referenced the dual drumming style in relation to the history of the drum set, Aukes's analysis of a continuous exchange between parade drumming and drum set styles over the 20th century makes a lot of connections which may have existed in the minds of musicians but were not documented extensively in pedagogical materials. By documenting these connections and transcribing obscure historical recordings, Aukes is offering his own valuable contribution to this tradition. He suggests that New Orleans drummers, with their exposure to second-line rhythms, create much more syncopated textures than their northern contemporaries citing a comparison between Tony Sbarbaro's cymbal crashes on the ODJB recording "At the Jazz Band Ball" and the more militaristic drumming of John Lucas in recordings of Earl Fuller's Famous Jazz Band (a northern group also recording in 1917). Aside from rhythm patterns, he notes other regional peculiarities such as the early jazz bands playing in a line formation with string bass and drums positioned at opposite ends breaking up the precise time unity of a modern rhythm section. This makes more sense when considered as a carry-over from early parade order where the

tuba leads and the drums bring up the rear sandwiching the band between the bass sounds of the ensemble.[297]

Aukes also seeks to "reveal that Dixie and funk drum roots are more strongly entangled than is usually recognized."[298] Such an idea is not necessarily new (Thress's writing covers a lot of connections to R&B, Funk, Motown), but Aukes addresses these connections much more explicitly. He begins describing a street scene where figures who appear in his book chapters on different time periods and styles collide:

> Early 1962 saxophonist Harold Dejan had recently gathered a new band playing in the traditional parade style and on March 10, 1962, "Dejan's Olympia Brass Band" played its first funeral job. Dejan had veteran Booker T Glass on bass drum and on snare was Paul Barbarin. Barbarin replaced Cie Frazier who was off with the Eureka Brass Band (see Part One) on another funeral, that same day.
>
> The man who's funeral it was, Walter "Papoose" Nelson, had been the electric guitarist in the much celebrated band of Fats Domino (see Part Two), up until the time of his early death.
>
> Just some years earlier Papoose Nelson in turn, had been teaching the electric guitar to a 'young white kid' named Mac Rebennack, who would soon gain fame as Dr. John The Night Tripper (see Part Three).[299]

Given the range of musicians in this story, Aukes emphasizes the social aspect of musical blending in a city where musicians of different generations and styles frequently intermingle.

Diverging from a focus on jazz drumming and the evolution of the drum set, Aukes suggests that the influence of the two-man rhythm section persists much further

---

[297] Aukes, *Second Line,* 24.
[298] Ibid, xv. Aukes is not consistent with his terminology as he traces this influence through "dixie" and funk drum roots (sometime using "dixieland" sometimes as synonym for early jazz, other times specifying that it refers more explicitly to white bands playing in Chicago with a greater focus on solos than collective playing). However, he clearly differentiates the early jazz tradition from the parade style through separate chapters and instrumentation.
[299] Ibid, 37.

beyond early jazz drumming. As jazz styles would give way to R&B and funk, Aukes frequently returns to the parade style in conversation with more modern musical innovations throughout the book. For example, as he describes the mixture of Latin rhythms in R&B drumming, Aukes recalls Jelly Roll Morton's use of the "Latin tinge" in early jazz.[300] He takes the connection back even further saying: "I believe the supposed line of influence given here, explains how the black (two men) brass band style supported the inflow of Afro-Caribbean percussion structures and percussionists approach characteristic of all New Orleans drumming."[301] Later, noting the complex syncopations in a transcription of Rebirth Brass Band, he illustrates how the dual drummer approach made it possible to execute grooves that would be extremely difficult for a single person to play on drum set.[302] Diving further into R&B, Aukes points out that Fats Domino's "I'm Gonna Be a Wheel Someday" samples the break from the Young Tuxedo Brass Band recording "John Casimir's Whooping Blues" and repurposes it as an intro. This example shows that many New Orleans artists "injected" the popular music of their day with traditional second line influence.[303]

Aukes makes the evolutionary jump from second line to funk via a story about drummer Clayton Fillyau creating the James Brown beat after listening to "Hungry" Williams play "When the Saints Go Marchin' In" in a traditional style with double downbeats on the bass drum (an account also acknowledged and quoted by other

---

[300] Ibid, 43.
[301] Ibid, xv.
[302] Ibid, 90.
[303] Ibid, 74.

scholars).[304] Aukes adds that this narrative was not simply a one-way relationship from second-line to other styles of popular music. His description of the Dirty Dozen Brass band as "a group of young musicians [which] sums up all the modern musical ideas and makes them fit the brass band mold" shows how these modern drum set innovations come full circle and revitalize the dual drum parading format. By outlining the exchange between dual drumming parade format and drum set players in other styles through his evolutionary narrative of the 20th century, Aukes theorizes a contiguous tradition of second line drumming in which drummers are constantly borrowing from and conversing with other musical styles.

Categorizing tradition in this way (borrowing and conversing with patterns), Aukes's invitation to students to experiment with the rhythmic vocabulary of New Orleans drumming seems a logical extension of what "tradition" means to him. As a geographical outsider to the New Orleans tradition, his relationship with traditional jazz has played out more deeply through prolonged engagement with recordings which demonstrate local musical vocabulary. His relationships with living New Orleans musicians play a significant role in validating his authority, but their personal musical vocabulary is not necessarily the main focus of his study. Though he cites sources and

---

[304] Ibid, 67. The James Brown-second line connection is explored in: Alexander Stewart, "'Funky Drummer': New Orleans, James Brown, and the Rhythmic Transformation of American Music," *Popular Music* 19, No. 3 (October 2000): 293-318. Stewart claims that Fillyau could not remember the name of the drummer who taught him New Orleans rhythms when Huey Smith and the Clowns came through his hometown in St. Petersburg, FL. Aukes does not cite a source to definitively claim it was 'Hungry' Williams. Also see: Benjamin Doleac, "Strictly Second Line: Funk, Jazz, and the New Orleans Beat," *Ethnomusicology Review* 18 (2003), https://ethnomusicologyreview.ucla.edu/journal/volume/18/piece/699.

directs readers to recordings he transcribes, his book is packaged with a CD which demonstrates Aukes's own performances of these excerpts. These factors to me that Aukes recognizes the authority of New Orleans musicians, yet the personal "shade" of tradition he emphasizes in his book involves learning vocabulary from recordings over a social bond with others.

The Balance of Objectified VS Social Tradition

Each of these authors offer theoretical frameworks and narratives about New Orleans drumming which are useful yet have limitations. Like the concept of collectively improvising horns, we needn't throw out such useful frameworks, yet we cannot entirely depend on them. As William Howland Kenney points out in his study of early jazz discography, theoretical binary frameworks devised by early critics (such as hot jazz vs sweet commercial dance music) were initially useful ways of defining the music. Over time, however, we have come to understand how those binaries have the potential to overshadow the complexity of history and become overly restrictive in the present.[305]

Analyzing these sources, I noticed consistently how they have dually shaped the New Orleans style of drumming as both a set of objects (rhythms, techniques, songs, recordings, instruments) and also a social relationship (teacher to student, family music making, bandmember to bandmember, and musician to non-musician). While earlier sources like the Dodds recordings lean more towards the preservation of an objectified

[305] William Howland Kenney, "Historical Context and the Definition of Jazz: Putting More of the History in 'Jazz History,'" in *Jazz Among the Discourses*, ed. Krin Gabbard (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995): 102-103.

tradition created by a small geographically and racially bounded social group, Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress present the evolution of New Orleans style passing through generations of artists and musical evolutions to form an evolutionary narrative, a well of common musical vocabulary from which musicians can draw as they perform across genre boundaries. Aukes expands this even further by making the tradition available regardless of geographic boundaries (through the transmission of objectified tradition based in musical vocabulary).

Following the trail of this gradually looser, community-centric perspective on tradition eventually allows for the possibility that a non-playing traditional jazz fan might be more steeped in tradition than an accomplished musician who plays many styles of music but only occasionally gigs in a traditional jazz style. Dan Thress, Fred Ramsey, or Bill Russell would certainly qualify as important tradition bearers under such a framework. In some ways, their contributions have potentially had a greater impact on current students than the musicians who perform(ed) traditional jazz. While titles like "master" or "middleman" inherently imply a hierarchical power structure, a number of scholars (such as Christopher Small with his concept of *Musicking*) have advocated for considering music making with a view of the interconnectedness of all involved (particularly those who may not identify as performers and composers).[306] Sherrie Tucker, for example, draws upon this line of argumentation in her treatment of non-playing New Orleans jazzwomen like garden party entrepreneur Betsy Cole or religious

---

[306] Christopher Small, *Musicking,* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1998).

figures like Mother Catherine Seals.[307] Including these figures within the social tradition expands the framework beyond relationships between musicians and provides valuable context which we miss out on simply tracing the evolutionary narrative of musical innovations.

Attempting to define tradition through objectified rhythm patterns also becomes problematic. As David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark pointed out in their volume *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries*:

> jazz possesses no essential characteristics. Some jazz performances swing; others feature a different groove or no groove at all. Some jazz highlights improvisation; some of it is meticulously planned in advance (a point of view even that improviser par excellence Charlie Parker maintained). 7 Some jazz adopts an unflinchingly "important" and anticommercial stance; much of it openly courts the marketplace or invites us simply to have a good time. Some jazz musicians possess a strong moral compass and toil to build a more just society; others are self-centered louts.[308]

I find Sherrie Tucker's illustration of deconstruction gone-too-far helpful here: "Is jazz studies completely open to everything jazz means to all people in all instances? I call this dilemma, 'When Sponge Bob leaps in, does Lester Leap Out?,' and it chills me to the bone."[309] Each of these New Orleans drumming sources defines certain things like press rolls, bass drum accents, and varying the texture behind soloists as clearly defined

---

[307] Sherrie Tucker, "A Feminist Perspective on Early New Orleans Jazzwomen," *New Orleans Jazz National Historic Park Louisiana,* accessed Feb 28, 2020, https://www.nps.gov/jazz/learn/historyculture/upload/New_Orleans_Jazzwomen_RS-2.pdf, 15.

[308] David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark, "Introduction," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries*, ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 12-13.

[309] Sherrie Tucker, "Deconstructing the Jazz Tradition: The 'Subjectless Subject' of New Jazz Studies," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 215.

elements of traditional jazz drumming. They also note other things that are peripherally related (Baby Dodds's drumstick nervebeats, two-man style parade drumming, and later stylistic evolutions like R&B and funk). Clearly, all of these things can NOT be traditional jazz, but clearly they ARE in some ways.

As these jazz scholars have wrestled with the jazz/not jazz discursive binary, traditional jazz is likewise many contradictory things simultaneously. New Orleans drumming is often about specific rhythmic patterns, but it is also about micro-rhythm. It is about bass drum accents, but it is also about press rolls and cymbals. It is about social relationships, but in a digital age those relationships may begin or play out through published pedagogical materials (on paper and online). It is many things, but clearly not infinite (because at some point second line becomes salsa).

Authorities come in many varieties with different motivations (preservationist, player, teacher, researcher, New Orleans native/foreigner, white/black). In my opinion, all these perspectives are valuable when defining the genre. Even though this means there is not a clean and easy way to define things, each voice adds new layers of understanding in both the ways that they reaffirm and complicate the others. For young musicians it can be quite overwhelming to make sense of diverse and seemingly conflicting voices telling them how traditional jazz (or any jazz for that matter) "should" be performed, yet allowing this tension in collective definition is very important in making sense all the variations of traditional jazz style which have emerged over the last century.

Coda: Imitating Baby Dodds

Circling back to my initial concerns as an educator who teaches students to play in a traditional jazz style, the above discussions of pedagogical authority and historical accuracy have important implications for jazz students because of the way they perpetuate a given focus. This section looks deeper at the modern extension of the 1930s revivalist's emphasis on preservation. In 2013, Italian drummer Giuseppe Urso posted a video performance of his Baby Dodds transcription on YouTube and received the following criticism from another musician "Doctorlloydmiller":

> Great that someone is interested in Baby Dodds' style. But the main thing is that he only played on the wooden rim of a huge bass drum often using two sticks together as much as possible which resembled two or more African drummers. Playing on the silly little rim of a snare or tom tom sounds really sissy and lacks the big powerful honkin' roar of the bass drum rim played, not with the ends of the sticks, but with the whole body about 1/3 of the way from the tips. Also a real maple block is a MUST; those phony fake ones sound like junk. The best would be an old 1890s bass held together with a zigzag rope like the original Turkish davul. First we need to get the set right then play the licks.[310]

Despite the Dodds's experimentalism and the revivalists' folk idealizations, the 1958 Dodds recordings are now seen as primary source material for the study of early jazz performance techniques and drummers who can assimilate aspects of Dodds's playing into their own performance can attempt to claim the authority of authenticity. As the above quote shows, the recordings have become such powerful objects that they even spawn followers who insist on imitating the setup of Dodds's drum kit.

---

[310] Doctorlloydmiller, comment on "Baby Dodds Transcription by Giuseppe Urso," video by realworld111, posted May 16, 2013, accessed Dec 1, 2017, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nsVZjSq2YPA.

The authoritative reverence bestowed upon Dodds's setup may offer a host of unfamiliar sounds to the contemporary drummer accustomed to modern drum kits. It may also offer a sense of validity to those who value the vintage instrument aesthetic, but mere imitation can actually go so far as to erase the modern performer (notice that Doctorlloydmiller's YouTube comment mentions nothing of Urso's performance or interpretive choices). As much as fans of historical instrumentation heap importance upon appropriate instrumentation, scholars have frequently dispelled the notion that this can be accepted as a faithful representation of the past; rather, it is a re-imagining grounded in the modern performer's values. This has been debated frequently in the early music revival genre as musicians attempted to sell "historically informed performance" and "period appropriate instruments" as pathways to authenticity but instead have been accused of fetishizing historical documents and instrumental hardware.[311] At the same time, Dodds's setup was unique and definitely informed his playing style. His 28-inch bass drum would have sounded notably different than the 18- or 20-inch drums more common in jazz playing today.[312] Additionally, some techniques made popular by Dodds (such as drumming on the rim of the bass drum) would be more physically difficult to execute on a bass drum which is significantly lower and further away from the snare drum head. In Dodds's recordings, he mentions that bass drum sound preference varied among musicians. Bunk Johnson preferred a big and booming sound while King Oliver wanted it muffled (and let's not forget the many bands who simply play whatever bass

[311] John Butt, "Acting up a text: the scholarship of performance and the performance of scholarship" review of *Text and Act,* by Richard Taruskin, *Early Music,* May 1996: 325.
[312] Matt Brennan, *Kick It: A Social History of the Drum Kit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020), 90.

drum they've got and can stand carrying around in the street for long periods of time).[313] Other key differences from modern drum sets include that Dodds refused to integrate the hi hat into his setup, preferring to keep time with his press roll (though William Ludwig reportedly measured his foot for the prototype sock cymbal), and non-tunable Chinese tom toms.[314]

Doctorlloydmiller's fixation on vintage instruments also reinforces a strong masculine aesthetic in a historically informed performance of New Orleans jazz. On the one hand, framing traditional jazz with masculine language does have strong historical precedent: Thomas Brothers describes the world of early New Orleans jazz as a "fraternal world" where "women were almost completely excluded from the scene of professional musicians."[315] There was also little tolerance for homosexuality as Pops Foster remarked, "We'd call them 'Sissies' or say 'Look at that faggot up there.'"[316] On the other hand, Sherrie Tucker points out that "unless researchers ask 'where are the women?' they are more likely than not to miss significant contributions of women."[317] Tucker addresses the contributions of instrumentalists such as pianists Lovie Austin, Dolly Adams, Emma Barrett, and Jeanette Kimball, trumpeter Ann Cooper, and bassist Olivia Sophia L'Ange Porter Shipp as well as women who played vital roles in traditional jazz such as "garden

---

[313] Baby Dodds, "Drums in the Twenties – 1. Jazzin' Babies Blues 2. Wild Man Blues," 1951, on *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos,* 6:41, accessed Nov 28, 2017, https://open.spotify.com/track/2DOkpJcJaVeRzECXHPwEQE
[314] Rick Mattingly, "Warren 'Baby' Dodds," PAS Hall of Fame, Percussive Arts Society, accessed Jan 14th, 2020, https://www.pas.org/about/hall-of-fame/warren-baby-dodds.
[315] Thomas Brothers, *Louis Armstrong's New Orleans,* (New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company, Inc., 2006), 198.
[316] Ibid, 201.
[317] Sherrie Tucker, "A Feminist Perspective on Early New Orleans Jazzwomen," 1-2,

party entrepreneur Betsy Cole, religious figures such as Mother Catherine Seals, and jazz fans, jazz club members, and revivalists such as Myra Menville."[318] Beyond the mere inclusion of these figures in historical narratives, Tucker questions what role "sounding feminine" or "sounding masculine" have in our conceptions of jazz aesthetics.[319] Given Doctorlloydmiller's criteria for authentic performance of Baby Dodds's style, would his comments change if the drummer in the video were female? Would he still advocate a "powerful honkin' roar" and avoidance of "sissy" rim playing? Such positioning of the masculine vs feminine as strong vs weak might be unfortunately common in masculine-dominated jazz culture but in this situation I also find it inconsistent with Dodds's drumming aesthetic. Dodds told Larry Gara (who compiled Dodds's biography) regarding his favorite drum solo he ever recorded: "I used the rims of my snare drum to get the effect I wanted."[320] To me, this suggests that Dodds regarded the rim as simply another color available in his sound palate as opposed to a hierarchically strong vs sissy sound.

While there is historical precedent for Doctorlloydmiller's characterizations of Baby Dodds's style, his conception of tradition as a clearly defined object is simply one perspective. In contrast (regarding historically informed performance in early music), Richard Taruskin has pushed for a concept of tradition as "cumulative, multiply authored, open, accommodating, and above all *messy,* and therefore human."[321] Part of the

---

[318] Ibid, 15.
[319] Ibid, 11.
[320] Larry Gara, *The Baby Dodds Story* (Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press, 1992), 84.
[321] Richard Taruskin, *Text and Act* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), 192.

challenge in defining tradition this way is that it requires us to own our own opinions rather than present them as objective fact. Likewise, describing modern ethnomusicological fieldwork, Jeff Todd Titon suggests that it is not enough to simply observe and collect our subject of study, but we must consider "what it is like for a person (ourselves included) to make and to know music as lived experience."[322] By acknowledging ourselves, our sources, and the mediated connections we have with them, we begin to create our own complex interactions with tradition that are necessarily separate from the original source (but no less valuable).

This scholarly perspective is more openly honest, yet I feel it is important to acknowledge how it rubs against the romanticism of the traditional jazz market. SherriLynn Colby-Bottel interviewed street musicians in New Orleans after Hurricane Katrina and found that the visual aesthetic was not insignificant:

> Ben [Polcer of the Loose Marbles] mentioned to me one day that having a collection of people who looked like they weren't from the local university helped. He said that "having all these dirty [traveler] kids come play" probably made tourists think that all the Loose Marbles were street kids, and tourists seem to be romantic about that sort of thing when it comes to tipping. If the tourists wanted to tip because someone hasn't showered, that is fine with the Marbles, so long as everyone understands that the music is the bottom line.[323]

This suggests to me a productive tension between a factual music tradition and a romantic aesthetic. It was in fact folk-romanticism which drove the preservation efforts of the early New Orleans revivalists. While scholarship may criticize those who claim historical authenticity or focus on historic objects, these aspects may be tremendously important to

---

[322] Titon, "Knowing Fieldwork," 25.
[323] Colby-Bottel, "Transposing the Tradition," 208.

a performer's act, and groups who are able to harness the fantasies of their audience through their visual style are likely to be much more successful.

Beyond imitating drum kit setup, the preservationist mindset has of course led drummers to tackle the difficult project of transcribing Dodds's drumming. The already difficult task is further complicated by the ambiguity of the source materials and the abundance of free user-generated instructional content on the internet. To illustrate, I have included links to two YouTube videos and comment exchanges between two drummers (Bernie Koenig and Jon Petters) seeking to provide information about Baby Dodds[324] Koenig's video appears authoritative because the production quality seems professional. He also mentions teaching jazz history courses bolstering his credibility as a "professor." Yet, his drumming demonstrations are very sloppy and, in my opinion, bear little resemblance to Dodds's sound. While some commenters recognize the poor drumming and wonder if it is a joke, the video still received a surprising amount of positive feedback, perhaps further inciting critics to call Koenig out on his mistakes. Jon Petters, a professional drummer from the UK, argued with Koenig about a number of points and made his own video to better represent Dodds's style. Petters's begins his video stating his motivation to clarify misleading YouTube videos. He also traces his own authoritative lineage through musicians he has played with in his 25 year career: Art Hodes and Wild Bill Davison (musicians who played with Dodds). Petters's video is in

[324] Bernie Koenig, "Rhythmically Speaking Chapter One Baby Dodds," *YouTube* video, May 2, 2008, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zAYRXISv7g8.
See Jon Petters response at: jonpetters, "Baby Dodds – An Appreciation," *Youtube* video, Feb 1, 2009, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WCup7MfJJ2k&t=93s.

my assessment a more solid representation of Dodds's style and offers reliable and useful information about jazz drum set on early recordings.

Part of the confusion between these two videos stems from the Baby Dodds's press roll demonstration in a video Bill Russell made (a silent film with overdubbed music which ironically further obscures Dodds unique press roll).[325] Petters chooses to avoid the out-of-sync Bill Russell video footage inviting the viewer to compare the two based on sound rather than visual cues. In his earlier comments to Koenig, Petters suggests he listen to "Careless Love Blues" and the "Press Roll Demonstration" in order to clarify that Dodds's basic pattern consists of: "beat one as a tap, beat two as a tap with one hand and a roll with the other, beat 3 a tap, beat 4 a tap and roll."[326] While I agree with Petters's interpretation, listening to "Careless Love Blues," I can see the potential for confusion as the audio clip actually begins with a tap in one hand and a roll in the other while the bass drum keeps time playing every beat.

Many of the Dodds recordings can be interpreted/transcribed in a variety of different ways. The instrumental tracks on *Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos* ("Careless Love Blues," "Rudiments with Drumstick Nervebeats," "Maryland," "Spooky Drums No. 1," and "Spooky Drums No. 2," and "Tom Tom Workout") do not begin with even a count-off or include instrumental accompaniment to show how the drumming might match up with an actual tune. Comparing the notation of Riley's approach to the

---

[325] Billy Ponzio Jazz, "BABY DODDS (Full Film) –'NEW ORLEANS DRUMMING,'" *YouTube* video, March 7, 2018, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1IMMeEWD-2A.
[326] Johnpetters comments on: Bernie Koenig, "Rhythmically Speaking Chapter One Baby Dodds," *YouTube* video, May 2, 2008, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zAYRXISv7g8.

press roll from *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming*, it is notable that the transcriber places the bass drum on the down beats and the press rolls on the off beats. This basic roll sounds the same as Dodds's recordings, but is notated in double time (1 measure of eighth notes as opposed to 2 measures of quarter notes). Conceiving of the rhythm in this way has a number of advantages (for one, it makes a written drum chart half as many pages), but I believe it also encourages a "follow-through" from each press roll leading to the successive bass drum hit.[327] While it may offer some potential advantages, it also clashes with the popular notion of a big four (accented bass drum hit on every other fourth beat) as the accent would now happen every measure on the offbeat of beat four.

The track "Careless Love" is particularly deceiving, As I listened and sang the melody of the tune along to Dodds's drumming, I was led to make the assumption that the audio started rolling late and the first audible beat is beat 2 of the first measure based on where Dodds placed fills and delineated the form of the song—namely the roll beginning a 0:15 coinciding with the ascending melodic line of the last 8 bars of the tune and the two tom-tom strokes at 0:36 delineating the top of a new chorus. A young jazz student who lacked familiarity with the basic tune would likely find this unaccompanied drum track more frustrating than enlightening. The track "Maryland" has a clearer beginning and seems to follow a regular march multi-strain form: 4 bar introduction

---

[327] As Baby Dodds imitates other drummers' incorrect version of his press roll, he plays the press roll as though it were accented in its own right and does not lead smoothly into the next downbeat, to which one of the revivalists remarks "They don't follow through." Baby Dodds, "Shimmy Beat and Press Roll Demonstration," *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos,* 0:11-0:28.

followed by 16 bar sections that are usually delineated by a crash cymbal. However, in the case of both tracks, given that the drumming is unaccompanied (aside from Dodds's occasional faint humming in the background), it is left to our imagination to envision how he might be complementing the melody. Dodds later said that both these tunes were "very familiar" to him and that he "played them just as [he] would have with a band" but that "it was very difficult because [he] had no melody to follow. [He] had drums alone and nothing else to help out."[328]

While I am delighted that the Dodds solo recordings exist, the revivalists' preservational focus has led drummers to either argue over the faithfulness of one's imitation or simply ignore them in favor of other more user-friendly sources. Ultimately, trying to copy Dodds's style is a valuable exercise, yet it is only one view of tradition. Thress offers a quote from Dodds on how he learned his press roll which expands our perspective:

> I got my press roll from Henry Zeno, Henry Martin, and Tubby Hall. The guy who used it most effectively was Henry Martin. He played with Kid Ory and it was very effective. It was a pretty hard thing to learn but I worked at it until I got it. Of course I did it in my own way and according to my ability and it never was exactly like someone else's. I used to study the rolls of different drummers at dances and in parades and worked out a long press roll which I preferred to the shorter ones.[329]

Aukes also notes how interviews with New Orleans drummers reinforce that each drummer had their own approach to the press roll.[330] These sources broaden the

[328] Gara, *The Baby Dodds Story,* 83.
[329] Riley, Vidacovich, and Thress, *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming,* 13.
[330] Aukes, *Second Line,* 5.

perspective of imitation to invite us to appropriate historical techniques to our own abilities and tastes.

With this context, we can see that the revivalists' focus on preservation fosters a focus on imitation of historical instruments, techniques, and aesthetics which continues in the modern day. I suspect many of these elements serve to facilitate a modern-day equivalent of folk-fascination where musicians and audiences can more easily re-imagine the New Orleans music of the 1920s (just as the revivalists did). However, as I have illustrated above, confining our approach to imitation/preservation clearly has some downfalls. Though preservation is certainly an important aspect of traditional jazz, it is simply one of many perspectives (none of which are a neutral take). By recognizing how various authors construct their authority to teach traditional jazz, we consider their motivations and note how they color the subject with the points which stand out as most important. This approach allows us to define the genre in much richer detail and recognize the problematic elements of history we would rather not emulate.

CHAPTER 3

TRADITIONAL VS MODERN JAZZ IN THE UNIVERSITY CURRICULUM

When Dave Robinson (founder of the Traditional Jazz Educator's Network and former traditional jazz combo instructor at George Mason University in Virginia) went to college in the 1970s, the single jazz professor who taught big band, private lessons, and jazz history spoke of traditional jazz in quite condescending terms: "Dixieland isn't jazz, it's just Dixieland…. But of course, you should check out where we've been in order to better appreciate where we are."[331] Such an anecdote illustrates the tenuous relationship between traditional jazz and jazz education which I will explore more deeply in this chapter. As the mid-century division of traditional and modern jazz (which I identified in chapter one) placed earlier and later styles of jazz in aesthetic opposition, traditional jazz would generally be left out of college curriculums as jazz education was built around the aesthetics emphasized by proponents of modern jazz. Though traditional jazz is often awarded a place of honor in jazz history classes, it was not often awarded the same "art music" status as other subgenres within university jazz programs). Studying and performing both these styles as a young jazz student, I often recognized how my mentors and fellow students ranked these categories hierarchically according to their preference. Traditional jazz, with its simpler harmonies, collectively improvised polyphony, and broad (though not universal) characterization as popular music often does not command the same artistic reverence as modern jazz styles, because many see it as less complex, less technically demanding, or less expressively profound. While fans and musicians may

[331] Dave Robinson, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020.

passionately defend traditional jazz and explicate the depths of its complexity and expressiveness, this is not the purpose of my study. Rather, I intend to show how the aesthetic clash of traditional jazz and university jazz education relates to larger issues of canon construction and interdisciplinary collaboration in jazz studies more broadly.

While different types of jazz might be appraised under a variety of different qualifiers, David Ake (musicologist/jazz pianist at University of Miami) has shown through a case study focused on John Coltrane recordings that oftentimes the recordings which are imitated and praised within university jazz education are those which are easily evaluable using existing pedagogical systems (primarily growing out of standards established by western classical music). Music which does not fit this mold is therefore excluded from definitions of "good jazz" (or labelled not jazz).[332] Along these same lines, traditional jazz has often been sidelined or even denigrated to the prehistory of jazz as art. For example in 1956, Andre Hodeir described the Armstrong Hot Five recordings as still "a long way from having found the equilibrium that characterizes true classicism."[333] Many of the traditional jazz musicians and educators I spoke with have faced similar opposition in their careers. Steve Call (professor emeritus at Brigham Young University-Provo, UT, founder of the Jazz Legacy Band) told the story of taking a student Dixieland band to perform at the Lionel Hampton Jazz Festival in the mid 1990s and receiving mixed feedback from the adjudicators. While one gave glowing praise, another left comments like "Why are you playing Dixieland at a jazz festival? Dixieland is not jazz!

---

[332] David Ake, *Jazz Cultures* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002), 113.
[333] Andre Hodeir, *Jazz: Its Evolution and Essence* (New York: Grove Press Inc, 1956), 26.

You guys should be listening to Freddie Hubbard and Sonny Rollins… this doesn't belong at a festival like this."[334] Though this resistance has certainly relaxed in more recent years, the fact remains that much of university jazz education is centered around a jazz canon which does not feature traditional jazz prominently as music to be performed, enjoyed, and appreciated in contemporary contexts. Ben Polcer (professional jazz trumpeter) studied jazz at the University of Michigan but has also recognized that his experience was different from most other students:

> "I played the traditional tune 'Way Down Yonder in New Orleans' for my audition, but I think they were looking for some Miles Davis or Charlie Parker tunes. ... I was a joke to them. I didn't play be-bop." He says he didn't hear music the way instructors wanted him to. He heard it the way he learned it—through melodies, simpler chord changes, and more collaborative improvisation. His instructors wanted him to hear complex chord extensions and harmonic rather than melodic improvisational lines.[335]

Polcer's experience illustrates how traditional jazz does not necessarily line up with the values of later styles. Though many programs have gradually embraced more diverse strains of jazz, students continue to feel frustration with being forced to fit the mold of a curriculum they feel doesn't necessarily fit their interests. Colin Hancock (professional jazz cornetist, founder of the Cornell Syncopators ensemble) describes how he reached a breaking point in a combo rehearsal as his instructor advised him to forgo his interest in earlier musical vocabulary and "try more of a Miles Davis approach" on the tune "Body and Soul" (a tune popularized long before the height of Davis's popularity).[336] Mike

---

[334] Steve Call, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020.
[335] Ben Polcer, quoted in SherriLynn Colby-Bottel, "Transposing the Tradition: The Social Production of Authenticity and Sincerity in Post-Katrina New Orleans Jazz" (PhD diss., University of Virginia, 2012), 191.
[336] Colin Hancock, interview with the author, October 20th, 2020.

Davis (professional jazz trumpeter) studying at Manhattan School of Music also experienced active discouragement from his professors regarding his interest in early jazz. Comments like "'you can't do this' and 'no one wants to hear this,' or 'that music is old and irrelevant' and 'you'll never make it'" did not make sense to the young trumpeter as he felt he was finding many more paying gigs to play older jazz than his classmates interested in more contemporary styles. In response, Davis said, "I developed a real chip on my shoulder. I concluded that I had to do my own musical research."[337]

As I heard stories like the ones I listed above regarding discrimination against earlier forms of jazz in the university, I began to notice how the genres of modern and traditional were aesthetically distinguished from each other by the ways they took inspiration from the past. Historical context and preservation is often foregrounded in traditional jazz groups—performers would often introduce tunes with an anecdote or some background on those who wrote it. Many concerts in this style were designed as short history lessons discussing the origins of jazz in New Orleans, the role of each instrument, second line parades, etc. Audiences therefore expected these historical presentations and received historical recreations with enthusiasm. I suspect this aspect grew out of the folk fantasies and preservationist efforts of the 1940s jazz revivalists which I have described in the previous chapters. The manner in which the revivalists and hot collectors enjoyed traditional jazz has never gone away. Audiences continued to find pleasure in nostalgia, re-imagining the past based on music from earlier eras. With this

---

[337] Brian Sheridan, "Mike Davis Finds the Way Back," Medium, posted Jan 11, 2018, accessed Nov 30, 2020, https://medium.com/@brianrsheridan/mike-davis-finds-the-way-back-23709b126619

aesthetic, traditional jazz performers who have transcribed and replicated recordings as closely as possible (as Colin Hancock's Cornell Syncopators did with the recordings of the Original Dixieland Jass Band for the 100th anniversary of their first recordings) would be no doubt applauded for their work. In contrast, professional performers in modern styles generally strive to produce a unique contribution which might take inspiration from the past but does not simply imitate other musicians. While the group Mostly Other People Do the Killing's album *Blue* (a painstaking replication of Miles Davis's *Kind of Blue* created in the spirit of social commentary) the album attracted significant criticism (even hate mail) from the wider jazz community.[338] Likely such criticism of imitation in more modern forms of jazz grows from, as Eitan Wilf observed, "modern sensibilities that abhor imitation and see it as antithetical to creativity."[339] Professional performers are expected to retain their individual voice and creative stamp even when imitating another musician. While I am making very broad generalizations of these genres, the differing treatment of preservation and historical performance in traditional styles illustrates one of the ways in which this genre diverges from the mold of later styles.

