Six Beginning Music Teachers' Music Teacher Role Identities

by

Michele Paynter Paise

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Musical Arts

Approved October 2010 by the
Graduate Supervisory Committee:

Margaret Schmidt, Chair
Jeffrey Bush
Sandra Stauffer
Jill Sullivan
David Schildkret

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

December 2010

ABSTRACT

In this study, I used a qualitative approach to explore the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after their student teaching experience. Data collection included participant-observation, interviews, and e-mail communication. Specifically, I looked at what each of these beginning music teachers discussed when describing themselves in the role of music teacher. These participants' music teacher role identities appeared to focus on four main components, while also remaining unique from one another. Those four components were: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. Further, the participants' role identities appeared to change from the period prior to student teaching through student teaching to the time after their student teaching experience. Based on data gleaned from the participants in this study, I created my own definition of music teacher role identity. This study's findings suggest further research using a longitudinal approach to explore the role identities of music teachers at various stages of their careers.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Completing a dissertation requires the support, love, and encouragement of many people. The following individuals have been an important part of the process: my husband John, who insisted that yes, I would finish the dissertation; my mother Kathleen and my father John, who both passed away before its completion, but always told me how proud they were of me and reminded me to "be a good kid;" my father-in-law John, who "always wanted a doctor in the family," and the many family members, spiritual fathers, and mentors who encouraged me, including Doreen, Darlene, Pam, Allen, Mike, John, Sam, Beth, Steve, Christopher, Cassidy, Haley, Hunter, Fr. Christopher Salamy, Fr. John Oliver, Kevin Scherer, Mr. Brad Collins, Dr. Farrell Coy, Barbara Stenger, Jay Stenger, Dr. James Pantle, Dr. Harlan Parker, Dr. Carolee Stewart, Dr. Nancy Boone-Allsbrook, Dr. Richard Miller, Dr. Gregory Gentry and Dr. Brook Larson.

I also wish to thank the members of my committee for offering their time and valuable suggestions toward the completion of this document: Dr. David Schildkret, Dr. Jeff Bush, Dr. Jill Sullivan, and Dr. Sandra Stauffer. I offer special, heartfelt thanks to Dr. Margaret Schmidt, my dissertation advisor. Without our Thursday afternoon telephone meetings, I might not have finished. Thank you, Dr. Schmidt, for inspiring me to think critically and trust my instincts.

I almost wish I hadn't gone down that rabbit hole—and yet—and yet—it's rather curious, you know, this sort of life! (Carroll, 1974, p. 34)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter One: Introduction

The Caterpillar and Alice looked at each other in silence: at last the Caterpillar took the hookah out of its mouth, and addressed her in a languid, sleepy voice. "Who are you?" said the Caterpillar. This was not an encouraging opening for a conversation. Alice replied rather shyly, "I-I hardly know, sir, just at present—at least I know who I *was* when I got up this morning, but I think I must have been changed several times since then." (Carroll, 1974, p. 43-44)

In Lewis Carroll's *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland*, the caterpillar asks Alice a simple question: Who are you? Alice, who has recently shrunk in stature and arrived in Wonderland, struggles to answer him. Fortunately, she eats a bite of mushroom and returns to her original size. After meeting a host of unusual characters, Alice awakens from a very long dream and once again knows who she is.

My story of becoming a teacher is not unlike Alice and what she initially experienced in Wonderland. Alice encountered familiar-looking characters who behaved in unfamiliar ways: a disappearing cat, a caterpillar who smoked, and a rabbit wearing a waistcoat while carrying a pocket watch. When I began teaching music, I encountered various recognizable "characters" as well, such as teachers, students, and administrators, but those characters did not always act according to my expectations. Like Alice when she arrived in Wonderland, I had moments of growth and times when I felt small and just not quite "myself." If I had been asked *who* I was, I would have had trouble answering. If only I could have just

eaten a mushroom or awakened from a dream to make sense of who I was, but then I might not have discovered my music teacher role identity.

For many years, I have wondered about the role identities of other beginning music teachers. Would they have been able to answer the caterpillar's question? How would they have answered it? Would their descriptions of themselves change in any way if the question had been asked at different points in the process of becoming a teacher? How might knowing some answers to these questions help music teacher educators better prepare those who are transitioning into teaching?

Statement of Purpose

This study has two main purposes. First, I examined what six beginning music teachers discussed while describing themselves in the role of music teacher prior to, during, and after student teaching. Further, I determined if and/or in what ways those descriptions of themselves changed over the course of a year. Three questions guided this investigation:

1. What do beginning music teachers discuss when describing themselves in the role of music teacher prior to, during and after student teaching?

2. Do their descriptions of themselves change?

3. If so, in what ways?

The second purpose of this study was to establish my own definition of "music teacher role identity," based on data that emerged from the participants. As I revisited what the beginning teachers each discussed about themselves in the role of teacher throughout the study, I sought to create a working definition.

Need for the Study

For several years now, the quality of teacher education has been "at the center of a national debate" (Nierman, Zeichner, & Hobbel, 2003, p. 821). National reform such as the No Child Left Behind act and the "Race to the Top" agenda hold educators and teacher educators responsible to ensure a quality education for all. To address these demands, some states have redesigned teacher education. The Tennessee Board of Regents recently developed a program called the Teaching Quality Initiative, which stresses a longer student teaching period for future teachers, enabling them to have more real-world experience. Those who designed the Teaching Quality Initiative believe that more authentic experiences in the classroom will improve the quality of teaching by preparing "teacher candidates so that they in turn have a positive impact on student performance from day one" (Tennessee Board of Regents, 2010). Missing from the policy, however, is asking these future teachers how they see themselves as teachers at the beginning of their careers, and then looking at how that information might also improve teaching.

> Teacher education or the much more mechanized phrase "teacher training" is usually focused on the future students of the preservice teacher, not on the development of the teacher him or herself. . . . This externally focused approach tends to assume that the teacher is already self-actualized, already emotionally and affectively prepared to assume the teacher identity, with few personal challenges left to face. (Alsup, 2006, pp. xiv-xv)

Alsup (2006) suggests that teacher education, and perhaps its reform, has been focused on future learners rather than future teachers and believes that a typical teacher education program ignores prospective teachers' role identities. This may not be the case, however, in all teacher education programs. Many teacher educators and researchers have examined both teacher identities and the process of becoming a teacher, or *socialization*. As Jorgensen (2008) points out, "becoming a teacher is a matter of beginning to think as if one is already a teacher" (p. x).

Socialization

Lortie (2002) defines socialization as "something that happens to people as they move through a series of structured experiences and internalize the subculture of the group" (p. 61). American teachers have had many experiences in the subculture of education, having "had sixteen continuous years of contact with teachers and professors" (p. 61). Lortie calls this an "apprenticeship of observation" (p. 61) and outlines two major limitations of this apprenticeship: the student can only see the teacher from her view as a student, and her understanding of the teacher's role is imaginary rather than real.

Woodford (2002) states that socialization into a career in music teaching happens in two phases: primary and secondary socialization. Primary socialization, the development of early understandings of teaching, takes place during one's childhood "and is effected through significant others, such as family members, teachers, or others with whom individuals identify emotionally" (p. 676). Secondary socialization occurs after childhood. This period begins once a

person has made a choice about career, such as enrolling in a particular university program. Although one might assume that secondary socialization would be most influential to an individual's music teacher role identity, "the most salient factors in the construction of music teacher identity occur through primary and not secondary socialization processes" (Woodford, 2002, citing Cox, 1997). Cox's (1997) findings are important because they suggest that the music teacher education program is not as influential as other factors in helping beginning teachers develop a role-identity. Other researchers support this view, acknowledging that music students come to the university already possessing teacher role identities which include both negative and positive ideas of what it means to be a teacher (Dolloff, 1999; Isbell, 2008; Knowles, 1992; Regelski, 2007; Samuel & Stephens, 2000). Therefore, it is no surprise that researchers have examined the period of secondary socialization for clues about how to help beginning teachers identify the teacher role identities that they developed during primary socialization.

Teacher Role Identity

Researchers have investigated the teacher role identities of preservice teachers prior to student teaching (e.g., Bernard, 2006; Brewer, 2009; Bouij, 2004; Dolloff, 1999; Isbell, 2008; Kerchner, 2003; Roberts, 1991, 2004; Regelski, 2007; Sumara & Luce-Kapler, 1996). Of great interest are the reasons individuals choose to become music teachers. These researchers have found that prospective teachers frequently choose music education as a career because they see teaching as a way to continue having positive musical experiences, they wish to be like a

respected teacher, they know they are accomplished musicians, they have a love for music and want to share it, or their parent was a music teacher.

Several things influence music teacher role identity during university coursework including family members, music education professors, ensemble directors (Isbell, 2008), past teachers, personal needs individuals had as a student (Dolloff, 1999), and life experiences (MacArthur, 2005; Sumara & Luce-Kapler, 1996). Prospective teachers may also be influenced by images of teaching found in various media or their "ideal" image of teaching (Dolloff, 1999; Sumara & Luce-Kapler, 1996). Further, performing in ensembles and interacting with both music education students and other music students are important experiences that influence beginning teachers' role identities (Isbell, 2008).

Although researchers have identified many things that influence music teacher identity, some researchers have found that music education students see the role of "performer" as superior to all other music-related occupations, and identify themselves more as musicians than music teachers (Bernard, 2005; Bouij, 2004; Roberts, 1991, 2004). This occurs because the context of the university music program supports a "musician" identity. Once these individuals begin teaching, however, support for their "musician" identity diminishes and they receive more support from those around them for a "teacher" identity (Roberts, 2004). There appears to be evidence that this struggle is ongoing (Bernard, 2005; Bouij, 2004; Roberts, 1991), since many music teachers continue to perform music outside of their classrooms and identify themselves with regard to the instrument they play, such as "clarinetist" (Roberts, 1991). In contrast, other

6

researchers believe there is too much stress on the conflict between "musician" and "teacher" identities (Bernard, 2004, 2005, 2007; Dawe, 2007; Dolloff, 2007; Regelski, 2007). They have identified alternative views of identity, such as looking at the whole person (Dawe, 2007; Dolloff, 2007), examining one's path to becoming a music teacher, and investigating the size of the school in which one teaches (Regelski, 2007). It is also important to see how music teacher role identity may be organized around "central axes," where individuals see themselves as possessing a chief identity with other, lesser identities surrounding it (Regelski, 2007).

While some researchers have looked at teacher role identities prior to student teaching, others have focused their studies on individuals while they were student teaching (e.g., Bullough, 1991; Deegan, 2008; Knowles, 1992; Samuel & Stephens, 2000). Sumara and Luce-Kapler (1996) looked at young teachers' development from the period prior to student teaching through student teaching. According to their findings, beginning teachers must negotiate at least three different teaching identities: the identities they bring with them to the university, the ones they establish while enrolled in the university program, and those that emerge during student teaching. While learning to teach, these individuals must also discard parts of their identity that do not coincide with their teacher role-identity and undergo a process the authors call "unbecoming" a teacher. Identity appears to develop quickly during student teaching and includes at least three competing forces: inertial, programmatic, and contextual (Samuel & Stephens, 2000). Inertial forces come from biographical experiences (Bullough,

7

1991; Knowles, 1992; Samuel & Stephens, 2000), whereas programmatic forces are those that result from experiences in the teacher education program (Bernard, 2006; Bouij, 2004; Bullough, 1991; Roberts, 1991, 2004; Samuel & Stephens, 2000). Contextual forces derive from changes in school culture both at the macro and micro-educational level (Bouij, 2007; Samuel & Stephens, 2000).

While student teaching, beginning teachers may see themselves as either conforming to an existing image of teaching or possessing freedom in creating their teacher role-identity, seeing their identity as being either inherited from existing ideals or re-fashioned (Deegan, 2008). When looking at past experiences, student teachers may look for confirmations about "what they assume to be true about themselves as teachers and about teaching. When this view of themselves and teaching proves faulty, as it often does during student teaching, beginning teachers face a difficult decision to accommodate to the situation" (Bullough, 1991, p. 48).

In addition to looking at teacher role identities prior to and during student teaching, researchers have examined the teacher role identities of music teachers once they are in charge of their own classrooms (e.g., Beijaard, Verloop, & Vermunt, 2000; Bernard, 2005; Cox, 1994, 2004; Dawe, 2007; Day & Leitch, 2001; MacArthur, 2005; MacLure, 1993; Weber & Mitchell, 1995). Beijaard, Verloop, and Vermunt (2000) found that music teachers' identities include a combination of three areas of expertise: subject matter, didactical, and pedagogical. Although most beginning teachers see themselves primarily as subject matter experts, their identity becomes more balanced as they gain

8

experience. MacLure (1993) found that teachers defined themselves in terms of what they were not, described a "spoiled" identity, and/or discussed what the author called a "subversive" identity. Indicators of a "spoiled identity" might be alienation from particular practices or values of the school, such as feeling undervalued by administration. A "subversive" identity is one where an individual might deny some aspect of their teacher identity, such as refusing to socialize with other teachers outside of school, because teachers are seen as "dull."

Other researchers have investigated factors that may influence a teacher's role-identity (Bernard, 2005; Cox, 2004; Dawe, 2007; Day & Leitch, 2001; Lortie, 2002; MacArthur, 2005; Regelski, 2007; Weber & Mitchell, 1995). Weber and Mitchell (1995) found that teachers' identities are influenced by cultural images of what it means to be a teacher. Those individuals who are of a race, social class, sexual orientation, or other background that does not coincide with the cultural ideal of teacher may find it difficult to consider "teacher" as part of their identity (Weber & Mitchell, 1995). Others have proposed that teacher role-identity is shaped by various experiences (Cox, 2004; Dawe, 2007; Day & Leitch, 2001; Lortie, 2002; MacArthur, 2005; Regelski, 2007), including music-making (Bernard, 2005). Bernard (2005) suggests that researchers might better understand music teacher role identity by examining professional discourse about music teachers and identity, characterizations of music making experiences, and the personal relevance of those music making experiences. It may also be important to consider the combination of beginning teachers' rational thoughts and emotional lives (Day & Leitch, 2001).

9

In a survey of teachers at various points in their careers, Cox (1994) examined the influences on music teacher role identities prior to college, during college, and after college. She looked at influences on both the role of musician and the role of music teacher. Those beginning teachers enrolled in college listed family, school music directors, private music teachers, and themselves as influential to the formation of their teacher role identities. In general, the study's participants listed a greater variety of influential persons as they progressed through various life-cycles. This was not a longitudinal study, however, as Cox examined teachers at many levels of their careers, rather than a group of teachers throughout their careers. Nonetheless, Cox found that the most significant early impact on a person's occupational identity concerned the role of musician, since it "was already substantiated by influential persons in the subjects' social environment before the time came to choose a major field in college" (p. 126).

Those who have researched teacher role-identity, and more specifically, music teacher role identity, have done so by looking at beginning teachers at particular points in their journey to becoming a teacher. Some have investigated those enrolled in teacher education programs, while others have narrowed their research to student teaching. Still others have examined the teacher role identities of established teachers in the field. Few scholars, however, have studied teacher role-identity over the course of a year. This study addresses that gap by examining the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers over the course of a year, including the time periods prior to student teaching, during student teaching, and after student teaching. It is my hope that, by gaining a better

understanding of who beginning teachers understand themselves to be, we might improve teacher education, and thereby improve the quality of teaching in our schools.

Definition of Terms

According to Roberts (2000), "many pieces of music education research which dabble within a sociological framework do so with a rather loose set of definitions" (p. 54). One reason is that researchers do not hold the same meanings for various sociological terms, such as "role" and "identity." Therefore, there is "a need for much greater precision" in using such terms (Regelski, 2007, p. 2). Terms that will be used throughout this study are defined below.

Role identity. McCall and Simmons (1966) define *role-identity* as "the character and the role that an individual devises for himself as an occupant of a particular social position. More intuitively, such a role-identity is his imaginative view of himself as he likes to think of himself being and acting as an occupant of that position" (pp. 67-68). More specifically, *teacher role-identity* is defined by Knowles (1992) as "the way in which individuals think about themselves as teachers—the images they have of self-as-teacher" (p. 99). In the initial stages of this study, I used these two definitions as a basis for what I intended to examine. As I began collecting data, however, I realized that these definitions might need to be altered, enhanced, or replaced by my own definition of music teacher role identity as it pertained to these six participants. This definition will be discussed further in chapter five.

11

Change. Saldaña suggests that, when describing change, the term "from-to" is limiting because it suggests beginning and ending points. The term "from-through," however, "implies a more temporal-based perspective that details the complexities of the journey" (p. 8). He says:

> Analyzing change requires at least two reference points through time, such as "then" and "now," 1996 and 1999, sophomore year and senior year. But a Point A-Point B longitudinal model or a before-and-after chart limits the ability to discern evolutionary processes. (Saldaña, 2003, p. 7)

In this study, the term "change" will be used to describe differences, whether subtle or major, within six individuals' music teacher role identities in the time periods prior to, during, and after student teaching. Further, the music teacher role identities as described in this study represent "a space of continual becoming rather than an endpoint culminating in a singular identity construction" (Alsup, 2006, p. 7).

Music student teaching. Music student teaching is a "specified time period when music education students are placed in an elementary or secondary school setting to work with a music teacher who helps them create and implement lesson plans, assess student learning, and master the administrative tasks that accompany being a music teacher" (Rideout & Feldman, 2002, p. 874). A music student teacher, therefore, is the "music education student" in the definition above. In this study, "student teaching" lasted a period of 16 weeks.

Cooperating teacher. Rideout and Feldman (2002, p. 874) cite Gallant (1992, 1994) in saying that student teachers observe and teach "under the

guidance of a cooperating teacher who serves as a role model and provides strategies for developing their professional skills." In this study, the student teachers did not always perceive their cooperating teachers as role models or providers of teaching strategies (Brewer, 2009). Therefore, for the purpose of this study, a cooperating teacher is understood to be a full-time music teacher in charge of the classroom where a music student teacher is placed during student teaching. This person may or may not serve as a role model, offer advice or suggestions to the music student teacher, or assist the music student teacher in any way. Those who do serve as role models or offer assistance do so to varying degrees.

University supervisor. For the purpose of this study, a university supervisor is a professor from the university where a music student teacher is enrolled, who has been assigned to observe, evaluate, and offer suggestions to the music student teacher.

Delimitations. The first purpose of this study was to examine what six beginning music teachers discussed when describing themselves in the role of music teacher and whether or not their descriptions of themselves changed. While I examined change in these individuals' music teacher role identities over the course of a year, this study does not address the cause(s) of that change or possible influences on their music teacher role identities. I used numerous data collection techniques, and included data from a variety of sources in the case studies in chapter four, however, when analyzing data I looked primarily at what each participant said or wrote about themselves, rather than the behaviors I

13

observed. My goal in doing this was to purposefully examine what they understood their music teacher role identity to be, rather than how others saw them. Further, I did not ask for others' perceptions of these individuals once they were teaching in their own classrooms.

