

Coverage of Human Trafficking
in Criminology and Criminal Justice Curricula

by

Tatyana Zhilina

A Thesis Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

Approved April 2011 by the
Graduate Supervisory Committee:

Michael Stancliff, Chair
Frances Bernat
Suzanne Vaughan

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

May 2011

ABSTRACT

The crime of human trafficking has received increased national attention over the past decade. However, the subject of human trafficking is rarely mentioned in criminal justice and criminology curricula in colleges and universities. This study discusses findings from a review of listed courses in 100 criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in colleges and universities in the United States. Implications for further research, including examining criminal justice education programs outside of academe, are discussed. The author advocates adding courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice curricula and makes recommendations for undergraduate criminology and criminal justice education.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES.....	vi
CHAPTER	
1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
Human Trafficking: An Overview	3
Definitions and Legislation	4
Scope and Magnitude of Human Trafficking	7
Methods of Trafficking.....	9
2 HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS A CRIMINAL JUSTICE ISSUE	13
3 METHODOLOGY	19
Sample.....	22
Data Collection	25
4 FINDINGS.....	27
Undergraduate Courses.....	30
Graduate Courses	35
5 DISCUSSION	38
Recommendations for Human Trafficking Courses.....	39
Limitations and Recommendations for Future Research	45
Conclusion	47

	Page
REFERENCES	48
APPENDIX	
A COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITITES REVIEWED	52

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1.	Academic Unit	28
2.	Title of Major	29
3.	Type of Bachelor's Degree	30

Chapter 1

Introduction

The crime of human trafficking has received increased national attention over the past decade. Human trafficking is now rapidly developing into a subject of widespread interest for governments, nongovernmental actors, and scholars. In recent years, numerous anti-trafficking statutes have been passed or amended, anti-trafficking agencies and organizations have proliferated, and an impressive amount of research on human trafficking and contemporary slavery has been conducted by scholars from a diverse range of disciplines (Gozdziak & Bump, 2008; U.S. Department of State, 2010).

To address the issue of human trafficking, the United States Government advocates a three-prong approach consisting of prevention, protection, and prosecution (U.S. Department of State, 2010). Thus, the U. S. criminal justice system plays an important role in addressing human trafficking because effective prosecution and criminal sanctions are in its realm. Thirty eight human trafficking task forces funded by the U.S. Department of Justice have been established to provide case coordination and law enforcement training (U.S. Department of State, 2010).

These developments in the anti-trafficking movement are part of a changing world to which education must adapt. Human trafficking requires attention from criminology and criminal justice education as these disciplines influence the criminal justice system and people's perceptions of crime. Attention to the crime of human trafficking given by criminal justice and criminology

education would provide tools that enable individuals to critically examine the issue and seek ways to effectively address the crime. Within this context, the current study explores the degree to which human trafficking is a subject of study in current criminal justice and criminology curricula, and discusses implications for undergraduate education.

The present chapter provides a necessary overview of human trafficking. Human trafficking is viewed from a criminal justice perspective and examined in relationship to issues of human rights and social harm. The purpose of this chapter is to familiarize the reader with the crime of human trafficking. It must be noted that by no means is this overview an exhaustive description of the issue.

Reviewed are the main pieces of current anti-trafficking legislation at the international and national levels. Legal definitions of human trafficking, the purpose and focus of such legislation, and its implications for the criminal justice system are covered. Further discussed are the scope and types of human trafficking, its relationship with the crime of human smuggling, and methods that traffickers employ. In providing this general overview, a discussion of current ideological debates (one being the relationship of sex trafficking and prostitution) in the contemporary anti-trafficking movement is avoided, as these debates are not the focus of the current study.

The second chapter elaborates on the role of the criminal justice system in addressing the crime of human trafficking. The chapter also argues that criminology and criminal justice programs are in a good position to lay the

necessary groundwork in educating their students about human trafficking and its complexity.

The methodology of this study is discussed in the third chapter. The fourth chapter discusses findings from reviewing the presence of courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in colleges and universities in the United States.

The fifth and final chapter advocates adding courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice curricula and offers guidelines for designing such courses. The thesis concludes with a discussion of implications for future research and makes recommendations for undergraduate criminology and criminal justice education.

Human trafficking: an overview.

Human trafficking is a “contemporary manifestation of slavery” that affects millions of men, women, and children in every country and every nation (U.S. Congress, 2000). Human trafficking for sex and labor occurs both within and between countries (Aronowitz, 2009). People from vulnerable populations are trafficked into labor or sexual exploitation for little or no pay. The duties of modern slaves vary: exotic dancing, pornography, hotel work, restaurant labor, construction, factory labor, housekeeping, childcare, landscaping, gardening, trinket selling, street begging, and criminal activities such as prostitution, selling and/or transporting drugs, pick pocketing, and moving arms or stolen vehicles (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009; Aronowitz, 2009). Some live in private residences where they must work long hours as housekeepers, maids, and nannies, while

others work in sweatshops, factories, hotels, nail salons, restaurants, agricultural fields or involved in the sex industry. These victims endure emotional, physical, sexual, and economic abuse by their traffickers. While victimization experienced by each individual is different depending on a person's gender and the specifics of trafficking situation, sexual abuse is more commonly experienced by persons trafficked into sexual exploitation. Although women and girls (and sometimes men and boys) trafficked into forced labor can be sexually assaulted as well (Logan et al., 2009).

Definitions and legislation.

On November 15, 2000, the United Nations General Assembly passed Resolution 55/25 adopting the Convention against Transnational Organized Crime ("Convention") and two of its supplemental protocols: 1. the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children; and 2. the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea.

The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, also referred to as the Palermo Protocol, defines human trafficking as:

recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (UNODC, 2000, Article 3(a)).

As of December 2010, the Palermo Protocol has been ratified by 142 countries, including the U.S. (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2010). Now, the Protocol serves as a paradigm for national legislations regarding the issue of human trafficking. The Protocol seeks to “prevent and combat trafficking in persons, paying particular attention to women and children”, “protect and assist victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights”, and “promote cooperation among State Parties in order to meet those objectives” (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime [UNODC], 2000, Article 2). Thus, the Protocol is designed to eliminate human trafficking through creating preventive measures and cooperation among State Parties.

The Palermo Protocol criminalizes trafficking in persons and encourages state parties to follow suit. Article 5 of the Protocol requires the state parties to “adopt such legislative and other measures as may be necessary to establish as criminal offences” trafficking in persons, “when committed intentionally.” In addition, Article 5 criminalizes the following activities: attempted trafficking, participation as an accomplice, “organizing or directing other persons to commit” trafficking (UNODC, 2000, Article 5). Further, the Protocol encourages the cooperation of “law enforcement, immigration or other relevant authorities” to successfully detect traffickers and their victims crossing an international border. Also, authorities should determine the means and methods of trafficking such as “the types of travel documents,” and “the recruitment and transportation of victims, routes and links between and among individuals and groups engaged in such trafficking, and possible measures for detecting them” (UNODC, 2000,

Article 10). Article 10 further obligates states to “provide or strengthen training” to prevent trafficking by effectively identifying potential victims and the methods of traffickers. The Protocol recognizes that such training should “take into account the need to consider human rights and gender-sensitive issues” (UNODC, 2000, Article 10).

As for federal legislation in the United States, the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) was proposed in 2000 as part (Division A) of a larger bill entitled the "Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000." The bill was enacted on October 28, 2000 (U.S. Congress, 2000). To date, the TVPA is the main piece of anti-trafficking legislation in the U.S. which has been reauthorized in 2003, 2005, and 2008, with growth in the areas of providing support to victims of trafficking and criminal prosecution of traffickers (Chacon, 2010). The TVPA anti-trafficking approach is: “to ensure just and effective punishment of traffickers, and to protect their victims” (U.S. Congress, 2000, Sec. 102(a)). In other words, the TVPA criminalizes the trafficking in persons and provides protection to victims. U.S. federal legislation defines human trafficking as:

A) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or (B) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subsection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (U.S. Congress, 2000, sec. 103(8)).

Thus, contemporary anti-trafficking legislation criminalizes human trafficking and enables the criminal justice system, including law enforcement, to address this crime. Both United States and international anti-trafficking legislation attempts to fight human trafficking worldwide, protect victims, and punish criminals.

Scope and magnitude of human trafficking.