As I began to coach traditional jazz ensembles in the university, my musicology training led me to recognize the aesthetics rifts between traditional and modern jazz and

---

[338] See: Christopher Harrington, "Jazz at the Century Mark: Taking a Trip Back to the Beginning," *Ithaca.com,* Feb 23, 2017, accessed Dec 23, 2020, https://www.ithaca.com/entertainment/music/jazz-at-the-century-mark-taking-a-trip-back-to-the-beginning/article_29d7a666-f92e-11e6-8413-cf88fd37ff7e.html. Compare: Brad Cohan, "Mostly Other People Do the Killing interview: 'If we wanted to make people mad, that's easy,'" *Time Out,* Nov 4th, 2014, accessed Dec 22nd, 2020, https://www.timeout.com/newyork/music/mostly-other-people-do-the-killing-interview-if-we-wanted-to-make-people-mad-thats-easy.

[339] Eitan Wilf, *School For Cool: The Academic Jazz Program and the Paradox of Institutionalized Creativity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2014).

consider how adapting the genre to the aesthetics of modern jazz enhanced its reputation and allowed it to belong with other jazz music in the curriculum. In order to help students understand the aesthetics of traditional jazz, I felt I had to spend some portion of the rehearsal talking about the historical and cultural aspects which led to its creation and revival throughout the 20th century. Given its reputation as music created by African Americans in New Orleans (yet primarily performed and enjoyed by whites in the present), I wanted students to understand how attitudes regarding race had not only shaped the beginnings of jazz, but also continued to shape the music and its performance today. In addition to learning to play the music, we discussed topics such as racially mixed creoles having increased access to music training, and the music making opportunities which grew out of New Orleans's popular red light district (with its reputation for light-skinned quadroon women). Additionally, the revival and preservation of early jazz by predominantly white male record collectors in the '30s and '40s, the exotic Dixieland representations of the southern United States and associated caricatures of African American people, the notion of separate white and black versions of early jazz which had evolved over the century, and the predominant whiteness of the current traditional jazz scene testify that traditional jazz is inseparably entangled in complex racial issues. Reflecting on the experience, I began to wonder to what extent these discussions grew out of my training as a musicologist and to what extent performance jazz educators in general perceived this type of discussion to be desirable.

For this chapter, I interviewed educators who had taught traditional jazz ensembles at the college level, program directors of college jazz studies departments, individuals with reputations as jazz scholars, directors of traditional jazz camps for the

public independent of any college, and others who are known primarily as jazz performers in order to more clearly delineate how traditional jazz ensembles are different from the more typical bebop-based combos of the university. What does a traditional jazz group offer to a young jazz musician in the way of musical skill development, cultural awareness, or the ability to adapt to different performance aesthetics? Because of my interests as a scholar performer, many of these interviews naturally expanded to a larger discussion about jazz education in general. To put these conversations in context, I consider the perspectives of these interviewees alongside existing discussions of jazz education by scholars like Ken Prouty, David Ake, Sherrie Tucker, Eitan Wilf, and Tony Whyton. While my focus in this chapter broadens significantly to consider larger issues in jazz education, I feel these issues are important context for my final chapter where I consider my own experience leading traditional jazz ensembles as a performer-scholar.

My work integrating historical/cultural study into ensemble rehearsals answers the charge for greater interdisciplinary collaboration between the performance and scholarly disciplines. I outline many of the challenges in pursuing greater interdisciplinary collaboration between faculty in performance and academic roles and suggest a number of paths to offering greater cultural context in performance instruction. As my first chapter documented the aesthetic associations of genre labels like "Dixieland" vs. "traditional jazz" in order to show how these terms demarcate the subject and specify what *is* and *isn't* part of the genre, this chapter builds on the work of the previously mentioned scholars in defining the goals and priorities of "jazz studies" in both its performance and scholarly manifestations. While I could simply advocate for the inclusion of traditional jazz (my area of expertise) in university curricula on the basis of

artistic merit, this becomes simply another arena for canon construction. I believe the larger issue behind including traditional jazz in a curriculum which primarily emphasizes post-1945 jazz lies in addressing the fragmented nature of "jazz studies" as a discipline, seeing how performers and scholars approach canon and historical context differently, and in exploring how we might have greater interdisciplinary collaboration to address those differences.

Recognizing the different aesthetics of these styles offers many new enriching possibilities to students, yet that diversity might be overlooked if traditional jazz is included on in the curriculum on the condition that it conforms to the existing aesthetics of music considered worthy for university study. Just as university jazz education is criticized for compromising the soul of jazz musicmaking, adapting traditional jazz to the standards of serious art music involves reconfiguring and making it more like the music already in the program. Given the established jazz canon, big band and bebop-based combos are often the default ensembles which fit the skillset of the majority of students and faculty members, so a specialty ensemble such as a traditional jazz group needs to address those circumstances by defining itself in juxtaposition to the commonly taught bebop vocabulary (emulating jazz artists from 1945-65, what some educators term the common practice period of jazz). The art music vs popular entertainment binary along with other dualisms of modern vs. traditional jazz ultimately contributed to the acceptance of the former within music conservatories.[340] Thus, traditional jazz ensembles

[340] See: Bernard Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," *Discourse*, Vol. 15, No. 3 (Spring 1993), http://www.jstor.org/stable/41389289. Also see: David Ake, *Jazz Cultures* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002), 113.

have often felt pressure to rebrand the music and emphasize how traditional jazz is just as complex, demanding, expressive, or culturally significant as bebop and classical music (music typically labelled as "art music" within a conservatory). With this in mind, I recognize that there is limited space in the curriculum, and many of the interviews I conducted began with the question of what students need to know and how we might best meet those needs within the limited space in the degree path and limits of the institutional framework. I asked jazz educators for their perspective on the educational potential of traditional jazz in order to gauge how they viewed this genre and how the differing aesthetics potentially influenced their decisions concerning which classes they felt were important to offer. In other words, I wanted to see how much canon curation translated to curriculum curation. I also wanted to see how educators balanced the standardized curriculum approach for all students with more flexible frameworks which allowed for instructor's judgement or students' interests.

Beyond cultural and historical context in traditional jazz, I investigated the potential for applying this approach in other ensemble rehearsal contexts. As I mentioned in my introduction, scholars like Mark Tucker and Sherrie Tucker called for more performance/scholarship collaboration and crossover in 1998 and 2012 respectively, yet such interdisciplinary study remains rare, perhaps because of the separation between jazz performance programs and "New Jazz Studies" scholars working in other departments like musicology, African American studies, gender studies, literature, or film which Ken Prouty described in 2011.[341] Beyond the physical separation of departments, I often

---

[341] Sherrie Tucker, "Deconstructing the Jazz Tradition: The 'Subjectless Subject' of New Jazz Studies," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles

perceive that performance programs and the faculty who run them generally support a canon constructing framework while academics usually take a more deconstructive approach. While academics and performance faculty alike recognize how both of these perspectives are valuable to students, faculty have distinctly different measures of success for which they must be accountable on their tenure evaluations (where such an interdisciplinary study does not count in the same way as a book manuscript or high-profile performance career). Such a structure does not incentivize connection between these disciplines, but rather leads scholars to "publish or perish" and performers to focus on producing graduates who are playing at a high level, winning competitions, and enhancing the profile of the institution. With my experience attempting to blend history and performance in the ensemble classroom, I wanted to investigate how and why other ensemble directors have attempted to integrate history into their rehearsals. While scholars have seemed to advocate for more interdisciplinary crossover, I wondered to what extent performance instructors have viewed greater historical context as something which would enhance the educational experience vs. cut into their time to prepare for concerts.

My initial assumptions with these conversations were often based around binaries like scholar/performer, player/non-player, and talking about jazz/playing jazz stemming

---

Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 219. Sherrie Tucker quotes Mark Tucker's review: Mark Tucker, "Musicology and the New Jazz Studies," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 51, no.1 (Spring 1998): 148. See also: Ken Prouty, *Knowing Jazz* (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2011), 10.

from Prouty's description of department divides.[342] As I spoke with jazz educators (including Prouty), I felt a consensus that these categories are increasingly becoming more flexible as jazz performers pursue advanced academic degrees. However, I became increasingly aware of how the title of "jazz scholar" or "jazz historian" can mean different things to different people. Students taking a jazz history class might be instructed by a musicologist offering "New Jazz Studies" critical analysis of race, gender, and historiography, or they might be taught by an instructor who presents a more survey-based approach built around a larger narrative of an evolving jazz canon. Some educators even consider professional musicians with extensive specialized knowledge of a musician or engaging anecdotes to be scholars or historians of the music.

These observations paint a fragmented picture of "jazz studies" where it is difficult to recognize how aesthetic values diverge with different varieties of jazz or study each genre with some degree of faithfulness to its non-academic existence (as the accounts I opened with illustrate). Within the university, jazz performance education stands as the public face of "jazz studies" while jazz scholarship operates in the background. This disconnection combined with the conflict of canon construction/deconstruction between performers and scholars means the two disciplines do not speak each other's language, and it is difficult to utilize their combined expertise to meaningfully address diversity issues (both musical and demographic). With greater interdisciplinary understanding and collaboration, I can envision a "jazz studies" which highlights the cultural richness of jazz and more deeply explores its subgenres.

---

[342] Ken Prouty, *Knowing Jazz* (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2011), 18-43.

Pathways for Learning Traditional Jazz

As a niche interest outside of a more standard jazz studies curriculum, traditional jazz can provide students with an alternative perspective to their other studies and lead them to unique opportunities. For students like Mike Davis who can't find the jazz education they seek within the institution, school becomes a place to build generic musical abilities like playing in time and in tune, developing range, and training their ears to learn aurally. With this basic training, they must look elsewhere to find the music they seek. Mark Tipton (jazz trumpet instructor - University of Maine) outlines such an independent study path: "students who really wish to explore the New Orleans style generally gravitate towards recordings, and consume as much as they can until they learn the tunes - the harmonic language, forms, interplay, and history. If they're really serious, they'll seek out older players who have mastered this style and study and/or play with them."[343] Depending on the institution and the resources available, students make what they can of their education and seek to create their own opportunities. Hancock, for example, would later devise a plan to form his own combo at Cornell University (the Cornell Syncopators) as a special research project commemorating the 100th anniversary of the Original Dixieland Jass Band. Mike Davis found a community of players at a Tuesday night jam session at Mona's (a New York City bar) which helped him learn new tunes and network with working bands.

[343] Mark Tipton, quoted by Dan Barrett (University of Maine) in email conversation with the author, Oct 28, 2020. It is worth noting that Tipton has done experiential study himself playing with the band "The Loose Marbles."

A number of schools offer dedicated traditional jazz ensembles regularly (usually led by a faculty member with a particular passion for that style of music). In such groups, students find unique opportunities to perform with guest artists who are well versed in traditional jazz as well as to participate in festivals and network within that music scene. Several groups like those organized by Bill Prince at University of North Florida and Kent Kidwell at University of Central Oklahoma were even formed with the purpose of competing at festivals like the Southern Comfort Collegiate Dixieland Competition (in Prince's case, the band was not an official class and he did not get paid for leading the group but did it for fun). Through the powerful experiences in these groups and the social connections they form, students who are interested in traditional jazz as a career may find unique opportunities or creative directions which they may not have found pursuing a more traditional degree path. For example, as a result of winning the Southern Comfort Dixieland Competition, Bill Prince's band was contacted by the United States Information Agency and had the opportunity to tour Latin America playing their repertoire, and the star trumpet player in his band (J.B. Scott) went on to play in New Orleans for several years as the musical director for the Dukes of Dixieland. In another instance, Steve Call's Jazz Legacy Band at Brigham Young University (Provo, UT) received a grant in 2016 to visit New Orleans for five days, performing concerts and working with guest artists Kevin Clark, Tim Laughlin, and Lucien Barbarin. Call ascribes much of the power of these transformative experiences to playing with the guest musicians: "They don't have to be famous people… I'd never heard of Lucien Barbarin until I heard him sitting in with a band at Preservation Hall…little did I know what a

powerful effect he would have on my program… and on me."[344] Jory Woodis, one of the band members described the experience of following Barbarin as he ended the tune "St James Infirmary" in concert at Preservation Hall:

> We ended up doing this way different ending than we had ever done before. Through his body language he just expressed to us somehow that we're gonna slow down at this spot and hold this chord out and then we're gonna play this thing in unison… who knows how it actually happened… he just somehow communicated this to us so professionally and so naturally that we all just went with it and at the end it was like "How did we do that?" You know? He just was able to bring us all together and we just followed him effortlessly. It was so cool.[345]

Woodis credits this trip and his connection with trumpeter Kevin Clark to his eventually moving to New Orleans to play with the Dukes of Dixieland and other local groups.

Outside of the university system, many young traditional jazz musicians find the resources they need attending camps like the Teagarden Jazz Camp in Sacramento, CA. Camp director Bill Dendle claims, "If you go down…Frenchmen street, half the street are former campers, and they will tell you about how much that nurturing environment meant to them."[346] These teacher-student connections suggest that the opportunity to play in a traditional ensemble has inspired many students to pursue specialized career opportunities in that style and has given them the skills and connections to succeed professionally.

Even if students do not specialize professionally in traditional jazz, studying the older music and learning from those models offers them a foundation to make

---

[344] Steve Call, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020.
[345] Steve Call, "A New Orleans Pilgrimage," unpublished video, 18:28.
[346] Bill Dendle, interview with the author October 26th, 2020. Dendle is commenting specifically to the non-judgmental positive learning environment he and the other camp staff strive to create.

connections between stylistic evolutions throughout jazz history and has the potential to point them towards innovative approaches in their own careers. Steve Call emphasizes the power of the New Orleans approach to the front line: "You can take a front line from 1920 and put a 1930 rhythm section and it sounds right… the idea of the trumpet embellishing the melody… the clarinet playing an obbligato… and the trombone creating a countermelody… if you can get the students to hear it that way then they are off, then it starts to click. They recognize the roles of the instruments and textures created by artists on the records they are assigned and the music we listen to in class."[347] Call hopes that students will recognize the roots of New Orleans in the playing of influential swing era soloists like Barney Bigard, Red Allen, and Lester Young and follow those connections to inform how they hear Charlie Parker.[348] Bill Dendle agrees: "if you learn the early style, then you get a good basic structure to build anything else on. I also think that it doesn't hurt to learn melodic improvisation first… It's a good starting point for anyone who wants to go further in any kind of jazz." To illustrate, Dendle told me how over the years he has worked with many reed players who were known primarily as modern jazz stylists (such as Paul Desmond for his work with Dave Brubeck) but also played traditional jazz clarinet and found a lot of enjoyment in that approach.[349] For those who are primarily interested in later forms of jazz, Kristen Bromley (current director of the Jazz Legacy band at Brigham Young University-Provo, UT) notes that the challenge in learning to be creative with a less harmonically extended palate (as playing traditional

---

[347] Steve Call, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020.
[348] Ibid.
[349] Bill Dendle, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.

jazz demands) helps students to develop core musicianship skills: "For me, going back and helping students semester after semester getting that much better at, so to speak 'basic concepts,' my creativity shoots through the roof because I've learned how to be way more creative just with… basic chords, root-3-5-6, root-3-5-b7… then when I go over to my other playing… having played that has boosted me."[350] The musical vocabulary of previous eras can also be repurposed in new ways. David Ake sees a clear link between the group interaction of New Orleans polyphony and later free jazz groups.[351] He suggests that, "there is still fertile territory in those earlier rhetorical approaches… it still sounds good… and it doesn't have to sound old… you could use it as a reference to the past, but you don't *have* to. Look at what Ornette Coleman did with that stuff in the 1950s, it certainly didn't sound old, but he was drawing on stuff that had been around for a long time."[352] While traditional jazz often implies "old" music, Dendle also notes that musicians like the Dukes of Dixieland, Dutch Swing College Band, and LA studio musicians in the Dixie-Bop scene continued to innovate with traditional tunes and techniques in more modern contexts long after the music fell out of fashion.[353] Likewise, present-day New Orleans musicians like Leroy Jones, Shannon Powell, the Preservation Hall Jazz Band, and many others have continued innovating and developing traditional styles of playing in many different musical contexts.[354] Beyond connecting to

---

[350] Kristen Bromley, interview with the author, October 22nd, 2020.
[351] Ake, *Jazz Cultures,* 130.
[352] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[353] Bill Dendle, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.
[354] See *Tradition is a Temple,* directed by Darren Hoffman (2013), film. Also see *A Tuba to Cuba,* directed by T. G. Harrington and Danny Clinch, (Blue Fox Entertainment: 2018), film. Also see *A Man and His Trumpet: The Leroy Jones Story,* directed by Cameron Washington (Russian Hill Projects: 2018), film.

other eras and styles, Colin Hancock finds great value in attempting to inhabit a specific musical mindset in a specific time and place:

> If you are a trumpet player in a white dance orchestra in New York City in 1926 you're gonna want to sound like Red Nichols or somebody like that. So, if for the semester the job is to sound like Sam Lanin's band or a white New York Dance band we're gonna listen to Red Nichols, we're gonna listen to Jean Goldkette, we're gonna listen to who the people were listening to at the time. We're gonna put ourselves in those players shoes… the musicians who I've worked with really enjoy that and it makes them actually feel more connected to the music because it makes it feel real.[355]

This ability to go deep on the musical vocabulary of a specific time and place is valuable skill development for students who wish to take on the challenge of improvising in any sort of idiomatically specific context as opposed to applying the standard chord scale theories and melodic patterns which many jazz students learn in improvisation classes.

The potential benefits outlined by these instructors show that students who study traditional jazz in a college setting will often find special insights, opportunities, and influences which they otherwise may not have found studying later stylistic periods. As the examples above suggest, many of these insights and techniques might also inform other music making opportunities. Whether using research and imagination to conjure a historical moment, recontextualizing music of the past in a more modern setting, or making broader stylistic connections in the history of jazz, students have much to gain from studying traditional jazz at the college level. For some, this experience will likely lead them to unique musical directions that their colleagues may have passed over or to additional career opportunities within traditional jazz.

---

[355] Colin Hancock, interview with the author, October 20th, 2020.

Wide Variety in Performance Jazz Studies Programs

Discussing jazz education broadly, it should first be acknowledged that school programs vary widely in size, student ability levels, faculty expertise, and local music making opportunities. This variety often remains unseen as academic literature on jazz education often focuses primarily on high-profile programs or programs which were the first to develop jazz courses (Berklee College of Music, The New School for Jazz and Contemporary Music, University of North Texas, New England Conservatory, Westlake College of Music), yet *Downbeat Magazine's* guide on where to study jazz in 2021 lists 212 schools.[356] With this variety, it should be acknowledged that any discussion about improving jazz education broadly may be adapted in diverse ways depending on individual circumstances. Some schools may have strict entrance requirements for incoming students and work only with students who are already playing at high levels, but others may have to adapt their expectations and curriculum to best serve students with a variety of backgrounds and goals. This might include those in other music major tracks (classical performance, music education, general music) who play well but are unfamiliar with jazz idioms, those who have settled on a jazz degree because it was the closest thing to a popular music degree that the school offered, students who hope to be a part of jazz

---

[356] For studies on these specific schools see: Wilf, *School For Cool…,* 2014. John Murphy, "Beyond the Improvisation Class: Learning to Improvise in a University Jazz Studies Program," in *Musical Improvisation: Art, Education, and Society,* ed. Gabriel Solis and Bruno Nettl (Champaign, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2009). Susan Calkins, "A history of Jazz Studies at New England Conservatory, 1969–2009: The legacy of Gunther Schuller," (PhD diss., Boston University, 2012). Michael T. Spencer, "Jazz Education at the Westlake College of Music 1945-61," *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* 35, No. 1 (October 2013): 50-65. "Where to Study Jazz 2021," *Downbeat,* September 22, 2020, https://downbeat.com/news/detail/where-to-study-jazz-in-2021.

classes while they pursue a non-music degree, and some who may be talented musicians but are not prepared for the rigors of university education. To illustrate, Michael White (professional jazz clarinetist) described coaching Juilliard students to simply transcribe parts directly from original recordings of King Oliver's band and practice them until they had assimilated the idioms and approaches of particular players into their own musical vocabulary.[357] This is certainly a tried and true method of jazz pedagogy, yet this process of transcribing music from a recording, understanding how melodies interface with the harmonic and rhythmic structure of a tune, and repurposing that melody in another context is likely far above the average student's abilities at less competitive schools.[358] Steve Roach (director of jazz studies - Sacramento State University) acknowledges that although some students arrive as undergraduates playing at a high level, the majority of students entering his program are not yet polished players: "Some of our applicants may not even know ten tunes from memory, but they show interest, potential, and they have a decent sense of style and feel for the music and, as a result, we are eager to accept them into our program."[359] Roach thus advocates for a strong focus on developing and continuing to emphasize fundamental skills such as playing over jazz standards like "Satin Doll" which might be called at a casual jazz gig. He adds that the university music school experience stretches students in many ways (not always musical); learning piano skills, taking academic courses, juggling a full schedule, and managing anxiety about the

[357] Michael White, "The 21st Annual Bill Russell Lecture: What Is Jazz?," Virtual Lecture given at *The Historic New Orleans Collection,* September 30th, 2020, https://my.hnoc.org/virtualprograms/russelllecture.
[358] Paul Berliner, *Thinking In Jazz: The Infinite Art of Improvisation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), 96-97.
[359] Steve Roach, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.

future are often significant concerns for students. Though these students are, on paper, pursuing a degree in jazz, the larger balance of their time is devoted to standard music classes. Roach says “Within the core concentration of our jazz studies degree, there are eight specific jazz classes. All of the other remaining lower and upper division music courses focus on non-jazz related classes such as ear training, theory, piano skills, conducting, and music literature and history. With such a rigorous academic schedule, we definitely have our hands full with just trying to get students through the program, let alone specializing in a specific style.”[360] Many students also take jazz classes but do not intend to specialize as jazz majors. Jeff Kidwell (assistant director of jazz studies - University of Central Oklahoma, instructor of traditional jazz combo) points out that programs like UCO, University of Northern Colorado, and North Texas State were all designed initially as teacher’s colleges with a focus on music education. At UCO specifically, Kidwell says “we have a huge number of folks learning how to be band and orchestra directors. So they want to learn that style of music and soak up as much pedagogy as they can while sitting in the ensemble so that when they go out and teach they’re successful at this style of music also.”[361] For yet another contrast, Gordon Towell (coordinator of jazz studies – Loyola University New Orleans) focuses especially on sight reading and stylistic versatility because he imagines that many of his students will go on to enter the market as commercial freelancers.[362] Because students arrive at university programs with diverse backgrounds and playing levels, and pursuing jazz with varying

---

[360] Ibid.
[361] Jeff Kidwell, interview with the author, October 8th, 2020.
[362] Gordon Towell, interview with the author, October 28th, 2020.

levels of dedication, it follows that every school will have different goals and expectations for their students which take into account their local demographics, musical culture, and career aspirations. Just as Ken Prouty observes that the term "the jazz community" includes "many constituencies… separated by race, age, mode of performance, level of professional involvement, geography, and other factors," a reference to something as specific as university jazz education must also acknowledge that the programs are in fact very different from each other.[363]

In some cases, university course offerings may be shaped by the local community's interest in traditional jazz. Steve Roach notes how neither the student body nor jazz improvisation faculty at Sacramento State University is strongly rooted in traditional jazz, yet they have cohosted a traditional jazz youth band festival for the past 15 years with the local jazz society:

> We rehearse and prepare some of our combos specifically for the trad festival. However, once the festival is over, the majority of our student combos that are self-run or taught, tend go in their own direction. They not only write a lot of original music, but they also enjoy exploring the music of many of the new contemporary artists that are on the scene.… so even though we host this spectacular trad jazz festival, we don't have many students who are necessarily interested in that early style. In fact, some of our participating high school groups that attend our festival have more experience and knowledge of the trad style than some of our own university students.[364]

Jeff Kidwell also notes that when his father started the University of Central Oklahoma Dixieland band in the 1980s, Oklahoma City was in the midst of a popular resurgence of Dixieland music and Cajun restaurants. These examples certainly play a role in the music

---

[363] Ken Prouty, *Knowing Jazz: Community Pedagogy, and Canon in the Information Age* (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2011), 18.
[364] Steve Roach, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.

students are exposed to and the performing opportunities they may encounter, however they may not directly impact university curriculum. Gordon Towell notes that Loyola University-New Orleans occasionally runs a traditional jazz combo led by Don Vappie depending on student interest, but that it is not a major focus of their curriculum as most students who are interested in playing traditional jazz will pick that music up as they are gigging outside of school given the local music making opportunities in New Orleans.[365]

Faculty members also wield significant influence through their individual interests and their expertise as they shape the unique canon of repertoire and approaches at different institutions. For example, Jessica Bisset Perea outlines how Hal Malcom, Waldo King, and John Moawad formed the unique jazz choir subculture of the Pacific Northwest by starting ensembles, arranging pieces, and developing their pedagogy.[366] This may be seen simply as matter of personal taste, but a shift to different repertoire often means emphasizing different musical aesthetics as well. David Ake describes how he initially was seen as "the avant-garde guy" when he began teaching at University of Nevada-Reno (utilizing graphic notation as a guide for improvisation in combo rehearsals), but as more of Ake's fellow Cal Arts alumni took over as jazz program directors (Peter Epstein and Adam Benjamin), the focus of the jazz program increasingly shifted in a more modern direction.[367] In contrast, Mike Kocour (director of jazz studies - Arizona State University) places a strong focus on arrangements, requiring that combo

---

[365] Gordon Towell, interview with the author, October 28th, 2020.
[366] Jessica Bisset Perea, "Voices From the Jazz Wilderness: Locating Pacific Northwest Vocal Ensembles Within Jazz Education," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 174.
[367] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.

instructors set the example of professionalism in their rehearsals by providing three or more arrangements for their student groups (often larger combos of 6-7 students). As students follow faculty examples, ensuring that the rehearsal time is used efficiently and preparing to present polished performances, Kocour hopes that discipline will translate to careful planning and arranging for the stage:

> Your jazz recital is not a jam session… What if somebody asked you to play at any kind of a festival… Ok your jazz group is going to come on after some bluegrass group has just ripped… and they've got a whole spiel… they have like a little patter that they do, that's all rehearsed… a little conversation, little jokes, they're all part of it!… You're gonna open for some singer-songwriter that's… telling stories and maybe singing some songs that everybody knows, and you're gonna go up and just kinda play tunes and be forgotten. Yeah those guys were okay…[368]

While he believes ASU's program should offer opportunities for creativity and exploration in a laboratory setting, Kocour tries to make it clear to students that "a lot of the music they love the most was very carefully planned."[369] Contrasting these examples, a strong focus from faculty in the direction of free approaches to improvisation or carefully planned arrangements creates a unique culture at each school which strongly shapes the type of students coming out of the program. While students most certainly benefit from any type of clear paths carefully laid by their instructors, these preferences lead teachers to shape the canonical mindset of their students by teaching them which artists were important and why. Ken Prouty offered an example from his time as a student at the University of North Texas jazz program where such canonical shaping became obvious. After a visiting artist clinic where trumpeter Byron Stripling called out trumpet

---

[368] Mike Kocour, interview with the author, November 6th, 2020.
[369] Ibid.

students for not studying Louis Armstrong, Prouty remembered how "For the next 13 and 5/8ths days, everybody was just talking about 'Oh Louis? Have you checked out this Louis Armstrong record… and then at that moment, all of a sudden people just stopped talking about it. It was like 'Ok we did our Louis Armstrong thing and now let's go back to Tom Harrell, which was the guy that most of the trumpet players at UNT liked to listen to at the time." Such a limited bounding of repertoire obviously has consequences for student's learning and often reinforces a problematic lack of diversity. Though he acknowledges many things have changed since his time as a student, Prouty suggests UNT at times became "wrapped up in its own narrative." He elaborates: "in terms of listening… your typical student probably listened less to Louis Armstrong, or Bird, or Coltrane, or Miles, whoever, than they did to last year's lab band record."[370] Though Prouty speaks from his own experience at UNT, he believes that disconnects between academic and non-academic jazz traditions are a larger system-wide issue. Institutions have often emphasized aspects of jazz which advance its social standing within the institutional culture without regard to the aesthetics of the larger jazz community.[371] As jazz faculty become more conscious of how repertoire and aesthetic preferences shape the educational experience, we have a responsibility to consider how our choices impact the larger social dynamics of music-making. For example, considering education as a form of social reproduction, Bisset Perea questions the continued marginalization of jazz vocal groups and jazz singing, pointing out the "systemic maintenance of 'ideal communities'

---

[370] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[371] Ken Prouty, email communication with the author, Feb 14th, 2021, See also: Ken Prouty, "The History of Jazz Education: A Critical Reassessment," *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* Vol. 26, No. 2 (Apr 2005): 79-100.

along gendered lines within institutionalized jazz education."[372] As faculty members make decisions about curriculum plans and offerings, it is essential that we recognize the ways our influence shapes students' understanding of how to play jazz, how to be a professional musician, and who we might be excluding from those paths.

Developing a Jazz Curriculum: Selecting from Many "Worthwhile Subjects"

As much as faculty want students to experience all the richness and variety in jazz music, sacrificing depth and mastery for familiarity with a wide breadth of styles is often simply not practical. Faced with the challenge of constructing a jazz curriculum, some educators draw upon their personal expertise and best judgement to help students learn while emphasizing that students who hope to succeed professionally will need to exercise significant personal initiative to account for that which isn't taught in the classroom. While this is certainly a valid assessment, others point out that it can be hard to acknowledge our personal bias in this process and that we must be careful and continually open to revision in how we weight subjects. I think it important to realize how judgements about complexity, commercial viability, and expressiveness are micro-curations of canon and aesthetics. For example, rather than try to teach every style and technique to his university students, Towell emphasizes the importance of developing students' core musicianship skills so that they can continue to learn from other musicians independently outside of school and after they graduate. He identifies bebop with its

[372] Bisset Perea, "Voices From the Jazz Wilderness," 182. See also: Lara Pellegrinelli, "Separated at "Birth": Singing and the History of Jazz," in *Big Ears: Listening for Gender in Jazz Studies* ed. Nichole Rustin and Sherrie Tucker (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008), 31-47.

complex chromaticism and fast tempos as a standard of technical facility and ear development which will equip students to tackle other musical interests independently: "If [students] are able to transcribe solos by Clifford Brown, they can transcribe earlier solos… if they can transcribe John Coltrane, they can transcribe Lester Young."[373] Towell references his own experience playing in a group which focused specifically on Don Redman and Fletcher Henderson music between 1927-1929 for which he had to spend time transcribing Coleman Hawkins solos as they diverged from the bebop language with which he was more familiar. Focusing on fundamental skill development helps students to feel competent in professional circumstances and to recognize how and when to showcase their strengths. For instance, while Towell felt confident playing clarinet at a professional level, he found it better to stick to the saxophone when he moved to New Orleans and began playing gigs alongside serious clarinetists like Tom Fischer whose playing "was a whole different level."[374]

Upon first glance, privileging bebop over earlier or later styles might seem to uphold David Baker's designation of bebop vocabulary as the "lingua franca of contemporary jazz improvisation," yet Towell does not suggest (as some take Baker's claim) that bebop vocabulary is backwards compatible with earlier styles of jazz (an assertion which has caused great frustration to traditional jazz instructors whose students continually fall back on playing bebop licks over traditional tunes).[375] Steve Call described some of his early struggles with teaching vocabulary: "I gave them listening

---

[373] Ibid.
[374] Gordon Towell, interview with the author, October 28th, 2020
[375] Prouty, *Knowing Jazz,* 50.

lists and stuff like that…but a lot of times they didn't ever bother to listen to them…and they came and…and they just…started doing the things they were learning in their jazz improv classes in the traditional jazz band and it just didn't work. You know?"[376] Call found he had to construct new theoretical approaches which were specific to traditional jazz solo improvisation to supplant the chord scale methods his students were learning in other classes. Call developed his own pedagogical models based on Bobby Hackett solos to help students to break down the vocabulary from recordings.[377] The fact that Call had to invent new theoretical techniques to teach traditional jazz is notable here. Prouty suggests that the bebop "common practice period" is often the easiest one to teach in terms of pedagogy because of theoretical systems like George Russell's Lydian Chromatic Concept (growing out of close association with Bill Evans, and Miles Davis) which would later lead to systems developed by David Baker and Jamey Aebersold.[378] Stepping away from a theoretical focus, Mike Kocour suggests that if educators focus on transcribing parts, providing reference recordings, and acquiring good arrangements, students will likely absorb the language of traditional jazz over time.[379] Call's and Kocour's suggestions illustrate the poles of the theory/practice continuum in jazz

---

[376] Steve Call, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020.
[377] Steve Call, "Teaching Traditional Jazz/Dixieland Improvisation," clinic given at International Association for Jazz Educators, January 12, 2008, Toronto, Ontario. See also: Steve Call, "Bobby Hackett: An Approach to Teaching Traditional Jazz Phrasing and Improvisation," *Jazz Research Proceedings Yearbook,* ed. by L. Fischer, Vol. 27 (2007). See also: Steve Call, "Bobby Hackett: An Approach To Teaching Traditional Jazz Phrasing and Improvisation," (paper presented to the International Association for Jazz Education, New York, New York. January 2007).
[378] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[379] Mike Kocour, interview with the author, November 6th, 2020.

education as described by Prouty (learning to play based on theoretical rules vs picking up theory through the context of learning arrangements or transcribing recordings).[380]

The experiences of these educators working with students on non-bebop styles of improvisation (playing pre-1945 or post-1965) further illustrate that the theoretical frameworks and musical vocabulary used to teach bebop do not universally map onto other musical idioms. Given that the myth of vocabulary transference has been proven false many times over and continues to persist, Prouty sees it as particularly detrimental for jazz education:

> So much of what [students] do is based in this particular approach to jazz. We drill it into their heads and… then we are surprised when they can't play traditional jazz. Well we shouldn't because they haven't learned it!...Playing jazz in the 1920s… was a different system than it is in the 1940s. It's not like "well it's the same thing, if you learn this common practice stuff you'll be able to apply this anyway." No! That is unequivocally not true![381]

Prouty followed this assertion with a story about a very capable tenor player colleague who got fired from their gig with a 1930s style band for playing like Joe Henderson.[382] Along similar lines, Banu Gibson (professional jazz singer and executive director of the New Orleans Traditional Jazz Camp for adults) emphasizes her frustration as a bandleader occasionally working with players who assumed their bebop study could translate easily to a traditional context:

> all the contemporary stuff sounds like just words. Word word word… word word word… word word verb noun. It doesn't sound like sentences to me. I don't hear people reinventing the melody that's given. It's just a lot of damn notes… Please! Find a new melody, create something that I can follow and that you're telling me

[380] Prouty, *Knowing Jazz,* 57.
[381] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[382] A true story as told by: Ken Prouty, Ibid.