The second purpose of this investigation was to determine a definition of "music teacher role identity." This definition is not meant to apply to all music teachers but is limited to the six beginning music teachers in this study, who were from a large university in the southwestern United States who student taught in spring semester 2006. These were student teachers whose specialty was choral and/or general music. This study did not include other student teachers from the same university whose expertise was instrumental music. Most of the data for this study were collected during the time period of January to December, 2006. Some artifacts and observations prior to January 2006 were also included.

Overview of the Dissertation

This dissertation is organized in six chapters. Chapter one introduces the study and outlines the purposes and research questions. Chapter two contains a review of literature divided into four categories: studies of teacher role identities prior to student teaching, studies of teacher role identities during student teaching, studies of teacher role identities after student teaching, and narratives of arts educators' identities. Chapter three outlines the method used in the study including data collection techniques and a brief description of the participants. Chapter four contains six separate case studies, one for each of the six participants. In chapter five, the data are analyzed in a way that addresses the

research questions. Finally, chapter six includes a discussion section and

recommendations for future practice and research.

Chapter Two: Literature Review

Introduction

"I didn't know that Cheshire cats always grinned; in fact, I didn't know

that cats *could* grin." "They all can," said the Duchess, "and most of 'em

do." "I don't know of any that do," Alice said very politely, feeling quite

pleased to have got into a conversation. "You don't know much," said the

Duchess, "and that's a fact." (Carroll, 1974, p. 61)

In this review of literature focusing on teacher identity, I explored the

terms "socialization" and "teacher role-identity." Then, I divided studies into four

large groups with the first three based on the time periods identified in my

research questions. I began with studies focusing on beginning teachers' identities

prior to student teaching. Next, I summarized studies that examined student

teachers' identities and, in the third section, I reviewed those studies that focus on

the identities of teachers after student teaching. The final section includes

personal narratives of arts educators' identities.

Socialization

As I began reading studies about beginning teachers entering the field of

education, I concentrated on studies pertaining to teacher socialization. According

to Lortie (2002), socialization is "something that happens to people as they move

through a series of structured experiences and internalize the subculture of the

group" (p. 61). For music teachers, this process takes place in two phases: primary

and secondary socialization (Woodford, 2002). Primary socialization occurs

during one's childhood and secondary socialization takes place once a person has made a choice about his or her career.

Although one might use terms such as "socialization" and "identity construction" synonymously, I soon found that the two terms hold very different meanings. After struggling with sociological terms himself, Roberts (2000) stated that socialization was "limited to a situated reality" but identity took place "within all social spheres" of an individual's life (p. 56).

Therefore the complex identity construction of any individual will be much more global than any single specific society in which that individual operates. Furthermore, one's identity does not necessarily totally conform to the socialization model nor accept all that is being "taught" socially. (p. 56)

Lortie (2002) called socialization an "apprenticeship of observation," saying that the "sixteen continuous years of contact" preservice teachers have had with other teachers and professors was limiting because the observations were seen from the student's point of view and the understanding of the teacher's role was imaginary rather than real (p. 61). After reading more about socialization, I realized that I was more interested in the identities of beginning music teachers, rather than the ways in which they were being socialized into the profession. Examining the literature on teacher identity, however, also presented challenges.

Teacher Role Identity

According to Roberts (2000), using sociological terms, such as "socialization" and "identity," is challenging because researchers in music

education hold different meanings for these terms, making it difficult to compare their use in various studies. Further, as sociologists have expanded and refined their knowledge, the meanings of these terms have often changed.

In 2004, Beijaard, Meijer, and Verloop reviewed literature concerning teachers' professional identities. They found that definitions of teacher identity in these studies were either varied or lacking, but determined that the concept of teacher identity in this literature shared four common characteristics. First, identity was seen as an ongoing process, rather than being stable or fixed. Next, professional identity in these studies concerned both a person and his or her context. Third, teacher identities consisted of sub-identities, which may or may not conflict with one another. These sub-identities related to teachers' different contexts and relationships and varied between being "broadly linked" or "more peripheral" with regard to his or her teacher identity (p. 122). Finally, teachers in these studies were actively involved in the process of their own professional identity development.

Based on their review of literature, the authors listed several problems they felt needed to be addressed in teacher identity research. First, "different concepts were used to indicate the same thing" (p. 126), and it was unclear how the concepts of "identity" and "self" were related. The literature also emphasized the personal side of identity formation rather than the professional teacher side. Finally, the authors felt that researchers should focus on the role context plays in one's identity and examine what it means for teachers to be "professional."

Identity studies of teachers prior to student teaching. While reading

studies concerning teacher identity, I found that some researchers focused on the

identities of prospective educators prior to their student teaching experience.

Isbell (2008) examined the socialization and occupational identity of 578

preservice music teachers enrolled in traditional teacher education programs. A

random sample of participants from 30 institutions completed a 128-item

questionnaire. Isbell reported his findings in two large categories: primary and

secondary socialization.

Primary socialization includes all experiences prior to enrolling in college

(Woodford, 2002). Once a music student enters the university, however, he or she

is "surrounded by a new set of social norms and expectations" (Isbell, 2008, p.

164). With regard to primary socialization, 37% of participants indicated that

school music teachers were most influential in encouraging their continued

activity in music, followed by parents (33%) and then private music instructors

(17%). Respondents not only indicated who influenced their decision to become a

music teacher, but also to what degree that person influenced them. All ratings

indicated a somewhat positive or very positive influence from all groups

influencing students before entering college. School music teachers had the most

positive influence, followed by parents, private instructors, friends, and siblings.

Participants also reported the influence of various teaching-related

experiences during primary socialization with regard to choosing to become a

music teacher. All experiences were viewed as either very positive or somewhat

positive. School concert performances, performing in the community and at music

festivals, leading sectional rehearsals, taking private lessons, conducting school ensembles, and teaching private lessons were all rated highly. Not all respondents indicated teaching experiences prior to college, however.

Isbell reported further findings from the period of secondary socialization, during the formal teacher education program. The preservice music teachers reported family members as most positively influential, along with music education faculty and ensemble directors. Mentor/cooperating teachers were rated lowest, although the subjects still reported them to have had a positive influence. Respondents rated all college performing and teaching experiences as either very positive influences or somewhat positive influences on their decision to continue studying music education. The most positively rated influences were performing in ensembles, interacting with other music education students, and interacting with other music students.

In addition to looking at primary and secondary socialization influences, Isbell asked participants to indicate the extent to which they identified as educators, teachers, music educators, music teachers, musicians, music performers, musical artists, and conductors using a 6-point Likert-type scale. They also indicated whether other people viewed them in the same way. Isbell conducted factor analysis on the responses and determined that a three-factor solution was most appropriate.

Using "simple bivariate correlations (Pearson's r)" (p. 172), Isbell examined links between socialization and occupational identity formation. He found stronger correlations between secondary socialization issues and

occupational identity than between primary socialization variables and identity. Using stepwise regression analysis, Isbell found that experiences during primary and secondary socialization significantly predict occupational identity, while influential people do not.

While Isbell found that participants pursuing a music education career were well supported in their decision, he admits that the study is biased in that it looked at only those who are already pursuing the career. It is possible that negative experiences during primary socialization may discourage individuals from entering the field. Isbell suggests that music teacher educators recognize that experiences during primary socialization are not nearly as influential as those experiences in secondary socialization and encourages music teacher educators to use dialogue in helping their students understand their identities. He suggests continued research and that looking at all music majors may reveal greater variations in occupational identity among music education majors and others.

Sumara and Luce-Kapler (1996) also examined the identities of teachers prior to student teaching. They found that beginning teachers must negotiate the identities they bring with them to the university, the ones they establish while enrolled in the university program, and those that emerge during student teaching. They explain that beginning teachers must learn to

> negotiate the dissonance between their pre-teaching lives and their lives as experienced teachers with a "fictive" identity. This fictive identity, like characters in literary fictions, is composed not only of elements of the

student teacher's already-experienced world of understanding, but also of the various cultural myths associated with the idea of "teacher." (p. 67)

Using John Dewey's *The Child and the Curriculum* (1902), the authors instructed their students to read and write responses to the text in the margins and between the lines of text. The goal was to have students "examine their evolving sense of identity as teachers" (p. 73); however, this did not occur. Realizing that they may have used an inappropriate text, Sumara and Luce-Kapler created a "writerly" text, a compilation of selections from a variety of published texts and quotes from research transcripts. After a public reading of this text, students were more willing to share their evolving identities. Further, the researchers found themselves emotional when sharing their own experiences of learning to teach. For these students, "learning to teach meant learning about oneself and, for many, it meant learning how to become someone else" (p. 79).

The authors believe that their "writerly" text was a useful tool to understand how the pre-teaching, "fictive," and lived teaching identities interacted while their students were learning to teach. Further, they realized that

> for many students, "becoming a teacher" entails not enriching their lives
> with a wider repertoire of abilities and insights, but, rather, discarding and
> excluding various identities and experiences that do not conform to the
> constricting cultural myths and practices. (p. 81)

Sumara and Luce-Kapler used the term "unbecoming a teacher" to describe the process many beginning teachers undergo while discarding those aspects of one's identity that do not align with being a teacher. They urge university teacher-

education programs to create opportunities for students to use a "writerly" text to "make explicit the various discursive practices and competing identities which converge as students learn to teach" (p. 81).

Dolloff (1999) summarized three of her studies that involved looking at the development of music teacher identity among students prior to student teaching. In the first study, she asked undergraduate and graduate students to write about "memorable experiences in music education settings" (p. 193). The teachers in these stories were often role models for students' images of self-as-teacher. Some images were also "composite," not representing specific teachers, but rather teachers in general (p. 195). Dolloff (1999) then asked the students to reread their stories and relate them to their own identities. To help facilitate the process, she asked the students to explain what the stories told them about the teacher they were, the teacher they would like to be, and the teacher they feared becoming.

Some students identified with the teacher in their stories while others "[built] theories of what music education looks like based on their own particular emotional needs as a learner" (p. 195). For example, "David" described trying to emulate his teacher, often using the same language to describe concepts, whereas "Susan" was careful to include leadership opportunities for her students based on her own experience with a lack of self esteem when asked to lead a prayer/song. "Elizabeth" spoke of being nurtured and challenged in one story and feeling fear and shame from a story about another music teacher. "Krista" told stories about the need to maintain classroom control, a concern of many beginning teachers. In

addition to our images of teachers from the past, Dolloff (1999) suggests that we hold images of teachers as portrayed in media, such as film, art, theater and other areas of popular culture. These images contribute to our overall idea of what it means to be a teacher.

In the second study, Dolloff (1999) engaged a graduate class of music education students to identify a metaphor for their identity as a teacher and then find an object or a picture that illustrated their metaphor. Students showed their picture and then explained why they made the choice. Dolloff (1999) tells us that metaphors are not always based on experience but were a way for these individuals to imagine what life could be like as teachers.

In the third study, Dolloff (1999) asked undergraduate students in their final year of elementary music education study to draw a picture of their "ideal" teacher. The drawings were in the same general style, but did not always contain the same qualities as the ideal teacher. Some of them drew ears as a sign of being a good listener, a smile as a symbol of being happy and welcoming, a heart showing compassion, and circles depicting a teacher that was rounded and centered. After drawing the ideal teacher, Dolloff had them draw themselves as teachers. Within this activity, Dolloff found evidence of a collective "ideal teacher." Some students drew pictures of teachers behind desks or with severe hair as they had seen as stereotypes or in real life.

Dolloff explained that there was a difference between the drawings of teachers with very little teaching experience and those of the graduate students, who had more teaching experience. Those with little experience drew ideal

teachers that looked much different from themselves, whereas those with more experience drew self-portraits of a teacher who lacked control due to a messy classroom or children who were out of control.

Dolloff cited Goodson (1992) in saying that writing stories helps prospective teachers remember the positive and negative roles models in their own educational background. Further, asking students to list metaphors can provide a tool for discovering what they think teaching is like. Finally, asking music education students to draw their ideal teacher and self-as-teacher provides hope for what music teaching could be. She suggests that further research is needed in linking role identity with pedagogy, classroom management, and teaching experience.

Roberts (1991) also examined the teacher identities of music education students prior to student teaching. Using qualitative methods of participant observation and interview, Roberts studied 108 music education students in five Canadian universities over a period of 36 months. He found that when the students first entered the music department, they saw themselves as accomplished musicians. They had excelled in high school and were "big fish" in a small "pond." As these students adjusted to the environment of the music school however, they reevaluated how they viewed themselves because they were now with other "big fish." It seemed important for each of the students in this study to establish and maintain a reputation as a musician, so that others would know who they were as individuals.

According to Roberts, the identity of "performer" was seen as superior within the music school. Even students who were not accomplished performers wished to be seen as such, perpetuating for themselves an "idealized" identity. When asked how they wanted to be compared with other students, they preferred comparisons based on musical skills and attributes rather than academic ones.

Roberts found that music education students, along with other music students often identified themselves by what instrument they played or their voice type, such as "trumpet" or "soprano." Although participants in this study identified themselves more as a "musician" than a "music teacher," Roberts found varying degrees of this identification among individuals. Students who did not view themselves as good performers preferred the label "musician." Others expressed that being involved with music was more important than being identified as a performer of a particular instrument.

In a later study, Roberts (2004) discussed the construction of musician and music teacher identities based on interviews with over 100 university music students and his own participant observation of college-level musicians. Seeing the world of university musicians as one that is isolated from the rest of the campus, Roberts described music majors as "insiders" often looking at those not involved with the music department as "outsiders." To Roberts, "insiders" are people with common interests. He explained, however, that "it is a well-established tenet that in homogeneous societies, differences in members are often stressed rather than commonalities" (p. 12-13). Therefore, some groups of musicians, such as music education students, are seen as "marginal insiders,"

based on their performance ability or declared major. According to Roberts, performance majors were seen as superior to all other students within the university music department. Therefore, all music students were constantly trying to maintain an identity of "performer" for fear they would be given the lesser, more generalized label of "musician."

Borrowing a term from sociology, Roberts describes the music education students in his study as *deviants* whose actions can be explained by the *labeling perspective*. This term from sociology refers to labels which have been assigned to particular members of a community. These labels have shared meanings, and members of the community will act and react based on their understanding of those labels. The students Roberts studied saw the label "musician" as an important part of their identities and preferred that over the label of "school music teacher." To them, the music education label carried a negative stigma, making the development of a music teacher identity "doomed from the start" (p. 35).

Roberts believes that once music education students enter professional life, their colleagues do not support their "musician" identities, but they do receive great support for their "teaching self." He describes these early years of teaching music as a war between the "teaching self" and the "musician self" and recommends that music education professors encourage students to "create firstly an identity as a teacher, who, secondly, happens to have, and teaches on the basis of, an extraordinary and highly developed musical skill" (p. 38).

Based on prior studies focused on the longitudinal development of music teachers, Bouij (2004) outlined two theoretical perspectives on the socialization of

student teachers to help explain his observations of music students prior to student teaching. The aim of his study was to investigate the competencies the individual was expected to master, the socio-cultural expectations of a person in a particular position, and what the individual considered desirable and/or suitable.

Grounding his position in symbolic interactionism, Bouij began with Reinharz's definition of socialization, calling it "the active creation of a new identity through a personal definition of the situation." He then turned to two related theories to discuss the socialization process as a way to understand music education students' development. First, he discussed McCall and Simmons'(1978) role-identity theory, which defines role-identity as "the character and the role that an individual devises for himself as an occupant of a particular social position." Second, he looked at Habermas' (1984) theory of communicative action.

Habermas' view of society includes two parts, the "life world" and a system. The life world consists of the everyday events and experiences of life and contains three components: culture, society, and personality. The individual must balance these three to understand and participate in cultural norms and values, while also maintaining an individual identity. The system is something that grew out of a need for effectiveness and order in social transactions. Both the "life world" and the system coexist in society, but it is through the "life world" that individuals create meaning.

Based on his analysis of Swedish preservice music teachers in earlier studies, Bouij created four role-identity categories: Musician/all-round musician, Performer, Pupil-centered teacher, Content-Centered Teacher. The four

categories are based on two larger categories of musician and teacher. Then, within those large categories, there is clarification of the "type" or "kind" of each of these roles.

Bouij suggests that many students in his studies accept music education as a second-best alternative, since the highest status in the music school is one of a performer. When a student's performance ability is insufficient, he or she may claim to be an all-round musician in order to self-preserve his or her status in the music program. Others in this same situation identify themselves as a teacher, but with a high-level musical ability, focusing on content, rather than pupils. Bouij claims that most students do not identify with pupil-centered teaching and those who do are most likely women. Once the participants in this study became teachers, a little more than half also worked as musicians on the side, suggesting that the struggle between musician identity and teacher identity for them was ongoing.

Bouij also describes what is happening with new teachers in terms of Habermas' theory. When these students enter the professional world, they are changing culture or "life world." They must adapt to the new "collectivity" of teachers, pupils, administrators and others in this culture. This new "life world" is highly contrasting to their previous one in the music school. Bouij feels that, by looking at the participants in this study through both Habermas' theory and role-identity theory, he is able to better understand music teacher socialization. He does not, however, offer suggestions for music teacher educators based on this research.

Brewer (2009) studied five preservice music teachers for a period of two years. He interviewed and observed participants and examined artifacts related to their teaching. Brewer (2009) found that the participants' conceptions of effective teaching were closely related to their music teacher role identities. Further, these role identities were based on participants' goals and their interaction with both their peers and other teachers.

Brewer (2009) created a theoretical model indicating what he found to be the three broad categories of the participants' role identities. These were personal skills and qualities, teaching skills and knowledge, and musical skills and knowledge. He suggests that these three categories form the contents of these individual's identities and overlap, creating a person's unique and individualized music teacher role identity.

In addition to discovering the three broad categories of preservice music teachers' role identities, Brewer (2009) found that a person's identity included the interaction between their own perceptions of self and the perceptions of others. He then created a more detailed model of music teacher role identity that included not only the three broad categories, but also accounted for the perceptions of self and other.