Aside from being a crime, human trafficking entails grave violations of human rights. Undoubtedly, the issue of human trafficking is perceived as a multi-dimensional threat by many governments and non-governmental organizations. The U. S. Department of State (2008) elaborates on the devastating impact of human trafficking:

It deprives people of their human rights and freedoms, it increases global health risks, and it fuels the growth of organized crime. Human trafficking has a devastating impact on individual victims, who often suffer physical and emotional abuse, rape, threats against self and family, and even death. But the impact of human trafficking goes beyond individual victims; it undermines the health, safety, and security of all nations it touches.

Victims of human trafficking are difficult to identify because of the clandestine nature of the crime. Hence, estimates on the scope of human trafficking differ considerably. Bales (2007) argues that there are approximately 27 million men, women, and children in forced labor and/or sexual servitude at any given time. According to the International Labor Organization (2008), there are 12.3 million people in forced labor and forced prostitution around the world, and 2.4 million of them were trafficked. Further, the ILO's figures are broken down into the different types of human trafficking: "32% of all victims were

trafficked into labour exploitation, while 43% were trafficked for sexual exploitation and 25% for a mixture of both” (International Labor Organization, 2008, p. 3).

The U.S. Department of State has been providing different estimates over the past decade. The 2003 Trafficking in Persons Report indicated that approximately 800,000 to 900,000 persons are trafficked across national borders each year. This figure does not include victims trafficked within their own countries (U.S. Department of State, 2003). In 2006, the estimated number of persons trafficked across national borders was between 600,000 and 800,000 people (U.S. Department of State, 2006). The most recent Trafficking in Persons Report (U.S. Department of State, 2010) referred to the International Labor Organization’s figure of 12.3 million. In addition, the Trafficking in Persons report explicitly states that every country is likely to be affected by human trafficking to some extent (U.S. Department of State, 2008). Therefore, the actual number of victims involved in sexual exploitation and forced labor remains unknown and likely underestimated.

Human trafficking is a lucrative crime as it generates about \$32 billion in profits annually (Bales, 2007). The trade in humans adopted a business model approach. Transnational organized crime networks act as business enterprises: their primary goal is the acquisition of profit (Picarelli, 2009). Previously, human trafficking was cited as the third largest criminal industry after the trade in drugs and arms (U.S. Department of State, 2004). It is believed to have recently surpassed trafficking in arms and now is referred to as the second largest criminal

industry in the world after drug trafficking (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2010).

Clearly, trafficking in persons has become one of the most serious global social problems. Traffickers deprive their victims of the most basic entitlements and human rights. Criminals take away trafficked people's freedom and ability to make life choices, and, oftentimes, deprive them of basic living needs such as food, safety, and access to healthcare (Logan et al., 2009). Human trafficking often results in deadly diseases, mutilations and murder of the trafficked persons (U.S. Congress, 2000). Additionally, the crime of human trafficking affects the society and international community as it "involves violations of other laws, including labor and immigration codes and laws against kidnapping, slavery, false imprisonment, assault, battery, pandering, fraud, and extortion" (U.S. Congress, 2000, Sec. 102b (10)). Thus, human trafficking is considered to entail "grave violations of human rights and is a matter of pressing international concern" (U.S. Congress, 2000, Sec. 102b (23)).

Methods of trafficking.

Poverty remains the "single most important factor" that makes persons susceptible to human trafficking (Logan et al., 2009, p. 10). Shirk and Webber (2009) note that traffickers often target people who are desperately searching for ways to find employment and better their lives. Poverty and inequality are considered to be the main driving forces of human trafficking. Following are a few examples of methods that criminals employ in order to victimize vulnerable people.

Tiefenbrun (2002) describes a typical sex trafficking scheme, stating that millions of women who were forced into prostitution could tell the same story. In this trafficking scheme, the criminals are divided into “agents” and “traffickers.” The main goal of an agent is to spark a victim’s interest with promises of a good job, financial stability, and a better life. After gaining the victim’s trust, the agent hands the victim over to the trafficker. The trafficker is usually responsible for providing means to relocate the victim (visas, passport, and transportation). Soon enough, the victim finds herself in debt, without documents, and forced into prostitution in a foreign land. Also, her escape is almost impossible because even the police oftentimes are corrupted and aid the criminals (Tiefenbrun, 2002).

A similar model is used for labor trafficking. Traffickers often recruit in victims’ hometowns by promising jobs. Thus people believe that they are accepting legitimate jobs such as waitressing, landscaping, or domestic work but, in reality, they end up being enslaved (Logan et al., 2009).

Children are targeted by human traffickers because of their “powerlessness, innocence, and inability to protect themselves” (Aronowitz, 2009, p. 37). Homeless children are considered to be particularly vulnerable to human trafficking (Logan et al., 2009). Youth living on the streets encounter poverty, violence, and crime on a daily basis. Engaging in sexual activities in exchange for food or shelter is a common practice not only for girls but also for boys (Aronowitz, 2009).

Children who live in families can be trafficked into labor or sexual exploitation as well. Usually, these children experience emotional, physical and/or

sexual abuse, witness substance abuse at home and/or come from impoverished families (Aronowitz, 2009; Logan et al., 2009). In some cases, children are sold into slavery by their parents, relatives or caregivers because of the family's desperate economic conditions. Sometimes, parents, deceived by traffickers, believe that their children will receive education and/or job training skills and would have a better life than at home (Logan et al., 2009). In the United States, runaway and at risk youth are considered to be an easy target for pimps. Usually pimps befriend such girls by pretending to be their boyfriends and later force them into prostitution (U. S. Department of State, 2010).

Once trafficked, victims are controlled and manipulated by criminals through a variety of psychological and physical means. Traffickers maintain control over their victims by taking away victims' travel and identity documents; threatening them with local law enforcement; threatened or actual sexual abuse and physical violence; isolation; disorientation; and debt bondage (Bales & Lize, 2005).

Human trafficking is linked to the activities of international crime organizations by the Trafficking Victims Protection Act:

Trafficking in persons is increasingly perpetrated by organized, sophisticated criminal enterprises. Such trafficking is the fastest growing source of profits for organized criminal enterprises worldwide. Profits from the trafficking industry contribute to the expansion of organized crime in the United States and worldwide (U.S. Congress, 2000, sec. 102b (8)).

A human trafficking ring may be composed of only one or two associates. Or, traffickers could establish extensive networks that have highly organized

structures and involve many partners (Zhang, 2007). Also, traffickers can use human smuggling operations to obtain new victims. Human smuggling is different from human trafficking as human smuggling involves a willing migrant who is trying to enter a country with the help of smugglers. Logan et al. (2009, p. 5) explain the nature of such operation: “usually, with human smuggling, the relationship between the transporter and the smuggled individual ends once the target destination is reached.” In some cases, however, victims are trafficked under the guise of smuggling services offered to them. Many undocumented immigrants have to rely on smugglers, “who are uniquely positioned to engage in both labor and sexual exploitation” (Shirk & Webber, 2004, p. 2). Therefore, human smuggling may escalate to human trafficking. It must be noted that mass media, general public, and law enforcement sometimes conflate these terms (Zhang, 2007).

Chapter 2

Human Trafficking as a Criminal Justice Issue

The crime of human trafficking often goes unnoticed. Most victims are not identified as victims of trafficking. Some may be seen as prostitutes, undocumented immigrants, or simply as “criminals” (Bernat & Zhilina, 2010). Law enforcement agencies play a critical role in detecting potential trafficking cases, as police officers often come into contact with traffickers and their victims. However, they tend to lack the training needed to effectively identify a case as human trafficking. Local law enforcement officers often fail to identify human trafficking cases, although they are more likely to encounter human trafficking than federal law enforcement officers (Farrell, 2009). A study by Farrell, McDevitt, and Fahy (2008) based on a survey distributed to a national random sample of approximately 3,000 municipal, county and state law enforcement agencies in the United States found that law enforcement agencies differ in their perceptions of human trafficking. According to the study, local law enforcement agencies believe that human trafficking is rare or non-existent in their communities while agencies serving larger jurisdictions view human trafficking as a pervasive problem. Further, only 18 percent of the agencies reported conducting any type of training in recognizing and responding to human trafficking (Farrell, McDevitt, & Fahy, 2008).

As a result of lack of detection, victims do not receive needed assistance and remain in their situations, and traffickers go unpunished and continue to engage in their criminal activities and victimize more people. Providing training

to law enforcement agencies is among the recommendations given by the U.S. Attorney General in his annual report: “Evaluate law enforcement training programs and consider existing feedback in revising law enforcement training curriculum” (U.S. Attorney General, 2010, p. 15).