> a story… I don't hear people coming out of school being fluent in musical storytelling… I just get mathematical note combinations.[383]

Colin Hancock adds that a simple binary split between modern/traditional does not accurately characterize the wide variety within pre-bop jazz:

> Canonizing musicians…makes early jazz seem very homogenous when it's not…. The jazz of 1921 and the jazz of 1924 are completely different, and the jazz of 1926 and the jazz of 1927 are completely different. …This was the first time…where accessibility to the competition's art was instantaneous or nearly instantaneous because of recorded music. …You can buy those [records], listen to them, incorporate them, and then change the style within a period of two or three months.[384]

Hancock suggests that 1940s Dixieland ensembles were a good example of "Everything that sounds good to someone in 1940 from the jazz age thrown into one place over a swing beat." While he sees this as a perfectly valid approach, he also feels that to truly know the style we have to look deeper at nuances, which was a main focus for his band at Cornell: "Play the weird stuff! That person only used a china cymbal. We are gonna only use a china cymbal, we're gonna see what that's like… It's digging into the weeds and the complexity of it because it was complex."[385] Musicians who have studied traditional jazz with this deep dive approach often have a greater awareness about musical vocabulary that seems out of place with their desired musical aesthetic and recognize when other players have not paid their dues listening and transcribing in order to match the style. While players might differ in their opinions about the specificity of their musical scope and appropriateness of vocabulary, these questions of style and taste are

[383] Banu Gibson, interview with the author, November 31st, 2020.
[384] Colin Hancock, interview with the author, October 20th, 2020.
[385] Colin Hancock, interview with the author, October 20th, 2020.

important concerns for young professionals to consider as they work with jazz within a prescribed style.

Specific themed ensembles like the traditional groups led by Call, Prince, and Kidwell may seem an obvious solution to acquaint students with a wider variety of vocabulary, yet some educators argued that mandating participation in such groups could actually box students into prescribed categories and inhibit their individual growth and versatility. Gordon Towell argues that a good combo instructor helps them explore things that interest them naturally but also acts like a foil to the ensemble by challenging them to try new things:

> Really looking at maybe some holes, it might be time meters, you know? Something multi-meter or something just in 3/4…nobody's calling something fast…no one's calling something slow, they're skipping ballads,…it could be everything is the '80s on, and nobody's looking at some of those great '50s and '60s kind of work…or it might be the opposite…also seeing…how they play and who they are and where they are at in their development.[386]

Mike Kocour adds that themed ensembles might seem to provide variety and simplify work for faculty but could actually make it harder to tailor combos to student interests and abilities:

> There are some institutions where…they worry less about kind of matching up the students so if you want to sign up for the Art Blakey combo great! Do that! ...But who gets left out? You know? "Oh I wanted to sign up but they already have a trombonist." It's easier for the faculty member…well if you're only teaching Art Blakey charts then well you don't have to think about charts do you? And thinking about charts is one of the toughest things about running a combo…I'm thinking, oh my god what tune can these people possibly play with this instrumentation and this kind of uneven level of experience? What's a tune that's going to be okay for this trumpet player that can do this really well but not this?…and the piano player who's maybe a beginner.[387]

---

[386] Gordon Towell, interview with the author, October 28th, 2020

[387] Mike Kocour, interview with the author, November 6th, 2020.

Bringing this emphasis on adapting and arranging to a traditional ensemble context often means that educators might have to become adept arrangers adding or subtracting parts within the framework of the style. Though New Orleans ensembles are known for their improvised polyphony, Colin Hancock's Cornell group also explored much of the unique repertoire for New York dance bands (an entirely different traditional jazz context) adding or subtracting parts to fit their changing instrumentation each semester.[388] Written arrangements are tremendously helpful for giving students a reference for idiomatic vocabulary but they require a specific instrumentation which may or may not be available each semester. Many of the educators I spoke with prioritized flexibility in small ensembles in order to find the best possible way to address the complex dynamics of shifting interests, expertise, and schedules among students and faculty.

Part of the issue with themed ensembles boils down to the question of to what extent educators should encourage stylistic versatility in students or simply encourage them to follow their own interests. Do we want to nurture breadth or depth in their playing abilities? Should it be mandated that students demonstrate fluency in various styles in their recitals? Prouty suspects most educators would choose depth though they may not admit it:

> I think if you hooked people up to a lie detector or injected them with truth serum or something, what they would probably say to you is "yes, I want my students to have some diverse, different experiences, but that is less important than what they do on their senior recital. That's less important than the kind of final product student that…I'm gonna present to the world."[389]

[388] Colin Hancock, interview with the author, October 20th, 2020.
[389] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.

While educators play a large role in determining curriculum offerings, Prouty also acknowledges that the various assessments which hold educators and students accountable (end of semester juries, recitals, tenure evaluations, etc) are important influencers in curriculum design.[390] In other words, faculty have some power, but the institutional framework also has a deep impact on what classes get offered, how faculty distribute their time, and how students are recognized. Decisions about repertoire and style are often a negotiation of various interests. To contrast Prouty's emphasis on the educator's responsibility, Steve Roach offered a student focused example:

> We had a fantastic student who was a piano major who loved trad jazz so much that…we couldn't get him out of that bubble…that's all he wanted to do. So, stylistically he was always playing in the stride tradition, his left hand was going left right left right…and his senior recital was pretty much all steeped in the trad jazz style. He wasn't that much interested in modern trends. A local product of Sacramento.[391]

In these types of situations, educators worry about how to help students develop enough versatility for the diverse situations they may be faced with in their future careers. Lewis Nash (professional drummer, professor of practice at Arizona State University) notes that this can be a difficult situation when trying to decide whether to push a student to diversify or to go deeper into whatever they love:

> That's a very difficult one because everyone has their own, the things that fulfill them the most, that they're more inclined to want to do. Sometimes that can be rooted in fear actually, you know? It's a safe place to just play this type of thing so I'm just going to stay in my little safe corner. But other times it could be because that musician really is… that's their comfort zone, they shine, they speak, they feel, it just resonates with them to do that, so if it's that I'm more inclined, and I don't know what's the key to knowing… when it's one or the other as outside observers I don't know if we can really know, but I know that difference

---

[390] Ken Prouty, email conversation with the author, February 14th, 2021.
[391] Steve Roach, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.

> exists… so much is dependent on… each student's personal inclinations, and way of learning, and way of executing.[392]

Nash sees the availability of information and opportunities to play different styles as a positive thing for a university jazz program but also suggests educators need to encourage more personal initiative among students. He illustrates how the time he spent independently learning about tumbao and clave paid off when he had the opportunity to play with Tito Puente at Carnegie Hall.

> They started playing something at the rehearsal, we hadn't really gotten underway yet…and I joined in, I started playing, so one of Tito's handlers or someone with him came over and said…"Tito doesn't use the drum set" and Tito's like "No! Let him play!"…If I wasn't doing the right thing he would have just said 'No drum set please'…so much of it is self-directed. …We gotta do more *ourselves* in terms of gathering all of this varied types of stuff…the programs are just…giving us little seeds of things-little clues about how deeply we can actually go ourselves. …They are not *finishing* schools, they are *starting* schools.[393]

Emphasizing the individual student's responsibility for their own learning, Nash suggests that developing their individual drive will play a vital role in their future career. Jeff Libman (clinical professor at Arizona State University) and John Murphy (retired ethnomusicologist from University of North Texas) have both conducted research into this perspective studying how student's academic experiences are supplemented with a host of other musical activities outside of school.[394] Students cannot simply enroll in school, do what they are told, and expect to have job offers lined up. Murphy suggests:

---

[392] Lewis Nash, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[393] Lewis Nash, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[394] Jeff Libman, "The Out-of-School Musical Engagements of Undergraduate Jazz Studies Majors" (PhD diss., Arizona State University, 2014). Murphy, "Beyond the Improvisation Class," 171-184.
http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1640912537?accountid=4485.

> Any curriculum, no matter how comprehensive, is only a selection from many worthwhile subjects and ways to learn, and it is (or ought to be) always open to revision. …I would be skeptical of a program that presented itself as complete and totally parallel to what one might have acquired as a professional jazz musician in the past—or one that claimed to provide everything that a student needed to be successful in the future.[395]

Bill Dendle also recognizes the limits of teaching time and prioritizes getting students excited and pointing them in the right direction over pushing a large body of information. Regarding the Teagarden Jazz Camp he runs, he said "I really try to stay away from 'teaching.'…My focus is on learning, and learning comes from curiosity. People seek out what they want to know, and if they are in an environment that is rich and open and comfortable, they are more likely to explore."[396] With this mindset, he designed the camp following the methods of collaborative apprenticeship learning developed by Vygotsky and Shea Bayer suggesting that people learn best when they are paired with people of a similar skill level and guided by someone who can help them solve the problems which are too hard.[397] Though Dendle is working with teenagers over a single week, I think his mindset is helpful in coming to terms with the limits of how much we can teach in a semester as well.

While I agree with the goals of encouraging student initiative and recognizing that we cannot possibly cover all things in a curriculum, I suspect that seeing curriculum as a selection from many worthwhile subjects obscures how our selection process is a reflection of values. For example, Loren Kajikawa points out that though institutions

---

[395] Murphy, "Beyond the Improvisation Class," 181-182.
[396] Bill Dendle, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.
[397] Ann Shea Bayer, *Collaborative Apprenticeship Learning: Language and Thinking Across the Curriculum, K-12* (Mountain View, CA: Mayfield Publishing Co., 1990).

have long privileged the music of white European and American males, "this privilege is disguised by race-neutral celebrations of musical excellence that make colorblindness (or colordeafness) the default mode of daily interaction."[398] Taking a colorblind stance means we often times we allow the value system of classical music to remain and adapt other music to fit the framework in order to be considered worthy of study. For example, Bruno Nettl points out how the ensemble conductor or director has been disproportionally over-represented in university jazz ensembles when compared with professional practice (an adaptation which molds jazz ensembles to look more like a classical orchestra).[399] Suggesting that we simply cannot cover everything in the curriculum might lead to the assumption that we need not try and lead to frustration with those who question our reasoning for the subjects we do include. In order to expose the value frameworks of "great" music, we must analyze and understand why we hold it in high regard. Noting how many teachers offer terms like "music," or "musical," as "terra firma categories," ethnomusicologist Henry Kingsbury shows that they are actually "highly contingent and occasionally self-contradictory" (in other words: subjective opinion rather than objective truth).[400] Even our more detailed descriptions of greatness are often romanticized as Nettl illustrates through competing notions of "genius" in Mozart vs. Beethoven. Biographers have revealed that the personalities of these composers were in fact much more complex

---

[398] Loren Kajikawa, "The Possessive Investment in Classical Music: Confronting Legacies of White Supremacy in U.S. Schools and Departments of Music," in *Seeing Race Again: Countering Colorblindness Across the Disciplines*, ed. Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2019), 156.
[399] Bruno Nettl, *Heartland Excursions* (Champaign, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1995), 107.
[400] Henry Kingsbury, *Music, Talent, and Performance: Conservatory Cultural System* (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 1988), 28.

than their typical duality of effortless genius vs. tireless hardworking genius, yet we continue to portray them this way because they symbolize "an important duality and also a set of oppositions in twentieth-century Western thought—genius and labor, the light and the heavy, sweetness and salt, and also divine and human, Zeus and Prometheus."[401] Similarly, in jazz, Guthrie Ramsey notes how the notion of black genius in bebop of the 1940s and '50s was curated through the combination of contemporary perspectives regarding virtuoso performance with "historical beliefs about blacks' intellectual and physical capabilities."[402] As these examples show, simply focusing on that which we perceive to be the most "worthwhile" subjects does not transparently communicate how we determine worth, genius, or greatness. Perhaps, as instructors continue to wrestle with the challenge of canonical curation, we might do well to recognize how dismissing the goal of comprehensive coverage as impossible is also an act of canonical curation. While emphasizing individual student responsibility to pursue the topic outside of class is certainly an important perspective in curriculum design, it does not solve the problem of canon.

Murphy's comment about a program providing that which students need to be successful is also notable because of the ambiguity in how we might define a "successful" jazz graduate, particularly in the commercial sense. Many educators continually emphasize that traditional jazz is very popular and has a lot of commercially viable applications (perhaps even more than bebop or more modern jazz). Ken Prouty

---

[401] Nettl, *Heartland Excursions*, 12.
[402] Guthrie Ramsey, *The Amazing Bud Powell: Black Genius, Jazz History, and the Challenge of Bebop* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2013), 94-96.

affirms that he has made significantly more money playing Dixieland-style music over his career than Coltrane tunes and questions why jazz programs don't reflect that market.[403] Steve Call and Jackie Lamar (professor emeritus at University of Central Arkansas) both mentioned how their groups were very popular playing around campus for events like administration parties or galas.[404] Mike Kocour sees unique performance potential during the COVID-19 quarantine for a traditional jazz group to play outdoors completely unplugged, potential which many musicians (myself included) have taken advantage of in New Orleans by busking in city parks and making up for at least some lost revenue.[405] Despite the existence of valid reasoning for inclusion on the basis of its marketability, traditional jazz has not found broad acceptance within the university system. Banu Gibson notes that even young high school students studying at the New Orleans Center for the Creative Arts are primarily focused on modern jazz as this is what will allow them to succeed going into top quality college jazz programs. If they want to learn traditional jazz, they have to do it on the streets.[406]

The reasoning for a stronger focus on modern jazz stems from its aesthetic association with notions of complexity, expression, and art music established to validate "classical music." With the elevation of modern jazz to "art" status, the earlier entertaining and popular varieties had to be separated from the serious. An opposition to entertainment has long been established in the classical tradition. David Ake points out

---

[403] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[404] Steve Call, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020. And: Jackie Lamar, interview with the author, November 5th, 2020.
[405] Mike Kocour, interview with the author, November 6th, 2020.
[406] Banu Gibson, interview with the author, November 4th, 2020.

that regardless of the era, classical works which were quite popular (such as works by Sullivan or Strauss in the 19th century or John Williams in the present) receive little attention in comparison to the "brooding and profound" German symphonies.[407] Though there are many arguments for the marketability of traditional jazz, these justifications do not qualify in the established aesthetic system. Instead, the little ground traditional jazz has gained towards broader acknowledgment has come primarily as a result of attempting to align itself with the same qualifiers that elevated bebop to art status. As DeVeaux puts it, demonstrating "that in some important sense [pre-bebop jazz] had always been art music, and that status was simply unacknowledged."[408] Many of the educators I spoke with feel that traditional jazz shares similar qualities with other music typically considered to be great art and hope to advance its status along those lines. Banu Gibson emphasizes its technical virtuosity:

> I always say… let me hear you play the beginning of Louis Armstrong's recording of "West End Blues," then we'll talk. The bum wrap given to early jazz is everything is simplistic and easy. It's not that at all, there can be a lot of complexity. Yes there can be a very basic song structure or songs that are just a circle of fifths, but there is a technical and musical proficiency needed to play at a high level as much as there is anything modern jazz has got.[409]

Dave Robinson emphasizes its timeless emotional expression:

> We don't get to a point where we say "Okay well that's enough of Bach and Beethoven…those older styles don't speak to the complex realities of today's world…" That's just nonsense, we have the same emotions today that we had then. We can feel the joy in George Lewis stomping through… "Just a Closer Walk With Thee" *today.* We can hear the pathos in Sidney Bechet's "Blue Horizon" *today*.[410]

---

[407] Ake, *Jazz Cultures,* 44-45.
[408] Scott DeVeaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition: Jazz Historiography," Black American Literature Forum 25 (1991): 544.
[409] Banu Gibson, interview with the author, November 4th, 2020.
[410] Dave Robinson, interview with the author, October 13th, 2020.

This push to justify the "high art" status of traditional jazz is understandable given the way modern jazz has benefitted from increased funding, education, and awareness. Those who are deeply engaged with traditional jazz recognize that it is deserving of the same social status as other styles of jazz and want to see the scene flourish.

Taking into account all the factors in curriculum construction, I believe we often portray jazz subgenres as more similar than they are. If we are to accept the notion of vocabulary transference as a myth, it follows that different styles of jazz might emphasize different core musicianship skills, appeal to different commercial markets, require different theoretical systems to teach effectively, and be considered "art music" for different reasons. While curriculum may be a selection of many worthwhile subjects, I think that it is important to recognize and allow the tension in defining a subject as "worthwhile." Educators surely strive to design the best educational experience possible for students, yet I think it is all too easy to dismiss concerns which do not fit our own biases. If we accept that a curriculum is only a selection of many worthwhile subjects, let us remain curious about the worthwhile subjects which do not get included and leave the curriculum open to further revision and new perspectives.

Jazz Studies: New, Old, and Blending the Two

In working together towards a more balanced curriculum performers' and scholars' different perspectives could be quite complimentary. With my training in both performance and research, I recognize that performance instruction often requires trimming extra details in order to provide students clear goals and instructions. Scholars,

on the other hand, are often digging away at the canons of performance programs to reveal what has been left out. These perspectives might also be characterized as two approaches to writing jazz history: 1) Canon constructing—leading to greater social status for the artform and 2) Deconstruction—emphasizing alternative viewpoints, diversity, and critical reassessment. These two approaches form a binary which Tony Whyton categorizes as "American" and "European" respectively (neither approach should be considered the generalized philosophy of those who reside geographically in America or Europe, but rather these represent a common characterization within jazz discourse).[411] Whyton argues that neither of these approaches is clearly more enlightened than the other. Though the "American" approach has excluded the contributions of many to glorify those of a few, it has also led to greater social status, funding, and recognition for jazz. The "European" approach celebrates diversity, richness, and music which does not conform to an exclusive hierarchical value structure, yet it also seems to threaten to pull down the higher status which jazz only recently acquired. Whyton instead invites a dialogue between the two which might lead to more productive outcomes. Many of the advances in jazz discourse have followed the trend of dialogue between binary opposites. For example, Eitan Wilf juxtaposes institutional rationality vs intuition-based creativity in academic jazz programs to show how many educators have sought ways to bridge the gaps between these opposites while simultaneously keeping them separated.[412] As someone with a foot in both the worlds of jazz performance and jazz scholarship, I find

[411] Tony Whyton, "Birth of the School: Discursive Methodologies in Jazz Education," *Music Education Research* Vol 8, No. 1 (2006): 75-76.
[412] Wilf, *School For Cool…,* 2014.

Whyton's characterizations accurate. Many of my university classes taught by performance faculty reinforced the standard jazz canon as they taught the same repertoire and recordings to all students. In contrast, it seemed all the jazz scholars I met were interested in finding historical narratives which had been neglected or considering to what extent the accomplishments of genius figures came about as a result of their environment and community. With my interdisciplinary training, I had found the ensembles rehearsals I directed to be potential venues for crossover a crossover of "American" and "European" approaches, yet I realized that sacrificing rehearsal time in the interest of historical discussion might have undesirable consequences. In trying to negotiate the best blend, I found that many of the performance educators I spoke with had diverging opinions about who exactly qualifies as a scholar, what type of history was valuable, and whether it was best to leave history and performance to their separate classrooms.

Before describing how performance and scholarship jazz studies might blend together in the ensemble rehearsal, I think it essential to discuss the fragmented nature of jazz studies as a field. Speaking with educators, I wanted to follow up on Ken Prouty's assertion that scholarly "New Jazz Studies" was a conglomeration of academics from a variety of fields (film, African American studies, gender studies, English, and others in addition to music) that operated separately from performance jazz studies to the extent that sometimes they may not even realize the other exists.[413] Given that Prouty published this in 2011 and that my own experience has in some ways differed, I question how this

[413] Prouty, *Knowing Jazz,* 10.

dynamic might have changed over the last decade and created more connection between performance jazz studies and scholarly "New Jazz Studies." David Ake offers his perspective:

> I think that's breaking down a little bit… as performers go back to school… most musicologists I know now who do jazz already had strong backgrounds as performers… That wasn't always the case… now it seems that there are a lot more players getting involved in notions of history, and culture, meaning… There are more musicologists, music scholars who have that background. There are still a lot of players… who don't yet… get exposed to the ideas… you are exploring now in terms of historiography, culture, meaning, pedagogy… and how teachers tend to perpetuate themselves.[414]

Speaking with Prouty recently, he agrees with Ake on these points and suggests that part of the difficulty connecting with performance programs may stem from the interdisciplinary nature of "New Jazz Studies" as it connects to race, gender, power structures, culture, politics, or other artforms.[415] He elaborates:

> I don't know that jazz studies proper people – and I don't know that academic music people in general – deal that well with interdisciplinary… I don't think they… truly understand what it is and how it operates… It doesn't factor into what they do, and so… when we are talking in class about these kinda esoteric concepts a lot of times it's like "*Why* are you talking about this stuff?... My students are coming and saying… they are not learning about Miles Davis," and that's the kind of blowback that sometimes we get.[416]

Brian F. Wright (professor of music history at University of North Texas) adds that such negative reactions to "New Jazz Studies" approaches would be to some extent expected given its difficult subject matter:

> I don't think the general public is as interested in having the conversations that New Jazz Studies has about race and gender and inequality and power

---

[414] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[415] For more on the nature of "New Jazz Studies" see: *Uptown Conversation: The New Jazz Studies,* ed. Robert O Meally, Brent Hayes Edwards, and Farah Jasmine Griffin (New York City: Columbia University Press, 2004).
[416] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.

> relationships… that's true of rock discourse as much as any other discourse. Public discourses often don't want to look in the mirror and think critically about those things, as much as they just want to know why was this history so great and who are the people I should be listening to.[417]

The tension with "New Jazz Studies" might also stem from its scarceness relative to performance jazz education. Dedicated positions for jazz research are few and far between, and the majority of college jazz history classes remain taught by instructors who are likely well qualified and experienced with jazz in some aspect but who do not have training or background in "New Jazz Studies." In these classes, students might get exposed to different artists depending on their teachers' individual tastes and visions of jazz canon. For example, Steve Roach describes the basic historical narrative in his jazz history course as "another replication of a jazz history book" but notes he also covers more younger and contemporary artists that are currently active on the scene in addition to a chapter devoted entirely to women in jazz.[418] When I asked jazz performers and performance educators about their thoughts on blurring the boundaries between history classrooms and ensemble rehearsals (a "New Jazz Studies" proposition), some were intrigued by the potential for additional cultural context, but most seemed wary of sacrificing the focus on playing and rehearsing to cultural context which they should be getting in the jazz history class. David Ake hopes the sense of "'oh yeah they can take that in history, we don't have to worry about that here' is changing." He adds: "I'm not sure that they get any of that stuff in history classes because a lot of the times it's the big band director, or the trumpet teacher, or the piano teacher, or whatever who's also

[417] Brian F. Wright, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[418] Steve Roach, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.

teaching history, but isn't teaching it from the perspective of a musicologist but from a perspective of a jazz musician, fan, record collector, canon supporter."[419] Ake and others with a musicology perspective feel that many jazz history teachers coming from a non-scholarly point of view focus on why the music was great and the great musicians students need to know, whereas a "New Jazz Studies" perspective takes a more critical approach. Wright explains:

> At the end of the day my goal is… not necessarily that my students are going to memorize every single fact and date and performer I talk about. It's to get them to think critically about the stories that are being told, to question them and to see if they hold up under scrutiny… That's the behavior that I'm modelling for students and trying to get them to participate in.[420]

This critical approach is necessary for being able to sort through sometimes conflicting ideas and nuanced arguments. I found John Abigana's (high school band director, pre-concert lecturer for UC Davis – now retired) description of a conversation he had with Branford Marsalis at a NAMM conference a provocative example:

> I was talking about Branford about his brother's aspect on how jazz… how it melted with our constitutional values and how congress writes bills and there's this check and balance which exists in jazz… and Branford just looked at me and he said 'You didn't believe that shit did you?' and I said "Yes, I do! I do!" and he says "Well, you're right I was just kidding you."[421]

I wonder whether Branford was truly just kidding or if he might have had other thoughts on or ideas about the subject. Especially since we often look up to famous jazz musicians with hero status, how do we learn how to differentiate what Wynton believes, what Branford believes, and what I myself believe? "New Jazz Studies" scholars see this type

[419] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[420] Brian F. Wright, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[421] John Abigana, interview with the author, November 14th, 2020.

of historical study as important skill development for students and suggest that in order to truly improve the quality of jazz education, we will eventually need greater collaboration between the disciplines. Ake believes this is too important and multidimensional to restrict to one single classroom: “It has to be there in every class. Just like your history classes should… address notions of performance… Mozart was a real live musician. He was playing gigs too!... It's a more honest approach to how music works and it better serves the students because they get to see (where they fit in)…We're making better musical citizens.”[422] Though more musicians are becoming interested in these topics, most general jazz history courses continue to present an evolutionary narrative outlining a canon of great jazz musicians and potentially feeding into overarching ideas like: jazz as America's classical music, jazz as a symbol of equality and democracy, or jazz as a symbol of freedom and expression.

Though at their core, performance jazz studies may be canon-building and “New Jazz Studies” may be canon-deconstructing, the two disciplines are not necessarily pitted against each other. Though Prouty and Wright identify some resistance towards their subjects, “blowback” from performance departments is hard to pin down. None of the academics that I spoke to offered specific anecdotes where they felt their work was ignored but simply noted that jazz discourse (and music discourse in general) inherently privileges performance over history. While many historians accept that this is reality, some like Wright feel the lack of support for history is troubling:

> History classes are not often seen as conveying essential information. Instead, students often treat them as obstacles that take away time from playing their instruments. I think that… is sometimes tacitly promoted in schools of music… If

---

[422] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.

> students walked in understanding that they needed to know and think about history, and realized that it is actually important for them as performers… I think that would go a long way to solving our problems.[423]

Comments like Prouty's and Wright's emphasize the general frustrations of historians struggling with students and faculty who might not take their subject matter seriously or see it as an important part of student education. In some schools, this may even be reflected in curricular requirements where their class is designated only as an elective rather than part of the major track. Mike Kocour acknowledges that in the past many faculty members (among all aspects of music study) were resistant to change but pointed out that many of that mindset have now retired. With schools of music incorporating more and more music outside the western classical canon, educators all have to work together to overcome the "invisible barriers" in curriculum and scheduling. Speaking of courses with a "New Jazz Studies" focus, Kocour advises:

> A class like that, if it can be a choice like an upper division history class… I think our jazz majors would jump at a class like that… but they wouldn't jump at it if it was scheduled against… another like required jazz class… as we look at schools that are trying to have more diversified offerings, a lot of times the issue has nothing to do with any kind of bias from faculty or in the curriculum, sometimes… it's a scheduling problem that needs to be discussed… I've been in that position where I feel like "well I'm the only jazz person here." So, it's easy to get a chip on your shoulder and kind of assume ill will or disinterest.[424]

Prouty's and Wright's comments should not be misconstrued to suggest that performance faculty are only interested in playing and prefer to avoid placing their work in relation to the complex issues facing society. In fact, the performance jazz faculty I spoke with all express deep concern that their students graduate with a strong awareness of cultural

---

[423] Brian F. Wright, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[424] Michael Kocour, interview with the author, November 6th, 2020.

issues and the injustices of the past and present. Many of the performance faculty I spoke with are very interested in unpacking the history of inequality in music publishing. Kocour wholeheartedly supports the mission of Jazz at Lincoln Center to try to address the oppression of black composers:

> I really believe in the Jazz at Lincoln Center agenda, what that organization has done I think is just amazing and when I think about what the marching band publishers Hal Leonard and Alfred have done, well, you know, they've made jazz band more like marching band. Now there's some really great charts you can get on Hal Leonard, and Alfred is now the official publisher of Jazz at Lincoln Center. So Jazz at Lincoln Center set an example and the other publishers have moved in. I think Sierra music has done a wonderful thing by becoming the official publisher of Benny Carter's music, and Billy Byers music, and a lot of music made popular by the Basie band.[425]

Steve Roach also notes the importance of this work saying that in all of his formal study in three different university jazz programs he never played a "legit Ellington style chart" like the transcriptions Lincoln Center has produced.[426] In light of the recent Black Lives Matter protests, many also feel a need to respond to the trend of violence against people of color by rethinking their teaching. Dan Barrett (lecturer at University of Maine) describes some of the conclusions of his department as they met over the summer of 2020: "Whatever courses the students are passing through here, whether it's a major or a minor or just playing in a group, I think the most important thing for us, is for them to come away with some perspective of the truth about where the music came from—especially from a racial and cultural perspective." Barrett feels this is particularly important for his school's local demographics: "It's a predominantly white population up here, and it is not surprising that the students might favor or gravitate towards role

[425] Ibid.
[426] Steve Roach, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.

models that look like them, that they can see themselves being someday. But they obviously need to get the larger historical picture."[427] Barrett takes inspiration in emphasizing diverse artistic models from Ethan Iverson's comments in a Jazz at Lincoln Center presentation:

> But I think part of what I'm here to do, in my role as a writer or as an educator, is to be like, "I hear you, I'm glad you're checking out Bill Evans and Keith Jarrett and this kind of thing, but you should also make sure to check out James P. Johnson and Thelonious Monk and Sonny Clark and Kenny Kirkland. Just because this feels good to you and you feel like, 'Oh, I can see myself in the image of Brad Mehldau more easily than in the image of Marcus Roberts,' that doesn't mean you should just take that and run with it to the exclusion of thinking about the whole parameter of this American music.[428]

In general, performance educators are very much aware of the inequality that has persisted historically and many make attempts to improve the diversity of their programs. Gordon Towell especially feels it important to hire women and African American instructors to show greater diversity to the students. He was also very enthusiastic about Loyola's first "Girls Jazz Day" in 2019, an event for the public featuring the jazz violinist Sara Caswell and the Shake Em' Up Jazz Band (a local all-female New Orleans style group). Towell happily embraced his role in the event of being in charge of the snacks.[429]

While concern for addressing inequality through culture and history is common with all the educators with whom I spoke, some seemed to view the guiding spirit of jazz as a philosophy of community and cooperation designed to combat injustice—a position that those with a scholarly viewpoint might feel has the potential to dismiss or cover up

---

[427] Dan Barrett (University of Maine), interview with the author, October 22nd, 2020.
[428] Andre Guess, "Wynton Marsalis and Ethan Iverson: A Conversation on Jazz & Race," www.*wyntonmarsalis.org,* Jan 11th, 2018, https://wyntonmarsalis.org/news/entry/wynton-marsalis-ethan-iverson-a-conversation-on-jazz-race.
[429] Gordon Towell, interview with the author, October 28th, 2020.

inequality in the present. Jeff Kidwell for example, describes the University of Central Oklahoma jazz program as a very socially progressive environment:

> If you want to come to a building where gender and race and creed and religion have no bearing then come to the jazz lab, because the idea behind jazz in general is again… it is the melting pot of America, I mean we have all those influences, so I don't care if you're green or blue or you came from Mars. If you can play your horn, and you want to learn how to play your horn, and jazz is something that interests you, then I think that you're in a great world at that point. I don't know that past has been that way. I think about Melba Liston the great African American trombone lady who played and you know she'd tell horrendous stories about the way she was treated on the road.[430]

In contrast to Kidwell's position, Sherrie Tucker notes that the view of jazz as "race-transcendent" does not address many of the current problems with race and inequality in America such as "the contradictions of the construction of race in America along a black/white binary… the limitations of mainstream integrationism, and… the failure of white liberals to recognize those limitations."[431] The difference in these perspectives illustrates some of the tension between two separate fields with separate approaches and priorities. Perhaps for Tucker, someone involved in the creation of the field of "New Jazz Studies," inequality of race and gender are glaringly emphasized in her day-to-day work while for Kidwell, the regular work of rehearsing bands and preparing for concerts does not highlight those issues. He explains:

> This is not going to make me any friends, but I think a lot of times we make a mountain out of molehill when it comes to thinking about current situations with jazz musicians and that sort of thing. I don't know that any of my kids sitting in the jazz lab (we have four jazz ensembles, six combos) I don't know that any of those folks when they sit down to play "Tico Tico" are worried about, you know?... what someone thinks about my pants I'm wearing that day or anything

---

[430] Jeff Kidwell, interview with the author, October 8th, 2020.