Summary. The studies in this section addressed identities of individuals prior to student teaching. Three studies focused on labels with which one identified him or herself, such as "musician," "content-centered teacher," or "music educator," (Bouij, 2004; Isbell, 2008; Roberts, 1991) while one (Dolloff, 1999) explored the images the individuals had of teachers, including possible

30

origins of those images. Isbell (2008) examined the people and experiences which were influential to these beginning teachers' identities, and Sumara and Luce-Kapler (1996) found that beginning teachers expanded their own self-knowledge and sometimes discarded parts of their identity when developing their teaching identity. Brewer (2009) discovered that the contents of preservice music teachers' identities included three broad categories and involve and interaction between self perceptions and the perceptions of others. These studies accounted for influences, images of teaching, the "labels" of identity, the contents of identity, and the gaining of self-knowledge. The next set of studies will examine the identities of individuals while they are student teaching.

Identity studies of teachers during student teaching. Many researchers are interested in the teacher identities of those in the midst of student teaching. Knowles (1992) studied the formation of beginning teachers' identities both prior to and during student teaching based on individuals' biographies. He defined the term *biography* as "those formative experiences of pre-service and beginning teachers which have influenced the ways in which they think about teaching and, subsequently, their actions in the classroom" (p. 99).

According to Knowles, *teacher role identity* is "the way in which individuals think about themselves as teachers—the images they have of self-as-teacher" (p. 99). In this article, he summarized three of his previous studies, which include five separate cases of student and beginning teachers.

In the first study, Knowles looked at three female student teachers, two of whom eventually became successful beginning teachers and one who failed in

student teaching. In another study, he examined a male student who was enrolled in an undergraduate, secondary internship program. In a third study, Knowles observed a female in an undergraduate, pre-service secondary teacher education program similar to those in the first study. The purpose of the studies was to examine the links between beginning teachers' biographies and their practices in the classroom, particularly to look at individual coping strategies. Specifically, Knowles desired to know how beginning teachers solved problems in the classroom and how their biographies related to or impacted their problem solving and coping strategies with those problems.

For Knowles, a *coping strategy* was a way that teachers manage difficult situations, whether consciously or subconsciously, and a *problem solving strategy* was a way individuals think about problems, the alternatives they might consider, and then the final decisions they make. He found that two of the participants had positive experiences in school and with their families and consequently, had strong teacher role identities. The two participants with weak teacher identities had had unstable family lives and/or poor teacher role models. The fifth participant had both negative and positive experiences in her background and developed a moderate to strong teacher role identity.

Based on his work, Knowles believes "personal biography seems to have profound effects on what occurs in the individual's classroom and the concept of teacher role identity is central for understanding the process by which prior experiences are transformed into classroom practice" (p. 126). He found that early childhood experiences, early teacher role models, and early teaching

experiences were crucial in the development of these teachers' role identities. Less important were significant people and experiences.

Knowles suggests that beginning teachers enter teacher education programs already possessing a sense of teacher role identity. This identity is based on their biography; experiences in new contexts will add to their biography in either positive or negative ways. He believes that the teacher education program will be most influential to those beginning teachers who possess a moderately strong teacher identity, and emphasizes that beginning teachers with strong positive teacher role identities are more able to cope with the difficult issues in teaching than those with weaker identities. He also suggests that those with very strong or very weak role identities tend to teach in the way in which they were taught.

Knowles used data from these cases to create two theoretical models to understand biography and identity. The first of the models is the Biographical Transformation Model. In this model, the experiences of childhood, teachers, and schools are interpreted by an individual, who gives them both *inherent* and *reflective* meanings. Inherent meanings are the meanings of an experience at the time that it happens, whereas reflective meanings are meanings something has once it has been analyzed. The actual analysis of an experience then becomes a *schema* for the individual. A schema is a way of understanding or resolving present and future situations, a cognitive filter, and a basis for future practices. As experiences continue, an individual develops a *framework for action*, which is how they will act in future events, such as encounters in the classroom. For

beginning teachers, these experiences, whether strong or weak, will help foster a strong or weak teacher role identity.

Knowles' second theoretical model is the Interaction between Biography and School Environment Model in which an identity evolves and is "wrapped in negative or positive orientations" (p. 143). If a person comes to student teaching with a negative teacher role identity and then has negative experiences in the school environment, he or she will continue to have a negative teacher role identity. This works the same way for those who come to teaching with a positive teacher role identity. Being careful not to oversimplify the issue, Knowles described a participant who had a positive teacher role identity during student teaching and had to take control of a chaotic environment in a new setting in order to maintain her positive teacher identity.

Knowles' studies involve the identities of beginning teachers both prior to and during student teaching, Deegan (2008) looked at 99 student teachers in primary teacher education programs in the Republic of Ireland. His aim was to examine ways these student teachers connected memories of childhood experiences with what they were currently experiencing.

For a period of twelve weeks, participants, who were mostly female ($n =$ 79), read two teacher-writer memoirs *The Master* by Bryan MacMahon and *Memoir* by John McGahern. Deegan created questions based on excerpts from these two readings, asking the participants to respond to questions once a week by writing in their journals. He then analyzed the writings and identified themes. Deegan found that "student teachers' identities were interrelated, dynamic and

complex processes, defined by a values orientation and operationalized by corresponding actions" (p. 188).

Deegan noticed that these processes could be represented by a four-fold scheme and a continuum, based on varying levels of conformity to existing ideals of "teacher" and freedom to create one's own identity as a teacher. The four-fold scheme includes individual freedom/elaborated identities, conformity/received identities, individual freedom/received identities, and conformity/elaborated identities. He defines received identities as those that are "given or inherited" based on tradition (p. 188) and elaborated identities as those that are re-fashioned. Elaborated identities are always active and dynamic, moving towards individual freedom, but received identities tend towards conformity, maintaining familiar ways of doing things. Deegan's study presents identity for student teachers as "contested terrain between individual freedom and conformity" (p. 194). He believes that a beginning teacher's past is part of decision-making while he or she is in the present moment.

Also interested in beginning teachers' pasts, Samuel and Stephens (2000) examined the contextualized self (Nias, 1985, 1989) of two South African student teachers. Specifically, they wished to understand the relationship between the participants' personal self, shaped by family and other experiences and their professional self, as shaped by the university.

This investigation came out of a larger study in which the authors studied how student teachers thought about the process of becoming English teachers. They collected data over the period of one year, which included written reflective

accounts of English teaching experiences, teachers' self and peer reports of professional performance, and the researchers' observations of lessons taught. Samuel and Stephens then composed a narrative account for each student teacher based on that data.

Samuel and Stephens addressed two key relationships in this study. The first was the relationship of self and identity and the second pertained to cultural context and professional environment. Self and identity relationships occur at the level of the individual whereas cultural context and professional environment relationships are at the level of the society in which an individual resides. According to Samuel and Stephens:

> The self can only attempt to define itself in relation to a host of other competing selves, which do not necessarily share the same fundamental principles, values, and beliefs. What constitutes a professional identity and a role is thus a "percolated" understanding and acceptance of a series of competing and sometimes contradictory values, behaviors, and attitudes, all of which are grounded in the life experiences of the self in formation. (p. 476)

The authors suggest that teacher educators can learn more about their students by looking at the identities students bring with them to the university. Much of this identity is formed in their early years and can include both positive and negative ideas about what it means to be a teacher. Identity develops in a quickly changing context and this process includes many competing components

that pull student teachers in different directions. Samuel and Stephens identify three main forces: inertial, programmatic, and contextual.

Inertial forces stem from an individual's biographical experiences and occur in one's home and schooling environments. Programmatic forces come from a university's teacher education curriculum, and contextual forces come from changing school policy and culture. The authors conclude by saying that it is important to ask the question, "What do we bring with us?" in addition to "Who are we?" and "What do we wish to become?" when examining teachers' developing identities. They suggest that researchers look at the time student teachers have to develop various concepts of themselves and teaching and how they are supported during the early stages of their career. They also feel that researchers should examine whether or not universities should challenge existing practices in schools and whose responsibility it is to help teachers develop. Finally, Samuel and Stephens suggest that researchers study student teachers' conceptions of their roles and identities as teachers and the nature and content of various experiences that will lead to reflection on these roles and identities.

Bullough (1991) asked a group of 15 student teachers enrolled in a student teaching seminar to write about their personal teaching metaphors. He then had them explore the similarities and differences between their metaphors and experiences. Although his initial study seemed worthwhile, Bullough believed that if he had asked students to compare their metaphors to their personal biographies or life experiences, they may have put forth more effort. With this in mind, he changed the study the following fall. This time he asked students to

identify events in their life that prompted them to become a teacher and then had them assign themselves a teaching metaphor. Bullough shared three examples from that study.

The first participant was a male in his middle 30's. His life story included his experiences with young people in nature. He described himself, metaphorically, as a husbandman of the young. Another student, a woman in her early 40's, called herself a devil's advocate. Her life story included experiences from school that, to her, were indifferent and mundane. A third student, a shy female in her early 20's, discussed her childhood experiences of playing school and being a tutor for others. She had many metaphors, but the most pronounced was that of a teacher as a butterfly.

The participants reexamined their metaphors every two to three weeks and just before they began student teaching. All three said their metaphors had remained intact, but were slightly elaborated. Once student teaching began, however, the two female student teachers struggled with teaching in a way that aligned with their metaphors. The woman who had called herself a "butterfly" found that she began acting in a role similar to her cooperating teacher and now saw herself as a "chameleon." The "devil's advocate" felt conflicted by large numbers of students, short class periods, and other contextual issues and began to see herself as a "character in someone else's play." She was also conflicted that the students and classes were not her own. Of the three teachers in this study, the male "husbandman" felt the most continuity between his teaching metaphor and what he was actually doing in the classroom. He discovered after listening to

audio tapes of his teaching, however, that he was more of an authoritarian in class than he wanted to be, and he vowed to change his behavior.

At the end of the teacher education program, all of the student teachers indicated that analyzing their teaching metaphors was important to their teaching development. The activity helped them to think about their role as a teacher, to not to be routine in their teaching, and to identify what sort of school would provide the best context to be the teachers they wanted to be. Bullough believes that the use of metaphor is a good tool, but that metaphor may encourage beginning teachers to have a narrow view of themselves. He says:

> Beginning teachers need to reach beyond self and engage in a broader consideration of the context of teaching and of schooling than is present in this article; self must be seen in relation to the identification and creation of conditions needed for professional development. (p. 49)

He also thinks it is important to look at how the one participant who had a strong self-concept found it difficult to realize it in the student teaching context. He chose to respond in a way that helped him preserve who he was as a teacher rather than conforming to a more conservative view of teaching. This made him look beyond himself and be more concerned with wider issues of education. Another participant, however, lacked a clear idea of herself as teacher and therefore might more readily comply with traditional practices. Bullough suggests it is important to help students like her build up their idea of teaching self. In summary, Bullough says:

Drawing on their past experience, they seek first and foremost

confirmation of what they assume to be true about themselves as teachers

and about teaching. When this view of themselves and teaching proves

faulty, as it often does during student teaching, beginning teachers face a

difficult decision to accommodate to the situation. (p. 48)

Summary. The studies in this section addressed the identities of beginning

teachers while student teaching. All of these studies related identities to

experience. Bullough (1991) had participants create metaphors and relate them to

prior experiences. Deegan (2008) asked individuals to write in journals to connect

their experiences in childhood with what they were experiencing while teaching.

Knowles (1992) found that experiences from childhood were critical in

developing role-identity and informing classroom practice. Samuel and Stephens

(2000) examined the relationship between participant's professional self, shaped

by the university, and their personal self, shaped by experiences in childhood.

They found that identity was formed in the participants' early years.

Although these studies are important for understanding the origin of

identities and how aspects of one's identity continues through student teaching,

these studies represent the teaching of various subjects and do not address some

of the specific issues that may confront those completing their student teaching in

the field of music. Neither do they include or account for changes to one's teacher

identity from the period prior to student teaching through student teaching. The

next section will address studies in teacher identity in the period after student

teaching.

Identity studies of teachers after student teaching. In addition to studying beginning teachers' identities prior to and during student teaching, some researchers study the identities of teachers at various points in their careers after student teaching. MacLure (1993) interviewed 69 teachers from 3 local education authorities to determine how they talked about identity while discussing their past, present, and future lives with regard to teaching. The participants "included teachers across all levels of the promotional structure and represented a broad spectrum of professional and biographical profiles in terms of age, experience, personal history, and domestic arrangements" (p. 313). MacLure found that these participants held varied meanings for labels such as "community" and "age," and often described themselves in terms of who or what they were not. For example, Yvonne defined herself in contrast to people she called "trendies" who dressed casually and used progressive teaching methods. Karen defined herself in contrast to colleagues in terms of where she lived, her age, and other qualities that were different from them. MacLure believes this is using identity

> as a form of argument—as devices for justifying, explaining and making sense of one's conduct, career, values, and circumstances. One way of making such claims is to assemble a list of categories that exemplify what one is not, in order to define oneself oppositionally, as the (virtuous) mirror image. (p. 316)

Many participants in this study talked about a "spoiled identity," which was evident in their descriptions of wanting to retire, feeling trapped in the job or feeling alienated at their schools. Finally, many teachers wanted to deny part of

41

their teacher identity. Those who did emphasized that they did not socialize with other teachers suggesting that teachers were dull. MacLure saw this as evidence of a "subversive identity" and stated that the teachers in this study seemed more varied in their sense of selves, less secure in their identity as teachers, and less anchored in seeing teaching as a career than previous studies have suggested. She suggested that this might be due to the increase in short-term or part-time contracts offered to teachers and the emphasis now placed on conduct outside the classroom, such as "reflection" for the reflective practitioner. Nonetheless, MacLure found "considerable unease amongst teachers about the restricted range of culturally endorsed professional identities available to them, and widespread resistance to the old iconographies of the dedicated career" (p. 320).

Beijaard, Verloop, and Vermunt (2000) administered questionnaires to 80 experienced secondary school teachers (male $n = 53$, female $n = 27$). All teachers had at least four years of experience and represented 12 secondary schools in the southwestern part of the Netherlands. The purpose of the study was to examine how teachers perceived themselves both currently and at the beginning of their careers, what influenced their perceptions, and what they thought were their most important learning experiences.

The questionnaire was composed of four parts. The first part included demographic questions and the second part asked participants to assign point values to various aspects of their identity and to write clarifications about why they assigned those particular point values. The third and fourth parts of the

questionnaire contained numerous statements concerning identity and asked participants to rate the degree to which they agreed with the statements.

The researchers analyzed data with both quantitative and qualitative techniques, using an item-total reliability test in addition to looking for themes in the teachers' clarifications of their perceptions. The data revealed that these teachers' identities contained a combination of three areas of expertise: subject matter expert, pedagogical expert, and didactical expert. Most of the teachers in this study saw themselves as subject matter and didactical experts rather than pedagogical experts.

Sixty-nine percent of the participants indicated that there had been a change in their perceptions of their professional identity since they were beginning teachers. The data revealed a significant difference in this area (Lambda = 0.0004) with beginning teachers seeing themselves mostly as subject-matter experts. As these teachers' careers continued, their professional identities became more balanced. The authors admit that it is not possible to draw conclusions from this data and suggest that future research be done regarding how experiences might influence a teachers' professional identity.

Day and Leitch (2001) studied the personal histories of 39 beginning teachers enrolled in two-year master's degree programs in universities in England ($n = 20$) and North Ireland ($n = 10$). They asked two key questions;

1. How is the professional self of the teacher affected by personal histories?

2. Can in-service courses assist teachers in adding self-knowledge as a means of increasing understandings of the ways in which emotion as well as cognition affect their teaching lives? (p. 404)

The researchers asked the participants at the university in England to write autobiographical accounts that linked their personal lives with their professional lives. In addition, they asked those enrolled in the university in North Ireland to look at the relationship between their inner selves and social selves with regard to teaching by making masks to wear. Although the two groups were engaged in different activities, the focus of both groups was to look for what the authors called "tensions within and between four interconnecting areas of teachers' lives: the cognitive-emotional and the personal-professional" (p. 401).

The two modules used in this study produced different types of results. The autobiographical exercise of the students from England helped participants become more aware of how their personal life affected their professional life. The mask-making exercise of those in North Ireland allowed the participants to look at emotions in a highly intense way, enabling them to confront long held emotions by re-experiencing them. Day and Leitch believe there are two ways to know and understand: rational and emotional. They feel it is important for teacher educators to see the emotional way of knowing as important.

It is through our emotional world that we develop our personal constructs and learning of outer reality and make sense of our relationships and eventually our place in the wider world. (p. 406)

44

Weber and Mitchell (1995) described two studies where they asked teachers and students to draw pictures in order to investigate how they perceived teachers. Specifically, they examined how children drew teachers and how teachers drew themselves. When participating teachers were asked to reflect and discuss their drawings, they said they had become aware of their past experiences and stereotypes of teaching. Through discussion, the teachers in this study also became aware of their own teaching identities. Some drew pictures that challenged traditional stereotypes of teaching while others drew the teacher that they wished to become.

The children's drawings showed a marked contrast with those of the teachers' drawings. One group of first grade students' drawings represented the highest percentage of non-stereotypical teachers and faces that appeared happy. The teachers were beside, rather than in front of children, and were drawn similar in size to the students. A visit to these students' classrooms revealed that the drawings reflected their personal experiences in the classrooms. Weber and Mitchell suggest that the children's and teachers' drawings not only reflected long-held views of teachers but also of actual experiences with teachers:

> Perhaps we need to face more explicitly the probability that ambiguity, and multiple, even seemingly contradictory images are integral to the form and substance of our self-identities as teachers. By studying images and probing their influence, teachers could play a more conscious and effective role in shaping their own and society's perceptions of teachers and their work. (p. 32)

In another study, Weber and Mitchell (1995) asked students and teachers to draw images of teachers and then had them write comments on the back of their drawings. Nearly all drew pictures of female teachers, but the boys' and girls' drawings were different from each other. Girls' drawings contained elaborate details done in pink, purple, yellow, and green colors. The boys' drawings were less detailed and contained darker colors. Some of the boys' drawings showed teachers as male figures dressed in women's clothing or depicted women with breasts. The researchers understood the differences in boys' and girls' drawings to mean that the boys in this study viewed teaching as a feminine activity. They further explain that the girls' drawings suggested a physical and emotional connection to the teachers whereas the boys' drawings depicted competition and conflict. The authors believe that the boys' drawings reflect "a disdain, an unconscious belittling of a profession and identity that is female, and obviously 'not theirs'" (p. 41).

Some of the girls in this study wrote about their own desires to become teachers one day while others explained their drawings from the teacher's point of view. The authors suggest that young girls have already integrated the image of teacher into their own identities and that young boys have already associated the image of teacher as a feminine identity. They continue by saying:

> Further, given that the development of identity during adolescence often involves a rebellion against authority figures, the opportunity for males to identify positively with teachers seem few, in comparison to girls who have at least the first twelve years of their lives. (p. 43)

Among the teachers who drew images of teachers, most drew females. One male, who admitted to thinking of teachers as females, purposely drew a male teacher to counteract the stereotype. Those who drew females drew them wearing long skirts with hair pulled back, representing traditional images of teachers. Other themes in the drawings included the teacher as a person who maintains control, the teacher as an organizer, and a teacher who points the way of learning for the students.