Human trafficking cases are more likely to be successfully investigated by law enforcement agents who received training and have experience with human trafficking cases. Bales & Lize (2007, p. 26) state: “such investigators show more sensitivity to the needs of the victims, know how best to handle them, and are aware of superior sources of information to corroborate evidence.” Similarly, Kumar Kibble, Deputy Director of Office Investigations at Immigration and Customs Enforcement, stated the importance of requiring law enforcement agencies to be victim-oriented: “we in law enforcement have a responsibility to treat victims fairly, with compassion, and with attention to their needs” (Department of Homeland Security, 2007, p. 5).

The criminal justice system is in a position to effectively respond to the crime, but it sometimes lacks the needed tools such as resources, personnel, and training. Since many prospective law enforcement officers and other criminal justice professionals are pursuing bachelor’s degrees, college studies provide an opportunity to begin acquiring knowledge about human trafficking. Although other disciplines such as sociology and political science might offer courses dedicated to human trafficking, it is reasonable to believe that the crime of human trafficking should receive attention by criminal justice and criminology since these disciplines study crime and crime control and need to respond to

contemporary issues. Criminology and criminal justice programs are in a good position to lay the necessary groundwork in educating their students about human trafficking and its complexity. Should these students pursue law enforcement or other criminal justice careers, or careers that interface with criminal justice work, they would be prepared to address human trafficking and, eventually, influence their agencies' response to the crime.

There is very little literature discussing human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice education. One way to explore the importance of human trafficking in a discipline is to review scholarly journals specifically designed for educators of the discipline. Currently, the *Journal of Criminal Justice Education* is the only journal dedicated solely to criminology and criminal justice education. The *Journal of Criminal Justice Education* is an official publication of the Academy of Criminal Justice Sciences (ACJS), the North American professional society of criminal justice scholars. The journal publishes articles on the development of criminal justice studies in higher education; research methodology, both quantitative and qualitative; and emerging substantive issues in the field. The journal is dedicated to providing "a forum for the examination, discussion and debate of a broad range of issues concerning post-secondary education in criminal justice, criminology, and related areas" as it purports to increase the quality of education in the field (Taylor & Francis Group, 2011).

A search of the *Journal of Criminal Justice Education's* articles helped to explore if any information and recommendations regarding human trafficking instruction are offered to faculty who teach courses in the field of criminology

and criminal justice. As of the time of this review, none of the articles published in the journal were dedicated to the subject of human trafficking and specifically designed to offer recommendations regarding human trafficking instruction. However, a number of articles indicated that a broad range of issues has been ignored in the past by criminal justice and criminology academic curricula. These “ignored topics” include gay and lesbian issues (Cannon & Dirks-Linhorst, 2006), environmental crime (Situ & Emmons, 1996), high technology crime investigation (Myers & Myers, 2002), and security-related topics (Kooi & Hinduja, 2008) among others. Perhaps human trafficking should be recognized in the literature as one of the ignored issues.

Natarajan’s (2002) note was the only article that mentioned the subject of human trafficking. Natarajan described the need for providing students with knowledge about international crimes and criminal justice systems by developing and implementing the “curriculum that would help produce the large numbers of sophisticated investigators who will be needed to deal with international and transnational crimes and criminal organizations” (p. 480). Such curricula then would cover a wide range of topics including “enslavement, <...> sexual slavery, enforced prostitution, forced pregnancy,” and “trafficking in humans” among others. Further, the process of development of the International Criminal Justice major at John Jay College of Criminal Justice was described with the purpose to “assist other universities and colleges interested in developing their own ICJ programs” (Natarajan, 2002, p. 482).

One more article was found to be somewhat related to human trafficking education. Turner, Giacomassi, and Vandiver (2006) discuss the importance of coverage of historical slavery and slave patrols in the United States in the introductory criminal justice text books. According to the article, “the slave patrol should be considered a forerunner of modern American law enforcement” and, thus, should be included in the introductory criminal justice text books (Turner et al., 2006, p. 186). While it is important to explore the history and development of law enforcement, however, it is also essential to discuss the issue of human trafficking which is a form of modern day slavery.

Although Natarajan (2002) touched upon the importance of covering various international and transnational crimes and including human trafficking in the list, her goal was not to provide guidance on how to teach the basics of human trafficking but to describe the importance of teaching a wide range of criminal justice related topics from a global perspective. Likewise, Turner et al. (2006) emphasize the importance of discussing historical slavery and slave patrols and their role in the development of law enforcement.

While human trafficking may not receive much attention in the *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, there is an active body of academicians and practitioners publishing research on human trafficking elsewhere (see for example Aronowitz, 2009; Bales, 2007; Bales & Lize, 2005; Barone, 2003; Bernat & Zhilina, 2010; Farrell et al., 2008; Farrell, 2009; Logan et al., 2009; Picarelli, 2009; Shirk & Webber, 2004; Tiefenbrun, 2002; Weitzer, 2007; Zhang, 2007). In short, there is a diverse interdisciplinary field of scholarship on contemporary

slavery and human trafficking that produces an ample amount of material from which to draw for course material on the subject. Within this context, the current study explores whether human trafficking is specifically reflected in current criminal justice and criminology curricula, and discusses implications for undergraduate education.

Chapter 3

Methodology

The current study explores the presence of courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in colleges and universities in the United States. As stated in the previous chapter, the disciplines of criminology and criminal justice were chosen because it seems logical that human trafficking, a crime that requires criminal justice intervention, would be considered a crime studies topic. Criminology and criminal justice undergraduate programs were explored with the purpose of discovering if current educational curricula sufficiently cover the issue of human trafficking, and how discourses about human trafficking are framed within these curricula. Also, human trafficking courses were evaluated in terms of their potential effectiveness in increasing students' awareness of human trafficking and teaching the basics of the crime. Thus, the study attempts to answer in a preliminary way the following questions:

- Do criminology and criminal justice bachelor degree programs in the U.S. offer courses dedicated to human trafficking as a part of their educational curricula?
- Are students required to take courses on human trafficking?
- Do criminology and criminal justice programs include information about human trafficking as a part of other related courses such as those on organized crime, victimology, juvenile delinquency, and/or domestic violence?

To explore the presence of courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice undergraduate curricula, the target population was defined as one of the top one hundred colleges and universities *with* criminal justice and criminology undergraduate programs in the United States. The author reasons that top schools ranked according to multiple quality measures would offer more comprehensive curriculum to their students. To acquire a sample of this type of population, a sampling technique that selects the appropriate programs was needed. To be included in the sample, programs must at minimum meet two basic criteria: 1) a criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree program and 2) housed in a school recognized by a ranking system. Random sampling could not be used in this case as such a technique would select schools without criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree programs. Thus, purposive sampling was used. Babbie (2011, p. 207) defines purposive, also called judgmental, sampling as a technique in which a sample is selected “on the basis of knowledge of a population, its elements, and the purpose of the study.”

Locating a sample of undergraduate criminology and criminal justice programs was difficult as a comprehensive list of such programs from which to sample is not available¹. In order to create a sample of programs, four ranking systems of universities and colleges were considered: the Princeton Review’s

¹ CriminalJusticePrograms.com offers a fairly comprehensive list of “criminal justice” programs but excludes “criminology” programs (CriminalJusticePrograms.com, 2011). Since human trafficking is both a criminal justice system and criminological issue, a sample that excludes one type of program would be unsuitable.

annual “Best 373 Colleges²,” Princeton Review’s “Best Value Colleges³,” U.S. News and World Report’s list of the top criminology graduate schools⁴, and U.S. News and World Report’s “Best Colleges.” The U.S. News and World Report’s “Best Colleges” ranking system (U.S. News, 2011) was selected because it offered the most comprehensive ranking lists from which to create a sample of programs. At the time of this study, the 2011 edition of “Best Colleges” was the most recently available.

The *U.S. News*’ goal is to provide “as much information as possible about the comparative merits of the educational programs at America’s colleges and universities” (U.S. News, 2011). The rankings are based on up to 16 key measures of quality “which fall into seven categories: peer assessment; graduation and retention rates; faculty resources; student selectivity; financial resources; alumni giving; and, only for national universities and national liberal arts colleges, graduation rate performance and high school counselor undergraduate academic reputation ratings” (U.S. News, 2011). Colleges and universities were ranked by

² The Princeton Review’s annual “Best 373 Colleges” lists the top schools according to the survey of 122,000 students (Princeton Review, 2011). The students were asked to rate their satisfaction with the colleges and universities that they were attending. While students’ opinions are important, there is no guarantee that students were capable of assessing the quality of education and other vital statistics of their schools.