[431] Geoffrey Jacques, Bernard Gendron, Sherrie Tucker, Krin Gabbard, and Scott Deveaux "Call and Response: A Roundtable on Ken Burns Jazz," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 13, 2 (2001): 212.

> like that… That's probably an Oklahoma way to look at it… here anyway I don't see big issues with all the things that seem to be going on around or at least that are politicized in the media these days.[432]

Kidwell's experience is not unique. Many of the current issues of inequality easily fly below the radar of many educators. Jackie Lamar notes that sometimes she did not even consciously realize there were no female students in her group until she started talking about concert dress standards.[433] The different perspectives of scholars and performers emphasizes to me that there is much we might learn from collaboration between these departments, but also shows how these two groups are in some ways threatening to the other and prefer to stay in their own bubbles.

Many of the jazz performance faculty I spoke with described their own ways of offering context in ensemble rehearsals but also felt wary of taking time away actual playing time. Dan Barrett (University of Maine) notes the difficulty of balancing a heavy day to day focus on refining student's musical abilities, preparing for concerts, and trying to give them some sense of where the music comes from. He admits that sometimes he feels he has failed:

> The other night my big band played three tunes on a jazz concert and… we played a McCoy Tyner tune, and I realized as I was telling the audience that McCoy Tyner just passed away this year… I never told my band that did I?... The intent is there, the desire is there, but as far as actually carving out time to talk with the students for a minute or two here and there about why we're doing what we're doing…it's taking me a little longer to rethink time management in the classes and rehearsals.[434]

---

[432] Jeff Kidwell, interview with the author, October 8th, 2020.
[433] Jackie Lamar, interview with the author, November 5th, 2020.
[434] Dan Barrett (University of Maine), interview with the author, October 22nd, 2020.

Jeff Kidwell feels his first priority is to prepare a high-quality concert in the ensemble rehearsal, but he agrees that context is essential for helping students make connections to the material they are learning in other classes: "I think people more tangibly tie that to the music they are playing at the time… Even college kids are still pretty concrete thinkers. So they need to see that this applies directly to that. You can't tell them something three hours beforehand and hope that they are going to grasp that and apply it to what you're doing in the rehearsal at that time."[435] Mike Kocour believes that veering too far from playing music in a rehearsal might be counterproductive but feels it is a great venue for exposing students to new paths for their own independent study:

> When people are holding an instrument they want to be playing it. That's the expectation… I do believe that the music inspires. So if you play the recording and its really good, hopefully the student says "now who are these people?"… Why would I read Robin Kelly's book about Monk? I was fascinated by Monk's playing, and I was fascinated by these Monk videos. Who was this person?[436]

Lewis Nash agrees that context is essential and explained his approach of bringing in many different recordings of a tune and prompting discussion about why certain tunes were adapted by jazz musicians. He also makes it a point to include recordings which might have been labeled "corny" such as Broadway show recordings, or "less artistic" than their contemporaries (referring to female bandleader Ina Ray Hutton, who fronted a band but did not play an instrument similar to Cab Calloway) and discussing where those perceptions may have come from. These conversations help students to picture themselves in earlier eras and connect to the music. At the same time, Nash feels that

[435] Jeff Kidwell, interview with the author, October 8th, 2020.
[436] Michael Kocour, interview with the author, November 6th, 2020.

performers are already held to an extremely high standard with their own performing and teaching:

> We shouldn't put this burden on ourselves as the artistic performers who are out there doing it to have to be the ones… to know all of the stuff that the historians know… we call them! Pick up the phone, we can Google, "Hey can you remind me of…"…but it behooves the musicians… its only gonna help their ability to give it an honest truthful performance if their awareness of how they fit into the historical development… and maybe their connection to the people who came before them is strong.[437]

Ultimately, though both performers and scholars are interested in addressing issues of race, gender, and inequality, engaging in meaningful critique with these ideas can potentially get sidelined or delegated to the history department as performance faculty focus on the goal of cultivating the musical abilities of young jazz musicians. Recognizing the challenge of balancing history, culture, and performance in the classroom, David Ake suggests that as much as it may seem overwhelming to educators, this kind of blended approach is crucial if we hope to address the social challenges of the present:

> You can't ignore what is happening in the world right now and in the music. You can't just focus on learning superlocrian or Charlie Parker anymore. That's not going to cut it in a 21st century pedagogy in schools or in the world. To be a musician in the world right now one has to be aware.[438]

While it may seem that spending rehearsal time on these issues might sacrifice a student's performance development, Melvin Butler (University of Miami) offered an example of how the next generation of jazz improvisers may even find unique career trajectories based on their engagement with culture and history:

---

[437] Lewis Nash, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[438] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.

> Three years ago, one of my students (a jazz trumpet performance major) drew on his family heritage to write a final paper on the relation between jazz and rebetiko (a form of Greek urban music). I like to think that his academic work in my class, along with our many discussions about musics of the world, have helped to mold the way he thinks about jazz and forges his educational and professional path in music. As he prepares to graduate and looks ahead to graduate programs in jazz performance, I'll be eager to see how his career takes shape. [439]

Historical and cultural context clearly play a powerful role in shaping the trajectory of a young musician's career, yet the role of a jazz scholar (who is typically assumed to provide that context) is not universally understood. In order to allow for future collaboration between scholarship and performance, I think it important to address how the labels of jazz scholar or jazz historian are applied more broadly.

Who is a Jazz Scholar?

As I spoke with jazz educators, one of the questions I asked was: "Do you feel your work as a jazz performance instructor is informed by the work of any professional jazz historians and scholars? If so, which ones and how have they impacted you?" The responses I got to this question ranged wildly—some citing biographers of jazz musicians, critics, music theorists, musicians who could tell lots of interesting stories, or black literary writers. These responses emphasize that people interpret the titles of "historian" or "scholar" very differently based on their experience. Some of those mentioned had an academic background like Ricky Riccardi (Louis Armstrong House), David Sager (Library of Congress), or John Joyce (Tulane University) however, others were qualified as scholar/historians based on their personal experience and connections. Steve Call for example, considers Dan Barrett (professional trombonist not associated

[439] Melvin Butler, email communication to the author, November 12th, 2020.

with a particular school) as a scholar/historian because of his professional associations with important jazz musicians. Among the many great performers he had the pleasure of working with, Barrett spoke fondly of growing up in LA and meeting a large community of older retired men and women who had moved there from New Orleans. Notably, he had the opportunity to meet and play gigs with Barney Bigard while in high school and Bigard and his wife came to Barrett's 16th birthday party.[440]

Speaking about the role of a scholar/historian, Brian F. Wright felt that musicians often "want someone who has some tangible connection to the great masters of the past" as opposed to "someone who has really done a lot of historical research and dug into what was happening."[441] Based on the response I got in interviews, this would seem to be true, in part because of accessibility. Barrett's recollections of Barney Bigard are fascinating to listen to and paint a picture to which fans and musicians can connect. Bill Dendle also testified of the power of such historical connections reflecting on his work with Bob Haggart's jazz band in San Diego in the 1980s saying: "I remember chatting with him [Haggart] on a gig one night when he told me that when he first moved to New York he had a trio gig on Monday nights with James P. Johnson and Baby Dodds! At that moment I felt connected to the entire history of jazz. I was playing, in 1986, with a guy who had played with musicians who shaped the music from its beginning!"[442]

In contrast to more accessible writers, an academic working for an institution may be writing about more specialized concepts and be publishing their work with journals

[440] Dan Barrett, interview with the author, October 29th, 2020.
[441] Brian F. Wright, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.
[442] Bill Dendle, email communication to the author, February 15th, 2021.

and presses geared toward other academics. David Ake hopes to break this barrier down: "I've always written with one eye towards scholars and one eye… I want it to pass the test of my friends. If Ravi Coltrane and Ralph Alessi and Scott Collie read this and… it rings true to them… I want it to ring as true to them as it would to Scott DeVeaux or Susan McClary or anybody else."[443] Others acknowledge that their writing may not reach the public in the same way but that it helps them communicate with other thinkers about specialized concepts, process their own research, and ultimately improve the quality of education they provide.

As someone with academic training I recognize my suspicion of histories which are not written with the same rigor and peer review typical of scholarly work, yet in traditional jazz the histories created by hobbyists, fans, and musicians are often more influential due to their accessibility. Many of the traditional jazz educators and performers I spoke with referenced the *Syncopated Times* (the periodical I mentioned in chapter one) as the place to go for traditional jazz history topics. I find the articles very useful in that they make a lot of information available about musicians and groups of the past and give a sense of the current audiences and musicians engaging with this type of music. Many of the articles are written by individuals who are clearly dedicated to traditional jazz and steeped in its history. However, the informal language and loose vetting of the articles makes the research appear suspect. Take for example Brian Holland's introduction to his article "Honky Tonk, Boogie Woogie, Stride: What's the Difference?": "I saw the question was posed to me, the quote-unquote 'ragtime authority'

---

[443] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.

to explain the differences between Honky Tonk, Boogie Woogie, and Stride piano styles. So firstly I'd like to say to Lew, 'Thanks!' Very rarely has my name and the word 'authority' been used in the same sentence (at least in such a positive connotation). Now, I shall do my best to oblige."[444] Holland goes on to mention a number of artists I had never heard of before but also offers sweeping generalizations about styles and genres. Looking into Holland's credentials more closely it is clear from his piano performances on YouTube that he has invested considerable effort in learning traditional jazz piano styles and has vast personal experience with the genres he describes.[445] While publications like the *Syncopated Times* are useful for their niche focus and influential for their accessibility, the contributors operate on very different credentialing standards than academia and exist primarily out of the passion and interest of those who maintain and support them.

In considering this range of figures who might qualify as jazz scholars, historical authority is often open to interpretation depending on context. Performers (or those who associated with them) speak from the authority of their own lived experiences, academics speak from the rigor of their training and process of peer review, and fans might speak from their knowledge grown out of passion and dedication. As I demonstrated with chapter two, these categories often overlap and interact in complex ways. In another

---

[444] Brian Holland, "Honky Tonk, Boogie Woogie, Stride: What's the Difference," *The Syncopated Times,* posted Nov 1st, 2016, accessed Dec 18th, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/honky-tonk-boogie-woogie-and-stride-whats-the-difference/?utm_source=The+Syncopated+Times&utm_campaign=8d5436d1da-EMAIL_CAMPAIGN_2020_11_25_01_59&utm_medium=email&utm_term=0_1d5b1765d2-8d5436d1da-367336649.
[445] banjojudy, "Brian Holland – 'Fats Waller Medley,'" *Youtube,* posted March 23rd, 2016, accessed Feb 17th, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=d2QtFWifTa0.

example, John Abigana worked primarily as a high school band director but had the opportunity to employ his passion for jazz as a preconcert lecturer for University of California Davis. Though he was not paid for his work, he had the opportunity to meet touring jazz artists and bring several of them out to his school to put on clinics and presentations for his students.[446] Abigana's authority here is therefore a mix of personal authority (his own knowledge gained through passion and dedication), institutional authority drawing on the academic reputation of the university, and the authority of others through his association with famous musicians who can speak of their firsthand experience.

These different perspectives on authority might offer a range of historical detail and factual accuracy. As someone with a background in academic research, my natural bias is to reserve the label of "scholar" for someone with a similar background, yet in actual practice this term is applied much more liberally. As someone specializing in early jazz research, I am continually impressed with the efforts of non-academic writers and researchers and see their work as an important resource for my own, yet I also feel the need to distinguish them from more academically oriented work because they accomplish different purposes. While writers in the *Syncopated Times* may think critically about history and take care to cite sources, the research scholars in the field of "New Jazz Studies" produce generally takes a more in-depth approach and speaks to larger societal issues. Consider a few of the questions posed by scholars contributing to the volume *Uptown Conversation: The New Jazz Studies:*

---

[446] John Abigana, interview with the author, October 14th, 2020.

> What would cultural historians— with their insistent drive to questions of nationality, race, sexuality, gender, economics, and politics— say about the extraordinarily complex terrains of the New Orleans of Bunk Johnson, the North Carolina and West Side Manhattan of Thelonious Monk? Of these artists' other geographical travels? What did their images, including mistaken conceptions of who they were, tell us about the cultures that mythologized them?[447]

Many of the educators I interviewed were interested in these types of broader cultural and social questions, but historical context often served a broader function of enhancing the entertainment of a performance, providing a background narrative to which listeners could connect emotionally, or bringing awareness to a specific social issue. With this in mind, I don't see it as possible or desirable to police the title of "jazz scholar" and restrict its use to those with academic training. Rather, I think it more valuable to describe historical accounts based on their underlying priorities and research methods.

For example, many of my interviewees noted the appeal of historical context in performance. When presented in an engaging manner, history can be part of the show! As a singer, Banu Gibson notes its appeal: "When I work, I like telling the backstory to the songs I sing. People come up afterwards and say, 'Oh I didn't know that! That's fascinating!' Audiences like the added information that gives a song more meaning. I think there's a big market for that."[448] Bill Dendle recognized this same potential but adds that this approach has its limits both on the stage and in the classroom: "If you're not being engaging, and to some extent entertaining… you don't know who you're leaving out… it's so easy to turn people off. You just have to be careful to avoid it. The

[447] *Uptown Conversation: The New Jazz Studies,* ed. Robert O Meally, Brent Hayes Edwards, and Farah Jasmine Griffin (New York City: Columbia University Press, 2004), 2.
[448] Banu Gibson, interview with the author, November 4th, 2020.

best teachers are entertainers."[449] This is difficult to navigate and requires sensitivity to each situation. In my experience, most historians (whether academic or non-academic) spend considerable energy thinking about how to present their work in an engaging way for their given audience—be that paying audiences, traditional jazz superfans, college students, or other academics. However, history can easily feel overwhelming; Whyton suggests that a penchant for heady details and minutiae in jazz has long been seen as antithetical to the ideology of performance:

> "[T]heorizing" jazz goes against the grain of the music's fundamental tenets of intuition and impulse. On a more subtle level, anti-academic sentiment frequently enters the jazz discourse when the dominant ideology is threatened. A challenge to the dominant ideology results either in being ignored (it is the music that matters), being ridiculed (why discuss such irrelevant things?) or being accused of crowding the jazz narrative with unnecessary ideology[450]

Such challenges to dominant ideology might not go over as well with audiences who do not attend a performance with the expectation of being challenged, yet they are clearly an important aspect of historical study. Geoffrey Jacques, Krin Gabbard, Bernard Gendron, Scott DeVeaux, and Sherrie Tucker discussed the Ken Burns *Jazz* documentary and outlined how certain historical narratives (American exceptionalism, racial integration for integration's sake, and stories of heroic genius combating insurmountable odds) work because audiences are hungry for them. These comfortable narratives don't require us to confront our own guilt or the injustices which continue to exist in society. Sherrie Tucker notes that she is often perceived as "outraged' or "self-righteous" as a result of her work

---

[449] Bill Dendle, interview with the author, October 26th, 2020.
[450] Whyton, "Birth of the School," 73.

discussing jazz and gender.[451] While academics are typically known to address more minute details and difficult topics, nonacademic historians do not necessarily keep to history lite. The *Syncopated Times* articles I referenced in my first chapter did not shy away from addressing uncomfortable racial stereotypes (however Dendle's warning proved true as these articles did have the effect of "turning off" many of the periodical's readers).

Though historians of all varieties may have different goals, the narratives they employ have the potential to place the audiences/students within a musical time period and stimulate emotional connection with the music. In the hands of a passionate person, history can be employed to build emotional momentum for any number of causes (community, financial, racial, etc). Banu Gibson underscores the role of passion: "If you don't have somebody that's jumping up and down saying 'This is the greatest thing ever!...This is really neat!'" it often doesn't really stay with people.[452] Gibson's comment encapsulates the power of canon-building narratives which celebrate musical geniuses and great works of art. Often times this type of emotional engagement with music (be it through performance or history) might be taught in hopes of supporting the larger music and arts culture in the community. In this respect, Jeff Kidwell (University of Central Oklahoma) notes that for many educators the goal is not to create world class jazz stars. Rather: "I'm grooming an audience for not only myself but for the students who will go

[451] Geoffrey Jacques, Bernard Gendron, Sherrie Tucker, Krin Gabbard, and Scott Deveaux "Call and Response: A Roundtable on Ken Burns Jazz," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 13, 2 (2001): 214-215.
[452] Banu Gibson, interview with the author, November 4th, 2020.

out and make a living playing whatever style of music they want to play."[453] Along these lines, universities and institutions like Jazz at Lincoln Center have been very successful—creating concerts, festivals, instructional materials, and arrangements to support young jazz musicians and encourage their emotional investment in music making.

In the case of activism around social issues, performers and educators are often drawing upon history in order to fuel social activism in the present. As a jazz history professor, Scott DeVeaux (University of Virginia) see the overarching jazz history narrative as a romance with emotional power: "a triumph for black musicians and their liberal white colleagues and supporters over adverse circumstances."[454] Though he recognizes all too well the holes in that narrative, DeVeaux teaches it with "all the eloquence and emotion [he] can muster" in hopes of instilling "pride in a racially mixed university for an African-American musical tradition that manages, against all odds, to triumph over obstacles of racism and indifference."[455] As a performer, Colin Hancock describes how he often feels the weight of other's assumptions when people talk about how great it is to see a young black guy like himself (or a girl, referring to the female members of his group) on the bandstand playing traditional jazz. Through his performances and historical study, he feels that he has the ability to recontextualize and reclaim the music for others:

> I definitely feel a responsibility as somebody—a person of color—who is interested in this music to show other people of color, other jazz musicians of

[453] Jeff Kidwell, interview with the author, October 8th, 2020.
[454] Scott Deveaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition: Jazz Historiography," *Black American Literature Forum* 25, no. 3 (Autumn, 1991): 543-544.
[455] Ibid, 552.

> color, other younger musicians, that this is something to be proud of, this is something that's beautiful, this is something that is like… one of the first true American artforms to be made… It just baffles me sometimes that people don't want to claim it but it also doesn't baffle me because the history is so difficult…[456]

Racial advocacy has actually long been a part of jazz historiography, Mario Dunkel outlines how Marshall Stearns wrote extensively in order to emphasize the contributions of American Americans beginning in 1936.[457] With more musicians pursuing advanced academic degrees in jazz Mike Kocour sees valuable opportunities to improve our understanding of the damage done by racial inequality:

> We are seeing a shift where the history of jazz is not being told by promoters and journalists. We have musicologists… and they're not being called ethnomusicologists anymore… I think the study of these people and getting to know them tells us a lot about who we are and our society…the fact that Monk created such amazing music and was dealing with such amazing problems… financially, healthwise, being a black man in New York.

Kocour's comment suggests that academic researchers are authoritatively positioned given their institutional affiliation to educate and advocate for social progress. Certainly, with their extensive engagement with detailed research on race and inequality "New Jazz Studies" scholars are well informed and able to advise on these issues.

Recognizing that the title of jazz scholar is not the exclusive domain of academics, I think it wise for researchers to seek more descriptive terms (the term "New Jazz Studies" for example) and explicitly describe one's methods. As academic training brings a lot of valuable rigor to the field of jazz history, I would advise performers and fans to take advantage of the new understanding which the growing field offers and move

---

[456] Colin Hancock, interview with the author, October 20th, 2020.
[457] Mario Dunkel, "Marshall Winslow Stearns and the Politics of Jazz Historiography," *American Music* 30, no. 4 (Winter 2012): 468.

past their suspicion of heady writing and analysis. At the same time, I think academics would do well to recognize the potentially different priorities of non-academic histories (which often reach larger audiences) and thus seek fruitful collaborations with historians of other perspectives.

Whether mobilizing history for entertainment, emotional connection, activism, or another purpose, each person's historical priorities are always colored by their experience. Just as the association with a university and requirements of tenure applications shape the way academics write, audiences shape the way performers integrate history into their acts, and periodical subscriptions and reader responses shape the type of articles that get published in *The Syncopated Times*. As Krin Gabbard wrote of the Ken Burns *Jazz* documentary: "'There can be no representation without signification.' In other words, the minute you start filming and developing some kind of narrative, a wagon load of desires, obsessions, myths, and tired old archetypes gets dragged into the picture."[458] With greater clarity on goals and methods, I believe the broader jazz community might more effectively utilize and appreciate the work of all who contribute to our understanding of jazz history and scholarship. Rather than use up our energy debating on who might be worthy to be called a scholar, I think we might find greater insight as we collectively consider the historical narratives we prioritize.

---

[458] Geoffrey Jacques, Bernard Gendron, Sherrie Tucker, Krin Gabbard, and Scott Deveaux "Call and Response: A Roundtable on Ken Burns Jazz," *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 13, 2 (2001): 220. Gabbard's internal quote highlights his own popular saying in the classroom.

Combining History and Performance in the Ensemble Rehearsal

Returning to my proposition of interdisciplinary history/performance collaboration, I made a list of potential activities which jazz scholars might undertake asked for feedback my interviewees for their perspective on what they might helpful for their students. These activities included: Publishing research in peer reviewed scholarly journal articles or books, publishing research insights in a more informal format such as a blog or social media, giving a talk or presentation in conjunction with a jazz concert, visiting jazz ensemble rehearsals as a guest speaker, collaborating with jazz performance faculty during a particular semester to help devise bite-sized historical/cultural presentations to be delivered in ensemble rehearsals, putting together a running list or social media group to expose students to the latest jazz research, meeting with jazz performance faculty to provide input on curriculum goals and design, and co-teaching a class with a performance faculty member. While there were no universally enthusiastic responses to any of the ideas, most people felt some degree of usefulness in these paths. The largest obstacles in implementing any of these strategies involve compensation. As this type of collaboration is very new, the academic institution does not have clear pathways for fairly evaluating individual contributions to an interdisciplinary project, and both research and performance faculty must be wary of dedicating a large amount of their time to something that may or may not count in their tenure evaluations.

The standard research goals for scholars (publishing academic books and articles in peer reviewed journals) is clearly valuable practice in helping them to organize their thoughts, communicate with others, and improve their teaching. However, these publications are not widely read by others outside their field. Though some performers

acknowledge that they and their students probably benefit from working with an academic jazz scholar even if they never read their colleagues publications, most performers do not see this type of work as particularly impactful in their lives or practice. Though more informal outlets for sharing jazz history research such as a blog, special interest social media group, podcast, or publication for the general public such as the New York Times, NPR, or Slate might reach a broader audience, this type of work does not substitute for the expected scholarly publications on tenure applications.

I also asked performance faculty their opinions on potential in person contributions from historians such as a talk or presentation in conjunction with a concert or ensemble rehearsal (though such an activity does not count significantly on a scholar's tenure application either). Both of these activities were highly dependent on the individual and the context. While both held the potential for a positive outcome, a mismatch might put a damper on a concert presentation or simply suck up rehearsal time. Most of the performance faculty I spoke with felt open to a contribution from scholarly faculty if they saw a clear shared interest but generally were more inclined to deliver scholarly context as supplementary content which students or audiences could investigate if it sparked their interest. A few scholars felt very connected to the jazz performance departments in their schools and regularly interacted with performance faculty and students. Though he is employed full time as the chair of the University of Miami musicology department, David Ake makes it a point to attend the jazz performance department meetings at the beginning of the year and introduce himself to new students,

sometimes play some piano, and make himself available as a resource to others.[459] Developing this kind of rapport with students and faculty is important groundwork in paving the way for future collaborations. While Ake's position as a performer/scholar allows him to more comfortably bridge this gap, others might not be as ideally positioned. Performance faculty did not generally respond enthusiastically to the suggestion that scholarly faculty might provide valuable input on jazz performance curriculum design. For faculty who are struggling to keep up with all the responsibilities coming their way, the additional scheduling and discussion did not necessarily seem worthwhile.

In the interest of more direct collaboration, I suggested the possibility of collaborating with a scholarly colleague during a semester to help devise bite-sized historical/cultural presentations which might be delivered to ensembles or even co-teaching a class together. Both of these ideas mean crossing department boundaries and stretching tenure evaluation rules. While the activities I suggested hold potential for very positive new directions, they mean extra work for overworked faculty members and risk that their efforts will not be properly valued. Given these obstacles, Wright believes that people who undertake this kind of collaboration are often not professionally incentivized but believe in their heart that it is important.[460] With the reality of scholar-performer collaboration inhibited by these issues, it seems such work will have to evolve slowly growing out of friendships, mutual interests, altruism, and an interest in community.

[459] David Ake, interview with the author, November 9th, 2020.
[460] Brian F. Wright, interview with the author, November 11th, 2020.

These discussions about the relationship between jazz performance and jazz scholarship illuminate the differing perspectives and priorities within these segments of the "jazz studies" field. The different insights from these groups have greatly enhanced my own understanding of traditional jazz and I believe that with greater collaboration between scholars and performers we will be able to better address issues within jazz education. Taking traditional jazz as an example, I see the value in raising the artistic profile of traditional jazz by aligning it with the valued aesthetics of the institution, but I believe we are also missing out on a lot by bounding the subject within those parameters. We ought to question our standards of "good" jazz and remain curious about music which might be constructed according to alternative priorities.

Let Traditional Be Traditional

As my interviews in this chapter confirmed many of the ways which traditional jazz differs from university jazz education pedagogy, I feel that teaching this style of music in performance ought to be accompanied by broader discussions of the aesthetic differences between modern and traditional styles. Personally, I have found the perspectives of "New Jazz Studies" scholars particularly helpful for their insightful critically examinations of historical narratives and discussions of inequality in jazz. I propose that we ought to allow traditional jazz (and other subgenres of jazz) to exist in the university on terms which reflect their non-academic existence. Forcing sub-genres to conform to the privileged aesthetics of bebop and the institutional structure is limiting to our understanding of the musical possibilities. I feel we would be losing many important aspects of the style were we to create a specialized traditional jazz program which simply

placed traditional jazz groups on the concert stage and expected students to perform traditional jazz transcriptions on their end of semester juries. With greater communication between "New Jazz Studies" scholars and performance programs, I believe we will be able to more clearly recognize the differences between different styles of jazz, deconstruct our reasoning for privileging certain repertoire, and be able to make more enriching choices about which music we study and how we study it.

Given the institutional barriers between "New Jazz Studies" and jazz performance, my own hybrid background as a scholar/performer means I (along with other young crossover academics) am well positioned to make the needed connections between these fields. After all, interdisciplinary collaboration is much easier when both the disciplines exist in one person. In my final chapter, I will describe how I have drawn on both sides of my training in leading ensembles to find a balance between the divergent aesthetics of traditional and modern jazz.

CHAPTER 4

TEACHING TRADITIONAL JAZZ ENSEMBLES AS A PERFORMER SCHOLAR: LESSONS LEARNED FROM ETHNOMUSICOLOGY

Discussing the semester goals with one of my traditional jazz combos at a local community college in Phoenix, AZ, I felt somewhat at a loss for words. It had been my assumption that the students were obviously taking the class to improve their jazz performance skills, yet as we talked about the direction of the group, only one member voiced this as a primary concern. Others enjoyed the friendship of other ensemble members, one was simply looking for fun and exciting ways to pass the time in retirement, a composition student felt that playing in the ensemble gave him new ideas to implement in his primary creative work, and another really enjoyed putting on a show to entertain audiences. Coming from my background studying jazz performance in the university, I wasn't quite sure what to do. The many sermons I had received from professors and older musicians over the years about self-motivation and commitment to the artform suddenly seemed quite irrelevant. If we aren't trying to get better at doing the thing we are studying, then what are we doing here?

This experience prompted me to refine my goals to allow the ensemble to mean multiple things to multiple people. As I have described in the previous chapters, I began considering questions of historiography, motivation, and intent in jazz and realized that I had never really questioned why *I* was learning this music or how I justified it as worthy of study in a curriculum. The possibilities opened up even further for me when Sherry Tucker visited Arizona State University in the spring of 2020 to give a presentation about her work with Pauline Oliveros and the Adaptive Use Musical Instrument (AUMI).

While she demo-ed the instrument for the group (essentially a camera app that tracks movement and translates it to sound), we saw how this instrument carried unique music making potential for someone who might face physical barriers to playing a traditional musical instrument. However, anyone who was attempting to use the AUMI to precisely execute technical passages of music would likely become frustrated with its unpredictable response. This led to a discussion about how Tucker's work as a scholar studying jazz from a feminist perspective and working with the AUMI team had led her to consider the ways that music as a privileged object came to oppress certain groups of people who did not participate via the established pathways.[461] Tucker's characterization of jazz as a privileged object suggested to me that simply studying jazz music from the viewpoint of how to "play it better" was quite limiting and—as I found out with my students—not always reflective of real-life situations nor of student goals.

As I demonstrated in chapter three, traditional jazz is generally seen as peripheral to the bebop-centric jazz education model, and its incorporation into the curriculum is often based on its historical value or novelty rather than on its reputation as a privileged object. As bebop has already been translated to be legible to high art concert culture through years of jazz criticism and activism, advocates of traditional jazz have struggled to win the same artistic recognition without conforming to the aesthetic standards of jazz modernism. Therefore, as a new ensemble director, the dominant framework I learned as a jazz performance student—jazz as "America's classical music"—became my starting point; I felt I had to run a group that was performing on a musically high level and

[461] See Tucker's book proposal at "How To Get Involved," AUMI Adaptive Musical Instruments, accessed May 6th, 2020, http://aumiapp.com/participate.php.

rigorously exploring the stylistic nuances of traditional jazz. I noticed that I often fell into an inner dialogue of justifying choices to myself regarding rehearsal techniques or repertoire choices because of my concern with proving myself and validating my ensemble to the faculty and students at the schools which I taught (Arizona State University, Maricopa Community Colleges, and The Nash—a nonprofit jazz performance and education organization).

I have also found I am not the only one who has felt tension over adapting their subjects to the classical values of the institutional framework. "World Music" or "Ethno-ensembles" in the university also play music which is both marginal within, and forced to adapt to the established aesthetics of the institution. Therefore, I see my own work in dialogue with the scholars who lead such groups. The label of ethno-ensemble is, first of all, illustrative of how these groups are considered "foreign" in contrast to other ensembles in a music school. Noting that classical music (rooted in Austria, Germany, France, Italy, and Russia) is not particularly native to America, Ethnomusicologist Richard Winslow suggests: "We would like to allow the feeling of *native* vs *foreign* to wither away. (Is the reader amused or irritated to realize that he is "ethnic" when viewed by a foreigner?)"[462] Disassembling hierarchies of privileged music in this way allows us to appreciate the unique aesthetic qualities of different styles of music as they are.