Cox (1994) examined "influential persons" in the professional socialization of music teachers as musicians and educators. Specifically she sought to determine who had most influenced the participants in their pre-college, college, and post-college years with regard to their roles as musicians and educators. She also examined relationships between gender and teaching specialization.

Based on interviews and a questionnaire, data from a pilot study suggested that socialization toward the role of music educator was a lifelong process. Further, Cox found that few people had encouraged the participants to begin thinking of themselves as teachers during their childhood and pre-college years.

Cox used a stratified random sample of all music teachers in the state of Arkansas (N = 500): 180 elementary specialists, 170 band directors, 140 choral directors, and 8 orchestra directors. The sample included 255 females and 245 males. Cox mailed the questionnaires and received 310 usable responses. She then conducted telephone interviews with 50 teachers who had returned their questionnaires to verify data documented on the questionnaire.

Concerning their pre-college years, more than half of the subjects in this study listed their mother as influential concerning their involvement with music in childhood; fathers, grandparents, siblings, and other relatives were also influential. Half of the subjects reported having one parent who was a musician. Aside from family, subjects listed school music directors, private music teachers, and their own selves as being influential in their roles as musicians in childhood. In contrast to influences on their role as musicians, participants reported fewer influences on their role as teacher in pre-college years; family members, music educators, school music directors, and private music teachers were listed.

During college years, the males in this study most often listed themselves or a school ensemble director as most influential whereas females listed both of those as well as a private music teacher. Female vocalists also reported their mother more frequently than school music teachers as influential in their role of musician.

Subjects identified family as influential in their roles as teachers in college, but not as frequently as in pre-college years. School music directors, private music teachers, and self were also listed as influential to the role of teaching. Mothers and fathers continued to be frequently cited during post-college years, but the other categories were also added during this life period; siblings, other directors, music teachers, other classroom teachers, and administrators were identified as important, especially with regard to the teaching role.

A Wilcoxon test revealed significant differences in the number of influential people for the role of teacher across the various life phases. Subjects

48

indicated more people who had influenced them with regard to teaching during college and after college than they did for pre-college years. There were no significant differences for the number of influential persons for the role of musician throughout the various life-cycle phases. Cox found significant differences in the number of influential persons concerning the role of musician versus the role of teacher during pre-college years for males. Males reported more influential people for the role of musician during childhood and adolescence than for the role of teacher. This was also true for females during childhood, but there were no significant differences in numbers of influential people for the role of musician and teacher for females during adolescence. In general, subjects listed a greater variety of influential persons as they progressed through various life cycles.

Cox believes that the most significant early impact on these subjects' identities as teachers concerned their identities as musicians:

The evidence from the present investigation suggests that identity as a musician was already substantiated by influential persons in the subjects' social environment before the time came to choose a major field in college. (p. 126)

She recommends that more investigations be done concerning the childhood years of music educators. Researchers should also examine music educators who left the profession and discover how their socialization process was different from those who remained music teachers. Other areas to investigate include individuals' social environments, gender issues related to music teacher

socialization, and the continued socialization of music teachers in their post-college years.

Also interested in the identities of music teachers, Bernard (2004) studied six elementary general music teachers who were also music performers. The participants, who ranged in age from their later 20's to late 50's, had between 5 and 25 years of experience in music performance and between 3 and 25 years of elementary classroom music teaching experience.

Bernard asked participants to tell her how they came to be music teachers and musicians and encouraged them to tell her about their teaching and their music. From their responses, she "juxtaposed their discussions of their music making and their music teaching and made comparisons between them" (p. 287), revealing the tensions the participants described between their music teaching and music making.

Bernard found that these participants adapted to music making and music teaching in one of three ways: as two separate roles, as two activities approached in the same way, and as two activities providing particular experiences. Although two of the participants in this study experienced the tension between the roles of musician and music teacher described in previous research, Bernard argues that the other participants in this study did not. She suggests that these findings might be helpful to music teacher educators who desire a greater understanding of the identities of music teachers.

A year later, in "Making Music, Making Selves: A Call for Reframing Music Teacher Education," Bernard (2005) admits feeling anxiety about

introducing herself to a group of people in a particular context because she sees herself as more than just a music educator or musician. Seeing identities as constantly evolving, she likens her views about identity with those of social constructionists, who suggest that identity is constructed primarily through social interactions. Bernard goes beyond this definition, however, suggesting that identity is also constructed through discourse, personal associations, meaning, and experience. Bernard feels that we might understand music teacher identity by examining professional discourse about the subject, characterizations of music making experiences, and personal relevance of those music making experiences. She believes that those three elements interact in a way that is non-hierarchical, non-sequenced, and different for each music teacher.

Bernard's article prompted responses from four researchers who were concerned by her interpretation of the literature and the current state of music teacher education in universities. The editors of *Action, Criticism, & Theory for Music Education* devoted a 2007 issue to those responses discussing issues of music teacher identity, in which Bouij, Dolloff, Regelski, and Stephens addressed four main points made by Bernard.

First, they felt Bernard had misinterpreted the music teacher identity literature. Second, they felt she poorly portrayed the field of music teacher education. In addition, they suggested that Bernard might have implied that her view was correct, while others were not. Finally, the authors criticized the quality of research Bernard did for the 2005 article.

Bernard (2007) wrote a response to these authors addressing the four key points they made about her earlier article. First, she explained that she continues to believe that the existing literature discusses the musician and teacher identities as opposing forces. She then cites literature that supports her statement suggesting that the use of the words "conflict" and "war" in this literature shows that there is still a battle between the two identities.

Next, Bernard addressed the criticism that she poorly portrayed the values of music teacher education by suggesting that the socialization of musicians into teachers is its primary goal. Bernard admits that her statements were strong and confesses that, if she were to do it over, she would have phrased her ideas differently. She includes a revision in this article, which is less harsh and suggests that some music teacher educators may unwittingly communicate a message that teaching is more important than musicianship. She admits that she read the language of the literature incorrectly and would have benefited from scholarly discussion. She still feels, however, that many music teacher educators fail to recognize preservice teachers' musician identities and place more emphasis on teacher identities.

The third point Bernard addresses is the authors who suggested that she believes her perspective is the only correct one. She states that her goal was to broaden the discussion of identity to include affirmation of students' musician identities as part of their teacher identities, not to claim the only right viewpoint.

Finally, Bernard discussed the doubts that authors had about her original study. She referred the readers to her original study, her dissertation, and asks

them to read it before critiquing both the conceptual content and the methodology. The examples from that study used in "Making Music, Making Selves" were included not to present the study, but to support her framework concerning the musician and teacher identity. Bernard concluded this article saying she looked "forward to the continued interaction among a wide range of vantage points on these issues as more research—by these and other scholars—becomes available" (p. 12).

Summary. This section covers a broader variety of topics concerning music teacher identity. Topics in this section include using identity to define the self in terms of what one is not (MacClure, 1993), how one approaches music teaching versus music making (Bernard, 2004), and the use of drawings to determine the images one holds of teachers (Weber & Mitchell, 1995). Day and Leitch (2001) studied how one's personal history affected his or her professional self. Other researchers (Beijaard, Verloop, & Vermunt, 2000; Cox, 1994) looked for differences concerning aspects of identity over different periods of time. Beijaard, Verloop, and Vermunt (2000) examined how individuals perceived themselves as subject matter, didactical, or pedagogical experts both currently and early in their teaching careers. Cox (1994) investigated who had influenced participants' identities in their pre-college, college, and post-college years. Bernard's (2004) study was unique in that she sought to determine if music teachers approached music making and music teaching in different ways. Her 2005 study made it apparent that there is still much research to be done in the field of music teacher identity, including finding a definition of the term

53

"identity" that will encompass the many areas that are in need of study. The final section of this literature review includes personal narratives of arts educators as they describe their identity in their own words.

Narratives of arts educators' identities. In addition to studies in which researchers examine others' teacher identities, individuals have written personal narratives about their own identities as arts educators. In a 2004 article, Cox described a 15-year dialogue with herself using knowledge of the symbolic interactionist framework. She began by discussing the traditional ways in which genders were defined in her childhood and described her distaste for popular styles of music that developed as a result of her violin study during her adolescent years.

As Cox began to develop her social role as music educator, she experienced conflict between her childhood experiences and those she was living as a music educator. Many of these conflicts were resolved, but not without feelings of grief and profound loss. She learned a new tolerance for others and became more aware of the social roles of her students. Her story is an important one in understanding the larger picture of teacher identity struggles and socialization.

Dawe (2007) also described her personal story of struggle while developing her music teacher role identity: how others addressed her. When teaching at the intermediate level, other teachers addressed her as "Ms. Dawe;" however, at the elementary level, teachers referred to her as "the music teacher." After reading much of the literature on music teacher identity, Dawe said she was

concerned that the literature is too focused on the conflict between musician identity and teacher identity. She believes that researchers should look at the whole person when studying music teacher identity.

MacArthur (2005) described her story of developing a music teacher role identity. Early in her career, she based her identity on achievement, seeing teaching as "a game" to be won. Her identity as a teacher was fragile and dependent upon her success and a need to be liked. She had a preconceived idea of what a teacher looked like and remembers carrying a briefcase and purchasing an outfit in an attempt to "play" the role of teacher. While taking a one-year leave of absence to pursue a master's degree, MacArthur began to reflect on her past experiences and learn more about herself. She developed a teaching philosophy that moved her focus away from herself and toward her students. When she returned to teaching, MacArthur found herself not only a music teacher, but also a homeroom teacher. Seeing herself now as a teacher and not solely a music teacher affected her identity as a teacher. She became more focused on the relationships she had with her students. MacArthur believes that her identity was shaped by her life experiences.

Personal narratives are not unique to music teachers, occurring in art education literature as well. Anderson (1981) struggled with her identity as a "professional artist" and a "professional teacher of art." She said, "The preconceived notion that the art educator must conform and identify with only one of these fields or professions, only lays the foundation for creative, intellectual, personal, and professional stagnation" (p. 45).

Anderson believes that the roles of artist and art teacher are not separate, "but there is a great deal of interdisciplinary fusion" (p. 45). She thinks artists are concerned with an end-product, expressing themselves through a particular medium, but art teachers are primarily concerned with learning. They must be fluent in their methods and knowledge and able to communicate the significance of art to their students. Anderson feels that it is not important whether art educators identify as an "artist" or "art teacher," but that they "strive for professional excellence in all areas of art education" (p. 46).

Ball (1990), a public school art teacher, wrestled with a question that was asked of her by one of her students: Have you always wanted to be an art teacher? Attempting to answer her student's question, she explained that the answer was "yes and no." Teaching for her is hard work, both joyful and painful and full of both despair and delight. She often feels a battle between the artist and teacher within her and admits to trying to "protect" the artist. Although she feels that teaching has made her able to analyze art more easily, Ball is not sure if she will survive being an "artist teacher." She doesn't want to lose her identity of artist. For her, teaching is full of ambiguity.

> My life is not unlike the artwork, changing as I interact anew with my students and my own artwork. With each moment, I evolve as an artist teacher—sometimes being more one than the other. It is my hope that I can maintain a balance between the artist and the teacher so that both can flourish within me. (p. 59)

McIntosh (2000), an elementary art teacher in Wyoming, tells a story of an art professor who told him that his art would suffer if he chose to teach in public schools. Although he believed that advice at first, when he became a substitute teacher, he discovered that he loved teaching. A teacher for eleven years, McIntosh now pursues his painting in the evening, after school is finished. He acknowledges that painting while also being a teacher is difficult but he believes his painting can inform what he does in the classroom.

Summary. These narratives address several themes concerning teacher identity. First, two of these teachers believed their identities were based on life experiences (Cox, 2004; MacArthur, 2005). Dawe (2007) considered more specific aspects of her identity, such as how she was addressed by students and colleagues. Ball (1990) saw being an artist and an art teacher as a battle and was worried that the "artist" would lose, whereas Anderson (1981) and McIntosh (2000) believed their art "fused" with and informed their teaching.

Chapter Summary

Absent from the studies throughout this literature review are studies of what beginning music teachers talk about when describing themselves in the role of music teacher prior to, during, and after student teaching. As stated at the beginning of this chapter, the purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching. In particular, it was my goal to investigate what six beginning music teachers discussed when describing themselves in the role of music teacher. I also wanted to examine if their music teacher role identities changed over the

57

period of one year, and if so, in what ways. A second purpose of this study was to create my own definition of "music teacher role identity." The next chapter outlines the method used for this study.

Chapter Three: Methodology

Introduction

They were indeed a queer-looking party that assembled on the bank—the

birds with draggled feathers, the animals with their fur clinging close to

them, and all dripping wet, cross, and uncomfortable. The first question of

course was, how to get dry again; they had a consultation about this, and

after a few minutes it seemed quite natural to Alice to find herself talking

familiarly with them, as if she had known them all her life. (Carroll, 1974,

p. 22-23)

One purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities

of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching using a

qualitative research methodology. Three questions guided this study:

1. What are the music teacher role identities of beginning music teachers

   prior to student teaching?

2. Do these music teacher role identities change during and after student

   teaching?

3. If so, in what ways do they change?

Qualitative researchers operate within an *interpretivist* paradigm, seeing

reality as "socially constructed, complex, and ever changing" (Glesne, p. 5). They

act as the main research instrument by interacting with and observing participants

in multiple ways. By spending a long period of time in the field and analyzing

data, they are able to provide detailed accounts to the audience. There are many

varieties of these accounts. One variety is the case study.

Research Design

A case study is "an exploration of a 'bounded system' or a case (or multiple cases) over time through detailed, in-depth data collection involving multiple sources of information rich in context" (Creswell, 1998, p. 61). A case can be a program, event, activity, or individual and may be studied within one site or across multiple sites. When more than one case is examined, the result is a *collective* case study. The focus of this dissertation is to look at the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers, whether those music teacher role identities change during and after student teaching, and if so, how they change. Since I wanted to examine more than one person and look for possible change over the period of a year, I chose a collective case study as the design for this investigation.

In January, 2006, I asked six music student teachers who were enrolled in the Music Education program at a large university in the southwestern United States to be a part of a one-year study that focused on the time prior to student teaching, during student teaching, and the semester after student teaching. All six would be student teaching in a choral or elementary general music classroom. Descriptions of the participants, data collection procedures, and data analysis follow.

The Participants

The music teacher education program at the university has three tracks: instrumental, strings, and vocal/general music. The program serves both undergraduate students seeking bachelor's degrees in music education, as well as

60

individuals who have already earned a bachelor's degree and seek teacher certification. In spring 2006, 18 students enrolled in student teaching in the university music education program. I limited this study to the six participants in the vocal/general track: Gia, Chad, Diedra, Melanie, Christine, and Veronica.

The beginning music teachers. Of the six participants, five were female and one was male. Two of the participants were single, three were married, and one was engaged at the beginning of the study but married by the end. Gia was a 38-year-old mother of three children under age five. The other participants were in their early twenties. Diedra, Christine, and Gia were completing their degrees in music education. Chad was pursuing a degree in vocal performance as well as music education. Melanie and Veronica held degrees in vocal performance and were completing a post-baccalaureate program in music education while concurrently enrolled in Master's degree studies. After completing student teaching, five of the participants accepted teaching positions. Gia and Diedra also applied to the Master's program in Music Education. Diedra began coursework in the summer of 2006. Chad chose not to teach in the semester after graduation.

Cooperating teachers. In addition to the six primary participants in this study, I collected data from other informed individuals. Each participant worked with two cooperating teachers while student teaching. When possible, I read written evaluations of the participants from these individuals and observed them interacting with the participants. At the end of student teaching, I sent an email containing questions to each of the cooperating teachers, provided my phone number, and gave them the choice to answer the questions in person or via e-mail.

61

Four of the 12 cooperating teachers responded to my e-mail. Chad's cooperating teacher at his high school placement answered questions via e-mail, but the teacher at his middle school placement did not respond to my request. Both of Christine's cooperating teachers chose to answer via e-mail, but only one of Gia's teachers did. Neither of Veronica's, Melanie's, or Diedra's cooperating teachers responded to my request.

University professors. The participants' university professors also provided a great deal of information for this study. I interviewed Dr. Byrd, an associate professor of music education, Dr. Gilley, an assistant professor who directed some of the university's choral ensembles, and Dr. Langston, who taught choral methods and coordinated student teaching placements. When conducting these interviews, I used a standard set of questions (Appendix A). I also collected information from Dr. Stewart, a professor in music education and specialist in elementary general music. Both Dr. Stewart and Dr. Langston acted as university supervisors during student teaching for the six participants in the study. Dr. Stewart taught all the participants in their elementary music methods class, and observed them in their elementary placements. Dr. Langston observed the student teachers in their secondary school choral placements. Further, Dr. Stewart and Dr. Byrd provided me with artifacts, such as archived emails, lesson plans, and graded materials from participants who had been enrolled in their music education methods courses.

Informed others. One administrator provided insight for the study. Justine, the assistant principal at the school where Melanie served as a long-term

substitute music teacher after completing student teaching, agreed to answer

questions in the form of a telephone interview. On a more informal basis, I

obtained information from some of the participant's peers, co-workers, students,

parents of their students, and from their public profiles on social networking sites.

Data Collection

I began collecting data at the first formal meeting of student teachers for

the six participants in this study, which occurred in January 2006. I continued to

collect data through the first semester after their student teaching, concluding in

December 2006.

As the study began, I approached the professors who taught methods

courses and asked them if they had kept any of the assignments these participants

had completed while enrolled in their courses. They presented me with various

artifacts including journal entries and statements of the participants' teaching

philosophies. Some information about the period prior to student teaching was

also learned through interviews with the participants. The participants in this

study each had two separate placements during student teaching. Chad and

Veronica's student teaching placements were at a high school for the first half of

the semester and a junior high or middle school for the second half of the

semester. Christine also completed her student teaching at a high school and a

junior high school, but her placements worked differently. For the first half of the

semester, she student taught full time at the high school. During the second half of

the semester, she completed her student teaching at the high school two days a

week and at the junior high school for three days a week. At the high schools,

Chad, Veronica, and Christine taught choral music and at the junior high schools they taught choral music and general music courses. In the semester following student teaching, Chad chose not to teach and pursued a performance career. Veronica accepted a position as a middle school choral music educator and Christine taught general music to students in grades four through eight.