³ Princeton Review’s “Best Value Colleges” lists “academically outstanding” schools that offer the best financial aid programs and are relatively inexpensive (Princeton Review, 2011). This list was considered too short because not all listed schools offer undergraduate programs in criminology and criminal justice.

⁴ U.S. News and World Report ranks top criminology graduate schools (U.S. News, 2011). However, this ranking system was not selected because it ranks only criminology graduate programs and provides a fairly small list. There are 28 programs listed, and only 20 of them are ranked. Thus, the author believes that the sample of 20 graduate programs in criminology is not sufficient to represent criminology and criminal justice undergraduate programs in the U.S.

their total weighted score. The ranking system also divides schools into Tier 1 and Tier 2. Tier 2 schools are ranked but their ranks do not get published. U.S. News lists Tier 2 schools in an alphabetical order.

Further, the ranking system stratifies U.S. colleges and universities by institution type into four main categories: national universities, national liberal arts colleges, regional universities, and regional colleges. The schools in the two latter categories are stratified into one of four geographic regions: North, South, Midwest, and West. A historically black college and university category is also provided (U.S. News, 2011).

Sample.

A sample of one hundred U.S. colleges and universities with criminal justice and criminology undergraduate programs was created by using the *U.S. News and World Report* ranking system (please see Appendix A for a complete list of schools). Twenty schools were selected from five categories: national universities, national liberal arts colleges, regional universities, regional colleges, and historically black colleges and universities to provide a diverse sampling of the different types of institutions. Two historically black schools were also ranked in other categories; so in order to avoid duplication, they were first counted in the other categories and excluded from the HBCU category.

To be included in the sample, a school must offer a Bachelors degree in Criminology and/or Criminal Justice or have “criminology,” “criminal justice,” or “crime” in the bachelor degree title. Minors, concentrations, and certificate programs in criminology and criminal justice were not considered to be full

programs and thus were excluded. Twenty schools offering criminology and/or criminal justice bachelor degree programs were selected in descending rank order from the lists of national universities, national liberal arts colleges, and historically black colleges and universities. In each category, the author began with the highest ranked school and proceeded down the list examining each school for the presence of a criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree program. Each time such a program was detected, it was added to the sample. The author stopped once twenty programs were selected from a category. The same approach was used on the lists of regional universities and regional colleges, but since these are stratified into four geographic regions, five qualifying programs were selected in descending rank order from the schools listed in each regional sub-category (totaling twenty from the overall category).

Since a fixed number was desired from each category, a type of quota sampling was used. The total sample consists of 100 universities and colleges *with* criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree programs drawn from *U.S. News and World Report* rankings in five categories (not to be confused with criminology and criminal justice programs at the top 100 schools). The 100 schools consist of 66 private and 34 public institutions ranging in student enrollment from 324 to 55,014 students. Because this sample was drawn from lists of top-ranked schools in their categories, the study's findings will not be generalizable to criminology and criminal justice programs at colleges and universities across the United States. The results of this study could be different if another sample and sampling method were used. However, the purpose of this

study is not to make broad generalizations but to make an initial inquiry into the presence of human trafficking courses in undergraduate criminology and criminal justice curricula beginning with some of the nation's top schools.

U.S. News defines *national universities* as universities that “offer a full range of undergraduate majors, as well as master’s and doctoral degrees and <...> committed to producing ground breaking research” (U.S. News, 2011). There are 262 universities in this category. National universities included in the sample range in rankings from 5 to 94.

National liberal arts colleges “emphasize undergraduate education and award at least 50 percent of their degrees in the liberal arts” (U.S. News, 2011). Out of 266 national liberal arts colleges, only ten Tier 1 colleges have undergraduate programs in Criminology and/or Criminal Justice (ranked from 32 to 174); these colleges were added to the sample. In order to reach the quota of twenty schools for this category, ten Tier 2 colleges were selected.

Regional universities “provide a full range of undergraduate programs and some master’s level programs. They offer few, if any, doctoral programs.” These 572 universities are ranked within four geographic areas: North, South, Midwest and West (U.S. News, 2011).

Regional colleges “focus primarily on undergraduate education, just as the liberal colleges do, but grant fewer than 50 percent of their degrees in liberal arts disciplines. At these schools, at least 10 percent of undergraduate degrees awarded are bachelor’s degrees” (U.S. News, 2011). This list ranks 319 regional colleges that are divided into four geographic areas.

The *U.S. News* also ranks *historically black colleges and universities* that are listed as part of the U.S. Department of Education's Historically Black Colleges and Universities registry. Out of 89 historically black colleges and universities, only 17 Tier 1 colleges have undergraduate programs in Criminology and/or Criminal Justice (ranked from 8 to 34); these colleges were added to the sample. In order to reach the quota of twenty schools for this category, three Tier 2 colleges were also included in the sample.

Data collection.

Data were collected and analyzed using a content analysis approach. For each of the 100 undergraduate programs identified, the author carefully examined department websites, undergraduate catalogs, and/or school bulletins to detect courses on human trafficking in program curriculum. For most programs the current catalog and/or schools bulletin year - 2010-2011 – were used. If, for some reason, a catalog/bulletin for the 2010-2011 academic year was unavailable, then the most recently available catalogs or bulletins were reviewed.

Four variables were extracted from the web-based information. Tabulated were the 1. number of elective courses on human trafficking; 2. number of required courses on human trafficking; 3. number of required courses containing some human trafficking content; and 4. number of human trafficking-related courses. Content of the titles and course descriptions was examined by using manifest coding. The presence of human trafficking was considered to be included in a course if the following words were mentioned in the title or course description: trafficking in persons, modern-day slavery, labor trafficking, sex

trafficking, forced labor, child trafficking, and/or exploitation. Further, the course descriptions were searched for related issues, such as prostitution and pornography reasoning that prostitution and pornography often intersect with human trafficking. If any of the related issues were mentioned in the description, the course then was considered to be related to the subject of human trafficking and potentially contain some information about the crime.

It must be noted that some courses on human trafficking being taught may not have been detected by this research. Schools could have been offering courses on human trafficking during the time that they were reviewed but not yet updated the department websites, undergraduate catalogs, and/or school bulletins. It is also possible that more courses could have been added since this study was conducted.

Data on program and school characteristics were also collected. These are academic unit (name of department or division for example), title of major, type of Bachelor's degree granted (BA or BS for example), if department offered Master's and/or PhD degrees, if any graduate-level courses on human trafficking were offered (using the same definitions mentioned for undergraduate programs above), if school was public or private, school size, and school location (city/state).

Chapter 4

Findings

Criminal justice and criminology undergraduate programs were offered through three types of academic units: departments, divisions, and schools. The majority of programs (86%) are hosted by a wide range of departments, including four interdisciplinary programs that belong to multiple departments. The most common department was the department of criminal justice (21%). Most departments are interdisciplinary and teach predominantly social and behavioral science disciplines such as sociology, criminology, social work, political science, anthropology, forensic science, and public affairs. Additionally, some departments teach disciplines that are considered to be extended beyond social and behavioral studies such as history, justice studies, cultural studies and communication studies. There are also divisions and schools that embrace a general category of social and behavioral sciences, and schools that are solely dedicated to the disciplines of criminal justice and criminology (see Table 1).

TABLE 1 ACADEMIC UNIT*

Academic Unit	Percent
Criminal Justice	21
Sociology	10
Sociology and Criminal Justice OR Criminal Justice and Sociology	8
Sociology and Criminology	7
Criminal Justice, Sociology and Social Work OR Sociology, Social Work and Criminal Justice OR Social Work, Criminal Justice and Sociology	5
Social Sciences	4
Criminal Justice and Criminology OR Criminology and Criminal Justice	3
Social and Behavioral Sciences OR Behavioral and Social Sciences	3
Behavioral Sciences	2
Criminology	2
Political Science and Criminal Justice	2
Sociology and Anthropology	2
Criminal Justice and Forensic Science	1
Criminology, Law and Society	1
Culture and Communication	1
Government & Justice Studies	1
History and Sociology	1
History, Politics, and Justice	1
Human Services	1
Justice and Policy Studies	1
Public Affairs	1
Social and Cultural Studies	1
Social Sciences and Criminal Justice	1
Sociology & Crime, Law and Justice	1
Sociology and Criminology & Law	1
Interdepartmental (interdisciplinary)	4
Division of Social Sciences	4
Division of Arts and Sciences	1
Division of Behavioral Sciences	1
Division of Social and Behavioral Sciences	1
School of Criminal Justice	2
School of Behavioral and Social Sciences	1
School of Criminology and Criminal Justice	1
School of Justice Studies	1
School of Public Administration, Social Work and Criminal Justice	1
School of Social Sciences	1

* *Note.* Academic unit is a department unless otherwise noted

The majority of programs (73%) identified themselves as offering “criminal justice” as the major, and 10% were identified as “criminology” and 6% were identified as both “criminology and criminal justice” majors. Eleven percent offered some other type of crime studies major, such as “Criminal Justice Studies” and “Sociology and Criminology” (see Table 2). The most common bachelor’s degree offered was a Bachelor of Arts (45%) followed closely by a Bachelor of Sciences (36%), and 11% of the programs offered both the Bachelor of Arts and the Bachelor of Sciences. Six schools in the sample provided other type of degree, such as “Bachelor of Criminal Justice” and “Bachelor of Applied Arts and Sciences in Criminal Justice.” Two schools did not specify what type of undergraduate degree they offer; therefore, the information about the type of degree for these programs was recorded as “unclear” (see Table 3).