I draw extensively here from the landmark volume *Performing Ethnomusicology: Teaching and Representation in World Music Ensembles,* a study which addresses the

---

[462] Richard Winslow, "World Music," *Wesleyan Alumnae Magazine,* 1967?, 3-9. Cited in: Sumarsam, "The Gamelan from Java to Wesleyan," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 90.

diverse challenges of representation, pedagogy, and adaptation involved in running these groups. Though the contributing ethnomusicologists generally strive to represent real world cultures with some degree of faithfulness, most would agree that efforts to "authentically" replicate a music or cultural practice are often unrealistic or problematic. They also note that teaching the music in an academic setting requires frequent adaptation to the culture of the institution. This negotiation between aesthetic frameworks can sometimes lead to contradiction. For example, when Ted Solis insisted his students listen to Javanese gamelan music with the typical institutional respect, he found himself "amiably hoist with [his] own petard:"

> After a few minutes, mildly irritated that few of the students were paying attention to the music and most were gabbing animatedly with one another, I rhetorically asked why no one was listening. Randy, a bright choral DMA candidate, pointed out to me that they were, by my own description, responding to gamelan music 'as Javanese might.' They were not listening quietly and reverently, as would an American concert audience, but rather accepting the music as a pleasant background for social interaction while awaiting a subsequent lively musical event upon which to concentrate.[463]

Solis and the other ethnomusicologists featured in *Performing Ethnomusicology* frequently discuss their internal anxieties over representing other musical cultures in the academic environment, sometimes choosing to replicate the experience of their fieldwork for students and other times deliberately adapting their methods to create entirely new and useful experiences which would serve their learning objectives. Solis writes: "In the end, whether we adhere fiercely to what we perceive as orthodoxy, or shed all pretexts to 'accurate' reproduction, we know we may be charged with either neocolonialism or

---

[463] 463 Ted Solis, "Introduction. Teaching What Cannot Be Taught: An Optimistic Overview," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 1.

irresponsible cultural squandering."[464] Such a "damned if we do, damned if we don't" relationship with authenticity means these questions are constantly at the forefront of their everyday work. It also means grappling with overwhelmingly complex layers of representation: As the cultural informants who taught them in fieldwork represent entire cultures, scholars in turn represent those same cultures to their students, and student ensembles may represent foreign cultures to the university and to the general public.

Compared with the canonical ensembles of the university (concert band, orchestra, choir), ethno-ensembles involve very different expectations. In a western classical ensemble, students, teachers, and audiences generally have a common understanding of the music and its accompanying performance culture (and the ensemble's primary goals involve further honing the performer's technical skills and expressive potential.) Roger Vetter compares this with his Javanese gamelan courses:

> How am I to simulate in a few weekly hours of rehearsal supplemented by some individual lessons the lifelong absorptions of contextual musical experience that produces competent native musicians and listeners in Java? Since very few of my students have ever been to Java, how can I in words alone convey to them the cultural context of this music while at the same time transmit to them the necessary musical knowledge to function as beginning performers of this music?[465]

Though both ensembles may perform an end of semester concert in the same concert hall, and audiences may sit in darkness applauding at the appropriate moments in a similar fashion, the learning experiences in these classes are quite different. Along these lines, Solis suggests that ethno-ensembles might be categorized as "experience ensembles"

---

[464] Ibid, 17.

[465] Roger Vetter, "A Square Peg in a Round Hole: Teaching Javanese Gamelan in the Ensemble Paradigm of the Academy," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 117.

where students “embrace a second (cultural) childhood, akin to the sort of entirely new musical experience most musicians underwent as children with their first piano lessons or sixth-grade band,” while the canonical groups (orchestra, band, choir) might be more aptly labelled “realization ensembles,” where students realize pre-existing musical skills.[466] In an experience ensemble, students might approach the music with curiosity, confusion, or exoticism. It is music which operates on unfamiliar theories and aesthetics; and music we don’t yet know how to play. In a realization ensemble, educators lead students in carefully sculpting sound into a performance which is often symbolic of higher virtues. In jazz, I believe the standard big bands and bebop combos to be more accurately termed as “realization ensembles” (at least for jazz majors). The notion of bebop as a lingua franca of modern jazz supports this characterization, and it has been my experience that students learn skills and vocabulary to help them succeed in these formats in their private lessons.

In this chapter, I analyze my own experiences leading a traditional jazz ensemble in dialogue with those of ethnomusicologists leading non-western ensembles. Their own observations—such as the distinction between realization ensembles and experience ensembles—also grow from a dialogue between scholarship and performance in the classroom (the interdisciplinary collaboration I had hoped to encourage in jazz). Additionally, much of their experience working in music schools that emphasize western music resonates with me as a director of traditional jazz ensembles appended to bebop-centric jazz performance programs. Critically analyzing my own experiences, I

---

[466] Solis, “Introduction…,” 7.

interrogate the reasoning behind my own pedagogy choices. In what ways do I study traditional jazz as a privileged object? How do I attempt to represent (or deliberately adapt) the culture of New Orleans? How do I define the genre? Grappling with these questions means attempting to integrate the discussions from my previous three chapters (genre definition, authority in teaching tradition, and combining historical/cultural context with performance education) into the ensembles I coach. In other words, this is my attempt to practice what I have preached. I believe that university jazz education could become more diverse and effective if jazz directors follow the example of these ethno-ensemble directors by critically examining their ensemble goals, desired aesthetics, and process of representing the nonacademic culture of jazz within the institution.

By learning from the example of ethnomusicologists who direct non-western music ensembles, I believe jazz directors can develop greater awareness of the ways they build a canon for their students and construct their own authority to teach about jazz. Mediating between their understanding of jazz as a non-academic culture, jazz education in the university, and the students' needs and abilities, jazz instructors must make decisions which have long term consequences for future jazz inside and out of the institution. As the majority of jazz ensembles most accurately fit the definition of a "realization ensemble," I believe that allowing more freedom to approach the group as an "experience ensemble" might allow us to find more productive ways to handle the current problems with jazz education.

More broadly, my analysis in this chapter brings the scholarly rubber to the road of performance in my attempt to transparently articulate how my priorities and values have shifted based on the challenges I faced in defining my subject, curating my

curriculum, adapting to student needs, representing the tradition ethically, presenting myself as an authority on traditional jazz, and packaging my scholarly insights into the ensemble rehearsal. While I began my teaching career trying to adapt traditional jazz to the privileged aesthetics of classical music and modern jazz, I began to integrate new perspectives from my scholarly research and experiment with insights I gained from studying ethno-ensemble directors as I gained the trust of students and faculty.

Defining the Subject Aesthetically through Pedagogy

In choosing how to set up my ensemble, I recognized that traditional jazz differs aesthetically from both mainstream jazz education and western classical music (privileged genres within my university institution). As a result, I selectively presented my subject—conforming to privileged aesthetics at times and rejecting them at others—in order to situate my band (and myself) in the most positive position. I could choose to emphasize the complexity of the music or its simplicity, its earthy qualities or its family friendliness, its deep artistic expression or its lighthearted entertainment. I recognized that positive reactions from full time faculty members and audiences would make a lasting impact on my future teaching opportunities and students' educational experience. These choices were frequently shaped by my development as a scholar, and I therefore think it helpful to describe how my choices evolved as I progressed through my doctoral degree.

I had the opportunity to form a traditional jazz ensemble at Arizona State University shortly after I began my PhD studies in musicology in 2015. After running this ensemble for a number of semesters, I had developed a reputation as the "trad jazz"

guy and received offers to teach other ensembles at local community colleges as well as to present traditional jazz performances and educational workshops throughout the Phoenix, AZ area. With my initial ensemble, I had to find students to play in the group, schedule rehearsal times, and arrange music for the band to play; I also chose to perform with the group in university combo concerts. My initial approach was to treat the traditional jazz genre as a bounded entity with stylistic rules and a clearly defined canon. It was a "how to" course utilizing pedagogical materials to prepare students for the occasional trad gig in their professional careers (much like the resources I analyzed in chapter two). I had a fair number of pedagogical strategies to draw upon from my experience playing in a "Dixieland" band in my own undergraduate studies, so I felt well-equipped to teach the course, and students who enrolled seemed to appreciate such a practical method. Under this framework, the repertoire I chose consisted of common tunes such as "When the Saint's Go Marching In," "Won't You Come Home Bill Bailey?," and "Doctor Jazz." We also focused on common licks and vocabulary that would ground students' playing more firmly in traditional source recordings. With this in mind, I framed the class competencies to help prepare students with tunes and skills that would allow them to visit New Orleans and sit in with a local band comfortably. I felt personally validated when some of my students later visited the city and told me my class had given them just what they needed for this practical purpose.

While the "how to" approach checked many boxes for my students and me, it primarily defined the subject matter of our course in opposition to mainstream jazz studies and western classical music (the privileged genres). In this respect, it was somewhat limiting as our focus was less on traditional jazz as a genre and more on the

differences of traditional jazz from the music students already knew. In fact, the most common priorities I heard from my mentors at the time were about getting jazz students to play musical vocabulary appropriate for the time period as opposed to falling back on the theory and licks they had learned for later styles of jazz. Similarly, my clarinetists (who primarily came from a classical background) could sightread complicated obbligato parts, but they usually came out sounding like Rose études with very polished tone rather than emulating the expressive manipulations of New Orleans players. Within these contexts, my "how to" approach was pedagogically useful to help students recognize how they might utilize their existing knowledge from mainstream jazz and classical training and where they had to develop new skills.

Though I achieved a certain level of success with the ensemble by defining it in relation to the mainstream, this method privileges what is already familiar to students and often leads to a binary simplification. Labelling music and techniques as modern or traditional jazz does not address the nuance and variety of the traditional jazz genre as it developed over time, geographic distance, and the contributions of many musicians. Trying to create a formula to solo like Louis Armstrong or devise specific exercises for making a classical clarinetists sound like a New Orleans player are certainly valuable approaches, but they will not substitute for extensive listening and engagement with the genre. My students might be able to evoke New Orleans for a short second line parade for a corporate event or wedding in Phoenix, AZ, but they would need more extensive engagement with traditional jazz if they wished to be taken seriously as players sitting in with a band in New Orleans.

That being said, as a “non-native” instructor teaching “non-native” students, it is much more comfortable to portray a foreign tradition in juxtaposition to the familiar because it can bypasses our anxiety about our own insider/outsider status and relationship with a complex living tradition. For example, consider ethnomusicologist Ricardo Trimillos’s observation on teaching Japanese *koto* at the University of Hawai’I that his “construction of Japanese traditionalism was selective and biased toward Otherness, that is, that which was different from the students’ normal experience.”[467] Not of Japanese descent, nor fluent or literate in Japanese himself, Trimillos came to be the *koto* teacher when his own teacher retired and recommended him for the job. Though he possessed alternative authority as a performer with academic credentials and an Asian physical appearance, Trimillos notes how he felt comfortable “teaching about the world of koto and traditional music” but not necessarily representing Japanese culture. Interestingly, he chose to focus on a number of traditional practices—such as playing in a kneeling *seiza* position as opposed to sitting in chairs—which are still practiced in formal settings, but have largely fallen out of fashion in the modern *koto* world because he felt this would provide “an opportunity to experience another aspect of culture in addition to its sound organization.”[468] While I see Trimillos’s rationale for this choice, he himself notes that such a choice might be a way to shift the gaze away from the teacher’s authority and onto the cultural subject. Writing of non-native ethnomusicologists attempting to establish their authority as teachers, he notes the “problematic notion” of “emphasiz[ing] older

---

[467] Ricardo Trimillos, “Subject, Object, and the Ethnomusicology Ensemble: The Ethnomusicological “We” and “Them,” in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 34-36.
[468] Ibid.

repertory and recognized aspects of 'tradition.'"[469] As I explained in chapter two with the case of Antoon Aukes, this type of an approach is a suitable way for an outsider to construct their authority, but it also sidesteps other aspects of tradition.

In my "how to" approach, I was overly focused on tradition as a way to assert my own authority, and I did not recognize the way my focus colored the subject for students. For example, as I attempted to point students to authoritative models, I was diverting the gaze from myself, but also exercising my authority to feature certain musicians. When I became conscious of this, I made efforts to try and broaden my approach to include a more diverse range of musicians, but I struggled to let go of such a powerful tool in defining my authority as an instructor. Indeed, some argue that tradition can become oppressive in some situations. Trimillos quotes theatre scholar Brian Singleton's claim that "tradition…is a powerful ruling weapon on which colonialism depends, on which the post-colonial world feeds, but which is ultimately a fabrication, and which blocks the formation and emergence of new narratives."[470] Thinking of tradition as an established and clear-cut practice is valuable in education, but it is not an accurate reflection of how musical cultures function in real life and over long spans of time.

I see critical reflexivity as a potential remedy to the tendency to categorize and an important tool to stimulate student awareness of exoticism and othering. While labels like "traditional," "modern," "classical," or "ethnic" present significant challenges in ethically representing our subjects, they are also an important part of teaching any musical subject.

---

[469] Ibid, 43.
[470] Ibid. Also see: Brian Singleton, "Introduction: The Pursuit of Otherness for the Investigation of Self," *Theatre Research International* Vol. 22, No. 2 (January 2009): 95.

Ethnomusicologist David Harnish described two varieties of "Otherness" which operate within the university in relation to Balinese gamelan: "In the first, the gamelan sparks the imagination and represents exoticism; in the potentially more harmful second, an administration or faculty constructs a power relationship in which the duality of Self and Other is not complementary, where the Self defines the Other as inferior and even irrelevant."[471] Harnish suggests that as students learn more about the culture and music of Bali, they are able to transcend some of that distance and find an enriching and ethical path forward. Reflexively turning student's analytical skills to their conceptions of the Other allows for greater insight into our categorization process (and hopefully some room for unresolved contradictions). For example, given the traditional ensemble's "otherness" in relation to mainstream jazz education and their frequent juxtaposition in the classroom, I later invented a project which would critically examine these categories. We compiled a group "lick-tionary" where each student in the group would listen to music they felt was categorized as "traditional jazz" and pick a lick (excerpt of musical vocabulary) to share with the class. We shared voice memos in a folder, learned to play them, transposed them to different keys, and discussed possibilities for how they might be used in a piece. As part of my own reflexive study, I had realized the difficulty in labelling vocabulary as "traditional" in order to carry out my "how to" approach with the class and extended this challenge to students, asking them to discuss their reasons for classifying the recordings and licks they chose as traditional or otherwise. I believe that these discussions allowed

---

[471] David Harnish, "No, Not 'Bali Hai'!": Challenges of Adaptation and Orientalism in Performing and Teaching Balinese Gamelan," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 137.

students to transcend the traditional vs. mainstream binary as it allowed them to remain curious and open to the contested nature of musical traditions.

As I formed the ensemble, I took the approach of "seriously digging in" to traditional jazz and performing it at a high level in order to differentiate the group from another traditional band at ASU known as the "Dixie Devils," which played for sporting events, pep rallies, and school administration parties (I had played with this group previously as had some of the students in my combo). While they held regular rehearsals, some of the students in the "Dixie Devils" were brought in from the marching band and lacked jazz experience, the band played simple head arrangements with a round of solos on each tune, and the primary focus of the group was entertaining sports fans and university donors. At the time (probably owing to my previous college experience playing the music in concert settings rather than as an accessory to a sporting event) I considered the Dixie Devils band with their pep rallies and donor event gigs as something of a corruption of the "real music;" performing in marching band polos alongside students in the marching band who had little jazz training seemed to me a watered-down version of the genuine article. Ironically, my own desire to "seriously dig into the real thing" involved replicating recordings, treating the music as a privileged object, and performing in concert—views that would be more consistent with mainstream jazz education and classical music. Placing audience entertainment as the number one priority, the "Dixie Devils" may have been more culturally faithful to the music as it is played in New Orleans than my rigorous transcription and imitation. Ultimately, we had much in common: we played the same tunes, often referencing recordings by the same artists, and focused on a similar agenda of basic stylistic principles. However, I organized my

ensemble with a more curated presentation aligned with the music school's bebop-based combos and the social norms of the recital hall. In many instances, I emphasized elements such as clean execution and playing in tune with the ensemble. I also arranged homophonic passages over more spontaneous improvisation because I felt it would better fit in with the jazz that seemed to command more respect within the institution. In this approach, my focus was deliberately oriented towards the privileged aesthetics of the institution. I hoped to win respect from university faculty for my teaching, for the students' performances, and for the genre of traditional jazz. As I discussed in the previous chapter, many of the educators from whom I had learned traditional jazz had gone to similar lengths to present the genre as worthy of an art music label. My choices to hold musicians to high technical standards, prepare polished arrangements, and adopt an attitude of serious performance as opposed to entertaining sports fans grew from a desire to mold traditional jazz to fit my own perceived notions of respectability. Indeed, Krin Gabbard described such "appeals to standards developed for classical music" in jazz as an effort to overcome its stepchild relationship to music which has been commonly accepted as "art music."[472]

Considering the notion of jazz as art music, my conceptions of musical standards and technique were primarily rooted in the notions of complexity and virtuosity that critics had emphasized to exalt bebop to art status. Analyzing this discourse, Guthrie Ramsey notes that jazz writers firmly believed in the notion that western art music is more complex than, and therefore superior to, other music and sought to raise bebop's

[472] Krin Gabbard, "Introduction: The Canon and its Consequences," *Jazz Among the Discourses* ed. by Krin Gabbard (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995), 2.

profile accordingly by "arguing that it is just as complicated (and that it is complicated in the same way) as western art music."[473] Given that this was the value framework established for modern jazz and that New Orleans jazz had historically been characterized as "fumbling," "inept," "dull clichés," and "uncertain procedures" by swing modernists in the New Orleans revival of the 1940s, I felt pressure to uphold the standards of quality and technique that would be expected for a rigorous college-level course.[474] A few students seemed very enthusiastic about traditional jazz, but from my perspective, they were attracted to the novelty of learning many different styles of music, taking only a superficial approach but never attaining a high standard of familiarity and technical mastery over the idioms. Sometimes, I enforced standards of quality to the point where overcommitted students eventually chose not to continue with the course as they could not prepare adequately for class. Holding students accountable for standards of technique and realization akin to the western classical tradition certainly has a place in traditional jazz, yet it exists alongside the hot collectors' characterization of jazz as folk music prized more for its emotion than for its technical execution. While Elijah Wald points out how Louis Armstrong listened to cornet virtuosos like Herbert L. Clarke and may have drawn inspiration for his famous "West End Blues" cadenza from recordings like Clarke's "Caprice Brillante," Thomas Brothers also describes how the practice of heterophony (multiple simultaneous versions of a single melody) flowed from African sources into sanctified church singing in America and suggests that collectively

---

[473] Guthrie Ramsey, *The Amazing Bud Powell: Black Genius, Jazz History, and the Challenge of Bebop* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2013), 32-33.
[474] Bernard Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," Discourse, Vol. 15, No. 3 (Spring 1993): 142, http://www.jstor.org/stable/41389289.

improvising horns may be "read as a stylized, instrumentalized, and professionalized transformation of church heterophony."[475] Such examples clearly show that traditional jazz is an amalgam of different aesthetics, and while some may line up well with a western classical notion of virtuosity, others might seem incongruous.

Returning to Solis's characterization of ethno-ensembles as "experience ensembles" and canonical groups as "realization ensembles," I had clearly emphasized the traditional jazz group as a realization ensemble in my efforts to appeal to the culture of the institution, but I began considering how an experience ensemble might prioritize different aesthetics than privileged "art musics" value. As I became confident that my faculty supervisors were pleased with my work as an instructor, I began to experiment more freely. One way I deliberately subverted the aesthetics of modern jazz was through encouraging students to practice and perform vocal choruses on the tunes we learned even if their voices were untrained. My previous experience with jazz education had privileged instrumental jazz over vocal, yet my experience visiting New Orleans revealed that musicians saw the ability to sing as highly valuable and much more likely to bring in tips from the audience than instrumental music alone. Based on this professional practice, I often encouraged all my band members to sing at least one vocal chorus for each of our concerts (regardless of their previous vocal training). Such a deliberate public showcase of singing (particularly of untrained voices) was very much against the grain in a program of primarily instrumental bebop. The vocals were generally received well by audiences

[475] Elijah Wald, "Louis Armstrong Loves Guy Lombardo," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 42. See also: Thomas Brothers, *Louis Armstrong's New Orleans* (New York: W.W Norton & Co, Inc, 2007), 42-45.

for their novelty, and the other jazz faculty agreed it was more typical for the style and offered good experience for students, yet it felt somewhat daring to attempt to reconfigure the recital hall aesthetics for the short set we would be onstage.

To put such an act in context requires further examination of the aesthetic discourse surrounding jazz singing and entertainment in jazz historiography. Musicologist Jessica Bisset Perea points out that vocalists were generally excluded by the modernist aesthetics meant to lift jazz to art music status (upon which most jazz education programs were founded):

> An instrumental bias in jazz originated in the 1940s of modernist aesthetics that invested deeply in notions of virtuosity, and anticommercialism. By contrast, conventional histories of the modern jazz era vocalists as inherently commercial or popular, and therefore not "real jazz," is evidenced through the calculated inclusion of vocalists in the swing era (alternatively described as the "mainstream" or "entertainment" era) followed by the overt exclusion of vocalists beyond the 1940s.[476]

The central issue with singing in a space that designates singing as entertainment and instrumental virtuosity as art is the suggestion that those categories are incongruent and that noncommercial music is inherently more valuable. In Bisset Perea's historiographic analysis, jazz singing and entertainment are placed in opposition to serious jazz (the privileged object). She echoes Lara Pellegrinelli's observations about how the rational mind and instrumental virtuosity (male) are placed in opposition to the carnal body and

---

[476] Jessica Bisset Perea, "Voices From the Jazz Wilderness: Locating Pacific Northwest Vocal Ensembles Within Jazz Education," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 181.

emotional seduction of the voice (female).[477] Characterized this way, Pellegrinelli argues that the elimination of singing (women's primary venue for participation) defines jazz as "demanding art music… made by men for men as connoisseurs."[478] Separated from its non-art associations with prostitutes in New Orleans, "the discourse gives exclusive control over the music to men, enabling them to control the singing body."[479] Considering these conceptions singing as feminized (and therefore not jazz), my feelings that I transgressed the norm seem quite justified as my emphasis of singing and entertainment challenges the aesthetics of the venue, deliberately emphasizing elements which at one time were integral in securing the privilege of jazz as "art music."

Bisset-Perea and Pellegrinelli describe anti-commercialism primarily in terms which devalue the contributions of women, but rejecting all things profit-motivated has been a favorite discursive weapon throughout jazz history in a wide variety of contexts. Discussing early jazz criticism, Bernard Gendron emphasizes that for the New Orleans revivalists, anti-commercialism "played into and reinforced their promotion of authenticity, folklorism, tradition, and affect set against a vaguely left-wing, antifascist background."[480] Writing about Louis Armstrong's affinity for marching bands, orchestra work, and sweet dance bands like Guy Lombardo's, Elijah Wald emphasizes how white music historians lapse into "nostalgie de la boue" (nostalgia for supposedly "low" culture) while praising the musical accomplishments of the hottest playing black

---

[477] Ibid, 182. See also: Lara Pellegrinelli, "Separated at Birth: Singing and the History of Jazz," in *Big Ears: Listening for Gender in Jazz Studies,* ed. Nichole T. Rustin and Sherrie Tucker (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008), 42-44.
[478] Pellegrinelli, "Separated at Birth…," 42.
[479] Ibid, 43.
[480] Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," 150.

musicians—attributing art status to their dance music—but ignoring the fact that many of them enjoyed and aspired to play the more "refined" music of the day (and, in most cases, find greater commercial success).[481] In all these examples, anti-commercialism lands on the critic's side: In Bisset-Perea's view, historians with higher aspirations for jazz reject commercialism to privilege modern jazz alongside European classical ideals of "serious" music; for Gendron, critics reject the commercial success of modernist swing in order to protect the supposed folk culture of early New Orleans; and in Wald's description, white historians reject the more popular sweet (predominantly white) varieties of jazz in order to privilege the hotter varieties played by black bands. Ironically, anti-commercialism continues to play a role in the popularity and financial success of the current jazz scene as described by Ramsey:

> All things told, jazz criticism and scholarship have helped to usher the music into a new age of quasi-respectability. Coupled with corporate interest in promoting this new profile, it would seem that we are in the sway of a new orthodoxy that might be called Jazz, Inc. With respectability as one of its core impulses, Jazz, Inc., embodies all of the tensions and contradictions of late capitalism, a state in which a discourse attempts to marshal and stabilize styles, critiques, and theories into something manageable and consumable even as it exploits its perceived marginal status.[482]

Paralleling the state of modern jazz with his analysis of bebop's journey to art music status, Ramsey indicates how both perceived anti-commercialism and popularity play an important role in the music's success. The uptown Harlem jam sessions where musicians could experiment and the 52nd street clubs where they could get paid, land record deals, and find publicity were both essential to musicians' success and the cultural elevation of

[481] Wald, "Louis Armstrong Loves Guy Lombardo," 40.
[482] Ramsey, *The Amazing Bud Powell…,* 51-52.

the artform. Thus, commercialism allows musicians to develop their art to a higher level and make a greater impact through more lucrative opportunities to perform and record. Yet, anti-commercialism remains what sets jazz apart as a privileged object: something worth pursuing without financial reward.

This scholarship shows how commercialism has played into aesthetic arguments about various substyles of jazz throughout history and proves that the duality of commercialism vs. art is flexible enough for all kinds of writers to employ it to their advantage in raising the profile of their preferred brand of jazz. The simple opposition of commercial = bad jazz and anti-commercial = art jazz has never been true, yet our larger ideological associations with commercialism make it a powerful aesthetic marker. My choice as an instructor to selectively embrace commercial elements like vocal choruses while also advocating for elements I perceived as important for serious music study (high technical standard, detailed study of recordings, well-crafted arrangements, and recital hall performance aesthetics) was an attempt to fit in, but also to stand out from, the crowd in a jazz combo concert. By positioning my group as something different, something fun and relatable, I hoped to reach a wider audience and grow my opportunities. At the same time, following a more popular aesthetic by including comedy routines and costumes or compromising the musical rigor of the ensemble might have led to a clear genre split with some questioning whether the university recital hall combo concert was an appropriate venue for my group.[483] In retrospect, my choices did distinguish the ensemble. After

[483]Bisset Perea described a similar split after the 1971 Reno jazz festival which led to jazz choirs being separated from show choirs given their different attitudes toward stage choreography, Bisset Perea, "Voices From the Jazz Wilderness…," 181.

running the group for a year, I had established myself as a competent instructor leading student groups in high-quality performances and had begun to develop a reputation as the local traditional jazz guy with students and musicians. Some reached out to me and expressed interest in joining the group. Additionally, I would later go on to find further opportunities to perform, direct other ensembles, and lead local workshops.

In these first semesters of directing the group, I began to see that my "how to" approach presented tradition as an oversimplified concept and to recognize how I was constructing my own authority as an instructor and forming a canon for my students. I began to develop my reflexive skills and analyze the ways in which I was both conforming to and subverting the aesthetics of institutionally privileged music. By working with the students on common "warhorse" type tunes, I felt they were able to practice applying theoretical approaches to traditional jazz improvisation in many different contexts. However, I had received the most positive feedback from faculty and mentors when presenting a mix of repertoire created using different techniques (written arrangements, basic tunes learned by ear, vocal choruses, pieces transcribed from a recording, and original material). Subsequently, I chose to shift the balance of the class towards repertoire, spending the first class of the semester learning "When the Saints Go Marching In" or another common tune by ear and discussing the theoretical framework of collective improvisation. As we continued the semester, I brought in a diverse range of repertoire for the band and tried to integrate more of a repertoire-focused study through transcribing model recordings.

Paying Homage to the Gods: Canon Construction, Transcription, and Imitation.

A “repertory band” is a group which takes the goal of replicating classic jazz styles of the past and teaching students idiomatic skills for interpreting that repertoire. The concept of a repertory band involves imitation (obviously), but the group can be conducted a number of different ways to subtly shape how students understand canon construction and “art music.” Personally, I have found imitation to be a powerful tool for understanding musical style, but I struggle with uncoupling it from the implied value judgement (we are imitating the *best* jazz musicians). Simply posing the questions to students of *why* we should imitate any piece of music, which recordings make an ideal model, and what larger goals we are pursuing with our study invite some critical thought and make the value systems which form the basis of our canonical choices more explicit. Recreating a recording as closely as possible lines up well with an academic framework where we can compare student performances to a model recording and suggest areas for improvement (usually meaning a more faithful recreation of the recorded sound). As I began to consider the group less of a “how to” tutorial and more of a repertory ensemble, I struggled to define my criteria for selecting repertoire. I could expand looking at older sources, newer sources, sources with a close tie to New Orleans, sources from famous musicians, explore various subgenres of traditional jazz, and so on.

In the classical realm musicologist Peter Burkholder notes that canon construction was closely linked with connoisseurship following the boom of mass market music in the 19th century:

> [W]hile the concert audience in Mozart's day included both connoisseurs and those less knowledgeable, and all elements of the audience could find pleasure in a single work of art, the new mass audience was more hostile to connoisseurship, and there was little in the music of virtuoso composer-performers to engage the attention of the musically intelligent. In reaction, more serious musicians turned back to Beethoven, Mozart Haydn, creating the concept of the 'master' and the 'masterpiece' in music and deifying these three (and, to a lesser extent, Bach) as the geniuses of a great musical art.[484]

In Burkholder's characterization of the formation of the western classical music museum, he points out that "classical" status is very deliberately anti-commercialist. He suggests that in order for the works of future composers to be worthy of inclusion they must serve the "same function, as works of lasting value which [proclaim] a distinctive musical personality, which [reward] study, and which [become] loved as they became familiar."[485] In order to achieve this, composers (particularly from Brahms onward) compositionally emulated their forbears to absorb their musical language and conventions, a practice which Burkholder designates as an essential part of "what makes a tradition a tradition."[486] Just as Burkholder describes these classical "masterworks" being removed from their original context as part of "ceremony, worship, public entertainment, dancing, or amateur music making," we elevate certain jazz recordings and arrangements to deified status within the institution.[487] We emulate them, research them, write down their solos note for note, and re-perform the music in concert halls; audiences, in turn, respond according to concert hall conventions. In this sense, a

---

[484] Peter Burkholder, "Museum Pieces: The Historicist Mainstream in Music of the Last Hundred Years" *The Journal of Musicology* 2, No. 2 (Spring 1983): 117.
[485] Ibid, 119.
[486] Ibid, 123.
[487] Burkholder, "Museum Pieces…," 119.

repertory ensemble can easily fall into the same established educational pathways for classical music.

The notion of a traditional jazz repertory band is also influenced by the broader culture of professional jazz musicians and fans who listen to that music. Bandleader Vince Giordano helped recreate the music of the1920s and '30s for films like Francis Ford Coppola's *The Cotton Club,* Martin Scorsese's *The Aviator,* and Woody Allen's *Sweet and Lowdown* and most recently for the HBO series *Boardwalk Empire.*[488] For *Boardwalk Empire,* Giordano not only recorded much of the music and appeared on screen leading the band, but also served as a historical consultant for the directors.[489] In interviews, Giordano describes his enthusiasm for recreating the sounds of earlier eras by collecting old band arrangements, piano rolls, 78s, and silent movie scores.[490] Such detailed research goes beyond merely copying a recording. While for Burkholder, the "musical museum" strips away social context to focus on the greatness of the music, Giordano is actually quite dedicated to understanding every detail not only of early jazz music making, but also the social world in which it existed. His dedication to the details also manifests in requiring his band to play written solos rather than improvising:

> The musicians today don't go home after a gig and wind up the phonograph and listen to Frankie Trumbauer or Bix or Louie or Coleman Hawkins. They're into

[488] "Vince Giordano: The Fresh Air Interview," *NPR* November 6th, 2013, https://www.npr.org/2013/11/06/243483782/vince-giordano-the-fresh-air-interview, accessed Jan 27th, 2021.
[489] Charles McGrath, "Playing a Bandleader and Keeping it Real," *The New York Times,* Sep 3rd, 2010, https://www.nytimes.com/2010/09/05/arts/television/05bempire.html, accessed Jan 27th, 2021.
[490] Ibid. See also: "Loudon Wainwright III and Vince Giordano Play From the Great American Songbook," *NPR,* December 31st, 2020, https://www.npr.org/2020/12/31/952276957/loudon-wainwright-iii-and-vince-giordano-play-from-the-great-american-songbook, accessed Jan 27th, 2020.

> all kinds of music. They'll listen to a little bit of that, but they'll be influenced by others things. Which is all fine and well. But what I'm trying to do is do a *repertory band* that sounds like music from that era. And the jazz should be of that era too. If you just put chord symbols in the solo spots, which I used to do, and the band is playing a 1927 chart but the soloist is playing Coltrane licks in there—does that make sense? No. So I have the solos written out and the guys play them as the guys played them back then. If it's a great solo, it's worth rehearing. We're paying homage to the gods.[491]

As Giordano's final phrase indicates, he is aware of the musical museum and believes that traditional jazz belongs within it. Yet, the canonical stakes of defining musicians as "gods" are high. The "gods" to whom Giordano refers are often mentioned in jazz history classes but are rarely the principal deities venerated in a university jazz program's improvisation curriculum. Nevertheless, his language clearly proselytizes that greater weight ought to be given to these earlier figures within the framework of the existing great man tradition and designates the act of transcription and realization as a sign of the devoted faithful.