Diedra and Melanie's student teaching placements were at a high school and an elementary school. Diedra completed her student teaching at the high school during the first half of the semester and at the elementary school for the second half of the semester. Melanie student taught at the high school in the morning and the elementary school in the afternoon throughout the entire semester. After graduation, Diedra accepted a position in a small school district, where she served as a choral music educator and taught general music to both junior high and high school students. After graduation, Melanie taught general music as a long-term substitute teacher at two middle schools and then accepted a position teaching elementary general music.

Gia's student teaching placements were at a junior high school and an elementary school. At the junior high school, she led choral warm ups and accompanied the choir. At the elementary school, she taught general music to students in grades K-5. After graduation, Gia accepted a part-time position teaching general music at an elementary school. She served as a substitute teacher on the days she did not teach music.

Observations. At the beginning of the study, all participants gave me permission to observe, videotape, and follow their professional life for the period

of one year. I observed all of the participants during their student teaching placements, and observed Christine, Melanie, Veronica, and Diedra after they began teaching in their own classrooms. I also observed Melanie in her long-term substitute position. Gia never responded to my requests to observe her after she began teaching in her own classroom. After completing his degree, Chad did not choose to teach, so I did not observe him in a classroom after his student teaching placement.

Throughout the study, I conducted two types of observations: planned, formal observations of classroom teaching, choral rehearsals, meetings, and performances; and observations of these same activities on video tape when I was unable to attend the events in person. In all instances, I placed field notes in a notebook and transcribed them immediately after the event. In some cases, I made video or audio recordings of the event and compiled notes based on what I saw or heard in the recordings.

Primary informant interviews. Glesne (1999) reminds us that "learning to listen well to others' stories and to interpret and retell the accounts is part of the qualitative researcher's trade" (p. 1). Formal, structured interviews are one way to achieve this. I formally interviewed five of the six participants at least two times: upon completion of student teaching and in the fall of 2006. Although I was able to interview Gia after her student teaching placement, I tried numerous times to set up an interview during the following fall, but she did not respond to my requests.

I also spoke to the participants on the telephone and in more social settings, and collected information they revealed to me in e-mail messages. To build questions for both formal and informal interviews, I used data from previous conversations, observations, and other sources of data. I conducted some interviews in person, while I asked other questions via electronic mail. At the beginning of the study, I asked broad, general questions of all six participants. As themes began to emerge, I began asking more specific, personal questions. I used statements made in early interviews to create questions for follow-up interviews, either for clarification or elaboration.

Secondary informant interviews. To broaden my understanding of each of the participants, I conducted formal and informal interviews with their professors and cooperating teachers. Occasionally, professors, students, or others offered unsolicited comments about one of the participants. Data collected this way were immediately documented so that I would remember the information as completely as possible. I referred to this data as "serendipitous information."

Artifacts. Artifacts were important to this study because they provided additional information about these participants' experiences prior to, during, and after student teaching. Documents such as lesson plans, concert programs, assignments from music methods classes, and electronic mail messages revealed information about each of the participant's music teacher role identities. I also examined formal and informal evaluations given by university supervisors and cooperating teachers during each of the participant's student teaching placements.

Data Analysis

     Coding. "Data analysis involves organizing what you have seen, heard, and read so that you can make sense of what you have learned" (Glesne, 1999, p. 130). As I collected data on videotape, audiotape, or through informal conversation, I immediately transcribed it, making notes about tone of voice, facial expressions, pauses in speech, and other factors that seemed important for interpretation. I collected these transcriptions along with other data already in written form and organized them into data records by participant. As new data were collected, I placed organizational codes in the data record as follows:

       Video transcript   VT

       Observation   OB

       Primary Informant Interview   PI

       Secondary Informant Information   SI

       Serendipitous Information   SP

       Electronic Mail   EM

       Artifacts   AF

       Researcher Log   RL

     I labeled written accounts of teaching as it was observed and captured on video tape as "video transcript." The primary informants in my study were the participants themselves, whereas secondary informants included professors, cooperating teachers, supervisors, and others involved in the study. I coded data that came about accidentally or without intention as "serendipitous information," and labeled conversations conducted via electronic mail as *EM.* I assigned the

label *AF* to documents such as lesson plans, written evaluations, assignments from music methods courses, and all other written sources that provided information about the participants.

For easy reference, I organized data in six notebooks, one for each participant, under the above headings chronologically, with the most recent last. I used the initials of the participants' names and numbers to help locate and reference data. So, data that I coded as CS.EM.2.4 means, "Chad's second e-mail, page four" and GG.VT.3.8 means "Gia's third video transcript, page eight."

Chad	CS
Gia	GG
Veronica	VS
Diedra	DM
Melanie	MK
Christine	CR

Analysis. After I finished organizing the data, I began analyzing it for themes. Colwell (2006) describes qualitative data analysis as an "art form" (p. 296), perhaps because qualitative researchers use various strategies for analyzing data. Some researchers recommend writing notes in the margins of text as an effective first approach, while others read through all data to gain a sense of emerging themes (Creswell, 1998). I began by reading all the data, one participant at a time, and underlined portions of text as themes began to emerge. I continued this process for all the participants and then revisited each to develop a preliminary character sketch for each of them. Once character sketches were

completed, I compared the participants' stories to examine common themes among them.

When analyzing multiple case studies, "one tries to preserve the uniqueness of the individual case, yet produce cross-site conclusions" (Colwell, 2002, p. 296). I analyzed data throughout the entire study from the time I received my first bit of data to the time I typed the last word of this document. Analysis included re-reading and revisiting both individual stories of each of the participants and looking at the collection of stories as a whole. Creswell (1998) describes this process through an image of a "data analysis spiral" (pp. 142-143) and explains:

> One enters with data of text or images (e.g., photographs, videotapes) and exits with an account or a narrative. In between, the researcher touches on several facets of analysis and circles around and around. (p. 142)

Analyzing change. One purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers, whether those role identities changed during and after student teaching, and if so, in what ways they changed. My initial analysis helped answer the first question, but I sought a new approach to discover answers to the second and third questions. To investigate whether these participants' music teacher role identities had changed and how, I turned to questions intended for longitudinal qualitative data analysis developed by Saldaña (2003). The questions are organized in three sets: framing questions, descriptive questions, and analytic/interpretive questions. I used all three sets as

69

tools for interpreting data in this study. The first set contains framing questions that focus on process and context.

1. What is different from one pond or pool of data through the next?

2. When do changes occur through time?

3. What contextual and intervening conditions appear to influence and affect participant changes through time?

4. What are the dynamics of participant changes through time?

5. What preliminary assertions (propositions, findings, results, conclusions, interpretations, and theories) about participant changes can be made as data analysis progresses? (Saldaña, 2003, p. 63)

Saldaña's second set of questions, descriptive questions, allowed me to "answer the five framing questions and the more complex analytic and interpretive questions that follow" (Saldaña, 2003, p. 64). They include:

1. What increases or emerges through time?

2. What is cumulative through time?

3. What kinds of surges or epiphanies occur through time?

4. What decreases or ceases through time?

5. What remains constant or consistent through time?

6. What is idiosyncratic through time?

7. What is missing through time?

Saldaña's third set of questions, analytic/interpretive questions, helped me make connections in the data. Those questions are:

1. Which changes interrelate through time?

2. Which changes through time oppose or harmonize with natural human development or constructed social processes?

3. What are participant or conceptual rhythms (phases, stages, cycles, and so on) through time?

4. What is the through-line of the study? (Saldaña, 2003, p. 64)

The last question refers to what those in the theater world call a character's "through-line." According to Saldaña (2003), a through-line is "the prominent, consistent flow throughout the course of the script that drives [a character's] action" (p. 150) and "describes, connects, and summarizes the researcher's primary observations of participant change" (p. 151).

Using Saldaña's questions as a guide, I looked for change among the characteristics of these participants' music teacher role identities. I present my analysis in chapter five and discuss my findings in chapter six of this dissertation.

Role of the Researcher

During data collection for this study, I was a full-time doctoral student in music education and a choir director at my church. I was working as a teaching assistant for both the music education department and the choral department, directing one of the university choirs and teaching a non-music major elementary music methods course. Prior to the study, I earned undergraduate degrees in Vocal Performance and Music Education and a Master's degree in Music Education. I had also taught for over 11 years as a public school music teacher. Five of those years involved teaching K-6 general music and choir. Another four years included K-8 general music, drama, and choir. I was a high school choir

director for two years and directed a middle school choir for one semester. In addition, I worked for two years as an adjunct professor, teaching a non-major elementary music methods course.

I knew each of the six participants prior to this study. As part of my doctoral coursework, I was an intern in the Elementary Music Methods course and first met Christine, Chad, Gia, Melanie, and Diedra there. Chad was also in the Secondary Music Methods course during the semester I served as an intern. Veronica and I met when we were both enrolled in a graduate-level curriculum course over the summer. I was also enrolled in a graduate course with Melanie, and Veronica, Melanie, Gia, and I sang in the university choir together. As part of my education, I chose to observe a beginning conducting course, which became more participatory as the semester progressed. Veronica, Melanie, Christine, and Gia were enrolled in that class. As a participant, I evaluated their conducting and was evaluated by them in class. For one project in this class, Gia was my partner.

Since I knew the participants beforehand, we had already established a rapport, and they all appeared to be at ease when discussing their teaching with me. Although my intention was to research these student teachers through an *outsider* approach, my role began to change as the study progressed. As a teacher, I found it difficult to withhold advice when participants asked for it. Although I was able to remain an observer with most participants, there were occasions when I gave Melanie minimal suggestions for issues of classroom management.

Trustworthiness

Creswell (1998) noted that "qualitative researchers strive for 'understanding,' that deep structure of knowledge that comes from visiting personally with informants, spending extensive time in the field, and probing to obtain detailed meanings" (p. 193). The credibility of these meanings, however, is determined by the extent to which the researcher establishes trustworthiness in his or her study (Glesne, 1999). Creswell (1998) lists eight verification procedures to establish trustworthiness and recommends that "qualitative researchers engage in at least two of them in any given study" (p. 203): prolonged engagement in the field, triangulation, peer review, negative case analysis, clarifying researcher bias, member checks, thick description, and external audits. I established trustworthiness in several of these areas.

First, I spent extended time with the participants in this study. I observed and collected data from each of them for the period of one year and gathered artifacts from their experiences prior to this study. I knew the participants before the study began and maintained contact with all participants for several months after the study. I am still in contact with all the participants except Gia through an online social network.

Triangulation is the "practice of relying on multiple methods" of data collection (Glesne, 1999, p. 31). Throughout the year, I observed each of the participants while teaching, watched video tapes of their teaching, read and responded to their e-mails, and looked at their lesson plans and other materials to gain insight for this study. I also interviewed cooperating teachers, university

supervisors, students, parents of students, and professors who taught methods courses. This allowed me to clarify and confirm data by comparing one source with another.

Clarifying researcher bias helps the reader to understand the position of the researcher and predict how that might affect the study (Merriam, 1988). One way that I have accounted for my own bias as a researcher is by revealing my background as a music educator and my relationships with the participants prior to and during the study.

Another method qualitative researchers use to establish trustworthiness is thick description, or "description that goes beyond the mere reporting of an act (thin description), but describes and probes the intentions, motives, meanings, contexts, situations, and circumstances of action" (Denzin, 1988, p. 39). I included thick descriptions in my field notes, which contained sketches of the environment, the body language of participants, my reflections of emerging themes, and questions I wanted to ask the participants about specific things I observed.

Creswell (1998) recommends that an external auditor examine the process and product of a study to determine if the findings are supported by the data. All data collected in this study was subject to an audit check, completed by my dissertation advisor, Dr. Margaret Schmidt.

Ethics

Before beginning this study, I applied for and received exemption from the Institutional Review Board of Arizona State University. Further, since many of

74

the issues beginning teachers experience might be considered sensitive, the names of all participants in this study were changed to maintain confidentiality.

Chapter Summary

As stated previously, one of the purposes of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to student teaching, whether those role identities changed during and after student teaching, and if so, how they changed.

In the following pages, you will learn about Chad, Diedra, Veronica, Melanie, Christine, and Gia as they journey on the path to becoming a teacher. I introduce them in chapter four, but the components of their identities will emerge in chapter five. In chapter six, I will discuss how I developed my own definition of "music teacher role identity" based on the data gathered from these participants.

Chapter Four: Case Studies

Introduction

"Tell us a story!" said the March Hare. "Yes, please do!" pleaded Alice.

"And be quick about it," added the Hatter, "or you'll be asleep again

before it's done." (Carroll, 1974, p. 78)

In this chapter, I describe the participants and their cooperating teachers at

each of their student teaching placements. Within the cases, I also include the

names of professors who taught them while they were enrolled in coursework at

the university. Since I will refer to these professors numerous times throughout

each study, I will introduce them here.

Dr. Stewart taught elementary music methods courses as part of her work

as a music education professor. She also supervised all student teachers at their

elementary placements. Dr. Byrd was also a music education professor and taught

secondary general methods courses. Dr. Langston was an instructor in music

education. He taught choral methods and served as university supervisor for all

choral student teaching placements. He also coordinated all the music majors'

field experiences and student teaching placements. A faculty member in the

choral department, Dr. Gilley directed the large university choir and taught

conducting courses. In addition to these professors, there were also three other

music education faculty members in the department who did not work with

vocal/general students. In the pages that follow, I present a separate case study for

each of the six beginning music teachers. I have organized each of the case

studies in three main sections: experiences prior to student teaching, during student teaching, and after student teaching.

Chad

Prior to student teaching. Chad grew up in Iowa and moved to the southwest when he was in the sixth grade. He attended private Christian schools through his senior year of high school and began playing the piano at age eight. In junior high school, Chad became involved in vocal music when he started singing with a show choir. He continued to perform throughout high school, in drama, choir, and other musical activities. He even led worship at his school's chapel on occasion and, at his teacher's request, directed the high school choir in which he was a member.

A secondary participant attended an evangelical church with Chad when she was in high school and they were both involved in the church music ministry, which included an annual fine arts competition held at both local and national levels. She commented that Chad usually won the "Judges Choice" award in at least one if not several categories. Chad also either won or placed highly in the categories "Male Vocal Solo," "Drama Solo," "Piano Solo," and even won "Short Sermon" one year. She said:

> On top of that, all the girls from all the churches involved, locally and nationally, knew who he was and were gaga over him. The year after Chad graduated, a guy at the state competition showed up sporting a shirt that read "Chad Simpson is gone. Here I come."

Still very active in his church, Chad began his studies in music education at the university. Although he loved being in front of a choir, Chad viewed a degree in music education as a "practicality" and thought it would be a good "stepping stone" to other ambitions he wished to pursue. He remarked:

I can't say that teaching is the end all be all for me, not in the least. . . . When I signed up for the music education major, I wasn't entirely convinced I was doing it to become a music teacher.

As part of an assignment for his elementary music methods course, Dr. Stewart asked him to explain his decision to major in music education. He responded that he wanted to lead a "passion-filled, purpose-driven life."

Music does something within me that cannot be expressed in words. I wanted to help others find this gift. . . . I knew there was something about working with a choir that made me feel alive.

He further stated, "Teaching is a place where I should be," although he knew he did not "have the natural inclination to teach at the elementary level."

Early on in his university education, Chad became aware that he was surrounded by diverse people who held religious beliefs or practiced lifestyles that were different from his. He described this as a time when his "environment expanded" and he began to question his faith. When Chad told his parents that he was questioning Christianity, his mother became very distraught and sent him to a therapist:

I was dealing . . . with an existential crisis in a very intense way and I was dealing with it on my own too because I had a lot of leadership positions

in the church and you're not encouraged to doubt and you're not

encouraged to be vocal about it. And so, I chose to do it all on my own. . .

. I was suicidal. It was a very dark time.

He became very involved in performances both within and outside of the

music department and decided to declare an additional major: vocal performance.

While enrolled in an advanced general music methods course, Chad sent an e-

mail to his professor, Dr. Byrd:

> Is it possible to develop a contract with a district in which I could leave if
>
> a major performance opportunity came up, or are the contracts always full
>
> school year/nine month agreements? Would a charter or private school be
>
> a better option if I wanted to keep open the possibility of
>
> performing/traveling mid-year?

When I spoke with Dr. Byrd about Chad, he described Chad's work in his class as

"average" but said Chad had some natural abilities as a teacher and was

charismatic. Dr. Byrd also told me that Chad was a good musician and that things

seemed to come easily for him. He was concerned, however, that if Chad taught,

he would not give the students the same attention that he would give

performances that might arise:

> Typically I always felt like if there was a toss up between performing and
>
> an education . . . conflict, he would almost always take the performance. . .
>
> . I think if anything, his public school teaching . . . will support his
>
> performance habit.

Although Dr. Byrd was not overly impressed with Chad's teaching skills, members of the choral department faculty were. One of the professors of choral music, Dr. Gilley, knew Chad, although he had never had him in class. He told me that Chad taught with a great amount of energy every time he observed him, and that concerned him:

> I find that teachers that spend time in the classroom on the go at a 100% end up wearing thin in terms of creativity pretty quickly. . . . The research indicates that oscillation of energetic level is essential for master teaching. . . . I think Chad in many respects is a master teacher, but in that respect, I'm very concerned for his future, that he learns how to work "down time" into his teaching structure.

Dr. Langston taught Chad in the choral methods class and invited him to serve as a student director with the mixed chorus he directed. He told me that Chad was a very good musician, leader, and person. He also felt Chad had strong keyboard, ear training, sight singing, conducting skills, and a great singing voice. He described Chad as "the best student [he] had ever had" in his choral methods course, but he did have one concern: "It's more of the whole package with Chad that makes him so unique. A selfish concern is that he won't go into teaching."

During student teaching. Chad's first student teaching placement was at a high school with one of the best choral programs in the state. Chad's cooperating teacher, was a well-respected choral educator who had taught for more than thirty years. Chad taught a beginning and advanced women's chorus, a men's chorus, and two advanced mixed choruses

When I observed Chad at this placement, he appeared confident, used appropriate gestures to elicit a variety of sounds, and very rarely looked down at the piano while playing warm ups, which were new to me and dealt with all aspects of the singing voice, including articulation. He modeled each warm up with lively vocal inflection and a sense of humor. All students' eyes were fixed on him. Although he appeared comfortable in this setting, he told me that he had trouble being himself at the high school and had to act differently than he did in his "theater world." He noted:

Sexual, adult humor, you know that kind of thing. . . . I just really had to tighten the reins. . . . A kid would say something, and of course five things popped in my head that were funny and other kids would enjoy and probably connect with it and have fun with it, but I was like, "I can't do that as a teacher. Not my role."

In addition to teaching choirs at the high school, Chad, without direction from instructors or his cooperating teacher, pursued an experiment with his students, which involved having students engage themselves fully in the music they were studying. This included physical movement, spirituality, and psychology rather than standing still and singing. Chad explained:

I brought in a Pilates instructor and we connected theater and movement on the same day. . . . There's a whole other level of art here. . . . You connect and engage your whole person into it as opposed to standing on a concert stage and singing. There's so much MORE to it than that.