TABLE 2 TITLE OF MAJOR

Title of Major	Percent
Criminal Justice	73
Criminology	10
Criminology and Criminal Justice OR Criminal Justice and Criminology	6
Criminal Justice Studies	2
Sociology and Criminology	2
Administration of Criminal Justice	1
Crime, Law and Justice	1
Criminology and Criminal Justice Studies	1
Criminology and Law	1
Criminology and Law Studies	1
Criminology, Law and Society	1
Sociology and Criminal Justice Administration	1

TABLE 3 TYPE OF BACHELOR'S DEGREE

Type of Bachelor's Degree	Percent
B.A.	45
B.S.	36
B.A and B.S.	11
B.A., B.S. and BAAS	1
B.A., BCJ	1
Bachelor of Criminal Justice	1
Major in Applied Criminal Justice	1
Major in Criminology	1
not clear	2

Although the focus was undergraduate programs, graduate programs offered by the schools in the sample were also reviewed in case they provide interesting comparisons to the undergraduate programs. Thirty schools offer Master's degrees, and ten schools have doctoral programs that offer PhD degrees. Due to the *U.S. News* classification methods, all doctoral programs are offered by national universities (U.S. News, 2011).

Undergraduate courses.

Findings revealed that there are *no* courses with a *human trafficking subject title* (identified in the Data Collection section in the previous chapter) offered either as a required course or as an elective by the examined 100 undergraduate programs in criminology and criminal justice. Eight courses were found that *mentioned* the subject of human trafficking in the description or were believed to contain information related to the subject but did not indicate human trafficking as a focus. The names of the schools offering these courses will not be identified herein to avoid the appearance of bias toward or against certain programs.

First, the following three courses mentioned the subject of human trafficking in the descriptions: *CRIM 150 Evidence-Based Crime and Justice Policy*; *CRIM 356 Organized Crime*; and *CJUS–P 474 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia*.

CRIM 150 Evidence-Based Crime and Justice Policy is a required course offered through a criminology program at a national university. According to its description, this course is designed to familiarize students with “statistical techniques and quantitative reasoning” as “essentials tools for properly examining crime and justice policy.” To address appropriate statistical procedures and “sound quantitative reasoning”, the course would apply a case study. The description further lists potential subjects to be used as a case study: “death penalty, racial profiling, *human trafficking*, DNA identification, sentencing guidelines, drug testing, war crimes, ballistic analyses from the JFK assassination, and others” (italics mine). Therefore, students are required to take this course and have a great chance to learn about human trafficking, provided the subject is selected to be used as a case study. However, the description shows that the focus is on statistical techniques and quantitative methodology, and the course is not specifically designed to discuss human trafficking. Students may have to research the basics of human trafficking on their own, assuming that the subject is of interest to them.

While many programs list courses on organized crime as part of their curricula, there is only one course listed that mentions the subject of human trafficking in its description. Offered by a criminology program in one of the

regional colleges in the South, *CRIM 356 Organized Crime* ties human trafficking with organized crime groups “including the Mafia, Yakusa, Triads and drug cartels.” The course covers the “historical evolution” of such groups and focuses on different types of illegal activities, such as “illegal drugs, extortion, gambling, loansharking, *human trafficking*, *prostitution*, international trafficking in stolen cars, money laundering, and others” (italics mine). The course is an elective, but it may be helpful in teaching students the basics of human trafficking crime.

Unfortunately, the description does not allow more information about the course; therefore, it is difficult to assess the quality of its content.

CJUS-P 474 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia is an elective course offered through a criminal justice program at a national university. The course reviews the Russian criminal justice system by examining “how the executive, legislative, and judicial branches of government are being influenced by the forces of transition.” “Analysis of Russian crime, including corruption, patterns of interpersonal violence, *human trafficking*, and drug use” (italics mine) is included in the course. Being a comparative justice course, it is not specifically designed to cover the subject of human trafficking. More information is needed to assess the course’s ability to teach students basics of the crime. Also, it is important to note that human trafficking is a global crime. When looking at the program’s course descriptions, one may conclude that human trafficking is a local issue as the only course mentioning it examines the Russian criminal justice system.

Second, the following five courses are believed to be related to the subject of human trafficking: *CJUS–P 423 Sexuality and the Law*; *CJ 274 - Sex, Violence & Crime on the Internet*; *CRJU 4025 Drugs, Addictions, Vice and Crime*; *CJ 412 Deviant Behavior*; and *0501-522 Victimless Crime*.

CJUS–P 423 Sexuality and the Law is an elective course taught in a criminal justice program at a national university. According to the course description, the course examines “legal and cultural debates regarding sexual images and acts, the criminalization of motherhood, the international *prostitution industry*, and *mass rape*” (italics mine). The course covers the international prostitution industry which implies that it may or may not include the subject of human trafficking. Reasoning that prostitution often intersects with human trafficking, the author expects that such a course would discuss human trafficking.

CJ 274 - Sex, Violence & Crime on the Internet is an elective course that discusses the impact that modern-day technology has on crime focusing specifically on “how the Internet has affected the structure of hate groups and the *child pornography* and *sexual predator* subcultures” (italics mine). While this course does not make a direct reference to human trafficking, it touches upon child pornography, the crime that can involve sex trafficking of children. It is unclear whether the course brings up the subject of human trafficking; nevertheless, it was included in the list of courses because it covers issues closely related to human trafficking.

CRJU 4025 Drugs, Addictions, Vice and Crime is an elective course offered by a criminal justice program at a historically black university. The course

examines “the causes, prevention and control of the so-called ‘victimless crimes’ such as drug use, addictions, gambling and *prostitution*” (italics mine). In addition, the course covers “other criminal offenses associated with crimes of vice.” This course could possibly offer some information on human trafficking as it discusses the issue of prostitution.

CJ 412 Deviant Behavior is an elective course offered through a criminal justice program at a historically black university. This course examines the types of deviant behavior including “sexual deviations, addictive behavior, *organized crime*, gambling, and *prostitution*” (italics mine). Both organized crime and prostitution intersect with human trafficking; therefore, this course was added to the list.

0501-522 Victimless Crime is an elective course offered at a regional university. The course touches upon “the illegal activity associated with *prostitution*, gambling, homosexuality, drug use and *pornography*” as it purports to evaluate the “social, moral, legal and practical consequences of legalizing such activities” (italics mine). The course was selected because it discusses the issues of prostitution and pornography.

To summarize, the majority of undergraduate programs (93%) reviewed offer no cataloged course on human trafficking to their students. Six programs offer related courses as electives and one required a related course.

Graduate courses.

As for graduate programs, only one program out of forty included in the sample offers a course on human trafficking. The mentioned course was found in a university listed in the historically black colleges and universities category and offered through a Master's program in criminal justice. The course titled *CJUS 537 Crime, Sex, Law and Order* is an elective that

...explores the global ties that exist between the international trafficking of sex workers and local criminal interest groups. With the rise of global economy and internet connections, pornography has become a lucrative business enterprise for many members of organized crimes. The course examines the globalization of sex crimes and the issues of illegal trafficking of women and children.

As seen in the description, the course focuses on the issues of sex trafficking of women and children, organized crime, pornography, and sex crimes on international and local levels. While covering an important side of the crime, the program does not offer a course that would discuss labor trafficking and trafficking of men and boys.