Giordano's approach of researching and performing music which functions socially as dance music and entertainment yet categorizing the repertoire as great and musicians of the era as gods (who played great solos that are worth rehearing) is somewhat "having your cake and eating it too." He embraces elements of the musical museum which serve his aesthetic framework (designating "god" status, collecting memorabilia from the era, and imitating the music with as much faithfulness as possible) but bypasses others (as he does not strip away associations from social dancing or note any conflict about great art music playing a subservient role to the film art). Though he

---

[491] Vince Giordano quoted in Chip Deffaa, *Traditionalists and Revivalists* (Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press and the Institute of Jazz Studies, Rutgers, 1993), 22.

advocates stylistic congruency even to the exclusion of improvisation, musicologist Eric Porter emphasizes that some consider improvisation an essential characteristic of jazz.[492] That being said, Giordano's selective emphasis is nothing new. Gendron points out that warring jazz critics in the '30s and '40s "simply accentuated certain tendencies of the 'modernist' impulse at the expense of others" in their goal of asserting the artistic merit of their preferred artists and genres.[493] Analyzing these precedents as an ensemble director, I feel it is important to clearly articulate my own priorities and rationale for shaping the ensemble one way or another. While I hope to avoid the pitfalls of deifying musicians and removing their music from social context, Giordano's comments shows that these narratives are obviously powerful and impact the way that we study and perform the music in the present.

While I initially ran my ensemble with a "how to" approach, I reorganized the group with a more imitative repertory approach in part at the recommendations of the full-time performance faculty with whom I worked, but also as a result of my experience developing and presenting a musicology event geared towards the general public as part of an applied musicology course. Hoping to incorporate my ensemble and put on a lecture/concert combo presentation, I reached out to a local jazz nonprofit venue to try and put something together. After looking over my initial program of tunes and historical background, one of the directors at the venue remarked that it didn't look like I was addressing anything beyond what a student might get in a typical jazz history survey

---

[492] Eric Porter, "Incorporation and Distinction in Jazz History and Jazz Historiography," in *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 21.
[493] Gendron, "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," 151.

course. Returning to the drawing board, I reconsidered the content I was offering students. While I had been focusing on repertoire that someday might prove economically advantageous for students (the most common gig tunes), I was motivated to branch out to material further outside that repertoire and even to experiment with music which seemed only tangentially related to traditional jazz. I also began to go into more detail on "New Jazz Studies" perspectives, incorporating more discussion into rehearsals and experimenting with the interdisciplinary blend I described in the previous chapter.

Looking at my options for expansion, the California revivalist bands I discussed in chapter one like Lu Watters's and Turk Murphy's had set the precedent of looking back to the repertoire of the earliest recorded traditional jazz bands and digging up old ragtime and blues pieces, a trend which more contemporary groups like the New Orleans street band Tuba Skinny continue in the present. Others expanded the more typical "great man" narrative of jazz history, tracing in exquisite detail the legacy of Louis Armstrong or other famous musicians—a process described by one of my colleagues as "choose one of the seven guys from that era who played your instrument and copy everything they did." As I mentioned, my musicological interests also led me to question to what degree traditional jazz as a genre was defined by the geography and culture of New Orleans, to what extent other genres like R&B and brass bands were related with traditional jazz, and to what extent songs romanticizing "Dixieland" cultivated racist nostalgia. Each of these canonical frameworks offered a different selection of artistic models and possibilities and made me question what I ought to perpetuate through inclusion in my curriculum. Considering the above directions (digging up old repertoire from the past, including more great men, or bring in repertoire related to my research questions) might lead to

emphasizing different aesthetics. Prioritizing older sources might emphasize folk authenticity or African roots, while a great man focus brings greater emphasis on virtuosity and innovation. My research questions emphasized recordings from New Orleans artists, an evolving New Orleans tradition over the past century, and ethical considerations about song lyrics and appropriation. Looking back on the experience, it has become clear to me that any of these options can yield positive results of one form or another, but it is important that an instructor transparently present their aesthetic choices and make it clear to students that this is one of many approaches.

Seeing how one person's opinion (with enough perpetuation) could become accepted as the authoritative standard by which other music would be judged served as a cautionary tale. The 1973 *Smithsonian Collection of Classic Jazz* serves a prime example—Damon Phillips (scholar in business and marketing) notes how the 46 page booklet which accompanied the recordings made them more appealing and logical: "After reading the liner notes, the confusing songs became clearer, annoying songs became art, and everything seemed to naturally belong in the jazz canon."[494] Scott DeVeaux adds that the collection became a staple of college jazz history classes, further enshrining the canonical status of the included recordings.[495] Recognizing how jazz critics had shaped jazz aesthetics throughout the 20th century and noticing a similar connection with how my jazz mentors had shaped the way I heard and appreciated jazz, I felt uneasy about attaching too much valuation to canonical recordings based on my own

494 Damon Phillips, *Shaping Jazz: Cities, Labels, and the Global Emergence of an Art Form* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013), 12.
495 Scott Deveaux, "Constructing the Jazz Tradition: Jazz Historiography," *Black American Literature Forum* 25, no. 3 (Autumn, 1991): 556.

musical taste. As a white musician who grew up in the suburbs of Portland, Oregon, I strongly related with the lack of first-hand experience Ken Prouty describes as common among modern jazz educators:

> How does an educator who was not "there" teach jazz history with any sense of legitimacy, other than to reiterate what has been written before? As the ranks of musicians who came of age at the height of jazz inexorably shrinks, how do today's musicians and teachers respond, without simply becoming curators of the canon of jazz history? How can educators help students in jazz education programs to understand their own place with the ongoing jazz tradition, and not to regard jazz as a museum piece?[496]

Though I trusted my own musical tastes, I still felt conscious of my cultural outsider-ness and wasn't sure I was qualified to shape a jazz narrative that would form the basis of my students' understanding about traditional jazz. I tried to keep these precedents in mind while I debated which repertoire to bring in, but I also recognized—like Trimillos finding ethnomusicological insights in the ensemble classroom—that the priorities of my musicology studies (a heavy dose of canon-deconstruction) were not necessarily serving the interests and needs of the students in the group. Discovering a genre for the first time, students need to find some broad orientation to the music. For example, in his "Yiddish Music Performance Styles" course at New England Conservatory, Hankus Netsky reinforces eight subgenre labels which he hopes will allow students to recognize interconnectedness in the music and position their own music making in context.[497]

---

[496] Ken Prouty, *Knowing Jazz* (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2011), 98.
[497] Hankus Netsky, "Klez Goes to College," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004)*,* 193.

With this intention, I utilized resources like Dave Robinson's traditional jazz style guide to expose them to a wider palate of traditional jazz.[498] Considering again that many students only play in the group for a semester or two, I see Robinson's descriptions of traditional jazz subgenres as a valuable reference point which might lead to discovery of new artists and greater familiarity over time. Robinson's focus is primarily descriptive rather than evaluative, emphasizing the rich variety of flavors in early jazz with the understanding that "Mixing and matching various stylistic elements is the norm--that is, after all, the creative process. Traditional jazz is a kaleidoscope of styles, one that is still being turned to create new colors."[499] As students expressed interest in developing their own arrangements, playing specific songs, or emulating certain artists, Robinson's categories became a valuable resource for honing a specific and intentional approach. For comparison, many of the initial approaches students brought to categorizing the repertoire were either very broad labels (tunes of the 1920s) or very narrow (tunes by Fats Waller). Others had heard a tune they liked such as "The Charleston" or "Mack the Knife" and looked up several recordings on Spotify for reference without any context about a particular time period or artist. Left to their own preferences, they often decided to mix elements of recordings from different time periods. One group, for example, decided to emulate the arranged elements of Mel Tormé's 1969 recording of "Lulu's Back in Town" with the Marty Paich Dektette but borrow solo ideas from Fats Waller's 1935 recording. Other times, students brought in original compositions that they hoped to play in a

[498] "A Traditional Jazz Style Guide," *Traditional Jazz Educators Network,* posted in 2014, http://prjc.org/tjen/styleguide.htm.
[499] "A Traditional Jazz Style Guide," *Traditional Jazz Educators Network,* posted in 2014, http://prjc.org/tjen/styleguide.htm.

traditional style. In each of these cases, studying style guides like Robinson's helped them develop greater analytical tools to describe the music they were hearing and achieve more nuanced variety in their interpretations.

As students applied the descriptions from the style guide in order to quantify the audible similarities/differences in their own performances vs. the recorded models, Robinson's genre descriptions also paved the way for discussions of authenticity in establishing our relationship to the tradition of traditional jazz. While I had begun my teaching career seeking to prove my authority as an instructor by imitating authentic models, the scholarly literature I read emphasized again and again how recordings were only a snapshot of lived practice and how traditions were complex social constructions which could not be easily codified.[500] Ethnomusicologist Anne Rasmussen demonstrated similar points emerging through a chaotic collaboration with her ensemble's guest artist, the Arab singer Yusef Kassab. Though they had discussed all the arrangements in detail, Kassab expected students to be more flexible with the repertoire and make changes on the fly. As Rasmussen explains: "Yusef didn't seem to understand that his tradition really wasn't their [the student's] tradition."[501] Though the collaboration ultimately produced an exciting final concert, Rasmussen admits that "we were disappointed when he completely forgot about some of the things we considered central to our arrangements: a carefully

---

[500] Anne Rasmussen, "Bilateral Negotiations in Bimusicality: Insiders, Outsiders, and the 'Real Version' in Middle Eastern Music Performance," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), 223. Also: Michelle Kisliuk and Kelly Gross, "What's the 'It' That We Learn to Perform?: Teaching BaAka Music and Dance," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), 252.
[501] Rasmussen, "Bilateral Negotiations in Bimusicality," 222.

choreographed introduction or ending, for example, copied from the best known recordings."[502] Such an experience clearly shows some of the limitations in basing a tradition off of recorded music. My own experiences with the traditional jazz group also revealed divergent practices between famous recordings and common professional practice. For example, Jelly Roll Morton's famous recording of "Doctor Jazz" is in the key of Db where many other bands perform the tune in the key of Eb. Beyond the challenge of transposing on the fly for an instrumentalist, a singer might also struggle with the song as Morton's vocal line is a blues variation on the melody starting on a high E natural for the baritone voice and transposing up a whole step pushes the song into a significantly less comfortable register. In addition, the Morton recording features an unusual number of breaks and arranged sections. Though a student might study this recording and diligently transcribe their part, they might be faced with an embarrassing situation if they were to sit in with a band playing the song in an unfamiliar key and responding to the other bandmembers rather than following a diligently rehearsed arrangement.

Its flaws aside, I found the repertory approach to be a very stimulating and rewarding experience for myself and the students when undertaken with the mindset that the exercise accomplished some purposes well but not others. Certainly, we were able to develop our technique, vocabulary, and arrangement skills by copying recordings, but learning to improvise freely in the style required more work. Without reflexive analysis and classroom discussions, students would fall into perpetuating privileged aesthetics and

[502] Ibid.

problematic canons. In any case, transcription was an approach that was already familiar to (and some extent expected by) the jazz majors in the group. Jazz educators have long emphasized imitation as one of the most important skills for a young musician (students will often perform an ambitious transcription of a solo from an acknowledged jazz master for an end of semester project or jury).[503] While transcription offered great understanding of the music and techniques of the artists and a thrilling chance to feel a sort of communion playing along with recorded solos, it is —as many have pointed out—*correlated* with developing an individual voice in jazz but not the direct cause. As guitarist and music educator Jeff Libman has put it: transcription "does not mandate that… students become innovative improvisers, but it allows and welcomes them to become so."[504]

My "continually reshaping" approach to canon construction would ultimately take on a blend of "how to," repertory ensemble, and "New Jazz Studies" discussion, often playing out a tug of war of shifting values between my performing experience, my teaching priorities, student interests, and the various scholarly perspectives I was exploring. While at one moment it seemed important to emulate great figures, another day I felt I needed to bring in something from an artist I had just discovered. With more experience and job security, I began to feel more comfortable following my own tastes and paying homage to whichever "gods" I was partial to at the moment as long as I could

---

[503] Eitan Wilf, *School for Cool: The Academic Jazz Program and the Paradox of Institutionalized Creativity* (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2014), 115-138.
[504] Jeffrey Libman, "The Out-of-School Music Engagements of Undergraduate Jazz Studies Majors" (PhD. diss., Arizona State University, 2014), 59. See also: Paul Berliner, *Thinking In Jazz: The Infinite Art of Improvisation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), 101-105.

justify some connection to well-known artists, traditional jazz practices, or the city of New Orleans more broadly.[505] I don't feel that any one of these approaches is inherently more valuable than another. Students *need* to have practical experiences to prepare them for professional gigging just as much as they *need* to develop their skills through imitation or understand the historical and cultural context of the music. In my opinion, these approaches to canon do not need to be in competition, though, as my interviews in chapter three demonstrated, they often are. Educators struggle to prepare students in the best ways they know how, yet as my own case illustrates, the day to day demands of our careers emphasize different priorities. We feel concern over developing our versatility as gigging musicians, rehearsing for the approaching big concert, or responding to current racial violence and inequality. I see canon construction as a reflection of all of these different purposes and believe that the more educators can reflexively consider their own motivations in repertoire selection, the more we might recognize who we are overlooking in the blind worship of our personal pantheon of jazz gods.

Institutional Accommodations, Theoretical Approaches, and Adapting to Student Needs

Reading more scholarly literature that critiqued authenticity in traditions of music led me to question the established pedagogy I had inherited and to experiment with learning formats that might improve the educational experience. Scholars like David Ake,

[505] In later semesters, my group performed songs such as Leroy Jones "I'm Talkin' Bout New Orleans" (2016), Egyptian Fantasy based off of Allen Toussaint's 2009 recording, and an original arrangement based on Kurt Weill's "Ballad of Mack the Knife" breaking into a New Orleans Street beat parade.

Eitan Wilf, and Ken Prouty have highlighted and questioned the broadly held beliefs that the informal learning ("bandstand education" acquired through performing with, and being mentored by, more experienced musicians) is portrayed as significantly more valuable than formal schooling in a jazz program.[506] Defining this style of learning (and determining to what extent jazz programs integrate these practices) is beyond my scope here, but generally speaking, I believe the "bandstand" method of jazz education emphasizes aural learning in real time, developing one's instincts and musical vocabulary through direct interaction and practice with professional jazz musicians as opposed to a more abstracted or theoretical approach in a classroom.[507] While many non-western music traditions differ in the specifics of their learning styles, bandstand education or aural learning seems to be a common theme in juxtaposition to the western classical tradition with its reliance on notation. To illustrate, Trimillos noted the difference between his students in Hawai'i (who had more familiarity with Filipino culture and generally learned better with non-verbal instruction and demonstration) versus his primarily white students in Santa Cruz, CA (who tended to rely on analysis and discussion when things did not go as planned in a rehearsal).[508] Based on these

---

[506] Ake breaks down the myth that jazz is learned on the street and not in the classroom: David Ake, "Crossing the Street: Rethinking Jazz Education," In *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012), 187-188. Wilf notes how jazz faculty emphasize the primacy of aural learning and mentorship outside of school programs but they also recreate those relationships to some extent with students: Wilf, *School For Cool…*, 1-2. Prouty notes how students are praised for not sounding like "university jazz": Prouty, *Knowing Jazz…*, 60.
[507] Paul Berliner details many examples of informal teaching in: Berliner, *Thinking in Jazz…,* 37-41.
[508] Trimillos, "Subject, Object, and the Ethnomusicology Ensemble…, 30-31.

precedents, I feel the juxtapositions of aural learning/notation, imitation/analysis, and instinctual/rational are helpful in categorizing the distance between my own instruction methods and a "traditional" learning method for jazz.

While the whole notion of a "traditional" ensemble might seem to be compromised by incorporating methods from outside that tradition, I found that most ethno-ensemble instructors recognized that their own experience had shaped their approach to the music in unique ways and that they often made adaptations to perceived "traditional" methods, even avoiding some aspects of them entirely or grafting in practices from other traditions they found helpful. While Ted Solis's grandfather led a marimba band in a more traditional Chiapan format, his father (a "vaudeville child") led a club band with a smaller marimba (the upper octaves cut from a larger traditional instrument) playing New York, Catskills, and Miami "society" music. This eclectic blend of experience left Solis quite open to innovation with marimba ensembles and led him to approach his university group "in a somewhat deracinated way, with some elements of its presumably typical ethnic context consciously suppressed, and with a somewhat ambiguous attitude toward 'authenticity' for its own sake."[509] He treats the ensemble as a lab to explore "performance philosophy and performer/audience relationships that have evolved partly in reaction to the Western concert paradigm."[510] Recognizing the liberal mixing of styles in his own experience, Solis felt license to adapt the marimba ensemble to focus on oft neglected musical aesthetics within the school as opposed to representing

---

[509] Ted Solis, "Community of Comfort: Negotiating a World of 'Latin Marimba,'" in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), 230.
[510] Ibid, 229.

a specific ethnic group. In another example of a liberal approach to traditional learning, Hankus Netsky noted that klezmer music was traditionally learned aurally in a "bandstand education" method like jazz, yet he asserted this was not his own experience. He had to learn primarily from the few recorded klezmer performances he could acquire, as the musicians he met (including his grandfather, uncles and their social connections) did not, for the most part, want to teach him. He explains: "I didn't learn klezmer on a bandstand; I learned it on my own, applying every aural and analytical technique and tool I had at my disposal."[511] With Solis's and Netsky's approaches as inspiration, I feel that there is much to gain from thinking about ensembles in ways beyond the "traditional" format.

In my ensemble I occasionally attempted to help students develop their aural learning through imitation and repetition teaching them a tune or lick by ear (designed to mimic the bandstand experience), but I also attempted to devise theoretical systems to help students play more idiomatically, simplified difficult passages to fit their abilities, emphasized singing and vocalization exercises, and tried to identify achievable semester goals. David Harnish describes a similar journey of "translating" gamelan music as he learned it from his teachers into his own personal language and negotiating the dynamics of each teaching situation: "The process of becoming a director—learning, synthesizing, teaching, presenting, performing—often requires compromises in repertoire, performance practice, appearance, context, and 'authenticity' in representation, and so forth. The degree of compromise a director negotiates tells a great deal about his or her identity and

---

[511] Netsky, ""Klez Goes to College," 195.

overall plans and goals."[512] Indeed in my own case, as my priorities shifted from proving myself as a competent instructor to thinking about my dissertation research, my conception of authenticity in traditional jazz broadened from the notion that the subject was clearly defined to representing the genre (traditional jazz) and the place (New Orleans) as musicologist Sarah Suhadolnik has described them: not "static, predictable, and historically fixed," but "fluid, dynamic, and continually contested."[513] Recognizing this broadening view for myself emboldened my experimentation and led me to shift focus from the subject matter to the abilities and needs of the students.

Like many world music ensembles, a traditional jazz group fell outside the primary areas of study for nearly everyone involved. Beyond the clear differences in skill level and training expected of those in more canonical university groups, Solis observes that students in world music ensembles do not usually receive performance scholarships like those who play in band, orchestra, or choir. The required credit hours of their primary study path also frequently limit their participation.[514] These difficulties rang true as I tried to staff the group and reconcile scheduling conflicts with my own load as a PhD student. Existing members of the ensemble who wanted to continue, potential new members, and room availability rarely lined up conveniently, and the constant

---

[512] David Harnish, "No, Not 'Bali Hai'!": Challenges of Adaptation and Orientalism in Performing and Teaching Balinese Gamelan," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 129.
[513] Sarah Suhadolnik, "Navigating Jazz: Music, Place, and New Orleans (PhD. diss., University of Michigan, 2016), 5.
[514] Solis, "Introduction…, 14. See also: Loren Kajikawa, "The Possessive Investment in Classical Music: Confronting Legacies of White Supremacy in U.S. Schools and Departments of Music," in *Seeing Race Again: Countering Colorblindness Across the Disciplines*, ed. Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2019), 156.

rearranging of personnel forced me to sometimes start afresh with new players each semester. This required me to rethink each semester how I might catch new students up on style basics, adapt arrangements to changes in available instrumentation, and guide students with unequal skill levels. Roger Vetter lamented this predicament in his gamelan ensemble noting that he much preferred the aural immersion learning process typical of musicians studying in Java but found it necessary to devise pedagogical aids for American students. He explains: "I do such things as articulate underlying structures, present melodic and rhythmic vocabularies as building blocks of more complex musical utterances, and impart abstracted principles of musical syntax. I make explicit for my students many languagelike features of the music system of which native performers might not be consciously aware."[515] Likewise, Steve Jones in his Chinese *sizhu* ensemble devised a process of elaborating on a basic melody as a "shortcut to improvisation" (though in Shanghai teahouses, such elaborated melodies would be taught note for note).[516] While theoretical frameworks are abstractions of music, they often help students to grasp concepts much more quickly in the limited timeframe of the semester.

Specifically speaking of traditional jazz, the theoretical framework of a collectively improvised front line is an important analytical tool. Robinson's style guide lists it as number one in his lists of elements marking the style.[517] Students in jazz history classes learn examples of melody, countermelody, and obbligato in Sousa marches and

---

[515] Vetter, "A Square Peg in a Round Hole…," 120.
[516] David Hughes, "When Can We Improvise?" in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 274.
[517] "A Traditional Jazz Style Guide," *Traditional Jazz Educators Network,* posted in 2014, http://prjc.org/tjen/styleguide.htm.

see how they can be applied in a New Orleans jazz band. This principle had become so ingrained in my mind as a tenet of the style that I initially felt frustrated when I wasn't able to line up the standard instrumentation and had to adapt to what was available. While this framework is useful, students are rarely successful applying the theoretical job descriptions of each instrument without extensive listening and transcription. Particularly given the difficult nature of the clarinet parts (and the fact that most of the clarinetists were primarily trained in the classical tradition, lacking experience in jazz and improvisation), I often found I had to transcribe parts or direct students to appropriate recordings and teach them how to transcribe on their own. Given that the basic principles of collective improvisation alone didn't necessarily result in better playing, this led me to consider what productive pedagogies might emerge from reimagining "collective improvisation" as a looser framework rather than a strictly defined recipe for traditional jazz.[518] Instead of a formal instrumentation with defined roles for each player, a more open concept would allow for any band of diverse instrumentation to improvise simultaneously while each instrumental line maintains a distinct identity and sonic space. Teaching the roles of melody, obbligato, and countermelody became less about the idiomatic vocabulary of a specific instrument and more about developing an awareness of how one's contribution might fit within the band. I was surprised to find out later that my looser strategy had historical precedents in a wide variety of instrumentation in early

---

[518] For more on this see Joti Rockwell's classical vs prototypical categorization of various bluegrass recordings: Joti Rockwell, "What is bluegrass anyway? Category formation, debate and the framing of musical genre," *Popular Music* 31, no. 3, (2012): 373-378.

New Orleans bands.[519] Hearing recordings featuring virtuosic soloists like Armstrong, Bechet, or Hines who seemed to transcend such roles bouncing between playing the melody, improvising flowery obbligato-like parts, or creating backing countermelodies also validated my thinking.[520] Thinking of collective improvisation in a freer format allowed me to extend the concept to the members of the rhythm section (for example, asking the trombone player to consider how their countermelodies might converse with the drummer's bass drum playing—a technique that seemed exciting to me at the time because the traditional jazz rhythm section is generally known more for timekeeping than interaction). As I noted in chapter two, I find it limiting to pigeonhole traditional jazz as "a horn player's game," and I felt that rigidly enforcing the roles of each instrument was not universally reflective of the musical variety I heard on recordings.

In my experiments with new ways to apply collective improvisation, one technique I learned from Ted Solis's gamelan classes at Arizona State University was to use singing as a method to keep students engaged and to help them further internalize the music. Solis would often ask students to sing the skeletal melody of a piece (balungan) and play an imaginary saron on days when we did not meet in the gamelan rehearsal

---

[519] Bruce Raeburn, *New Orleans Style and the Writing of American Jazz History* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2009), 8.

[520] For an example of Armstrong and Bechet blurring the boundaries of such roles see the last half of: Red Onion Jazz Babies, "Cake Walking Babies from Home," recorded April 6, 1923 - December 22, 1924, track 25 on *Louis Armstrong and King Oliver,* released 1974, accessed on Spotify, https://open.spotify.com/track/4u4XgMOzvBOcxPBFaRy3Un?si=fuoxRiQJTm65fPvr6TRQnw. For an example involving the piano see: Louis Armstrong, "Weather Bird," recorded December 5th, 1928 on *Louis Armstrong: Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man 1923-1934*, released 1994, accessed on Spotify, https://open.spotify.com/track/3eMrYc092k7SIJfWJ7oasR?si=B_HGrY2-TzazUSnKZk3jAw.

room so that pieces would stay fresher in our minds. I understood that this was meant to provide not only repetition, but also aural engagement with the pieces (increasing the possibility that we would rely more on our ear learning than on reading notation in the textbook.) In my own ensemble, singing provided great flexibility to address uneven skill levels across the group as I could assign more experienced students more challenging parts to sing and keep those who were struggling on the skeletal pieces (melody and bass lines). Those who felt comfortable playing their part might further reinforce their conception of the melody by singing the intervals and learning the lyrics of a tune through repetition while I was working directly with one member of the ensemble. Over time, I devised variations of the singing exercise for each ensemble member's abilities and comfort levels. For example, a student who felt paralyzed by note choice options might ignore pitches altogether and focus on singing an effective rhythmic phrase while more experienced students might actually try to sing their lines in tune and blend harmonies with each other. These singing exercises fed directly into my focus on featuring vocal choruses in the concert performances. For those students that chose to accept the challenge (not all did), they were often surprised at how difficult it was to remember words, sing on pitch, and be conscious of how they were emoting on stage. I saw these experiences as tremendously valuable for students; one of my clarinet players ended up playing music with the armed forces later and affirmed that developing her skills as an entertainer in my class had helped prepare her for performance situations she would later encounter (specifically performing an engaging clarinet solo while standing on a table). Another student who had a side career performing in drag shows heard the

group perform and asked to join the band specifically because he felt it would be a valuable path to developing as a singing musician and entertainer.

While theoretical approaches often related more to improvisation, sometimes the formally arranged sections of pieces were simply too hard for students to execute comfortably. My response was to omit notes and simplify sections per Steve Jones's description of creatively constructing the "intermediate version" of a piece of music that students may fall into when they must play a piece that they don't have sufficient technical skill to realize.[521] As the director, I realized a compromise in the arrangements was necessary when my students were struggling, yet the parts still needed to sound idiomatic as these were often the figures students would internalize best and fall back on in their improvisations. Simplified arrangements served as a referent, or as David Hughes suggests: "a meeting point of the needs of students, teachers, and the tradition itself" from which they might derive "appropriate" creativity.[522] This was most apparent to me working with some older students in a community college ensemble when the group had expressed interest in playing the tune "Beau Koo Jack" from the Louis Armstrong Hot Five recordings. Realizing there was much more than a simple head arrangement happening, we spent time as a group studying the recordings and working out parts but ran into a number of issues. The group's clarinet player (the oldest member of the group) struggled with rhythm; it became a source of tension for him and the other band members when he came in at the wrong moments, and I ended up having to simplify sections of his

---

[521] David Hughes, "When Can We Improvise?: The Place of Creativity in Academic World Music Performance," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 275.
[522] Ibid, 281.

part so that he could react to the figures other band members played. The tune's final shout chorus ended up being pitched too high for our trumpet player to play comfortably, so I reworked a transition, and we chose to modulate to a more comfortable lower key. Such concessions in the music clearly go against both the virtuosity which elevated jazz to art music status and the urtext mentality of the classical world. Given the canonical status of the Louis Armstrong Hot Five recordings, it seems that simplifying them would be controversial. Could anyone imagine an orchestra chopping the finale of a classical masterwork and reorchestrating it because it was too hard?

The adaptions I made from my professional life experience with traditional jazz to the university context were based on my desire to provide students with what I perceived to be the best possible learning experience. Analyzing this in retrospect, I believe my priorities more specifically were to ensure that each student felt they had tools to understand the music and was able to participate at their personal skill level. More broadly, I hoped that rather than view traditional jazz as something that only happens in New Orleans, students could take ownership of their music and see themselves relative to the tradition. While my initial efforts focused on how I perceived traditional jazz to function as a defined way of doing things which must be preserved (tradition as a privileged object), my framing of the topic evolved to allow room for students (and for myself) to individually re-imagine the genre and relate it to each of our personal musical worlds.

Representing Tradition

Despite my consistent use of terminology like "collective improvisation" and "traditional jazz," many people did not easily identify our subject from these terms, responding with a confused "You mean like a Dixieland band?" I instructed several ensembles of retirees at local community colleges, and some of the members would consistently rephrase my instructions to "collectively improvise" as "to Dixie." Though the music was more easily categorized and recognized with "the D word," my research for the first chapter of this project had convinced me that labelling the music Dixieland was racially insensitive, unhealthily nostalgic, and antithetical to an inclusive learning environment. I often initiated discussions with students about terminology or shared historical perspectives and anecdotes which illustrated the problematic nature of the Dixieland label. As important as I percieved the issue to be, I also felt it was important not to be overly combative about this as I knew how easy it was to dismiss this argument altogether as ranting or political correctness. Tension over the term Dixieland is not new. As the Tex Wyndham articles I referenced in chapter one show, fans and musicians have long disagreed over the meanings of Dixieland and expressed discontent with the label being applied to music they felt was important to their identity.[523] Some of them even went as far as to invent new labels for the music such as the acronym "OKOM" (Our Kind of Music).

[523] Tex Wyndham, "Texas Shout #67 Dixieland Revisited," The Syncopated Times, accessed Jan 31, 2020, https://syncopatedtimes.com/texas-shout-68-dixieland-revisited-part-2/.

This type of possessive approach to a genre of music felt alarming to me for its potential to exclude and oppress others. Particularly given the overwhelmingly white traditional jazz fan demographic, "Our" Kind of Music seems to assert the primacy of that group. This is not merely a question of personal preference for one genre over another but of recognizing how powerful institutions are able to elevate a style of music to a more privileged art status (with greater recognition for the artists who played it historically and higher paid performance opportunities for those who play it currently) based on how it conforms with ideology. Returning to the example of Wynton Marsalis and Jazz at Lincoln Center, Eric Porter placed Wynton Marsalis's views "that African American musicians had a duty to uphold an African American tradition of classical jazz and that they somehow failed their community when they engaged too deeply with popular forms" in contrast to Don Byron's "wider vision of jazz, simultaneously historically minded, eclectic, and future oriented tastes."[524] While both artists have distinct preferences, Marsalis's views are defined more aggressively by what they exclude. Speaking of Jazz at Lincoln Center, Byron notes: "I don't even exist in jazz as these people perceive it to be."[525] Notably privileged traditions which reside in institutions like Lincoln Center and in university music programs can afford to be exclusive *because* they have strong financial backing (in contrast, I sat in with some local musicians busking at New Orleans City park during the COVID 19 pandemic where we found ourselves granting requests for "Old McDonald Had a Farm" and "Baby Shark" in order to get tips). When Jazz at Lincoln Center began in 1991, jazz critic Peter Watrous

[524] Porter, "Incorporation and Distinction in Jazz History and Jazz Historiography, 22-23.
[525] Ibid.

warned that it was set to become “a partisan in an ideological environment, and it should not be when its program is the only one of its kind in the country.”[526] Large financially backed institutions are a powerful force in representing jazz as the values they choose to emphasize are reproduced in subsequent generations of students (given the anti-commercialist aesthetics of modern jazz, many of my classmates became known for their jazz elitism shunning more commercial, less virtuosic, or “square” music). While my experience as a new director (fairly freshly out of a jazz performance MM program) led me to prioritize many of the privileged values I had absorbed, my musicology studies led me to engage with a much more diverse range of music and to recognize the different value systems of each genre. Personally, this translated to a desire to cultivate an inclusive educational environment in which to show how music could mean many things to different people. Perhaps some would associate traditional jazz with sensuous revelry while others preferred to see it as family friendly fun music? While artists who have found inspiration in the past (such as Turk Murphy and Tuba Skinny) emphasize the importance of honoring the memory and achievements of early black jazz musicians through the music, others might particularly enjoy music from white artists, from contemporary players, or they may approach the music with a freer attitude towards experimentation.

Occasionally in rehearsal, I would highlight diverging ideas about the music (through discussion or a published opinion) in order to cultivate greater awareness of the

[526] Peter watrous, “Good News for Jazz, with a big Caveat,” New York Times, 18 August 1991, 23, quoted in Kimberly Hannon Teal, “Posthumously Live: Canon Formation at Jazz at Lincoln Center through the Case of Mary Lou Williams,” *American Music* Vol 32, no. 4 (Winter 2014): 401.

contested aesthetics regarding early jazz. Is it folk music? Is it commercial/not commercial? Should it be preserved with standards of historically accurate performance? Which races should receive credit for it?[527] Exploring these broad questions invites deeper study and often reveals how privileged voices attained their privilege through years of discourse which positioned them as worthy subjects (and hopefully allows us to see them with a more neutral light). Though my students will ultimately choose how they wish to label and represent traditional jazz, my hope is that they will continue to recognize both the dominant themes that constitute labels like "Dixieland" (nostalgia, exoticizing the American south, minstrel stereotypes of African-Americans, and white supremacy) and take that potential to exclude or oppress others into account as they make ethical choices about how they wish to represent themselves and their music.