Chad's cooperating teacher said that Chad was a strong student teacher, excellent musician, and a fine conductor. Instead of giving Chad pointers after observing him teach, his cooperating teacher often found himself taking notes to help improve his own teaching. He said:

I am considered a good teacher, but I cannot teach as well as Chad. He has complete genius for being in front of a class. . . . It would be a tragedy if he does not teach; a tragedy for our great profession and the students who could benefit from his genius, and a tragedy for Chad as well.

Although Chad received positive feedback from his cooperating teacher, throughout student teaching he struggled with getting up early and "being 'on' as a professional educator." He felt teaching was like performing, but "without any off-stage time and without the fun of the lights, costumes," and other elements of theater. Regardless of this struggle, he thought he was good at improvising lessons.

I do prepare in general, but I do best when I go in and just wing it. . . . I mean, half of the warm ups and things that I did, I just made up. . . . That's why I say it's like a performance.

Chad found rehearsing to be easy but conducting was not. He was not "as experienced as [he'd] like to be" with conducting and called it "the weakest element" of his teaching. He remarked:

Conducting doesn't come naturally to me. . . . I have to work at it and I think it's more of a work thing. I just get lazy. I don't prepare. It requires

work from me and therefore I have to actually go home and look at my music [and] practice it, whereas rehearsal, I can just think on the spot.

For the second half of student teaching, Chad taught at a junior high school. Here, he taught choir and worked individually with students who were enrolled in a piano class to help them with their piano skills. When I observed him at this placement, I noticed a difference in his energy level from the high school. His cooperating teacher at the junior high school taught the first 20 minutes of class while Chad sipped water from a gallon-sized jug and sat at the piano. As the students began working on a music theory worksheet, Chad, still seated at the piano, yawned and glanced at the clock. He then sifted through the sheet music in his folder while adjusting the sunglasses that had become tangled in his curly brown hair.

Eventually, Chad got up, walked to the other side of the room, hands in his pockets, and began helping students, individually. When the students were finished with their worksheets, Chad took over the class and began leading warm ups. He was not as animated as he had been at the high school. Our eyes met and Chad increased his energy level a bit, but I could already tell that his usual approach for this class was much different from what I had witnessed before. Dr. Langston, Chad's university supervisor, also noticed a difference in Chad:

I saw a change when he went from his first placement to his second placement. He was not as committed because he was working with a far weaker mentor teacher in Chad's mind, and in mine. . . . The program

83

wasn't as strong because of the teacher, and then his attitude also changed because of the . . . weaker program.

At the junior high school, Chad struggled with classroom management. He told me that students showed "blatant disrespect." In the past, "all [he] had to do was be respectful with the kids and they would be respectful back," however, this did not work at the junior high school placement. Chad said, "At first I tried to ignore a lot of the stuff. . . . I praise the positive things [and] bring it all to a positive level." One of his classes, the women's prep choir was especially difficult. Chad commented:

It's like pulling teeth trying to get them to do anything, and I think a lot of that has been because I've let it slide so much because I'm not used to that behavior. I didn't realize how strict I needed to be with them.

Chad eventually developed a procedure when students misbehaved. He asked students who did not participate to leave the choir area and sit in another part of the room: "I put them at a desk and have assignments waiting for them to do that are rigorous, require a lot of time [and] affect their . . . grade."

Chad did not have the same amount of respect for the cooperating teacher at his junior high as he did for his teacher at the high school. He thought that, at the high school, respect "was given to [him] almost inherently because of the teacher," whereas at the junior high he "was fighting to get their respect" and "that was a kind of battle which inhibited going deeper." Chad also found it "annoying" that he was "treated like a novice" at the junior high school, and he

did not feel he was "learning anything that [he] couldn't be learning while [he] was getting paid for it." He continued:

> The high school thing finished, and I kind of went, "OK, that was my student teaching experience." I did it. I got through it. I really invested a lot into it. I feel good about it. Now, I'm really going to start focusing in on . . . what I'm planning on doing after this is done. And that's not teaching junior high, so I'll just do enough to get by. We're teaching frickin' quarter notes, stuff that I don't need to be spending eight hours a day [on]. . . . I have other things that are . . . a little more important right now.

Chad also said that he and his cooperating teacher had "a different approach" to teaching. According to Chad, his cooperating teacher would often say, "That person isn't going to amount to such and such," and Chad did not "like that approach."

Overall, Chad, found the "theater element" of his experience and education had been beneficial to his student teaching. He found it to be "more engaging for the students" than other methods of teaching choral music:

> So I'd just take what we've done as theater things that the kids think are fun and enjoy and then I put it into a vocal thing. . . . I didn't get those from [the university]. Those weren't things I got from choral methods classes. They don't talk about doing weird things.

85

After student teaching. At graduation, Chad was selected to sing the alma mater, give a speech, and receive two awards. Normally a happy occasion, Chad felt depressed:

> When I graduated . . . it felt like a semi just hit me and threw me around and I was sitting on the side of the road . . . all bruised. . . . I was getting these awards and things and I didn't feel deserving of them. I felt like a fraud, like I don't know who I am and I don't know what I'm doing. I don't even want to do these things.

Over the summer, Chad worked at a Lutheran church directing a choir and leading a contemporary worship service. He told me he wished he "could take over the choir director position so [he] could get his fix of teaching music." He also kept busy auditioning, sending out portfolios, researching performance jobs, and teaching two private voice students while pursuing a professional performance career. He planned to stay in the southwest for a year but had a strong desire to go on tour or perform on a cruise ship. He was also looking at a variety of other possibilities:

> OK, I did the music ed thing. I'll go be a performer for a little while, have that in my bag of tricks, go study theater for a little while, so I'll have that in my bag of tricks, and actually have a plan to go do a Fulbright scholarship to South Africa and study tribal music and . . . maybe even [pursue] an ethnomusicology master's or something like that. . . . I want to kind of become a professional jack of all trades.

Later in the summer, Chad was cast in four local shows, all major roles, some musical and some straight theater. His plan was to prepare for more auditions, continue working at the church and get another job to supplement his income. He processed his teacher certification paperwork and planned to register as a substitute teacher in four local school districts. He would have applied to more districts, but according to Chad, the applications were "too extensive." I asked if he planned to substitute for music classes only and he replied, "It would be nice, just because it would be fun to do, but at this point, I'm really just doing it for the cash." In early August, he was offered a teaching job, but he turned it down to pursue other interests.

In the fall following his graduation, Chad told me he was saving money to move to New York as soon as his commitments here were fulfilled. He was considering applying for a job that involved teaching music at a theater school in Manhattan, although he seemed unsure about taking a job that involved teaching:

> [I've also] been considering being crazy and taking my pocket of cash and sweating my audition and [then] wait until I get something. . . . Do temp work or something, like every other actor does.

This was Chad's preference. He said:

> As much as I love it . . . [teaching] takes a lot of time and energy and a lot of commitment. . . . When you're investing your energy in another career, it's just kind of . . . distracting. . . . I kind of just want to step out of it completely while I'm pursuing this other dream.

For Chad, teaching and performing were both important ways to contribute to society, but he felt turmoil over his decision not to teach. He experienced feelings of guilt related to what he described as "pressure to teach" from some people in his life, especially his professors: "There's a lot of guilt, actually, of dropping the teaching ball and picking up the performance one."

Chad planned to join the Actor's Equity Association and had an upcoming performance as a narrator for an educational outreach program with the city's symphony orchestra. He was also getting ready to sign with an agent so that he could start doing commercials. He was offered and declined a position to direct the training choir of the city's boy's choir.

That semester, the last time I spoke with Chad, he was very happy. He was still working at the church and had been hired to perform in several venues for the next year:

> Life is really great right now. The other day I had this vision of a beach. It was really weird. I was driving and it's like, I'm living on a beach right now and it's a really beautiful thing.

Although he enjoyed performing, Chad did not plan to perform for the rest of his life. He told me that he takes pleasure in doing a variety of things and likes getting to know different people. He also appreciates "living in the moment." He shared his philosophy:

> There's a quote that says. "The soul grows in the midst of real human relationships," and I think the more people you can interact with and learn

from and connect with and share your life with . . . the more exciting it is, the more enriching it is.

Chad described himself as "a spiritual person" and said that being a music teacher never felt "right in his spirit." Teaching felt "claustrophobic" to him. He elaborated:

Performing makes me tick. The lights, the backstage, the dressing room, the whole environment, I love it. Being in a classroom every day does not make me tick. Connecting with the students and having things happen . . . really gets me excited and makes me tick, but I don't know if teaching does.

Gia

Prior to student teaching. Gia and her two siblings moved many times throughout their childhood and were educated in Catholic schools. She lived overseas until her father's job as an engineer in the airline industry brought the family back to the United States. She was four years old when she learned to speak English and her interest in music began at age six, when she embarked on piano lessons.

It's not like the performance majors who have played all their life, you know, hours and hours every day. I took lessons. My parents never forced me. . . . They certainly encouraged it because my mom and dad have such a love for music. And my mom is very musical, but . . . I would get involved in dance and sports and would maybe stop for a while, off and on.

Gia received an Associate of Arts degree from a community college and then took computer courses before entering the workforce. She worked for several large computer corporations doing outside sales, administrative duties, customer support and marketing; however her "passion and love were always in music and the piano." After working all day, Gia would go home and practice piano for hours. In her mid twenties, Gia moved to the southwest and started playing piano more frequently. She heard pieces she liked and tried to learn them on her own. She called herself "a late starter," explaining that "at age 26 is when I really started getting serious. . . . I'm proud . . . [that I've learned] so much in the time that I have."

Realizing that she wanted to study piano more seriously, she began studying music at the university when she was 33. Although her intention was to pursue a piano performance degree, Gia told me that her piano professor "suggested that with my love for music and children I should turn my degree into something I can really use, such as a music teacher."

Gia and her husband were living separately at the time of this study, but were trying to reconcile for the sake of their three young children. A few years earlier, they had owned a successful company, which enabled them to live in a posh neighborhood but the housing market in the area had declined, causing them to lose the business and move to a more modest community.

Even with her shiny black hair in a pony tail, Gia's appearance was striking. She often attended university classes wearing a sweat suit or other

workout clothing that outlined her athletic physique. I learned later that she was a vegetarian and conscientious about maintaining good health.

While enrolled in the elementary music methods course, Gia described what she wanted for her future music classroom:

I want the children I teach to feel good about what they are learning. I want them to be excited and enthusiastic about all that music can enrich their lives with. I want it to be a positive learning experience for them. . . . This [course] will be my first chance to really experience what teaching is all about, especially at the elementary level, which is what I want to do.

Gia told Dr. Byrd, the secondary methods teacher, that she thought "elementary [was] where [she wanted] to focus" and that she wanted to "inspire" and "motivate" students to "excel and learn." She believed that she had "the ability to make a difference in a child's life and it [was] up to [her] as an educator to make that difference every chance" she got. She also told Dr. Byrd that she needed to improve "in many areas from sight-reading to sight-singing to conducting and rhythm."

Gia experienced particular difficulty with a required choral conducting course. Dr. Gilley, her conducting professor, expressed concern to the music education faculty about her lack of skill in this area. Later, he told me:

I think Gia is somebody that works very, very hard to try and accomplish tasks that are set before her and . . . is perhaps a little less willing to pursue things with an open mind . . . but I think she came around a great deal to

understand where her skills did or did not lie, but it took an act of congress to get her to understand that.

The music education faculty scheduled a meeting with Gia to discuss their concerns about her skills, and suggested that she complete her degree without teacher certification. Gia believed that with "time and actual teaching experience" she would be able to develop the skills she needed.

I know my conducting class is an issue, but I will do all that I can to pass Dr. Gilley's class and hope that he will work with me on this. . . . I feel sure about my decision and have worked hard to have the certification as part of my degree.

Other professors also saw Gia as a weak music teacher candidate. Dr. Langston, her professor in the choral methods course, said:

She just didn't understand the process. She had no rehearsal techniques whatsoever. She had no methods. She had no thoughts of how to go from point A to point B, so she was really a sponge and blank slate as far as "what do I do."

Gia's music education professors were also concerned about her. Dr. Stewart, her professor for the elementary music methods course, explained, "She just has no ability to transfer. The next lesson is like starting over from scratch. She's not dumb. She's not unmusical." Dr. Byrd shared a specific example when Gia had difficulty "connecting pieces" while teaching a lesson about the blues:

She wanted the people to learn the blues and so she'd just put instruments in front of them and say, "The chords are I, IV, and V" and we had to say,

"Gia, you know, a fifth or sixth grader is not going to immediately know

what I, IV, and V means." So then, the next time she would teach them

that, but from there she would assume they could improvise. . . . She

couldn't sequence to see how these things were done.

Dr. Byrd was concerned that Gia would not be able to assess whether her students

were doing well and thought she might "ignore the fact that her kids [were] on a

slippery slope towards not being very successful. . . . I doubt she'll have a

mediocre program. I don't think she'll be that good." In addition to his concerns,

Dr. Byrd shared that he thought Gia was an "eternal optimist" and that if someone

were to tell her several things to improve upon and one thing that she did well,

"she would forget" the things which she needed to improve and "would focus on

the one."

During student teaching. For her student teaching, Gia taught choral

music at a middle school and general music at an elementary school. She chose

those particular positions not only because she liked the schools, but also because

the elementary school was next door to her gym, down the street from her house,

and very close to where her children attended Catholic school.

A few weeks after she began student teaching, Gia discussed her

elementary placement at a meeting for all the vocal/general music student

teachers:

The younger ones, you have to have a lot planned for them. . . . I had to

make lesson plans where there are at least five things we are doing

because their attention span is such that they need to move on . . . but I

think what really surprises me is just that I do feel really comfortable. . . . I think to be in front of 35 or 30 little elementary school kids, like, it's really comfortable.

Gia liked her elementary cooperating teacher's "motherly" personality style and described her as "a very compassionate, caring person." She told me that classroom management was challenging at the elementary school, especially "for the younger students like the ones in kindergarten," but she used her own "parenting things in it":

I think what really helps me is that I am so familiar with this area from having my own three children that it doesn't bother me to have to say something to the student who is not paying attention. . . . I would first do the rewarding system, as to whoever was really listening, I would go around saying . . . "Look at so and so" and encourage that behavior, but then [if] someone kept going on and on, I would set them out.

Gia "pick[ed] about four or five things" for the students to do while planning lessons at the elementary school. It took her "a couple hours in the evening" to look through everything. Gia said that any lesson that involved movement and singing, the students "enjoyed a lot" and that the students also loved "that thing with the scarves" and using Orff instruments. One lesson she was particularly proud of was part of a conducting unit she taught to a group of third grade students:

I just thought that it would be so fun to have them learn. . . . It was hard 'cuz some kids were all mixed up as to their left and right on a four pattern

94

and then a three pattern but we would do it over and over again. . . . So I had to make sure that I went the same way they did so it wouldn't be confusing, 'cuz I was staring at them directly.

When I observed Gia at the elementary school placement, she sang a song she had written entitled "Purple Kite." The lower notes in the song were below the singing range of the students, and Gia did not appear to have an objective for having them sing it. Throughout my observation, Gia struggled with classroom management and looked to her cooperating teacher for help several times. She often stood slouched, scratching the back of her neck.

After observing another lesson, Dr. Stewart, Gia's university supervisor, told her that she "said 'good' for everything" and needed to "give specific and individual praise" to the students. On another lesson, Dr. Stewart told Gia that her directions were "confusing":

> Sing, listen, count. Are we to sing or listen? How are we to count if we are singing? With our fingers? The children were confused and you didn't seem clear either.

During another observation, Dr. Stewart told Gia that she was "positive and enthusiastic with the children," then continued with other suggestions such as, "Be sure you are accurate when you point to the screen. At the beginning, you pointed to the A section way before we got there."

At her middle school placement, Gia worked with a woman whom she described as "a very effective teacher" because "she really cares" about students.

When students misbehaved at the middle school, Gia followed her cooperating

teacher's lead:

> At first I tried to be very nice about it, but they could really run all over
>
> you if you're not really firm from the beginning. . . . I had to learn that. . . .
>
> My mentor teacher gave me total freedom to do whatever I wanted [to do].
>
> . . . One thing she does a lot of is send them out to write a paragraph on
>
> respect, so I started doing a lot of that. . . . And it was really hard for me
>
> because . . . I want to be nice.

Gia said that planning lessons at the middle school was different from the

elementary school because junior high school plans involved mostly singing:

> My preparation time was a lot on the piano. At home, I would go learn the
>
> music. [My cooperating teacher] wanted me to do accompanying, and I
>
> would do a lot of warm ups, so I worked a lot on those things.

While at the junior high school, Gia helped prepare seventh and eighth graders for

an upcoming concert and worked on a Disney® medley with the sixth-grade

students. She usually started class by having the students listen to a recording of

the pieces they were learning. She led warm ups and then accompanied the choirs

for her cooperating teacher. Gia's cooperating teacher at the junior high school

called her "a terrific student teacher" and said that her main weakness was

accompanying on the piano: "Not that her piano skills were bad, they were great,

however playing the piano and accompanying a choir while conducting and

teaching is a bit tricky."

96

At the end of the experience, Gia told me that she was happy student teaching had gone so well. She felt she had done a good job based on the feedback her cooperating teachers had given her:

> Out of . . . 600 points for all the student teaching I think I got a 598. I mean, they gave me really, really high marks and really great comments and they both wrote me my letters of recommendation.

After student teaching. When student teaching was over, Gia explained that "when [she] actually [got] hands-on experience" she had "a lot more confidence. . . . Until [she] was actually in that setting, [she didn't] know what to expect." She planned to pursue a master's degree in music education, seeing herself as "always wanting to learn." She wanted to teach part-time while taking classes until her younger children were enrolled in kindergarten.

> The two districts I'm most interested in [are] Kelly and Chapelville because, well, they're right there. . . . If I taught in Kelly, I'd be on the same schedule [as my children] but if I'm in a different district . . . I'd have to make arrangements for the whole summer because we're such different schedules. That's really hard for three little kids, you know.

Gia sought a part-time music teaching position in the Kelly school district but she also applied to be a substitute teacher in case she did not get a part-time position. Although she applied to the graduate program, Gia received the official notice in early June that she was not accepted. She did however acquire a part-time music position, teaching at two elementary schools.