The following graduate level courses mentioned human trafficking subjects in the descriptions: *CRIM 7336 Globalization of Crime and Justice; P674 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia; CJ 823 Globalization of Crime; and CJUS 514 Transnational Organized Crime.*

CRIM 7336 Globalization of Crime and Justice, offered at a national university, "examines how globalization and internationalization affect crime and crime control in the United States (e.g., *human trafficking*)" (italics mine). The course discusses the field of "global criminology" by "including the analysis of

international and regional trends and differences in law, crime, and justice.”

Although the course is not required, students who take it are able to learn about human trafficking and current trends in the global criminal justice. Obviously, more information is needed to decide whether the course effectively covers the basics of human trafficking.

P674 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia is a graduate level elective course similar to the undergraduate course *CJUS-P 474 Law, Crime, and Justice in Post-Soviet Russia* mentioned above. Offered in the same department, the courses’ descriptions are almost identical. The same issues apply to this course as to its undergraduate counterpart. The course provides an overview of the Russian criminal justice system and is not specifically designed to cover the subject of human trafficking.

CJ 823 Globalization of Crime has a fairly brief description: “International crimes and organized crime. *Trafficking in women, children, and body parts*. Related problems such as firearm violence, money laundering, and corruption that transcend national boundaries” (italics mine). Laudably, the course discusses trafficking in body parts, the crime considered to be a form of human trafficking under the Palermo Protocol (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2000). However, the author considered the provided framework to be narrow because the course does not cover trafficking of men, although the course could be broad in its coverage of trafficking of women, children, and body parts.

CJUS 514 Transnational Organized Crime is an elective that covers illegal activities of organized criminal groups, such as “transnational money

laundering, drug trafficking, *trafficking of women and children for sex*, and illegal *human trafficking*” (italics mine). While the course is not exclusively on human trafficking, it could conceivably go into depth on human trafficking issues and male and labor trafficking could be covered under "illegal human trafficking."

In addition, two graduate courses are believed to be related to the subject of human trafficking: *SOC 6273 The Sex Industry* and *CJ 566 Juvenile Sex Offenders and Victims*. *SOC 6273 The Sex Industry* provides an overview of the sex industry in the United States and other countries. The course examines “*prostitution, pornography, and other forms of sex work*” (italics mine). *CJ 566 Juvenile Sex Offenders and Victims* also discusses the issues of pornography, prostitution and the victims of sex offenses. As mentioned above, prostitution, pornography, and sex work in general are closely related to the subject of human trafficking.

Chapter 5

Discussion

The purpose of this study is to explore the extent to which human trafficking education is provided in U. S. universities and colleges. Using the disciplines of criminology and criminal justice as a case study, this research examines the presence of human trafficking courses in criminology and criminal justice curricula. After reviewing the programs' course titles and reading course descriptions, the author concludes that the subject of human trafficking is not widely covered in criminal justice and criminology curricula at the undergraduate level among those programs reviewed. There are no exclusive courses on human trafficking offered either as a required course or as an elective by the examined 100 undergraduate programs in criminology and criminal justice. Only seven undergraduate programs offer eight courses that either mentioned the subject of human trafficking in the description or were believed to contain information related to the subject (one department offers two elective courses). Further, when compared to graduate programs, the undergraduate programs reviewed were less likely to offer courses that mention the subject of human trafficking or related courses. Out of the forty graduate programs reviewed, six programs contain courses that mention human trafficking or relate to the subject. One of these programs actually offers a course dedicated to human trafficking.

In the sample reviewed, the majority of undergraduate and graduate courses identified focus on sex trafficking: some courses were included because their descriptions contained such key words as "prostitution" and "pornography."

None of the courses mentioned “labor trafficking” or “forced labor” in the descriptions. Also, some descriptions shifted focus to women and children as potential victims. The only graduate course on human trafficking is dedicated to sex trafficking and victimization of women and children. Keeping in mind that sex trafficking and labor trafficking are two types of human trafficking, these findings may indicate that the programs leave out an important part of the already ignored issue.

The author advocates including human trafficking courses in the criminal justice and criminology curriculum. Human trafficking is a transnational *crime* that is vastly under-reported and that requires *criminal justice* intervention and, thus, has a place among criminal justice and criminology courses. Given the call for training on human trafficking for law enforcement personnel, it is important that criminology and criminal justice incorporate human trafficking into their curricula by recognizing human trafficking as a crime, violation of human rights, and global social problem. This chapter provides guidelines for designing a course on human trafficking and discusses implications for further research drawing from the limitations of the current study.

Recommendations for human trafficking courses.

The following are some principles that should guide the development of courses on human trafficking. The purpose of a human trafficking course would be to provide students with a solid understanding of the scope of contemporary slavery and the trafficking of humans, their causes, and their consequences to the international community. The causes and consequences of human trafficking

should be examined in light of theory and research from criminology. The inclusion of human trafficking course content can be accomplished by adding new courses and by adding content to current courses. Courses may also be taught conjointly with other departments. This collaboration would educate students from multiple disciplines about human trafficking utilizing a reasonable diffusion of resources (departments would need to employ fewer instructors for example).

A course must provide a general context of human trafficking by covering a variety of issues related to the crime. Dragiewicz (2008, p. 193) recommends addressing a number of foundational issues such as poverty, migration, prostitution, and data reliability issues “before diving into a discussion of trafficking.” Views on the mentioned issues and possible solutions to address them widely differ however. Therefore, Situ and Emmons (1996) advocate for applying the seminar, rather than the lecture, format in order to effectively address controversy in the classroom: “In the seminar format, the fuller and freer exchange of conflicting viewpoints can be facilitated by group discussions and team debates” (Situ & Emmons, 1996, p. 152).

In the beginning of teaching a human trafficking course, it is important to lay the groundwork of students’ understanding of human trafficking as not only a violation of law but also a violation of human rights. It is essential to provide a general framework of the crime by referring to poverty and global inequality as the context for exploitation and main driving force of human trafficking. As a trafficker exploits a slave, rich countries’ economic policies often dictate terms to the poorer ones. Within this context, global migration patterns should be explored

by examining socioeconomic and political conditions that urge individuals to migrate. “Globalization and transitioning state economic structures” are key factors that facilitate “wars, armed conflicts, and social and economic crises” and, thus, make individuals and communities vulnerable to human trafficking (Hernandez, 2010, p.8). Without prospects of finding work and the means to feed themselves and their families, people are forced to seek job opportunities elsewhere. Oftentimes, the only outlet for these persons is to engage in illegal activity in order to make some money (human smuggling for example) which makes already vulnerable people even more susceptible to being trafficked and exploited (Dragiewicz, 2008).

A well-designed course will review human trafficking in all of its manifestations. This entails discussing both labor and sex trafficking; the trafficking of adults and children and females and males, and the experiences of local citizens as well as foreign nationals. It is important to provide a fair assessment of the crime without a skewed focus on one type of trafficking over another, as such a course would do a disservice to students. If it is decided to offer a course on a particular type of trafficking, sex trafficking for example, then it would be important to provide students with some information about labor trafficking as well. In the same vein, all types of victims must receive equal attention in the course. Focusing on victims belonging to some social categories over others, for instance, creates the impression that some victims are more worthy than others. Also, the differences between human trafficking and human

smuggling should be explained as human trafficking is often confused with human smuggling.

Students should become familiar with the most recent research on human trafficking, including that covered in reports prepared by the United Nations, International Labor Organization, the U.S. Department of State, and the U.S. Department of Justice. However, estimates of the scope and magnitude of human trafficking provided by the United Nations, the U.S. Department of State, and various nongovernmental organizations should be approached with a critical eye. As noted earlier, these estimates differ considerably. Dragiewicz (2008, p. 196) suggests using these discrepancies as an opportunity to teach students about the strengths and weaknesses of qualitative and quantitative research methods for learning about crime:

All of these numbers are akin to speculation, and it is a good idea to talk about why these numbers are presented in the absence of solid data, why the estimates may look so different from one another, and how and what we can learn about the magnitude of trafficking despite these gaps in data. Like other sensitive, illegal, and covert issues, research on trafficking is better suited to some forms of investigation than others. Studies conducted with trafficking victims, traffickers, or others are often more amenable to qualitative methods that can reveal something about the nature of trafficking, the tactics traffickers use, and the conditions that contribute to its occurrence.

Students should be introduced to international, federal, and, whenever possible, state anti-trafficking legislation. When discussing the legal definitions of human trafficking, it is suggested to touch upon offenses that are often not acknowledged as human trafficking. Although the United Nations Palermo Protocol's definition provides the most coverage and recognizes a multitude of

forms of exploitation, it still does not cover several existing outlets of human trafficking. The U.S. Trafficking Victims Protection Act too excludes many offenses.