Being an Authority and Directing the Ensemble

Reflecting on my journey as an ensemble director and a scholar, my notes on the experience reflect a fair amount of anxiety over representing tradition accurately and proving my expert status through historical knowledge and musical command of the repertoire. As a busy PhD student, this was perhaps an unrealistic expectation. The impracticality of splitting my attention between leading an ensemble and trying to complete academic coursework often made me feel as though I was doing two jobs on a subpar level (a challenge many scholar-performers face in trying to combine both sides of

[527] Regarding jazz more broadly, these types of defining questions are central to the book *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* ed. David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012)

their training with employment contracts that don't take such interdisciplinary work into account). Stretching beyond the basic "how to" approach to traditional jazz also required more work on my part as a director: thinking about charts and repertoire, studying that music with finer detail, and adapting arrangements to a new group each semester.

My participation in the ensemble as a pianist impacted the dynamic of my authority because I felt I had to be well practiced enough to demonstrate any cleanly any concepts I was teaching or risk perceptions of hypocrisy and damage to my reputation as a pianist and instructor. Also, notably my musical participation in the group meant I had to sacrifice some of my attention bandwidth for observing the band and offering suggestions and critical feedback. On the occasions we were practicing a particularly difficult arrangement or something with which I was less familiar, I felt embarrassed that I could only suggest we play something again because I hadn't been able to simultaneously play my part and listen well enough to the others to provide meaningful feedback. With my academic courseload, teaching assistant position, and outside jobs to pay the bills, I had very little time to keep up with my own piano practice and sometimes had to accept that I could not reliably play more advanced vocabulary and that advanced students might in some cases surpass my own skills. I also wasn't just teaching piano licks and techniques that I had practiced over the years. I often had to spend time translating my knowledge to help the other instruments in the band improvise idiomatically. Over time, I came to recognize where students needed supplemental exercises and transcriptions in order to collectively improvise idiomatically because my own attempts to construct obbligato lines and countermelodies on the piano based on pedagogical formulas fell flat. A significant portion of my time went into familiarizing

myself with the other instruments in the band and doing enough transcribing that I could provide quality instruction to students.

In some cases, the desire to give better feedback to the other instrumentalists actually led me to follow the examples of ethnomusicologists and K-12 music educators, who often attempt to learn rudimentary skills on all the instrumental parts in their ensemble. Such pursuits took further time away from my piano playing yet led to many new insights as I came to anticipate the idiomatic phrases of each instrument and adapt to the ensemble sound as a pianist. As Solis explains: "In the Western orchestra we do not actively promote the idea that one becomes a better trumpeter if she or he learns the clarinet or the drums and so forth, but writers on gamelan pedagogy often espouse the idea that the more parts of which a player has practical knowledge, the more effective a player's command of his or her own part."[528] Indeed, Dick Hyman suggests there is historical precedent for this as well, characterizing Jelly Roll Morton's piano style as a translation of a New Orleans marching band to the piano.[529] As the group director, the ability to demonstrate these parts on the piano was helpful, but doing so required greater flexibility as an instructor in order to shift between playing well and cueing students without dropping out the band's rhythmic and harmonic support.

After I had led the group as the pianist for several semesters, I found other teaching opportunities which allowed me to leave the piano chair, yet I continued to fill

---

[528] Ted Solis, "Community of Comfort: Negotiating a World of Latin Marimba," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 240.
[529] Violin Piano, "Jelly Roll Morton Lesson," YouTube Video, 1:55, accessed April 28th, 2020, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9RFK-EXmZBQ.

in for other instruments in the ensemble. I sometimes brought an accordion, melodica, or keyboard or put my basic training on the drums to use when a bandmember was absent. Ethnomusicologists frequently speak of the value in being able to hop around the ensemble demonstrating each part, but they also note the risks and inevitable confusion that results (sometimes leading to a breakdown and other times to a valuable learning experience). Hardja Susilo occasionally left his gamelan ensemble in the hands of the students on certain pieces in order to step out front and dance (effectively surrendering control of form and structural aspects of the music and having no choice but to follow the students however long they chose to remain on a section of the dance).[530] Roger Vetter, one of Susilo's students, notes these opportunities to "free Pak Susilo from his musical directorship role" as important milestones in his proficiency in the style.[531] As students become more independent, the master-disciple dynamic begins to level out and the director is freed up to participate in a more expressive manner. Though I had not developed any level of virtuosity on other instruments, my experiences directing the ensemble from different vantage points brought many new observations and allowed me to refine my pedagogy. As the pianist/director, students frequently looked to me to cue solos or to take the lead on counting in and ending tunes cleanly (a role which is traditionally performed by the trumpet player as they can play with one hand free to make hand gestures). However, behind the drum set positioned at the rear of the group, this was

---

530 Hardja Susilo, interview by David Harnish, Ted Solis, and J. Lawrence Witzleben, "A Bridge to Java: Four Decades Teaching Gamelan in America," in *Performing Ethnomusicology,* ed. Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 56-57.
531 Vetter, "A Square Peg in a Round Hole," *Performing Ethnomusicology,* 116.

simply not practical and students stepped up to handle things. While I was less actively directing from the drums, my simple second line grooves and strategically placed fills were very helpful cues to students who felt less secure with their rhythm or keeping track of the form while improvising (support which was not nearly as effective coming from the piano). While I was tempted to play along with the band at times using my very basic upright bass or tuba skills, I opted instead to play along with an electronic keyboard bass because I felt I could not maintain adequate awareness of the rest of the group to offer helpful feedback while playing my own part at a satisfactory level. On the whole, I found the ability to switch instruments and play with the band very beneficial pedagogically; it led me give students better feedback and exercises as a director and led me write more idiomatically as an arranger.

This experience was very different from the more typical university jazz instructor-band relationships I had experienced as a college student, where large ensemble directors would listen intently, make notes to address errors, provide cues, conduct sections of particularly challenging pieces, and occasionally perform a solo with the band. Small combos were often left to their own creativity to the extent that directors would step out of rehearsals for long periods of time and let the band members work through things independently; I rarely saw an instructor perform with a combo unless they were a grad student. Taking the point of view of an overcommitted adjunct faculty combo coach, I can see how performing with a student ensemble—while a great educational opportunity for students—is not always advantageous to the director. Just as a great band makes a soloist sound even better, an inexperienced band can make a seasoned musician look like they don't know what they are doing. In my own experience

playing piano with student rhythm sections, I sometimes felt as though each beat of the song was rhythmically a shot in the dark, and more complex subdivisions were likely to only worsen the confusion. With this in mind, perhaps ethnomusicologists are able to perform with their ensembles and take risks in the name of improving student experiences because of the general public lacks familiarity with the foreign musics and cultures they are representing. Susilo also notes that American audiences would never notice problems in the gamelan ensemble when he stepped away to dance, but instead frequently complimented his animated facial expressions.[532] American audiences would likely be more apt to notice flaws in a jazz performance given both the lower potential for exoticism and novelty and their greater familiarity with the music. It would be much more likely to find audience members who listened extensively to jazz, had knowledge of recordings, and possibly played at some point. Mark Katz argues that particularly well-known tunes or recordings generate a precedent for audience members and they may even expect to hear improvised solos performed in the same way.[533]

Having experienced performances as a performing director, directing from the stage, and simply observing from the audience, I would argue that the degree of participation each instructor chooses may be based on not only the self-sufficiency of the ensemble, but also the instructor's preferred amount of distance should the band screw something up. Performing as a member of the ensemble means investing the time to learn a part, leading by example, developing a musical rapport with the ensemble, and

---

[532] Susilo, interview by Harnish, Solis, and Witzleben, "A Bridge to Java…," 57.
[533] Mark Katz, *Capturing Sound: How Technology Has Changed Music* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010), 73.

assuming greater risk of being implicated in a poor performance should things go wrong. Following the model of education established by bandleaders like Miles Davis and Art Blakey, usually only the most talented students get the close mentorship of actually playing with their instructors regularly if they play an instrument which complements the instructor's ensemble and they play well enough to realize the instructor's aesthetic. For example, bass player Brad Goode suggests that older musicians like Marcus Belgrave allowed him to sit in with their bands because he knew the tunes well and played upright bass. As mentorship opportunities with touring jazz greats dwindle, Goode suggests that opportunities for students to play with their teachers outside of school are ever more important. [534]

In contrast to jazz ensembles whose primary goal is to execute a well-crafted performance, my goals as an instructor increasingly diverged as I felt my authority become established through successful performances and positive feedback from faculty. I also became more influenced by the academic literature I had been reading and began to abandon my preoccupations with authenticity and with clearly defining the tradition. I began to be more concerned about how to make the genre of traditional jazz relevant to individual students and felt the answer was a combination of helping them develop musically and highlighting the music's cultural context and dominant aesthetics (often with particular emphasis on identity and race). I initially felt delighted when the historical tidbits I shared in class got students talking about racial and historical issues (one student

---

[534] Damani Phillips, *What is This Thing Called Soul: Conversations on Black Culture and Jazz Education* (New York, NY: Peter Lang Publishing, 2017), 113-113.

even felt he ought to white out lines about "darkies" singing and playing banjo in the verse to the tune "Dinah" in order to not perpetuate a minstrel-ized stereotype.) In time, I began to notice how I felt frustrated when other students continued to refer to the music as "Dixieland" and questioned whether my feelings signaled that I was perhaps trying to proselytize my own perspectives too much. Was my goal to get students to adopt what I considered to be progressive stances towards tradition, or was it to get them to recognize the contested nature of, and multiple meanings within, the genre?

Though I had grown into my authoritative role as an instructor, it had led me into thinking that as an expert, people ought to privilege my opinions over their own experience and recognize how the genre was defined by multiple perspectives; I was only jolted out of such unfortunate irony by my own embarrassing mistakes. As I referenced in my chapter introduction, one of my students primarily took the class because he loved entertaining audiences. He would always prepare an emcee routine for each concert introducing the tunes, providing a little background, telling some jokes, and introducing the band in creative fashions. Before one concert on which I was playing drums with the group, he specifically asked that we be ready to begin our set after the opening announcements to have a seamless performance. I of course agreed and went about preparing for the set. I got the stage and sound set up, communicated with the other ensemble directors, reminded the band members to be in place, and after the opening announcement ended… suddenly realized my music was still in my bag and not on the music stand. The subsequent hasty scramble to get the music out and count off the tune put a hitch into my student's carefully prepared introduction. While I certainly felt bad about this and made a mental note for future concerts, it brought to my mind how I had

become wrapped up in my own perspective. As the expert, obviously I was doing important things to prepare for the show, yet I was also sweeping others' priorities under the rug.

Do Blind Men Have Anything Valuable to Say About Elephants?

As I have generally associated canon constructing pedagogy with jazz performance faculty and deconstruction with music history faculty, I believe the dual perspectives of my training allowed me to take the ensemble in new directions. The pathways of "how to" and repertory ensemble grew directly out of my training in jazz performance, while my work as a scholar lead me to question my priorities, recognize aesthetic patterns, and experiment with new ideas. When the COVID 19 pandemic hit in 2020, all the groups I directed were forced to adapt to an online format of teaching over spring break (a difficult proposition for a music ensemble with internet lag). Rather than trying to figure out the technology to continue making music together that semester, I gave my students independent playing assignments to work on and supplemented our classes with some scholarly articles to read and discuss over Zoom. Some students responded very positively to the change and others not so much. In a group email following one of our discussions a student expressed his opinion that jazz writers are "like blind men feeling different parts of the elephant not knowing it's a single creature. The soloist is riding the elephant. His predecessors trained the elephants." Jazz writers, therefore, "see the minutiae but not the bigger picture." While his comment is heavily biased towards the voices of performers (and assumes that the writers are not performers themselves), I think this comment encapsulates general discussion on the merits of jazz

scholarship well. Obviously, the performer riding the elephant whose ancestors trained the elephant would have something very valuable and important to say, but shall we automatically assume that a blind man's perception of an elephant is flawed, less valid, less detailed, or redundant? As a scholar who recognizes the huge impact of jazz writing in establishing the music as an artform, I feel inclined to dismiss the characterization of jazz scholars as "blind men wrapped up in minutiae" as the opinion of someone who simply doesn't understand that perspective. Even the metaphor feels problematic in its dismissal of the disabled. Could we not simplify this argument to characterize whoever is riding the elephant as the privileged perspective and the blind person as the underprivileged? At the same time, I recognize that the majority of jazz writers have been white and that many of the black musicians whom they wrote about did not appreciate their descriptions. Amiri Baraka described how the labels they chose benefited whites:

> Paul Whiteman became "the King of Jazz," Benny Goodman "the King of Swing," the Rolling Stones "the Greatest Rock and Roll Band in the World." Then dig the grand larcenous essence of commercial Copperheads inducting Black Musicians into the Rock and Roll Hall of Fame when, Naw, Jimmy, them dudes was playing Rhythm and Blues BEFORE THERE WAS A ROCK OR A ROLL![535]

In this respect, I can see how my earlier assumption about the privilege of jazz performers falls apart—in part due to the wide credential variety in jazz scholars I described in chapter three. I think most "New Jazz Studies" scholars would feel unfortunately categorized in the same lot as many of the jazz writers of the mid 20th century who wrote with a less scientific perspective, yet as my interviews suggest, due to

---

[535] Amiri Baraka, "Jazz and the White Critic: Thirty Years Later," *Digging: The Afro-American Soul of American Classical Music* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2009), 146.

the wide variety of individuals described as “jazz scholars” I don’t think we can easily dismiss this association.

In regard to my goal of incorporating jazz scholarship into performance classrooms, the most successful avenue I found was furthering my own education as a scholar-performer and searching for ways to integrate my research and performance practice in the same classroom. The historical newspaper research for this dissertation’s first chapter never failed to provoke a reaction among students when I brought in a scan of an article with an intriguing perspective. I also found that pointing out the ways that aesthetic binaries like “modern” vs. “traditional” have shaped jazz discourse prompted students to consider how music might not fit neatly into either of those categories and how neither word need imply a value judgement about the music. Students also found scholarly works like Thomas Brothers’s *Louis Armstrong’s New Orleans* fascinating as it provided detail not only on Armstrong, but also about the broader culture and environment of turn of the century New Orleans in which he grew up. Elements like these certainly add a lot to the educational experience of the ensemble, but they are only a small slice of the many scholarly perspectives available.

Unfortunately, as much as I would like to insist on the need for greater awareness amongst performance educators of “New Jazz Studies” perspectives, I must agree with Ken Prouty that the interdisciplinary nature of “New Jazz Studies” research is difficult to articulate clearly, and I think scholars have a lot of work ahead to make the discipline relevant to those outside the field.[536] Returning to the experience which prompted the

---

[536] Ken Prouty, interview with the author, Nov 9th, 2020.

expansion of my pedagogy beyond the "how to" model, I found it quite difficult to concisely articulate for a non-scholarly audience exactly what the "New Jazz Studies" perspectives *are* and what they offer beyond the canonical models of teaching jazz history (I am not alone in this. In fact, most of the scholars I interviewed seemed to struggle with defining the field and usually suggested I go read other scholarship like *Uptown Conversation: The New Jazz Studies* in order to clarify my own perspective).[537]

Ultimately, I see the integration of "New Jazz Studies" perspectives on race, gender, power structures, culture, politics, or other artforms as an important step in overcoming the privileged object approach to jazz. Exploring these perspectives has allowed me to see more clearly the ways that traditional jazz education is the same as mainstream jazz education and also the ways that they diverge. These types of observations have important implications for how the non-academic community of jazz is represented in the academy (jazz educators are only beginning to address the imbalances which privilege the institutional culture over the people who created and sustained jazz.)[538] While adapting jazz to fit the "art music" aesthetics of western classical music has brought new opportunity and prestige to the genre, many have come to realize how privileging such a small set of aesthetics suppresses the richness of our musical cultures and maintains structures of discrimination.

Conclusion

---

[537] *Uptown Conversation: The New Jazz Studies,* ed. Robert O Meally, Brent Hayes Edwards, and Farah Jasmine Griffin (New York City: Columbia University Press, 2004).
[538] See: Damani Phillips, *What is This Thing Called Soul: Conversations on Black Culture and Jazz Education* (New York, NY: Peter Lang Publishing, 2017.)

In my hope to blend scholarly and performance perspectives in the ensemble classroom, I have come to the conclusion that this is best accomplished by an instructor who can speak to both of these perspectives. Fortunately for jazz educators, ethnomusicologists have been doing this kind of work for many years, and their field offers ours a strong foundation on which to build. Taking this path means that we will likely have to re-organize our goals, but it offers great promise for a better balance between academic and non-academic jazz communities. I suspect that borrowing the "experience ensemble" model will allow new perspectives for both teachers and students in the ways that we learn and perform both traditional jazz and jazz music more broadly as well as offer new opportunities for students to learn via direct mentorship via performing with their instructors. I am excited to see how this disciplinary crossover might be realized by the next generation of scholar-performers in jazz.

REFERENCES

Arena, John. *Driven from New Orleans: How Nonprofits Betray Public Housing and Promote Privatization.* Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2012.

Adams, Vincanne. *Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013.

Ake, David. "Crossing the Street: Rethinking Jazz Education." In *Jazz/Not Jazz the Music and its Boundaries*, edited by David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garret, and Daniel Goldmark, 207-221. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012.

Adams, Thomas Jessen. "New Orleans Brings It All Together." *American Quarterly* 66, no. 1 (2014): 245–256.

Adams, Vincanne. *Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina.* Durham: Duke University Press, 2013.

Ake, David. "On the Ethics of Teaching "Jazz" (and "America's Classical Music," and "BAM," and "Improvisational Music," and…)." In *Improvisation and Music Education,* edited by Ajay Heble and Mark Laver, 19-31. Oxford: Taylor and Francis, 2016.

Ake, David. *Jazz Cultures.* Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2002.

Ake, David. *Jazz Matters: Sound, Place, and Time since Bebop.* Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2010.

Ake, David, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark. "Introduction." In *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries*, edited by David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark, 10-16. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012:

Aukes, Antoon. *Second Line: 100 Years of New Orleans Drumming*. Oskaloosa, IA: C.L. Barnhouse, 2003.

Arena, John. *Driven from New Orleans: How Nonprofits Betray Public Housing and Promote Privatization.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2012.

Banet-Weiser, Sarah. *Authentic^{TM}: The Politics of Ambivalence in a Brand Culture.* New York: New York University Press, 2012.

Banjojudy. "Brian Holland – 'Fats Waller Medley.'" Youtube*.* Posted March 23rd, 2016. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=d2QtFWifTa0.

Baraka, Amiri. “Jazz and the White Critic: Thirty Years Later.” *Digging: The Afro-American Soul of American Classical Music.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2009.

Barrett, Faithe. *To Fight Aloud is Very Brave.* Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 2012.

Bayer, Ann Shea. *Collaborative Apprenticeship Learning: Language and Thinking Across the Curriculum, K-12.* Mountain View, CA: Mayfield Publishing Co., 1990.

Bebco, Joe. “Reconsidering “Dixieland Jazz”, How The Name Has Harmed The Music.” The Syncopated Times, Sept 27th, 2019. https://syncopatedtimes.com/reconsidering-dixieland-jazz/.

Bell Jr., Derek. “Brown v. Board of Education and the Interest-Convergence Dilemma.” *Harvard Law Review* 93, no. 3 (Jan 1980): 518-533. https://doi.org/10.2307/1340546.

Berliner, Paul. *Thinking in Jazz: The Infinite Art of Improvisation.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1994.

Bjerstedt, Sven. “Landscapes of musical metaphor and musical learning: the example of jazz education.” *Music Education Research,* Vol. 17, No. 4 (2015): 499-511. Accessed May 10th, 2019. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1080/14613808.2015.1025733.

Bjerstedt, Sven. "Stealing Knowledge in a Landscape of Learning: Conceptualizations of Jazz Education." *British Journal of Music Education* 33, no. 3 (2016): 297-308. Accessed May 10th, 2019. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1017/S0265051716000103.

Bidgood, Lee. “‘America is all around here’: An Ethnography of Bluegrass Music in the Contemporary Czech Republic.” PhD diss., University of Virginia, 2011.

Bidgood, Lee. “The Americanist Imagination and Real Imaginary Place in Czech Bluegrass Songs.” *Popular Music and Society* 41, no. 4 (2018): 390-407. 10.1080/03007766.2017.1302210.

Billy Ponzio Jazz. “BABY DODDS (Full Film) –‘NEW ORLEANS DRUMMING.’” *YouTube* video. March 7, 2018. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1IMMeEWD-2A.

Bithell, Caroline and Juniper Hill. *The Oxford Handbook of Music Revival.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.

Blais-Tremblay, Vanessa. “‘Where You Are Accepted, You Blossom’: Toward Care Aesthetics in Jazz Historiography.” *Jazz and Culture,* Vol 2 (2019): 59-83. https://doi.org/10.5406/jazzculture.2.2019.0059.

Blum, Lawrence. *I'm Not a Racist, But…" The Moral Quandry of Race.* Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2015.

Brennan, Matt. *Kick It: A Social History of the Drum Kit.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020.

Breunlin, Rachel and Bruce. "Sunpie" Barnes. *Talk That Music Talk: Passing on Brass Band Music in New Orleans the Traditional Way.* New Orleans, LA: University of New Orleans Press, 2014.

Breunlin, Rachel and Helen A. Regis. "Putting the Ninth Ward on the Map: Race, Place, and Transformation in Desire, New Orleans." *American Anthropologist* Volume 108, no. 4 (December 2006): 744-764. Accessed April 8, 2019. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1525/aa.2006.108.4.744.

Breunlin, Rachel and Helen Regis. "Can There Be a Critical Collaborative Ethnography?: Creativity and Activism in the Seventh Ward, New Orleans." *Collaborative Anthropologies* Volume 2 (2009): 115-146. Accessed April 9, 2019. 10.1353/cla.0.0028.

Brothers, Thomas. *Louis Armstrong's New Orleans.* New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company, 2006.

Bruce, David. "The Nineteenth-Century 'Golden age' of Tourism: How the Beaten Track of the Intellectuals Became the Modern Tourist Trail." In *The Routledge Handbook of Cultural Tourism,* edited by Melanie Smith and Greg Richards. London: Taylor & Francis Group, 2013: 11-18.

Bunten, Alexis Celeste. "Sharing Culture or Selling Out? Developing the Commodified Persona in the Heritage Industry." *American Ethnologist* 35, no. 3 (2008): 380-395.

Burford, Mark. "Mahalia Jackson Meets the Wise Men: Defining Jazz at the Music Inn." *The Musical Quarterly* 97, No. 3 (Fall 2014): 429-486.

Burke, Meghan. "Racing Left and Right: Color-Blind Racism's Dominance Across the U.S. Political Spectrum." *The Sociological Quarterly* Vol 58, Issue 2 (2017): 277-294. https://doi.org/10.1080/00380253.2017.1296335.

Burke, Peter. "Review." Review of *The Invention of Tradition*, by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger. *The English Historical Review* Vol 101, No. 398. January 1986.

Burkholder, Peter. "Museum Pieces: The Historicist Mainstream in Music of the Last Hundred Years." *The Journal of Musicology* 2, No. 2 (Spring 1983): 115-134.

Burns, Ken, dir. *Jazz.* "Episode 1 – Gumbo." PBS, 2001, film.

Burns, Ken, dir. *Jazz,* "Episode 2 – The Gift," PBS, 2001, film,

Burns, Mick. *Walking With Legends: Barry Martyn's New Orleans Jazz Odyssey.* Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press, 2007.

Butt, John. "Acting up a text: the scholarship of performance and the performance of scholarship." Review of *Text and Act,* by Richard Taruskin. *Early Music* May 1996: 323-328. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3128117.

Calkins, Susan. "A history of Jazz Studies at New England Conservatory, 1969–2009: The legacy of Gunther Schuller." PhD diss., Boston University, 2012.

Call, Steve. "Teaching Traditional Jazz/Dixieland Improvisation." Clinic given at International Association for Jazz Educators. January 12, 2008. Toronto, Ontario.

Call, Steve. "Bobby Hackett: An Approach to Teaching Traditional Jazz Phrasing and Improvisation." *Jazz Research Proceedings Yearbook,* edited by L. Fischer, Vol. 27 (2007).

Call, Steve. "Bobby Hackett: An Approach To Teaching Traditional Jazz Phrasing and Improvisation." Paper presented to the International Association for Jazz Education, New York, New York. January 2007.

Callahan, North. *Carl Sandburg: His Life and Works.* University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010.

Cash, W. J. *The Mind of the South.* New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., 1941.

"Cast of 'Club Dixieland' to Be Given By Pupils of the Northwest School Today." *The Hartford Courant,* Feb 21st, 1936. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant.

Campanella, Richard. "Gentrification and Its Discontents: Notes from New Orleans." *New Geography,* Published March 1st, 2013. Accessed July 8th, 2019. https://www.newgeography.com/content/003526-gentrification-and-its-discontents-notes-new-orleans.

Chidester, Bruce. "What is the Difference Between New Orleans and Chicago Dixieland Jazz." *The Trumpet Blog,* posted Feb 6, 2015. http://www.thetrumpetblog.com/what-is-the-difference-between-new-orleans-and-chicago-dixieland-jazz/.

Clark, Emily. *The Strange History of the American Quadroon: Free Women of Color in the Revolutionary Atlantic World.* Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2013.

Colchester Jazz Club. "Musician Profile – Colin Bowden." https://www.colchesterjazzclub.co.uk/about-colchester-jazz-club/musician-profile/?name=Colin%20Bowden&id=47.

Comaroff, John and Jean Comaroff. *Ethnicity, Inc.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009.

Contreras, Felix. "Unfurling 'Sweet Home Alabama,' A Tapestry Of Southern Discomfort." NPR, posted December 17th, 2018. https://www.npr.org/2018/12/17/676863591/sweet-home-alabama-lynyrd-skynyrd-southern-discomfort-american-anthem.

Charters, Samuel. *A Trumpet Around the Corner: The Story of New Orleans Jazz.* Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2008.

"Chevy Chase Lake." *The Washington Post,* Aug 2nd, 1925. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post.

Chow, Kat. "'Politically Correct': The Phrase Has Gone From Wisdom To Weapon." NPR, posted Dec 14th, 2016. https://www.npr.org/sections/codeswitch/2016/12/14/505324427/politically-correct-the-phrase-has-gone-from-wisdom-to-weapon.

Cobb, James. *Away Down South: A History of Southern Identity.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Cohan, Brad. "Mostly Other People Do the Killing interview: 'If we wanted to make people mad, that's easy.'" *Time Out.* Nov 4th, 2014. https://www.timeout.com/newyork/music/mostly-other-people-do-the-killing-interview-if-we-wanted-to-make-people-mad-thats-easy.

Colby-Bottel, SherriLynn. "Transposing the Tradition: The Social Production of Authenticity and Sincerity in Post-Katrina New Orleans Jazz." PhD diss., University of Virginia, 2012.

Davis, Mike. "Catastrophic Economics: The predators of New Orleans." *Le Monde diplomatique.* Published October 2005, Accessed July 8th, 2019. https://mondediplo.com/2005/10/02katrina.

Deffaa, Chip. *Traditionalists & Revivalists in Jazz*. Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, 1993.

Delgado, Richard, and Jean Stefancic. *Critical Race Theory: An Introduction.* New York, NY: New York University Press, 2012.

Depoy, Donald. "Cultural Context of Bluegrass Music: Preference, Familiarity, and Stereotypes." PhD diss., University of Maine, 1996.

DeVeaux, Scott. "Constructing the Jazz Tradition." *Black American Literature Forum* Volume 25, no. 3 (Autumn 1991): 525-560. Accessed Jan 22nd, 2019. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3041812?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents.

DeVeaux, Scott. *The Birth of Bebop: A Social and Musical History*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997

"Display Ad 87 – No Title." *New York Times,* Feb 4th, 1917. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: New York Times.

"Dixieland Ideal Place For Impromptu Parties." *The Hartford Courant,* May 16th, 1926. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant.

"'Dixieland Jazz' Album Released." *Baltimore Afro-American,* Sep 14, 1940, ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Baltimore Afro-American.

Doctorlloydmiller. Comment on "Baby Dodds Transcription by Giuseppe Urso." Video by realworld111. Posted May 16, 2013. Accessed Dec 1, 2017. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nsVZjSq2YPA.

Doleac, Benjamin. "Strictly Second Line: Funk, Jazz, and the New Orleans Beat." *Ethnomusicology Review* Volume 18 (2013): 1-16. Accessed December 2nd, 2016. http://ethnomusicologyreview.ucla.edu/printpdf/journal/volume/18/piece/699.

Dodds, Baby. *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos.* Folkways Records, 1951. Accessed Nov 28, 2017. https://open.spotify.com/track/2DOkpJcJaVeRzECXHPwEQE.

Dodds, Warren Baby. "Warren 'Baby' Dodds 1958-05-31." Interview by William Russell. *Music Rising at Tulane: The Musical Cultures of the Gulf South.* May 31, 1958. Audio. https://musicrising.tulane.edu/listen/interviews/warren-baby-dodds-1958-05-31/.

Dreyfus, Laurence. "Early Music defended against its devotees. A theory of historical performance in the twentieth century." *Musical Quarterly* 69 (1983): 297-322.

The Dukes of Dixieland. *The Dukes at Disneyland Vol. 1.* 1966. Columbia. Spotify. https://open.spotify.com/album/7uIuREmiKkyosSchLSWEVB?si=Uhliui4kTQy5V505LZiTgw.

Dunkel, Mario. "Marshall Winslow Stearns and the Politics of Jazz Historiography." *American Music* 30, no. 4 (Winter 2012): 468-504. https://doi.org/10.5406/americanmusic.30.4.0468.

Echtner, Charlotte, and Pushkala Prasad. "The Context of Third World Tourism Marketing." *Annals of Tourism Research* 30, no. 3 (2003): 660-682. doi:10.1016/S0160-7383(03)00045-8.

Ellison, Mary. "Dr Michael White and New Orleans Jazz: Pushing back Boundaries while Maintaining the Tradition." *Popular Music and Society* 28, no. 5 (December 2005): 633.

Faulkner, Nicholas and Ana-Maria Bliuc. "'It's okay to be racist': moral disengagement in online discussions of racist incidents in Australia." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 39, no. 14 (2016): 2544 – 2563. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2016.1171370.

Filene, Benjamin. *Romancing the Folk: Public Memory & American Roots Music.* Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2000.

Frank, Alexandra. "'That's the way I've always learned': The Transmission of Traditional Music in Higher Education" Masters Thesis., East Tennessee State University, 2014.

Gabbard, Krin. *Black Magic: White Hollywood and African American Culture.* New Brunswick and London: Rutgers University Press, 2004.

Gabbard, Krin. "Introduction: The Canon and its Consequences." *Jazz Among the Discourses,* edited by Krin Gabbard, 1-28. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995.

Gara, Larry. *The Baby Dodds Story.* Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press, 1992.

Garcia, David. "From Jazz Pedagogy to Improvisation Pedagogy: Solving the Problem of Genre in Beginning Improvisation Training." In *Improvisation and Music Education,* edited by Ajay Heble and Mark Laver, 96-107. Oxford: Taylor and Francis, 2016.

Gendron, Bernard "Moldy Figs and Modernists: Jazz at War (1942-1946)," *Discourse*, Vol. 15, No. 3 (Spring 1993): 131, accessed December 2nd, 2016, http://www.jstor.org/stable/41389289.

Gennari, John. *Blowin' Hot and Cool: Jazz and Its Critics.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.

George, Courtney. "Keeping it 'Reals' Narrative of New Orleans Jazz History as Represented in HBO's *Treme.*" *Television New Media* Volume 13, no. 3 (May 2012): 225-234. Accessed December 2nd, 2016. doi: 10.1177/1527476411423674.

"Getting to know the Hogan Jazz Archive." Music Rising at Tulane: The Musical Cultures of the Gulf South. Audio. https://musicrising.tulane.edu/listen/.

Gilbert, David. *The Product of Our Souls: Ragtime, Race, and the Birth of the Manhattan Musical Marketplace.* Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2015, 158.

Goodey, Brian. "New Orleans to London: Twenty Years of the New Orleans Jazz Revival in Britain." *Journal of Popular Culture* 2, no. 2 (Fall 1968): 173-194. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0022-3840.1968.0202_173.x.

Goodman, Glenda. "Sounds Heard, Meaning Deferred: Music Transcription as Imperial Technology." *Eighteenth Century Studies* 52, no. 1 (Fall 2018): 39-45. https://doi.org/10.1353/ecs.2018.0025.

"Greetings everyone, Shaye here." Tuba Skinny's Facebook page, posted June 4th, 2020. https://www.facebook.com/groups/tubaskinny.

Griffin, Rachel Alicia. "The Disgrace of Commodification and Shameful Convenience: A Critical Race Critique of the NBA," *Journal of Black Studies* 43, no. 2 (2012): 161-185. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0021934711412182.

Grossman, James. "WHOSE MEMORY? WHOSE MONUMENTS? HISTORY, COMMEMORATION, AND THE STRUGGLE FOR AN ETHICAL PAST." *Perspectives on History* 54, no. 2 (2016). https://www.historians.org/publications-and-directories/perspectives-on-history/february-2016/whose-memory-whose-monuments-history-commemoration-and-the-struggle-for-an-ethical-past.