97

In addition to teaching part-time and substitute teaching, Gia was teaching private piano to ten students. She also took lessons herself at the university, and she "love[d] that!" At the end of her first semester of teaching, Gia explained why she had not been available to talk to me or have me observe her teach:

I am going through some things in my personal life and feel all my energy and focus needs to be on making some decisions for the better, and of course on my children and being there for them. My time is spread so thin as it is. And I have a lot on my plate at this time, so I am trying to juggle many things with the situation I am in. I know everything will work out for the best and I will be in a much better place soon, but again at this time I am just focusing on the things I need to. I am glad that I have my degree and my certification since I feel that I have a profession that works well with my children's schedule and allows me to continue to learn as well. At least I am getting some experience this year as a part-time music teacher and can decide where I want to go with it from here.

I suspected these personal issues might explain the difficulty I experienced in trying to set up times to observe her teaching and meet with Gia. I sent nearly a dozen e-mail messages, but she did not respond with times or locations to observe her. This was nothing new, since, during student teaching, she and I also had difficulty making arrangements for observations.

Christine

Prior to student teaching. Originally from a western suburban town in the metropolitan area, Christine grew up listening to a variety of music, including

everything from Garth Brooks and Counting Crows to Tchaikovsky. Although she stood just over five feet tall, there was something about Christine that seemed strong. She had a presence, especially when she stared at you with her squinted blue eyes. Christine knew she wanted to be a music teacher since she was in high school:

> I made the decision to pursue a career in music education when I was a freshman in high school. I wanted music to be part of my life and I wanted to have the opportunity to share music with others.

> During her freshman year at the university, she received a C in voice

lessons, music theory and class piano. As she continued in her degree program, she earned C's and D's in music theory, and history. Dr. Byrd, one of her music education professors, told me that Christine had great difficulty completing her degree and was close to failing as a music education major:

> She's almost been booted out a couple of times with low grades in a variety of different classes. A lot of it was marching band. . . . She was doing all kinds of extra stuff for the marching band [to] the detriment of her other classes.

According to Dr. Byrd, Christine "couldn't get into a [saxophone] studio," so she auditioned for a voice studio even though she really wanted to be "in the band world." She enrolled in marching band as an elective and Dr. Byrd thought that Christine would eventually accept "a position where she [could] at least help out with the marching band." Regardless of whether it was vocal or instrumental music, Christine had clear ideas about teaching music and was certain about her

99

strengths and weaknesses as a music teacher. For example, she believed that

"students [would] only respond to what [she taught] if she [gave] it to them with

as much enthusiasm as [she expected] from them." She wished, however, that she

could become "more comfortable and confident" in her abilities, especially sight

singing. "I tend to second guess myself," she said.

Dr. Langston, her professor for choral methods, said Christine had "a

confidence about her on the podium without arrogance," but she did not "see the

potential . . . to be outstanding." He continued:

> Overall, as a student, she often does the minimum that's required and
>
> doesn't work beyond that, which is unfortunate because she is probably
>
> one of the most natural teachers that I've had in class.

While enrolled in coursework, Christine had a job working in the

university's music library. During the semester prior to student teaching, she also

worked part-time as a choral director at a new high school where her best friend

led the band program. She had trouble motivating students at that position: "I was

giving attention and getting nothing in return. . . . They had a band director

teaching choir and me, so they hadn't had that long tradition of 'this is how things

work.'" That same semester, I observed Christine in an advanced conducting class

and thought she was one of the strongest conductors in the class. The professor,

Dr. Gilley, agreed with me:

> Her leadership is very surprising. . . . She's a very quiet individual . . . but
>
> as a leader, she becomes very dynamic. . . . To watch her when she got on
>
> the podium in class, she just took charge of things musically and as a

leader, very clear, clear cut ideas. . . . This is a well-groomed individual that clearly takes the profession seriously. . . . I think she'll be extremely successful.

During student teaching. Christine began her student teaching at a high school, where she had opportunities to direct four choirs and helped with after-school rehearsals for the annual musical. She also assisted with the Solo and Ensemble Festival and Regional Choir auditions, chaperoned and conducted at the Jazz/Madrigal Festival, ran choral rehearsals, and assisted with the regional honor choir rehearsals and All-State choir auditions. Her cooperating teacher, Mr. Fisher, described her as "cautious," both as a person and a teacher. He told me that she "worked very hard at refining her [piano] skills" and "spent hours and hours outside the classroom learning a computer program that generated accompaniment tracks." He also suggested that she would benefit from being "in a situation that offers her mentors. She will learn and become better at every chance she gets, but the opportunities need to be there for her."

While at the high school, Christine worked with individual students to help them improve their singing voices. One student was auditioning for the school musical.

I was just working with [her] to try to get her to sing in her head voice instead of her chest voice. . . . It was just things that I thought back to my lessons and they actually worked. . . . It's amazing!

Although Christine had been successful at diagnosing this female student's voice, she often had trouble with pacing, saying that things were "rough until the kids

101

got used to how I run my rehearsals." She said, "I just kinda go and go and go and I forget that high school kids can't think for that long."

In addition to pacing, Christine struggled with classroom management at the high school, especially with one of the choirs:

There's about 50 kids in there and they, they just talked and were [in]attentive and really kind of rude to me without being openly rude. . . . [And] I just . . . did what I had to do and didn't really say anything because I didn't know what to say.

Christine had been working on *How Lovely is Thy Dwelling Place* with the group and had planned to "work the piece in segments and then put it all together." She said, "I was very nervous and that affected my limited piano playing abilities, which frustrated the students." She said that the students became "angry" and "almost hostile" toward her. She decided to move on to another piece of music that they enjoyed.

Dr. Langston, Christine's professor for choral methods, also acted as her university supervisor. He said that Christine was "not as prepared for her student teaching lessons . . . as she was for choral methods." Later, Christine commented to me that she thought Dr. Langston "wanted [her] to be more involved and ask for more musicality from the students, but . . . I can't ask them for that before they've learned the notes." Christine said that, during choral methods class, she was working with trained college students and "could spend more time teaching expressive ideas," but with high school students she was "focusing on things that have nothing to do with music," such as behavior:

102

You have to play to your audience and what THEY can do. You play them

too hard and they're just going to shut down and not do anything. You

give them little snippets at a time and in that rehearsal, it was learning

pitches, learning notes. . . . I think the lion's share of your job as a teacher

is classroom management.

In one of Christine's choirs, there was a student who often refused to sing or

asked Christine to repeat sections continuously. When Christine did repeat the

parts, the student still refused to sing. Eventually Christine learned to "just ignore

it." She said, "I don't let her take the glory of the rehearsal, which I'm sure she

hates."

Christine told me classroom management made teaching stressful, as did

her limited piano skills: "I have trouble playing more than two parts at a time,"

she said. "It's just my fault for quitting piano lessons so early." Christine used

strategies, such as having the sopranos sing their part while she played the alto

line on piano and then reversing. She believed her students would be stronger

musicians because they would not rely so heavily on the piano for their pitches.

As student teaching at the high school continued, Christine began to look

at some of her cooperating teacher's practices with a critical eye. For example, he

did not teach sight-singing until students reached the "top choir." Christine felt he

could do more. She commented, "[Members of] the top choir are required to

audition for Regionals [including sight-singing], so if they started that earlier,

think of how many . . . kids would make regionals."

Christine told me that it took a long time to feel like she could be herself at her high school student teaching placement. She was worried that she might look unprofessional or immature. She commented, "I made the decision not to be goofy, not to be silly, strictly because I wanted to establish that [they] were the students and I am the teacher. . . . I kept all that inside until later."

For the second half of the semester, Christine taught at a middle school for three days a week while continuing at the high school on Tuesdays and Thursdays. She taught choir and general music, including a unit on world drumming. Christine said her general music classes were challenging because seventh grade boys were "a handful" and teaching them was "like babysitting." She told me, "I really . . . think my personality is better for high school kids," and she didn't know if she "could ever teach junior high for a long time." Although she did not see herself working with them long term, she did feel somewhat more comfortable with junior high school students. She also felt "most successful at the junior high because they . . . don't care if you can only play one line [on the piano] at a time."

When I observed Christine teach at the middle school, she had students lead physical warm ups while she took attendance. She then played piano during vocal warm ups and led a sight singing exercise. The students were well-behaved, but according to Christine, this was unusual: "It's draining because you have to be up all the time just to get them to smile or to look up at you and that's hard."

Christine said that teaching middle school was different from teaching high school because there are "things that they don't know that the high school

104

kids know" and they "require more of your attention in class." She said she often had to separate pitches and rhythms when she was teaching a new piece of music: "I have done a few rhythm readings. I chose to take it out of context with the music, but I wanted to use the music as a jumping off point."

Christine's cooperating teacher at the middle school thought Christine was a strong student teacher who related well with middle school students. She described her as "flexible" and willing to try new things. She commented:

Christine is a great person. She was very committed to her internship, continuing after she graduated. She said, "Yes" to everything I asked and took on quite a bit of responsibility.

At the end of student teaching, Christine said she had learned that she was "not going to please everybody." She could now "stop class and say, 'Look we have such and such time. We are on a limited schedule and we have to get this done. Your success is up to you.'" In addition to learning better ways to manage students, she was surprised by the connections she made with the students during student teaching.

I really thought I would come in, do my job, and just leave, and they . . . would forget about me in the next five seconds. . . . I didn't realize they would want me around as much as they do, and it breaks my heart to have to leave them.

After student teaching. Christine wanted to teach on the west side of the metropolitan area, but became frustrated with her job search, saying "I don't handle the 'sit and wait' approach very well." She was nervous that she might not

105

get a job, or that she would not be employed at a school with a supportive administration and useful resources. An elementary position was available in Phillips School District, which is where she hoped to teach, however, she was not sure if she would apply because she "really [didn't] want to teach elementary school at all." Christine hoped to obtain a part-time choral position and use her remaining time to assist the band director with the marching band. Feeling uneasy about whether she would get a job on the west side, she applied to two districts in the eastern suburbs, "mostly out of desperation." While attending a job fair, Christine found a northwest elementary district booth and stopped to talk. Her mother had urged her to consider this district. The principal in the booth happened to know Christine's brother and parents and conducted a screening interview with Christine on the spot. She offered Christine a contract and told her she could choose between eight different jobs in the district. Her salary would be $2,000-3,000 higher than what most districts were offering. Christine took the contract home and later accepted a job a middle school in the district. She was familiar with the school because her sisters and boyfriend had attended there. The position was split between her and another music teacher; she would teach general music to grades six through eight while the other teacher would teach grades four and five. She planned to start a choral program and said she might "even look for ways to use the district's handbell set."

While preparing for her job in the fall, Christine explained her ideas about how to establish respect with her future students:

I've always heard that you don't smile until Christmas. . . . I think you have to balance it. . . . You have to set rules and you have to obey them and you have to make students follow the rules . . . and then at the same time, sharing little pieces about you, so that they feel some ownership and they feel like they know you. . . . But definitely set the rules down at the beginning.

Christine's colleague at the new school was Megan, a woman in her second year of teaching who was a year younger than Christine. At the beginning of the school year, Christine and Megan each had their own music rooms, but at the end of the first trimester, the school administrators changed the schedule. Their goal was to give all teachers across each grade level the same planning period, which meant that all students in each grade level came to music class at the same time. Unfortunately, Christine and Megan did not have enough resources to teach two sections of the same grade level at the same time in separate rooms, so they combined their classes and taught in a large room that was part of the physical education wing. Christine and Megan were not warned about the change and had to adapt quickly to the situation. This also meant that Christine now had to teach grades four through eight. Christine said, "I just had to fly by the seat of my pants."

They adapted by borrowing keyboards from several schools and teaching with a program called *Music in Education*, a keyboard method where students play along with recorded accompaniments. According to Christine, the keyboards "help with [classroom] management because they are actually doing something."

Every school in the district had 15 keyboards plus one for the teacher, but even with two students at each keyboard, there were never enough. Megan told me, "We usually hope that one or two are absent."

The keyboard program included lesson plans, which Christine and Megan adapted to fit the district's requirements. Christine also started a choir at the school and chose songs found in *Music K-8* magazine over traditional choir music because it "was a hassle" to borrow music from her school district. She also liked the resource because it included accompaniments recorded on compact discs. "That worked because I can't accompany and [Megan is also] not comfortable accompanying the choir," she said. Christine admitted that, although her "passion" was choral music, she was not "doing enough of that" or "sharing that with enough people."

Christine told me that she was "going through the motions" at her new job, and that there were days when she was "done" and other days when her students displayed "moments of brilliance." Her plan was to "stick it out until the fourth graders graduate," and she hoped to "feel like a whole person again." She wanted to turn the program "into something that can satisfy the needs of the students" and thought she might "go back to school to get [her] master's in choral conducting." Christine told me that she had questioned herself at her job when she should not have, and she realized that she knew more than she originally thought. "The kids aren't going to know," she said. "You can fake a lot if you're not 100% sure about something."

Melanie

  Prior to student teaching. Melanie received a bachelor's degree in vocal performance and was teaching private voice lessons while working at a local university as an academic advisor before returning to school to pursue her post-baccalaureate teaching credentials. She decided to pursue a master's degree in music education at the same time:

> I chose a career in music education when I realized the joy that I received from teaching private lessons. I feel that I have strengths in teaching which come from having patience with people as well as empathy. I also just want to make sure that I am surrounded by music every day. This is a great way to make a career out of it.

  Melanie, a short, blue-eyed blonde, was raised in a Seventh Day Adventist church, and although she had stopped attending, she remained a vegetarian. She had recently married Josh, whom she had met in college. They bought a house, and Josh was supporting them financially. Every time I saw her on campus, she appeared friendly and her freckled face sported a big smile.

  Melanie believed that being a music teacher meant "being consistent, empathetic, musical, patient, well-prepared, and knowledgeable in the area of music and music education." She said, "I want my students to be excited to come to class because every moment of it keeps their creative juices flowing." Dr. Byrd, one of her professors, said she asked good questions in class and was a strong musician, but he thought she had "the performer bug." Dr. Byrd commented that while Melanie was enrolled in coursework, "she almost dropped out of the

master's program to pursue a degree in vocal pedagogy," and that he did not try to "talk her out of it," but "strongly disagreed with her choice." Melanie decided to stay enrolled as a graduate student in the music education program.

Dr. Langston, Melanie's professor for the choral methods class, said, "She approached choral methods [class] prepared." He thought so highly of her work, he asked her to assist him with a university-based choir whose members were primarily non-music majors, but things did not go well. He noted:

> She did not show that same level of preparation for [Campus] Singers. . . .
> The students recognized that, even [though they were] non-majors . . .
> [and] she lost control of the class, pretty much every rehearsal.

While enrolled in a choral conducting class, Melanie told me that she felt like she was "not living up to" the professor's expectations, and the instructor, Dr. Gilley, agreed that she did not always live up to her potential. He said Melanie had "a beautiful head voice" and a "lovely lyric soprano," commenting, "The vocal instrument that she's been blessed with is clearly the greatest strength she has." He continued:

> I think Melanie is in a phase of life where she is struggling probably with some very significant issues, personal issues and . . . she is hampered and bound by her own insecurities.

During student teaching. Melanie's student teaching schedule was less common in the university's program in that she taught at both placements throughout the semester, going to a high school each morning and an elementary school every afternoon. At the high school, Melanie directed a women's choir and

observed her cooperating teacher during two other choirs. Melanie's cooperating teacher at the high school was a young woman who had graduated from a neighboring university, had five years of teaching experience, and was in her first year as a high school choir director. She previously taught at a local middle school, which was a feeder program for her current teaching position, so had established rapport with the students. Early in the semester Melanie expressed concern about her high school placement:

> I feel like I'm not getting enough time teaching. I think part of it is because my teacher is brand new to high school and she's only been teaching for a few years. . . . She's having a hard time giving over control.

The cooperating teacher typically began the day by telling Melanie what to teach the choir. On a day I observed Melanie, the cooperating teacher greeted the students and Melanie began warm ups. I glanced at the students, who were standing in slouched positions, some of them talking, and one eating a breakfast sandwich from a local fast food restaurant. Melanie gave instructions: "Someone tell me one way you could have a nice, silent breath." Without waiting for a response, Melanie continued, "If you have a nice open mouth, a nice open throat, you'll have less friction." Melanie then taught a sight singing exercise. She looked at only the right side of the room. One student slapped her music against the chair in front of her and other students were digging in their backpacks. Melanie told the students about minor scales and then played them incorrectly on the piano. After apologizing, Melanie led the students in a sight-singing exercise, but neither Melanie nor the students could sing it. The rehearsal continued with students off

task, talking, rolling their eyes, and lip syncing. Melanie continued, "Does everyone know where we're at? Even those who are talking? . . . Please don't make me yell. . . . Even if you don't feel like it's exciting, act like it is."

Melanie stopped class five minutes early and thanked the students for "a great rehearsal." I asked one of the students in the class how she thought the rehearsal had gone. She told me, "It's just that she's not as fast as the teacher and sometimes we're just UHH. It's just boredom. She's a little slow at the piano." After the lesson, Melanie told me that she was "having a hard time getting the girls engaged," that her "energy level might not have been completely up," and that she sometimes felt "really nervous" in front of the class.

Melanie told me that the high school students were often disrespectful. She recalled one incident when her cooperating teacher took one of the choirs on a field trip and she was left in charge to do "all the teaching":

> While I was teaching the beginning girls' choir things were not going well. I kept messing up on the piano. The girls were complaining that I was going too slow. One girl acted like she was shooting herself in the mouth because it was going so badly. The more discouraged I got, the worse I did. I finally stopped and told them all that I realized I didn't play the piano like their teacher, but that didn't mean I couldn't help them. I also told them that they needed to be on and learning no matter what.

After Melanie expressed concern about not being "able to engage the students," her cooperating teacher told Melanie that from that point on, she would only work with the women's choir for half a class period. Although she thought

112

her cooperating teacher was "phenomenal," Melanie felt that she was "not focused on" her. When Melanie arrived at school in the morning, her teacher was usually busy in her office. Sometimes she asked Melanie to run copies or file papers, but they did not usually talk until just before class began. Melanie asked for lesson plans a day ahead of time so she could prepare, but the cooperating teacher continued to give them to her just before class began. Melanie explained, "She hasn't done mentoring too much and so I can sense a real fear from her that I may cause a level of tension in the choirs. . . . I don't want to cause any problems." According to Melanie, her "job and her students are her number one priority," and Melanie was "number two."

Melanie rarely planned lessons at the high school. One of her lesson plans simply read: "Objective: Must have a pencil! Run all three pieces. Try to do as much as possible without music." Her high school lesson plan folder included drawings and scraps of paper containing suggestions for improvement from her cooperating teacher, who drew a line with two categories: positive and negative. One scrap of paper read:

Nice energy about the piece . . . muddled instruction while playing . . . good attempt to have them take leadership . . . Please move seats when necessary in any class.