Barone (2003) provides a list of crimes and human rights abuses that should be acknowledged as human trafficking: commercial sexual exploitation, such as prostitution, pornography, and sex tourism; trafficking for the purpose of non-commercial sex, such as marriages for the purpose of child-bearing, forced marriages, early marriages, temporary marriages, and mail-order brides (i.e., bride trafficking); trafficking for the purpose of forced labor, in particular domestic service, street begging, and camel jockeying; trafficking for the purpose of illicit inter-country adoption (i.e., baby trafficking); trafficking for military purposes; trafficking for the purpose of involvement in illegal activities, such as drug trafficking; and trafficking in human organs (Barone, 2003). Clearly, this list is long, and some of these offenses are often not recognized as human trafficking. A course should address the potential consequences for those affected by these offenses, acknowledge that governments may not consider them as human trafficking victims (if victims at all), and address the harm to victims that is not being redressed.

Regarding practical issues, students should become familiar with potential indicators of human trafficking and the immediate and long-term effects of victimization. In fact, professionals such as law enforcement officers, attorneys, and social service providers could be recruited as guest speakers who could offer valuable information based on their professional experiences. As Situ and

Emmons (1996, p. 153) state, “these speakers not only contribute their rich experience to the class but also serve as models to students who plan to work in law enforcement.”

Additionally, the subject of prostitution should be critically addressed in a human trafficking course. Prostitution is considered by many to be a “victimless crime,” including some criminologists and criminal justice scholars (Frase, 2002). However, for prostitution to truly be a victimless crime, all parties must be completely willing to engage in sexual exchange without coercion and able to give consent to such activities—meaning that both parties must be over 18 years of age and mentally and emotionally capable. In many cases of prostitution, it may not be apparent to the observer that a person offering sexual services is not a completely willing participant. Prostitution has become a subject that ignites many ideological debates among organizations and individuals involved in the anti-trafficking movement (Dragiewicz, 2008). Scholars assert that radical feminists and some faith-based nongovernmental organizations conflate prostitution and sex trafficking by perceiving all prostitution as a form of trafficking (Dragiewicz, 2008; Weitzer, 2007). Other feminists may argue that women have the right to use their bodies and sexuality for economic gain. While this ideological conflict within the anti-trafficking field is complex and deserves careful study, the author recommends that when prostitution is covered in human trafficking courses, it should be emphasized that some of the “prostitutes” could in fact be victims of sex trafficking. It is essential, however, that prostitution and sex trafficking not be conflated.

To summarize, attention must be given in human trafficking courses to all forms of trafficking and types of victims, which includes “responsible representations and use of research; recognition that there are adults who consent to illegal forms of work and migration; distinctions between consensual sex work and trafficking” (Dragiewicz, 2008, p. 191). Also, it is vital that students understand the role of law enforcement and other criminal justice agencies in addressing human trafficking issues.

Limitations and recommendations for future research.

Results of the current study must be interpreted in the context of its limitations. First, as noted earlier, the findings cannot be generalized to all colleges and universities in the United States, nor to all criminology or criminal justice programs. Due to the nature of the sample, the findings are generalizable only to the nation’s top schools which have criminology or criminal justice bachelor degree programs.

Furthermore, some courses on human trafficking being taught may not have been detected by this research. Many programs offered courses dedicated to “current issues” or “special topics” that discuss different topics based on the instructor’s and students’ interest. This is particularly true when a new topic of research emerges such as human trafficking. Such courses did not appear in this analysis. While some of them listed potential topics in the description and thus were reviewed, many of the courses’ descriptions did not specify which topics would be covered. Thus, the author was not able to identify human trafficking courses taught as catalog-listed current issues or special topics.

These limitations may be addressed by future research. First, as a follow-up study, course syllabi and assigned readings, activities, and lecture content could be requested from instructors and analyzed to enhance the accuracy of the current study's findings.

Second, future studies should use other colleges and universities as sampling frames to explore the possibility that human trafficking courses have a stronger existence at other types of schools. Results from these studies could be compared to those of the current study. For example, an analysis of the top criminal justice and criminology graduate programs ranked by *U.S. News and World Report* or in journals may produce interesting results that may differ from this analysis. Also, a random sample of the undergraduate criminal justice programs listed by *CriminalJusticePrograms.com* could be used to generate findings more broadly generalizable at least to "criminal justice" degree programs. It would be informative as well to explore if human trafficking courses are taught in community and junior colleges.

Third, future research could also examine criminal justice education programs outside of academe. For example, it should be expected that professional training programs such as those of police academies are including human trafficking education, as police officers may frequently come into contact with victims and offenders of human trafficking (exploited youth and pimps for example). Also, conferences, seminars, and other brief programs offering training and continuing education to a variety of criminal justice and human services professional could be studied.

Conclusion.

Aside from being a human rights violation and a global social problem, human trafficking is a transnational crime that brings enormous profits to the criminals who prey on the most desperate and vulnerable persons. Human trafficking requires attention from criminology and criminal justice educators as they are in a special position to shape their students' perceptions of crime and ways to deal with it. By including courses on human trafficking in criminology and criminal justice curricula, undergraduate bachelor degree programs would prepare well-informed graduates who could look at the issue not only through the lens of law enforcement but also understand the social complexity of human trafficking. It is strongly recommended to incorporate courses dedicated primarily to human trafficking into the criminology and criminal justice curricula. By providing a fair assessment of the crime, criminology and criminal justice programs could eventually change public perceptions of the issues of human trafficking, poverty, migration, and prostitution for the better.

References

- Aronowitz, A. A. (2009). *Human trafficking, human misery: The global trade in human beings*. Westport, CT, London: Praeger.
- Babbie, E. (2011). *The basics of social research* (5th ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.
- Bales, K. (2007). *Ending slavery: how we free today's slaves*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Bales, K., & Lize, S. (2005). *Trafficking in persons in the United States: A report to the National Institute of Justice*. Oxford, MS: Croft Institute for International Studies, University of Mississippi. Retrieved from <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/211980.pdf>
- Bales, K., & Lize, S. (2007). Investigating human trafficking: Challenges, lessons learned, and best practices. *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*, 76(4), 24-32.
- Barone, T. (2003). The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000: defining the problem and creating a solution. *Temple International and Comparative Law Journal*, 17, 579-594.
- Bernat, F. P., & Zhilina, T. (2010). Human sex trafficking, the local becomes global. *Women & Criminal Justice*, 20(1/2), 2-9.
- Cannon, K. D., & Dirks-Linhorst, A. P. (2006). How will they understand if we don't teach them? The status of criminal justice education on gay and lesbian issues. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 17(2), 262-278.
- Chacon, J. M. (2010). Tensions and trade-offs: Protecting trafficking victims in the era of immigration enforcement. *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, 158(6), 1609-1653.
- CriminalJusticePrograms.com. (2011). Retrieved from <http://www.criminaljusticeprograms.com/>
- Department of Homeland Security. (2007). Combating modern-day slavery: reauthorization of anti-trafficking programs. Retrieved from <http://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/071031forman.pdf>
- Dragiewicz, M. (2008). Teaching about trafficking: Opportunities and challenges for critical engagement. *Feminist teacher*, 18(3), 185-201.

- Farrell, A., McDevitt, J., & Fahy, S. (2008). *Understanding and improving law enforcement responses to human trafficking*. Washington D.C.: National Institute of Justice.
- Farrell, A. (2009). State and local law enforcement responses to human trafficking: explaining why so few trafficking cases are identified in the United States. *Sociology of Crime, Law, and Deviance*, 13, 243-259.
- Frase, R. S. (2002). Victimless crime. In *Encyclopedia of Crime and Justice* (Vol. 4, pp. 1626-1629). New York, NY: Macmillan.
- Gozdziak, E. M., & Bump, M. N. (2008). Data and research on human trafficking: Bibliography of research-based literature. Retrieved from: <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/224392.pdf>
- Hernandez, M. B. (2010). Confronting human trafficking: Nongovernmental organizations and the U. S. anti-human trafficking approach. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). The Ohio State University, Columbus.
- International Labor Organization. (2008). *ILO action against trafficking in human beings*. Geneva: International Labor Office.
- Kooi, B., & Hinduja, S. (2008). Teaching security courses experientially. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 19(2), 290-307.
- Logan, T. K., Walker, R., & Hunt, G. (2009). Understanding human trafficking in the United States. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 10(1), 3-30.
- Myers, L. J., & Myers, L. B. (2002). Preparing for high technology crime: An educational assessment of criminal justice and criminology academic programs. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 13(2), 251-271.
- Natarajan, M. (2002). International criminal justice education: A note on curricular resources. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 13(2), 479-498.
- Picarelli, J. T. (2009). Enabling norms and human trafficking. In H. Friman (Ed.), *Crime and the global political economy* (pp. 85-101). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.
- Princeton Review. (2011). *The best 373 colleges, 2011 edition*. Princeton Review.
- Shirk, D., & Webber, A. (2004). Slavery without borders: Human trafficking in the U.S.-Mexican context. *Hemisphere Focus*, 7(5), 1-5.