Gruber, Ruth Ellen. "Beyond Virtually Jewish: New Authenticities and Real Imaginary Places in Europe." *Jewish Quarterly Review* 99, no. 4 (2009): 487-504. https://www.jstor.org/stable/40586730.

Guess, Andre. "Wynton Marsalis and Ethan Iverson: A Conversation on Jazz & Race." www.wyntonmarsalis.org. Jan 11th, 2018. https://wyntonmarsalis.org/news/entry/wynton-marsalis-ethan-iverson-a-conversation-on-jazz-race

Harker, Brian. *Louis Armstrong's Hot Five and Hot Seven* Recordings. Cary, NC: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Harnish, David. "No, Not 'Bali Hai'!: Challenges of Adaptation and Orientalism in Performing and Teaching Balinese Gamelan." In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 126-137. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Harrington, Christopher. "Jazz at the Century Mark: Taking a Trip Back to the Beginning." Ithaca.com. Feb 23, 2017. https://www.ithaca.com/entertainment/music/jazz-

at-the-century-mark-taking-a-trip-back-to-the-beginning/article_29d7a666-f92e-11e6-8413-cf88fd37ff7e.html.

Harrington, T. G. and Danny Clinch, dir. *A Tuba to Cuba.* Blue Fox Entertainment. 2018. Film.

Harrison, Marion Clifford. "Social Types in Southern Prose Fiction." PhD diss., University of Virginia, 1921.

Hentoff, Nat. "Warren 'Baby' Dodds." In *The Jazz Makers,* edited by Nat Shapiro and Nat Hentoff. New York: Rinehart & Company, Inc, 1957.

Hersch, Charles. *Subversive Sounds: Race and the Birth of Jazz in New Orleans*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007.

Hobson, Wilder. *American Jazz Music.* New York: Da Capo Press, 1976.

Hodeir, Andre. *Jazz: Its Evolution and Essence.* New York: Grove Press Inc, 1956.

Hobsbawm, Eric., and Terence Ranger. *The Invention of Tradition.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

Hobson, Vic. *Creating Jazz Counterpoint: New Orleans, barbershop harmony, and the blues.* Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2014.

Hoffman, Darren, dir. *Tradition is a Temple.* 2013. Film.

Holland, Brian. "Honky Tonk, Boogie Woogie, Stride: What's the Difference." The Syncopated Times. Posted Nov 1st, 2016, https://syncopatedtimes.com/honky-tonk-boogie-woogie-and-stride-whats-the-difference/?utm_source=The+Syncopated+Times&utm_campaign=8d5436d1da-EMAIL_CAMPAIGN_2020_11_25_01_59&utm_medium=email&utm_term=0_1d5b1765d2-8d5436d1da-367336649.

"How To Get Involved," AUMI Adaptive Musical Instruments, http://aumiapp.com/participate.php.

Hughes, David. "When Can We Improvise?" In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 261-282. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Hutchison, Coleman. "Whistling Dixie for the Union (Nation, Anthem, Revision)." *American Literary History* Vol 19, no. 3 (2007): 615.

"It's all in the Count." *The Washington Post.* April 12, 1903. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post.

Jackson, Travis A. *Blowin' the Blues Away: Performance and Meaning on the New York Jazz Scene.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012.

Jacques, Geoffrey., Bernard Gendron, Sherrie Tucker, Krin Gabbard, and Scott DeVeaux. "Call and Response: A Roundtable on Ken Burns Jazz." *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 13, 2 (2001): 207-225.

Jazz at Lincoln Center's JAZZ ACADEMY. "Collective Improvisation in New Orleans Jazz." YouTube video, 5:37, Jan 11, 2015. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EadpcjMB_2s.

Jewtube69. "Johnny Rebel – Stay Away From Dixie." *BITCHUTE,* published September 16th, 2018. https://www.bitchute.com/video/ahABXhaSXf50/.

Johnson, Cedric. *The Neoliberal Deluge: Hurricane Katrina, Late Capitalism, and the Remaking of New Orleans.* Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2011.

Johnson, Patrick E. *Appropriating Blackness: Performance and the Politics of Authenticity.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.

jonpetters. "Baby Dodds – An Appreciation." *Youtube* video. Feb 1, 2009. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WCup7MfJJ2k&t=93s.

Kajikawa, Loren. "The Possessive Investment in Classical Music: Confronting Legacies of White Supremacy in U.S. Schools and Departments of Music." In *Seeing Race Again: Countering Colorblindness Across the Disciplines*, edited by Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw, 155-174. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2019.

Katz, Mark. *Capturing Sound: How Technology Has Changed Music.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010.

Kaufman, Gil. "8 Things Lady A (The Singer) Needs You to Understand About the Name Feud." *Billboard,* posted Aug 3, 2020. https://www.billboard.com/articles/columns/pop/9427755/lady-a-interview-name-battle.

Kearns, J. Michael. "Thinking about Jazz Education in Canada: A Comparative Case Study of Collegiate Educators regarding Pedagogy, Administration, and the Future of Jazz Education." DME diss., Indiana University. 2011. Accessed May 10th, 2019. ProQuest Dissertations and Theses.

Keil, Charles. "Who needs 'the folk'?" *Journal of the Folklore Institute* 15, no. 3 (1978): 263-265.

Kelly, Keith. "A New Cartography: Learning Jazz at the Dawn of the 21st Century." DMA diss., Arizona State University. 2013. Accessed May 10th, 2019. https://repository.asu.edu/attachments/110346/content/Kelly_asu_0010E_12736.pdf.

Kelly, Thomas Forest. *Early Music: A Very Short Introduction* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Kennedy, Al. *Chord Changes on the Chalkboard: How Public School Teachers Shaped Jazz and the Music of New Orleans.* Lanham, MD: The Scarecrow Press, 2002.

Kenney, William Howland. "Historical Context and the Definition of Jazz: Putting More of the History in 'Jazz History.'" In *Jazz Among the Discourses*, edited by Krin Gabbard. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995: 100-116.

Kerr, Darin. "'A Whole Hundred Years of Questionable Behavior': Wainwright/Garland/Jolson and Performance as Palimpsest." *Theatre Annual* 62 (2009): 1-20, 103.

Kingsbury, Henry. *Music, Talent, and Performance: Conservatory Cultural System.* Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 1988.

Kippen, James. "Working with the Masters." In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspective for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology,* edited by Gregory Barz and Timothy Cooley, 125-140. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.

Kisliuk, Michelle., and Kelly Gross. "What's the 'It' That We Learn to Perform?: Teaching BaAka Music and Dance." In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 249-260. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Koenig, Bernie. "Rhythmically Speaking Chapter One Baby Dodds." *YouTube* video. May 2, 2008. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zAYRXISv7g8.

Korkis, Jim. "Profile of Disneyland's New Orleans Square 1966." *Mouse Planet,* posted Feb 20, 2019. https://www.mouseplanet.com/12309/Profile_of_Disneylands_New_Orleans_Square_1966.

Larsen, Capion. "The Albert System." Capion Larsen New Orleans Jazz. Copyright 2014. http://capionlarsen.com/the-albert-system/.

lennon1252. "AL JOLSON & THE MILLS BROTHERS - IS IT TRUE WHAT THEY SAY ABOUT DIXIE?" YouTube Video, 2:43. July 28th, 2017. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iIZp1dqiQv8.

Libman, Jeff. "The Out-of-School Musical Engagements of Undergraduate Jazz Studies Majors." PhD diss., Arizona State University. 2014. Accessed May 10th, 2019. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1640912537?accountid=4485.

Limburg, David and Wayne Pauli. "Reader Responses to 'Reconsidering Dixieland Jazz: How the Name has Harmed the Music.'" The Syncopated Times, Oct 18th, 2019. https://syncopatedtimes.com/reader-responses-to-reconsidering-dixieland-jazz-how-the-name-has-harmed-the-music/.

"Loudon Wainwright III and Vince Giordano Play From the Great American Songbook." NPR. December 31st, 2020. https://www.npr.org/2020/12/31/952276957/loudon-wainwright-iii-and-vince-giordano-play-from-the-great-american-songbook.

Lomax, Alan. *Mister Jelly Roll.* Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2001.

Lott, Eric. *Love and Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2013.

Louis Armstrong. "Weather Bird." Recorded December 5th, 1928 on *Louis Armstrong: Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man 1923-1934*. Released 1994. Spotify. https://open.spotify.com/track/3eMrYc092k7SIJfWJ7oasR?si=B_HGrY2-TzazUSnKZk3jAw.

Magruder, Julia. "The Southern Girl." *Los Angeles Times,* Nov 11th, 1894. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times.

Martyn, Barry. *Walking With Legends, Barry Martyn's New Orleans Jazz Odyssey.* Edited by Mick Burns. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2007.

Marsalis, Wynton. *Mr. Jelly Lord – Standard Time Vol. 6.* 1999. Columbia. Spotify. https://open.spotify.com/album/50ypDiqIDdNl9biyTbsEDe?si=V5ZHoOrsQmmqtKqQwrRlig.

Matterhorn 1959. "SOP Saturday – Profile New Orleans Square." Stuff From the Park, posted March 24th, 2007. http://matterhorn1959.blogspot.com/2007/03/sop-saturday-profile-new-orleans-square.html.

Mattingly, Rick. "Warren 'Baby' Dodds." PAS Hall of Fame, Percussive Arts Society. https://www.pas.org/about/hall-of-fame/warren-baby-dodds.

McGrath, Charles. "Playing a Bandleader and Keeping it Real." New York Times. Sep 3rd, 2010. https://www.nytimes.com/2010/09/05/arts/television/05bempire.html.

McWhirter, Christian. *Battle Hymns: The Power and Popularity of Music in the Civil War.* Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2012.

Miller, Karl Hagstrom. *Segregating Sound: Inventing Folk and Pop Music in the Age of Jim Crow.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010.

Millstein, Gilbert. "Turk Murphy, Out of New Orleans Via San Francisco, Reshapes Old Style." *New York Times,* Oct 10, 1954. ProQuest Historical Newspapers; The New York Times.

Monson, Ingrid. *Saying Something.* Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1996.

"Moonlight in Dixie." *The Chicago Defender,* Mar 11, 1922. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Chicago Defender.

Morrison, Matthew. "Race, Blacksound, and the (Re)Making of Musicological Discourse." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 72, no. 3 (2019): 781-823.

Murphy, John. "Beyond the Improvisation Class: Learning to Improvise in a University Jazz Studies Program." In *Musical Improvisation: Art, Education, and Society*, edited by Bruno Nettl and Gabriel Solis, 171-184. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2009.

Musser, Charles. "Why Did Negroes Love Al Jolson and The Jazz Singer?: Melodrama, Blackface and Cosmopolitan Theatrical Culture." *Film History: An International Journal* 23, No. 2 (2011): 204-212.

Nathan, Hans. *Dan Emmett and the Rise of Early Negro Minstrelsy.* Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1962.

Netsky, Hankus. "Klez Goes to College." In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 189-201. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Nettl, Bruno. *Heartland Excursions.* Champaign, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1995.

"News Items." *Hartford Daily Courant.* Dec 6th, 1860. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Hartford Courant.

Norton, Kay. "Who Lost the South?" *American Music* 21, No. 4 (Winter 2003): 391-411. https://doi.org/10.2307/3250572.

"Obituary: Bill Russell" Independent. Posted August 11th, 1992. https://www.independent.co.uk/news/people/obituary-bill-russell-1539621.html.

O'Meally, Robert, Brent Hayes Edwards, and Farah Jasmine Griffin, eds. *Uptown Conversation: The New Jazz Studies.* New York City: Columbia University Press, 2004.

Ostendorf, Berndt. *New Orleans: Creolization and all that Jazz.* Piscatway, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2013.

Pellegrinelli, Lara. "Separated at Birth: Singing and the History of Jazz." In *Big Ears: Listening for Gender in Jazz Studies,* edited by Nichole T. Rustin and Sherrie Tucker, 31-47. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008.

Perea, Jessica Bisset. "Voices From the Jazz Wilderness: Locating Pacific Northwest Vocal Ensembles Within Jazz Education." In *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries.* Edited by David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012: 173-186.

Perlstein, Rick. "Exclusive: Lee Atwater's Infamous 1981 Interview on the Southern Strategy." *The Nation,* Nov 13, 2012. https://www.thenation.com/article/archive/exclusive-lee-atwaters-infamous-1981-interview-southern-strategy/.

Petrus, Stephen and Ronald D. Cohen. *Folk City: New York and the American Folk Music Revival.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.

Phillips, Damani. *What is this Thing Called Soul: Conversations on Black Culture and Jazz Education.* New York, NY: Peter Lang Publishing, 2017.

Phillips, Damon. *Shaping Jazz: Cities, Labels, and the Global Emergence of an Art Form.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013.

Piazza, Tom. *Why New Orleans Matters* New York: Reagan Books, 2005.

Pittman, Nick. "Johnny Rebel Speaks." Gambit, June 9th, 2003. https://www.nola.com/gambit/news/article_463c487d-1c52-50ea-9721-7faa207733ca.html.

Porter, Eric. "Incorporation and Distinction in Jazz History and Jazz Historiography." In *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* edited by David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark, 18-31. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012.

Prouty, Ken. "The 'Finite' Art of Improvisation: Pedagogy and Power in Jazz Education." *Critical Studies in Improvisation* 4, no. 1 (2008):1-15. Accessed July 8th, 2019. https://www.criticalimprov.com/index.php/csieci/article/view/346/964.

Prouty, Ken. “The History of Jazz Education: A Critical Reassessment.” *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* Vol. 26, No. 2 (Apr 2005): 79-100.

Prouty, Kenneth. *Knowing Jazz, Community, Pedagogy, and Canon in the Information Age.* Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2011.

Prouty, Kenneth. “Orality, Literacy, and Mediating Musical Experience: Rethinking Oral Tradition in the Learning of Jazz Improvisation.” *Popular Music and Society* 29, no. 3 (2006): 317-334. Accessed July 8th, 2016. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1080/03007760600670372.

Pryor, William A. “San Francisco and the Revival of New Orleans Jazz.” *IAJRC Journal* 45, no. 3 (Sept 2012): 28-31.

Racy, Ali Jihad., Scott Marcus, and Ted Solis. “Can’t Help but Speak, Can’t Help but Play.” In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis. 155-167. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Raeburn, Bruce Boyd. *New Orleans Style and the Writing of American Jazz History.* Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2009.

Raeburn, Bruce Boyd. “Stars of David and Sons of Sicily: Constellations beyond the Canon in Early New Orleans Jazz.” *Jazz Perspectives* Volume 3, no. 2 (2009): 123-152. Accessed December 2nd, 2016. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17494060903152370.

Ramsey, Frederic Jr and Charles Edward Smith. *Jazzmen.* New York: Harcourt, Brace, and Company, 1939.

Ramsey, Frederic. Liner notes for *Footnotes to Jazz, Vol. 1: Baby Dodds Talking and Drum Solos.* https://folkways-media.si.edu/liner_notes/folkways/FW02290.pdf.

Ramsey, Guthrie. *The Amazing Bud Powell: Black Genius, Jazz History, and the Challenge of Bebop.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2013.

Ramsey, Jan. “By the Numbers: Sweet Home New Orleans Releases 2012 State of the New Orleans Music Community Report.” Offbeat Magazine. http://www.offbeat.com/news/sweet-home-new-orleans-releases-2012-state-new-orleans-music-community-report/.

Rasmussen, Anne. “Bilateral Negotiations in Bimusicality: Insiders, Outsiders, and the ‘Real Version’ in Middle Eastern Music Performance.” In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004: 215-228.

Red Onion Jazz Babies. “Cake Walking Babies from Home.” Recorded April 6, 1923 - December 22, 1924. Track 25 on *Louis Armstrong and King Oliver.* Released 1974.

Spotify.
https://open.spotify.com/track/4u4XgMOzvBOcxPBFaRy3Un?si=fuoxRiQJTm65fPvr6TRQnw.

Regis, Helen. "Blackness and the Politics of Memory in the New Orleans Second Line." *American Ethnologist* Volume 28, no. 4 (November 2011): 752-777. Accessed April 8, 2019. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3094934.

Regis, Helen A., Rachel Breunlin, and Ronald W. Lewis. "Building Collaborative Partnerships Through a Lower Ninth Ward Museum." *Practicing Anthropology* Volume 33, no. 2 (Spring 2011): 4-10. Accessed April 8, 2019. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.17730/praa.33.2.mu53h77518u285pt.

Regis, Helen. "Producing Africa at the New Orleans Jazz & Heritage Festival." *African Arts* Volume 46, no. 2 (Summer 2013): 70-85. Accessed April 8, 2019. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1162/AFAR_a_00067.

Regis, Helen A. and Shana Walton. "Producing the Folk at the New Orleans Jazz and Heritage Festival." *The Journal of American Folklore* Vol 121, No. 482 (Fall, 2008): 400-440. Accessed December 2nd, 2016.
http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/stable/20487627.

Regis, Helen. "Second Lines, Minstrelsy, and the Contested Landscapes of New Orleans Afro-Creole Festivals." *Cultural Anthropology* Volume 14, no. 4 (November 1999): 472-504. Accessed April 9, 2019. https://www.jstor.org/stable/656542.

Reich, H. "Saving Grace: New Orleans Violin Repairman's Collection Is Rewriting the History of Jazz." *Chicago Tribune*. November 9, 1997.

Rembowska-Pluciennik, Magdalena. "Second Person Narration as a Joint Action." *Language and Literature* 27, no. 3 (2018): 159-175.
https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0963947018788519.

Riley, Herlin and Johnny Vidacovich. *New Orleans Drumming Vols I, II, and III.* Alfred Music. DVD.

Riley, Herlin, Johnny Vidacovich, and Dan Thress. *New Orleans Jazz and Second Line Drumming.* Van Nuys, CA: Alfred Music, 1995.

Ritchie, Donald A. *Doing Oral History: A Practical Guide.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.

Roberts, John Storm. *The Latin Tinge: The Impact of Latin American Music on the United States.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Robinson, Dave. "Advocating the Tradition." Traditional Jazz Educators Network. Copyright 2015. http://www.prjc.org/tjen/advocating.htm.

Robinson, David. "A Traditional Jazz Style Guide." Traditional Jazz Educators Network. Copyright 2015. http://www.prjc.org/tjen/styleguide.htm.

Robinson, David. "List of Educators." Traditional Jazz Educators Network. Copyright 2015. http://prjc.org/tjen/listing.htm.

Rockwell, John. "Concert: Orchestra of 18th Century at Tully." *New York Times*, November 23, 1987.

Rockwell, Joti. "What is Bluegrass Anyway? Category Formation, Debate, and the Framing of Musical Genre." *Popular Music* 31, no. 3 (2012): 363-381. doi:10.1017/S0261143012000293.

Rogers, Allan. "The Georgia Sheriff hears "Dixie" in London." *The Atlanta Constitution.* May 16th, 1903. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Atlanta Constitution.

Rogers, Alan S. "How a Girl Who Smiled Saved a Young Man's Life." *The Atlanta Constitution.* July 27th, 1903. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Atlanta Constitution.

Roper, Hugh Trevor. "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland." In *The Invention of Tradition,* edited by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, 15-42. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

Rose, Al and Edmond Souchon. *New Orleans Jazz: A Family Album.* Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1967.

Rubinoff, Kailan R. "Orchestrating the Early Music Revival: The Dutch baroque orchestras and the mediation of commodification and counterculture." *Tijdschrift van de Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis*, Deel 63, No. 1/2 (2013): 169-188.

"Russell, William, 1984, August 18." Oral History of American Music – Yale. Interviewed by Vincent Plush. https://yalemusiclib.aviaryplatform.com/collections/931/collection_resources/25270/file/91091.

Sacks, Howard L. and Judith Rose Sacks. *Way Up North in Dixie.* Chicago, Il: University of Illinois Press, 2003.

Sager, David. "History, myth and legend: the problem of early jazz," in *The Cambridge Companion to Jazz,* ed. Mervyn Cooke and David Horn, 270-285. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Sakakeeny, Matt. "Living in a Laboratory: New Orleans Today." *Books and Ideas.* September 10, 2015. Accessed Mar 18, 2019. http://www.booksandideas.net/Living-in-a-Laboratory-New-Orleans-Today.html.

Sakakeeny, Matt. "New Orleans Music as a Circulatory System." *Black Music Research Journal* Vol. 31, No. 2 (Fall 2011): 291-325. Accessed Mar 18, 2019. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5406/blacmusiresej.31.2.0291.

Sakakeeny, Matt. "Playing for Work: Music as a Form of Labor in New Orleans." *Oxford Handbooks Online.* Dec 2015. Accessed Mar 18, 2019. 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199935321.013.23.

Sakakeeny, Matt. *Roll With It: Brass Bands in the Streets of New Orleans.* Durham: Duke University Press, 2013. 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199935321.013.23.

Sakakeeny, Matt. "Running with the Second Line: How New Orleans Brass Band Went Hip Hop" *Red Bull Music Academy Daily.* October 15, 2013. Accessed Mar 18, 2019. http://daily.redbullmusicacademy.com/2013/10/running-with-the-second-line-how-brass-band-went-hip-hop.

Sakakeeny, Matt. "'Under the Bridge': An Orientation to Soundscapes in New Orleans." *Ethnomusicology* Vol. 54, No. 1(Winter 2010): 1-27. Accessed Mar 18, 2019. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5406/ethnomusicology.54.1.0001.

Sampson, Paul. "Traditional or Modern: Jazz Records Offer Rich Field." *The Washington Post,* Dec 5, 1954. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post.

The San Francisco Traditional Jazz Foundation Collection: The Charles N. Huggins Collection. "Turk Murphy." https://exhibits.stanford.edu/sftjf/feature/turk-murphy.

Sartain, Geraldine. "Smiling Cotton Fields Way Down in Dixieland." *Baltimore Afro American* Dec 2nd, 1933. Proquest Historical Newspapers: The Baltimore Afro-American.

Scholz, Ben. "John Riley: Inspiring Innovation." All About Jazz. Published July 23, 2014. https://www.allaboutjazz.com/john-riley-inspiring-innovation-by-ben-scholz.php.

Schultz, Thomas. "A History of Jazz Drumming." Booklet from *PASIC* conference 1979, pg. 116. http://www.brad-meyer.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/History.pdf.

Shapiro, Marc. "New Orleans Jazz Lives On." *Baltimore Jewish Times.* Nov 29, 2013. Accessed December 2nd, 2016. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/1475116718?accountid=4485.

Sharf, Zack. "Robert Downey Jr. Has No Regrets Over 'Tropic Thunder' Blackface: 'It Blasted the Cap on the Issue.'" Indiewire Jan 21st, 2020. https://www.indiewire.com/2020/01/robert-downey-jr-tropic-thunder-blackface-regrets-1202204722/.

Shelemay, Kay. "The Ethics of Ethnomusicology in a Cosmopolitan Age." in *The Cambridge History of World Music*, edited by Philip Bohlman, 786-806. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Sheridan, Brian. "Mike Davis Finds the Way Back." Medium. Posted Jan 11, 2018. https://medium.com/@brianrsheridan/mike-davis-finds-the-way-back-23709b126619.

Singleton, Brian. "Introduction: The Pursuit of Otherness for the Investigation of Self." *Theatre Research International* Vol. 22, No. 2 (January 2009): 93-97.

Small, Christopher. *Musicking.* Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1998.

Solis, Ted. "Community of Comfort: Negotiating a World of 'Latin Marimba.'" In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 229-248. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004.

Solis, Ted. *Performing Ethnomusicology.* Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2004.

Solis, Ted. "Introduction. Teaching What Cannot Be Taught: An Optimistic Overview." In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 1-19. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Souther, J. Mark. "The Disneyfication of New Orleans: The French Quarter as Façade in a Divided City" *Journal of American History* Vol. 94, No. 3 (Dec 2007): 804-811.

Souther, J. Mark. "Making the 'Birthplace of Jazz': Tourism and Musical Heritage Marketing in New Orleans." In *Louisiana Legacies: Readings in the History of the Pelican State,* edited by Janet Allured and Michael S. Martin, 291-313. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 2013.

Spencer, Michael T. "Jazz Education at the Westlake College of Music 1945-61." *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* 35, No. 1 (October 2013): 50-65. https://www.jstor.org/stable/43958416.

Stewart, Alexander. "'Funky Drummer': New Orleans, James Brown, and the Rhythmic Transformation of American Music." *Popular Music* 19, No. 3 (October 2000): 293-318. https://www.jstor.org/stable/853638.

Suhadolnik, Sarah. “Navigating Jazz: Music, Place, and New Orleans.” PhD diss., University of Michigan, 2016.

Suhor, Charles. *Jazz in New Orleans: The Postwar Years Through 1970.* Lanham, MD: The Scarecrow Press, 2011.

Sumarsam. “The Gamelan from Java to Wesleyan.” In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 69-92. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Susilo, Hardja. “A Bridge to Java: Four Decades Teaching Gamelan in America.” Interview by David Harnish, Ted Solis, and J. Lawrence Witzleben. In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 53-68. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

The Syncopated Times. https://syncopatedtimes.com.

Taruskin, Richard. *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance.* Cary: Oxford University Press, 1995.

Teal, Kimberly Hannon. “Posthumously Live: Canon Formation at Jazz at Lincoln Center through the Case of Mary Lou Williams.” *American Music* Vol 32, no. 4 (Winter 2014): 400-422.

“Term ‘Dixie’ Debated Once More; New Orleans Calls Origin French.” *The New York Times.* Sep 25th, 1927. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The New York Times.

Titon, Jeff Todd. “Knowing Fieldwork.” In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspective for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology,* edited by Gregory Barz and Timothy Cooley, 25-41. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.

Torregano, Michael. “The History of Jazz Education in New Orleans: An Investigation of the Unsung Heroes of Jazz Education.” DMA diss., Boston University. 2014. Accessed May 10th, 2019.
http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1562585920?accountid=4485.

Trimillos, Ricardo. “Subject, Object, and the Ethnomusicology Ensemble: The Ethnomusicological ‘We’ and ‘Them.’” In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 23-52.

Tucker, Mark. “Musicology and the New Jazz Studies.” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* Vol 51, No. 1 (Spring 1998): 131-148.

Tucker, Sherrie. "A Feminist Perspective on New Orleans Jazzwomen." New Orleans Jazz National Historical Park. Accessed Jan 23rd, 2019. https://www.nps.gov/jazz/learn/historyculture/upload/new_orleans_jazzwomen_rs-2.pdf.

Tucker, Sherrie. "Deconstructing the Jazz Tradition." In *Jazz/Not Jazz the Music and its Boundaries*, edited by David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garret, and Daniel Goldmark, 207-221. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012.

"Turk On His Own." The San Francisco Traditional Jazz Foundation Collection: The Charles N. Huggins Project, created Sept 2018, https://purl.stanford.edu/dq777fd7798.

Turner, Richard Brent. *Jazz Religion, The Second Line, and Black New Orleans.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009.

"United Daughters of the Confederacy." *Los Angeles Times,* April 15th, 1924. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times.

"Vale, General Gordon." *The Atlanta Constitution.* Jan 13th, 1904. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Atlanta Constitution.

Vetter, Roger. "A Square Peg in a Round Hole: Teaching Javanese Gamelan in the Ensemble Paradigm of the Academy." In *Performing Ethnomusicology,* edited by Ted Solis, 115-125. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

"Vince Giordano: The Fresh Air Interview." WUWF: NPR for Florida's Great Northwest. Nov 6th, 2013. https://www.wuwf.org/post/vince-giordano-fresh-air-interview#stream/0.

Violin Piano. "Jelly Roll Morton Lesson." YouTube Video. 1:55. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9RFK-EXmZBQ.

Wade, Michael. "Johnny Rebel and the Cajun Roots of Right-Wing Rock." *Popular Music and Society* 30, 4 (2007): 493-512. https://doi.org/10.1080/03007760701546364.

Wagner, Ben "William Russell: Jazz Lover, Collector, Musicologist An Annotated Bibliography." Historic New Orleans Collection. https://www.hnoc.org/sites/default/files/file_uploads/russell_biblio.pdf.

Wald, Elijah. "Louis Armstrong Loves Guy Lombardo." In *Jazz/Not Jazz: The Music and its Boundaries,* edited by David Ake, Charles Hiroshi Garrett, and Daniel Ira Goldmark, 32-44. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2012.

Warner, Matthew. "Paradox, Problem, and Potential in Secondary School Jazz Education." DMA diss., Boston University, 2014. Accessed May 10th, 2019.

http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1545997025?accountid=4485.

Warren, Robert Penn. *Jefferson Davis Gets His Citizenship Back.* Lexington, KY, 1980.

Washington, Cameron, dir. *A Man and His Trumpet: The Leroy Jones Story.* Russian Hill Projects. 2018. Film.

Peter Watrous. "Good News for Jazz, with a big Caveat." New York Times. 18 August 1991.

"Ways of the Pickaninny – Always Fat and Happy and Fond of White Folks." *The Washington Post,* Jan 10th, 1905. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Washington Post.

Welch, Michael Patrick. "Jazz's Great White Hype." *Narratively,* published Aug 25, 2014. https://narratively.com/jazzs-great-white-hype/.

Wells, Christopher. "'A Dreadful Bit of Silliness': Feminine Frivolity and Ella Fitzgerald's Early Critical Reception." *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 21 (2017): 43-65. https://doi.org/10.1353/wam.2017.0003.

Wells, Christopher. "*You* Can't Dance to It: Jazz Music and Its Choreographies of Listening." *Daedalus* 148, no. 2 (Spring 2019): 36-51. Accessed May 22nd, 2019. https://doi.org/10.1162/daed_a_01741.

"Where to Study Jazz 2021." Downbeat*.* September 22, 2020. https://downbeat.com/news/detail/where-to-study-jazz-in-2021.

White, Michael. "The 21st Annual Bill Russell Lecture: What Is Jazz?" Virtual Lecture given at *The Historic New Orleans Collection,* September 30th, 2020. https://my.hnoc.org/virtualprograms/russelllecture.

White, Nazera Sadiq. Review of *The Strange History of the American Quadroon: Free Women of Color in the Revolutionary Atlantic World, b*y Emily Clark. *Early American Literature* 49, no. 1 (2014), 257-262. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24476602.

Whyton, Tony. "Birth of the School." *Music Education Research* 8, no. 1 (March 2006): 65-81.

Wilf, Eitan. "The 'Cool' Organization Man: Incorporating Uncertainty from Jazz Music into the Business World." In *Modes of Uncertainty*, edited by Limor Samimian-Darash and Paul Rabinow, 29-45. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2015. Accessed May 10th, 2019. ProQuest Ebook Central.

Wilf, Eitan. "Modernity, Cultural Anesthesia, and Sensory Agency: Technologies of the Listening Self in a US Collegiate Jazz Music Program." *Ethnos* 80, no. 1 (2015): 1-22. Accessed May 10th, 2019. https://doi-org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1080/00141844.2012.751930.

Wilf, Eitan. "Rituals of Creativity: Tradition, Modernity, and the 'Acoustic Unconscious' in a U.S. Collegiate Jazz Music Program." *American Anthropologist* Vol. 114, no. 1 (2012): 32-44. Accessed May 10th, 2019. https://anthrosource-onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/doi/epdf/10.1111/j.1548-1433.2011.01395.x.

Wilf, Eitan Y. *School for Cool : The Academic Jazz Program and the Paradox of Institutionalized Creativity*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2014.

Wilf, Eitan. "Swinging within the Iron Cage: Modernity, Creativity, and Embodied Practice in American Postsecondary Jazz Education." *American Ethnologist* 37, no. 3 (2010): 563-82. Accessed May 10th, 2019. http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/stable/40784616.

Wilson, John. "Turk Murphy to Perform At Carnegie." *New York Times,* Jan 9, 1987. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The New York Times.

Williams, Martin. *Jazz Masters of New Orleans.* New York: The Macmillan Company, 1967.

Winslow, Richard. "World Music." *Wesleyan Alumnae Magazine,* 1967.

Wyatt-Brown, Bertram. *Southern Honor: Ethics and Behaviour in the Old South.* New York, 1982.

Wyndham, Tex. "Texas Shout #1 'Dixieland.'" The Syncopated Times. https://syncopatedtimes.com/tex-wyndham-texas-shout/. Originally published in *West Coast Rag,* November – December 1989.

Wyndham, Tex. "Texas Shout #67 Dixieland Revisited, part 2." The Syncopated Times. https://syncopatedtimes.com/texas-shout-68-dixieland-revisited-part-2/. Originally published in *The American Rag,* December 1995.

Yanow, Scott. "Reader Responses to 'Reconsidering Dixieland Jazz: How the Name has Harmed the Music.'" *The Syncopated Times,* Oct 18th, 2019. https://syncopatedtimes.com/reader-responses-to-reconsidering-dixieland-jazz-how-the-name-has-harmed-the-music/.

Zane, Maitland. "The Jazz Scene." *The Hartford Courant,* Feb 26, 1956. ProQuest Historical Newspapers: The Hartford Courant.