- Shirk, D. A., & Webber, A. T. (2009). Human trafficking and protections for undocumented victims in the United States. In K. Staudt, T. Payan, & A. Kruszewski (Eds.), *Human rights along the U.S.-Mexico border: Gendered violence and insecurity* (pp. 168-182). Tucson, AZ: The University of Arizona Press.
- Situ, Y., & Emmons, D. (1996). Teaching environmental crime in a criminal justice curriculum. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 7(1), 147-154.
- Taylor and Francis Group. (2011). Journal Details: The *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*. Retrieved from <http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/titles/10511253.asp>
- Tiefenbrun, S. (2002). The saga of Susannah. A U.S. remedy for sex trafficking in women: The Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000. *Utah Law Review Society*, 107-175.
- Turner, K. B., Giacomassi, D., & Vandiver, M. (2006). Ignoring the past: Coverage of slavery and slave patrols in criminal justice texts. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 17(1), 181-195.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2000). United Nations Convention against transnational organized crime and the protocols thereto. Retrieved from <http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf>
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2010). Status of ratification. Retrieved from http://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en
- U.S. Attorney General. (2010). *Attorney General's annual report to Congress and assessment of U.S. Government activities to combat trafficking in persons: Fiscal Year 2009*. Washington D.C.: Department of Justice.
- U. S. Department of Health and Human Services. (2011). About human trafficking. Retrieved from <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/index.html#overview>
- U. S. Department of State. (2003). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2003/>
- U. S. Department of State. (2004). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2004/>

- U. S. Department of State. (2006). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2006/>
- U. S. Department of State. (2008). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2008/>
- U. S. Department of State. (2010). *Trafficking in persons report*. Washington, DC: Author. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2010/>
- U. S. Congress. (2000). Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/10492.pdf>
- U. S. News and World Report. (2011). Best colleges 2011: College rankings & lists. Retrieved from <http://colleges.usnews.rankingsandreviews.com/best-colleges>
- Weitzer, R. (2007). The social construction of sex trafficking: Ideology and institutionalization of a moral crusade. *Politics & Society*, 35(3), 447-475.
- Zhang, S. X. (2007). *Smuggling and trafficking in human beings: All roads lead to America*. Westport, CT: Praeger.

APPENDIX A
COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITITES REVIEWED

	University	Enrollment	City, State
1	University of Pennsylvania	19,311	Philadelphia, PA
2	University of California – Irvine	27,142	Irvine, CA
3	Pennsylvania State University	45,185	University Park, PA
4	University of Miami	15,629	Coral Gables, FL
5	George Washington University	25,061	Washington, D.C.
6	University of Florida	50,691	Gainesville, FL
7	Ohio State University	55,014	Columbus, OH
8	University of Georgia	34,885	Athens, GA
9	University of Maryland (College Park)	37,146	College Park, MD
10	Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey	37,364	Piscataway, NJ
11	Northeastern University	19,221	Boston, MA
12	Indiana University	42,347	Bloomington, IN
13	Marquette University	11,689	Milwaukee, WI
14	University of Delaware	20,374	Newark, DE
15	Michigan State University	47,278	East Lansing, MI
16	University of Alabama	28,699	Tuscaloosa, AL
17	Drexel University	16,916	Philadelphia, PA
18	St. Louis University	13,313	St. Louis, MO
19	University of Denver	11,644	Denver, CO
20	Iowa State University	27,945	Ames, IA
21	University of Richmond	3,513	Univ. of Richmond, VA
22	Stonehill College	2,468	Easton, MA
23	St. Anselm College	1,915	Manchester, NH
24	Lycoming College	1,373	Williamsport, PA
25	Simpson College	1,988	Indianola, IA
26	Roanoke College	2,044	Salem, VA
27	Guilford College	2,833	Greensboro, NC
28	University of Mount Union	2,193	Alliance, OH
29	Hastings College	1,104	Hastings, NE
30	Merrimack College	2,031	North Andover, MA
31	Albertus Magnus College	1,613	New Haven, CT
32	Brevard College	658	Brevard, NC
33	Cedar Crest College	1,685	Allentown, PA
34	Evangel University	1,735	Springfield, MO
35	Ferrum College	1,426	Ferrum, VA
36	Franklin Pierce University	1,892	Rindge, NH
37	Greensboro College	1,173	Greensboro, NC
38	Huston-Tillotson University	768	Austin, TX
39	Judson College	324	Marion, AL

40	Johnson C. Smith University	1,466	Charlotte, NC
41	Villanova University	7,201	Villanova, PA
42	College of New Jersey	6,237	Ewing, NJ
43	Rochester Institute of Technology	14,045	Rochester, NY
44	Quinnipiac University	5,971	Hamden, CT
45	Marist College	5,330	Poughkeepsie, NY
46	The Citadel	2,366	Charleston, SC
47	Loyola University New Orleans	2,764	New Orleans, LA
48	Appalachian State University	14,872	Boone, NC
49	Bellarmino University	2,417	Louisville, KY
50	University of North Carolina--Wilmington	11,197	Wilmington, NC
51	Butler University	3,726	Indianapolis, IN
52	Xavier University	4,228	Cincinnati, OH
53	Bradley University	5,061	Peoria, IL
54	John Carroll University	2,987	University Heights, OH
55	Hamline University	1,921	St. Paul, MN
56	Gonzaga University	4,729	Spokane, WA
57	Seattle University	4,306	Seattle, WA
58	California Lutheran University	2,352	Thousand Oaks, CA
59	St. Mary's University of San Antonio	2,372	San Antonio, TX
60	St. Edward's University	4,368	Austin, TX
61	Messiah College	2,766	Grantham, PA
62	Elizabethtown College	2,322	Elizabethtown, PA
63	Elmira College	1,359	Elmira, NY
64	Lebanon Valley College	1,747	Annaville, PA
65	Roger Williams University	4,269	Bristol, RI
66	High Point University	3,277	High Point, NC
67	Florida Southern College	1,911	Lakeland, FL
68	Coker College	658	Hartsville, SC
69	Alderson-Broaddus College	592	Philippi, WV
70	Elizabeth City State University	3,208	Elizabeth City, NC
71	Dordt College	1,328	Sioux Center, IA
72	Ohio Northern University	2,685	Ada, OH
73	Cedarville University	3,029	Cedarville, OH
74	College of the Ozarks	1,356	Point Lookout, MO
75	Carthage College	3,031	Kenosha, WI
76	Howard Payne University	1,217	Brownwood, TX
77	East Texas Baptist University	1,179	Marshall, TX
78	Northwestern Oklahoma State University	1,977	Alva, OK
79	Bacone College	1,021	Muskogee, OK

80	Southwestern Assemblies of God University	1,708	Waxahachie, TX
81	Claflin University	1,779	Orangeburg, SC
82	North Carolina Central University	6,441	Durham, NC
83	Florida A&M University	10,244	Tallahassee, FL
84	North Carolina A&T State University	8,955	Greensboro, NC
85	South Carolina State University	3,874	Orangeburg, SC
86	Jackson State University	6,805	Jackson, MS
87	Delaware State University	3,222	Dover, DE
88	Tennessee State University	6,827	Nashville, TN
89	Clark Atlanta University	3,202	Atlanta, GA
90	Alcorn State University	2,700	Alcorn State, MS
91	Virginia State University	4,871	Petersburg, VA
92	Lincoln University	2,035	Lincoln University, PA
93	University of Maryland--Eastern Shore	3,922	Princess Anne, MD
94	Fayetteville State University	5,586	Fayetteville, NC
95	Kentucky State University	2,638	Frankfort, KY
96	Grambling State University	4,538	Grambling, LA
97	Southern University and A&M College	10,300	Baton Rouge, LA
98	Albany State University	3,753	Albany, GA
99	Benedict College	2,984	Columbia, SC
100	Bethune-Cookman University	3,594	Daytona Beach, FL