Dr. Langston, Melanie's choral methods professor, said that Melanie demonstrated "weak" skills at her high school student teaching placement. He believed she was "not engaging the students" because she did not "know the music like the back of her hand, have an interpretation of it in mind," and was not

demanding of her students "like she [was] in choral methods." He also felt that she sang with "a really fast vibrato" and modeled "a tone that [her students could not] achieve." He felt that she was "more wired to teach" elementary school.

In the afternoons at the elementary school, Melanie worked with a woman she described as a "supportive mentor teacher." Melanie discovered she was "rather good at teaching the elementary school kids" and hoped that an elementary music position would "come open in the fall." Her cooperating teacher told Melanie, "I have really seen you grow in your time here. You have taken responsibility both physically and emotionally for these children. . . . This is the time to practice and use all your management tools." Melanie felt successful at her elementary student teaching placement saying, "I just feel so comfortable and happy with those kids." She explained:

> I think one of the reasons I feel really comfortable with the little kids is it is easier to have control over them. I feel a lack of control with the high school students. . . . With young kids I am able to tell them to change their behavior and tempt them with a star on the board or a gummy worm. It doesn't work that way for older kids.

Melanie believed she "had a hard time demanding" respect from high school students because she felt "insecure about [her] own abilities." Still, at the elementary school, she had to find what she called a "stern voice." She commented:

I've kind of messed around with it to see what works as a stern voice. I always feel like I'm crushing their poor little fragile souls when I'm using it, but it really does get their attention.

For Melanie, addressing poor behavior was also exhausting. "Sometimes I just don't want to deal with it," she said, but she realized that it was "important [to] get everyone focused" before teaching the lesson. Dr. Stewart, Melanie's university supervisor, told Melanie that she looked like she was "apologizing for having to remind" the students to listen. She suggested that Melanie "practice other phrases" and "look in the mirror" at her facial expressions. She told Melanie:

> Another classroom management technique you can use is to praise people for doing what you want. Right now you are correcting or acknowledging what is not going well. So what we are learning is that we can get your attention by doing wrong.

When I observed Melanie at her elementary placement, she showed a video and then asked the students to sing a song. She did not count off the song or give a starting pitch. The students were restless and the room became noisy. She counted backwards from ten, with her fingers in the air and the students stopped talking. They sang the song again, but it fell apart by the end because students began talking. Melanie took a star off the board, grabbed her clipboard, and asked students to share their feelings about the song they had sung. The lesson continued while Melanie put a check next to the names of children who shared their answers with the class.

After student teaching. Before student teaching ended, Melanie was offered a longterm substitute position teaching sixth through eighth grade. She knew that it was not "what [she] planned on doing for a full time job," but took the position because she thought it would "be a good experience" and she and her husband "needed the money." The position was divided between two schools. Although the classes at the first school were choirs, Melanie made them general music courses because she didn't feel "safe or comfortable singing" due to the students' poor behavior. For the first two weeks, Melanie continued student teaching at the high school in the morning and went to the junior high schools immediately afterward. She taught two classes at the first school, then drove to the second school and taught two classes there.

At the second school, Melanie worked with a large seventh- and eighth-grade choir with more than forty students. Although Melanie thought the students were talented, there had been no structure prior to Melanie's arrival and several of the girls in the choir had taken charge. "It's hard for me to be strict because I am so tired from teaching all day since 6:30 am," she said, "I give up more than I should."

Melanie was the fourth music teacher students had had that year. At the beginning of the school year, the district had hired a choir director, but that person did not show up on the first day of school. The next music teacher quit after the first two quarters. The students then had a long-term substitute followed by a male teacher who stayed for a few months but had to leave due to family reasons. Melanie was hired to finish the last few weeks of school. She explained:

116

Today I think I had a breakthrough with them. . . . I used my yelling voice. SCARY! Boy, did that whip them into shape. I didn't like that they were scared of me, but at least they were all participating and knew that I meant business. It felt good to finally be the one in charge. I kinda stopped caring what they thought about me. It is for their own good that I am whipping them into shape. They need it!

The room at her first school had originally been a home economics room and contained stoves, a refrigerator, and countertops. Before Melanie arrived, the students had been reprimanded for jumping on the countertops and lighting fires on the stove. She described her classes:

The first class is small, so even though there are some behavioral issues, I am able to manage it pretty well. The second group has about 35 students and it has been complete chaos. . . . I have been having a hard time getting them to do anything.

At this school, Melanie had spent most of her time trying to get students to sit down and be quiet: "I'm so not used to middle-schoolers."

When I observed Melanie, she had the students sing "Lean on Me" to "canned accompaniment." While the students sang, Melanie sipped a drink from a straw on the other side of the room. During the song's interlude, Melanie told them it was "time to show off their excellent dancing skills." A few of the students said they wanted to sing "Boogie Woogie Bugle Boy," so Melanie shouted, "Alright, go get on the risers!" The students sang the song several times until the bell rang.

The next class came in one student at a time. As students continued to enter, the classroom became more and more noisy. Melanie clapped a rhythm pattern to get their attention. They clapped back but kept talking. She chanted "Please get in your seats." The students chanted back but then continued their talking. Melanie began counting backwards from five and when she got to "one," a student yelled, "Blastoff." She clapped the rhythm patterns again, but only a few students clapped them back to her.

With the room still noisy, Melanie pressed "play" on her CD player and told the students to "start their reflections" on the piece of music, which happened to be a Baroque harpsichord piece. One boy yelled, "Casey is a nerd," and another student said, "This song stinks." Melanie told the students to finish their reflections while she took attendance.

Several students moved to different seats throughout the room while Melanie took attendance. When she finished, she clapped another pattern to get the students' attention and only two students responded. For the rest of the period, Melanie had the students do a non-musical team building activity, and then asked them stand on the risers and sing songs they had learned prior to her arriving there. Eventually, Melanie completely lost control of the students and had to call the assistant principal, to intercede. The assistant principal told me, "I was in the room the last week of school almost every day because their brains had turned off and it was the behavior management piece that wasn't coming very easily for Melanie." She continued:

I would definitely consider hiring her for K-5, but if I were to hire her

again for junior high school, I'd say there would definitely need to be

some professional development opportunities that we would need to take

advantage of.

After observing Melanie at her long-term substitute position, I asked her

how she planned lessons. As she shuffled through her purse to find a lesson plan

to show me, she said her planning had been "scattered." She continued:

It's been very disorganized, how I've planned, and I would have liked for

it to be more organized. . . . I don't know which way is up. . . . Usually the

night before, I try to come up with something interesting to talk about. . . .

A couple of times I've done word searches on words that we've learned,

like "chant," "Renaissance," and "Medieval."

She told me that lesson planning caused her stress. "I feel like I don't

know how to do this," she said, "I never thought about doing things . . . in this

kind of situation." Melanie felt she was not "emotionally" ready for this situation

and often thought she was "not getting anywhere" with the students because she

was so tired. She felt bad "being the drill sergeant" with students. When she

started the position, she had had a plan to address behavior, but that did not work

the way she thought it would. She said:

I wasn't even able to have them hear me on the first day. They were so

loud. . . . My plan was to give them a warning if they were talking. That

was such a stupid plan. . . . All I did the whole time was warning, warning,

warning. Warning, warning, and nothing happened.

When the students failed to respond, Melanie started giving daily points, but admitted that being a good classroom manager was "a matter of switching into a different" person in the classroom, which she had not found yet. She wanted to show students that she cared, but also be "very, very strict so they know they can't get away with anything." She said that the "transition between being a student [and] being a teacher" was difficult, because having authority was part of her personality she had not "had to present before." Melanie also admitted she and her husband had "finance problems" and she was "trying to lose weight," and these issues along with learning how to teach caused her to stay "up late at night" and not get "enough sleep."

Although Melanie was grateful for the long-term substitute job, she was excited about the prospect of having her own elementary music classroom. During the summer, she interviewed and was hired at a new elementary school located about 20 minutes from her home. When I visited Melanie at the elementary school, I noticed her room was very attractive. The walls were adorned with a vocabulary area, words to songs, class rules, music theory ideas, and other things.

Melanie set up a classroom management system allowing students to earn points toward obtaining a "golden music note." She greeted students at the door and waited for them to be quiet before inviting them into the room. Melanie gave each first-grade student a pumpkin sticker and reminded them what they needed to do to keep their sticker. The students were attentive and responded when Melanie sang a special song to indicate that it was time to sit down and get quiet for the next activity. Although she enjoyed this group of first graders, Melanie

120

told me that she liked teaching third and fourth grade students because "they are very independent while still really liking teachers and school." Kindergarten and sixth grade students were her "biggest challenge." She commented:

> [Kindergarteners] are just so high maintenance and needy, they take a lot of patience and energy. The sixth graders are getting better, but can be pretty silly sometimes. I don't feel like I've had great lesson plans with my sixth graders. I want to do more activities with them, but for some reason end up talking at them way too much.

On my second visit to the elementary school, I watched Melanie teach a fourth-grade general music class. Again, the students were attentive and understood Melanie's expectations. The students learned about traditional Jewish foods, sang a Hanukah song, and learned how to play a game with dreydls. Melanie introduced musical steps, skips, and leaps and asked the students to sing a song while following the notation in their texts to find examples of each. She said:

> I feel so much more successful as a teacher. . . . I am thrilled with my job. Not every day is perfect, but overall I feel like a good teacher. I have a very good relationship with my students.

Diedra

Prior to student teaching. Diedra had always considered herself to be musical. She began piano lessons in second grade, stopped before she entered junior high school, and then resumed lessons in high school. She became serious about singing while in junior high and started taking voice lessons in eighth grade.

Diedra's musical endeavors were supported by her father, who had been in local bands for "as long as [she] could remember." Although she loved music, Diedra did not always want to be a music teacher.

> I was originally a business major, but switched to music when I realized that everything was about the bottom line. I wanted to do something that mattered to people on a personal level.

> Diedra believed that being a music teacher would make her "an individual who has a direct link to the future," but she "was turned off to teaching for a long time." As a child, she was always "ahead in [her] classes" and her teachers would ask her to help the other students. "From that point on, adults as well as children were telling me that I should be a teacher. I guess I just rebelled for a while," she said, "It's not that I'm such a great musician or anything; it's just that there's nothing else that makes me feel this excited about working."

Changing her major required Diedra to spend a longer time in college than she originally anticipated. Although she was not happy that her degree took six years to complete, she was pleased with her decision. The extra time allowed Diedra the opportunity to be the leader of a group called The Shining Stars, an extracurricular women's choir not offered by the School of Music but organized as a student club. Dr. Byrd was the advisor for the group and said Diedra acted like "a bit of a know-it-all" with the students in the group. He explained:

> This girl wanted to sing soprano, but she was really an alto. . . . [Diedra] wasn't able to see it from the other person's perspective. . . . She was the

expert and you should listen to her. . . . She's not as flexible as I would like to see.

Dr. Byrd described her leadership as "dishwater" and did not believe she was a strong musician, but thought she could be a "decent" teacher "if she's willing to put in the work." Diedra's choral methods professor, Dr. Langston, said Diedra was "not much better than competent in most areas" and described her as "average." He noted:

> She's not bad at conducting, but she's not good at conducting. She's not bad at playing the playing the piano, sight singing and ear training, but she's not good at those things. . . . She's not outstanding.

Dr. Langston thought Diedra had "a little bit of an attitude" and felt that she thought "she [knew] more than she [did]." He also said that she "could rub some people the wrong way because there is almost a degree of arrogance about her."

Diedra's conducting professor, Dr. Gilley, thought that Diedra would be most successful teaching elementary or middle school music and believed she "lacked the ability to react to what she [was] hearing and then give further instruction." He did not "think she [was] a very strong musician" and felt that "making high- level music [was] going to be a . . . tall order for her."

Diedra believed she had both strengths and weaknesses as a music teacher. She said she was "really big on structure and organization" and thought "creativity in the classroom [was] wonderful but should still be orderly." Diedra wanted "to create an environment where children can focus and learn new things

while having fun." However, she was worried about her "tendency to over-explain" and said she needed to "learn to give one small instruction at a time."

During student teaching. Diedra began her student teaching at a high school. Her cooperating teacher was a twenty-eight-year-old, single man whom Diedra described as "mellow." At this placement, she was responsible for teaching three women's choirs, a Jazz/Madrigal choir, and an a cappella group. She also helped rehearse the musical *Guys and Dolls*.

Early in the semester, Diedra told me that her cooperating teacher had been "very helpful with suggestions" and that it was "still a struggle" for her "not to talk way too much." She had attended a regional solo and ensemble festival and told me about her experiences there:

> I didn't really have a job, but when things started getting out of hand, I took it upon myself to keep things moving. The kids seemed confused about where they were going at the beginning, so I made sure everyone knew who they were following. I also tried to spend a few minutes with each kid before they auditioned to calm some nerves and give last minute pointers.

Throughout student teaching, Diedra planned lessons and then wrote reflections on them at the end of the day. One of her reflections read, "I did a crappy job on 'Oh Happy Day.' I messed up notes and rhythms. It takes me too long to teach. Bad!" After another lesson, Diedra stated that her conducting was "not very expressive" but she did a good job of "giving students something new to improve upon" every time they sang.

At the high school, Diedra struggled with getting students to stay on task during her rehearsals. She "felt like a jerk" when she had to tell students "the same thing over and over." She said:

Yesterday there was just so much constant talking. Every time I gave a direction, they got off track. I don't think they caught half the directions I gave. It got to the point where it was really disrespectful and I got sick of fighting it.

Diedra told me she left the room and told her cooperating teacher that she "was done." He told her to take a walk down the hall while he reprimanded the students for their rude behavior. This was not the only class that was difficult for her, however, she also had issues of insecurity when working with the choir of mixed voices. "I don't feel as confident working with guys as I do with girls," she said, "I have a harder time hearing their parts and mistakes, so I don't think I help them much."

On one occasion, Diedra and her cooperating teacher had different ideas about one of the choral pieces. Diedra wanted students to add an "h" sound to the word "wind" so that it would sound "more airy." He told her that he would not do it that way, but Diedra defended "[her] piece of art" saying, "I'm an artist in my own right and it's okay for me to interpret things differently."

Generally, Diedra enjoyed working with her cooperating teacher and developed a close relationship with him. After concerts they would "go out and get pizza" and "have a beer" but were careful to "stay professional in front of the kids." He also taught Diedra a great deal about conducting and helped her with

her piano skills. Before student teaching, Diedra could only "conduct a beat pattern" and her wrist "wobbled too much." She said, "Now I'm more expressive. I'm more free. I'm easier to follow in my conducting." She also told me how her cooperating teacher had helped her with her piano skills.

> [He began] showing me different things and how to get them real quickly [and] I kept thinking, . . ."Gosh, if I had a piano teacher like this, I would've never stopped when I was young."

Although her cooperating teacher's evaluations of Diedra's teaching were "pretty positive," she had a hard time believing it because she was "really critical of herself." He did offer suggestions to Diedra, such as, "Talky, talky . . . too much talky. Ask them why you want more of the moving parts. If they don't know why, then how will they remember?" He also thought that some of Diedra's skills would improve with "time and experience." He explained, "Diedra struggles with knowing what to 'fine tune' on a piece that is nearly performance ready. Her students were led with confidence up to this point."

At the end of her high school teaching placement, Diedra felt she had done a "pretty good job" and "took on more music" than she thought she could. She still taught "at a slower pace" than she would like to, and was so "worried about getting everything done" that she did not take time to "enjoy [herself] with the kids." Diedra believed that, although she was still "more comfortable teaching girls over boys," she would "rather teach high school or junior high" than elementary school.

For the second half of the semester, Diedra taught elementary general music to students in grades K-5. Her cooperating teacher at the elementary school was a woman in her 50s with a small frame and curly, light brown hair. She wore glasses and a portable microphone because she was concerned about losing her voice while teaching. During the first week in this placement, it became apparent that Diedra was not happy:

> I wish I could go back to high school. I feel so uncomfortable and out of place here. I can't tell if I'm upsetting the mentor teacher when I express my opinions, so most of the time I feel like I'm just supposed to shut up and agree with whatever she says. I remember liking elementary in the past, but this sucks.

Working with her new cooperating teacher was difficult for Diedra. When she first arrived at her elementary placement, Diedra addressed her cooperating teacher as "Mrs. Kaplan," but later felt comfortable calling her by her first name. After a few weeks, her cooperating teacher insisted that Diedra call her "M.K.," because that was how her name was listed on her teaching certificate. M.K. had many teachers in her family, all of whom listed their first and middle initial on their teaching certificates.

In addition to this peculiarity, Deidra's cooperating teacher had numerous physical ailments and suffered pain on a daily basis, particularly with her teeth. She was also very concerned about the spread of germs in the classroom. One day, Diedra taught the kindergarteners a song about a monkey that included movements. At one point in the song, the monkey giggles, so Diedra asked the

127

students to put their hands up to their mouth like they were giggling. Her cooperating teacher "interrupted the lesson and made [the students] practice putting their hand up without touching their face." She also had the students "get up and wash their hands" because she was so "afraid of germs." Diedra said, "It just seemed silly to me. . . . I don't think our philosophies of teaching are at all alike."

Diedra felt her cooperating teacher's philosophy of teaching was "about order and discipline," and thought she did not "worry as much about how [students were] relating to what she [was] teaching and to her as a person." Diedra agreed with her teacher's belief that "kids want structure" and "feel more comfortable in a classroom" with it, but was upset with her cooperating teacher's overall approach. She said:

> At the elementary school, you gotta' plant the seeds . . . and I feel like a lot of the time, she's kind of scattering the seeds in the general direction [of the students] and they're just bouncing off.

While at the elementary placement, Diedra planned and taught lessons that included singing, moving, and playing instruments. Her cooperating teacher offered Diedra numerous suggestions to improve her teaching, but most were things that Diedra thought were not "all that important." Diedra said, "This is not forever learning. It's ELEMENTARY school. You're just trying to get 'em hooked on a love of music." Diedra told me that her cooperating teacher often corrected her pronunciation while she was instructing the students. For example,

"Instead of giving me musical feedback, what she said is, 'It's thee air. . . . If you have a vowel before another vowel, it has to be a long e.'"

I witnessed the cooperating teacher correcting Diedra's grammar after a lesson. She told her, "Proper English matters. We as professionals always want to model. It needs to be, 'my partner and I.'" Diedra admitted that when the cooperating teacher "was criticizing," she ignored a lot of what she said. "I'm a good teacher," Diedra said, "I'm good at what I do and I do a nice job with the students."

Eventually, her cooperating teacher created a checklist for Diedra so that she could remember the classroom procedures. For example, the cooperating teacher had assigned each grade level a color and all learning associated with that grade was to be represented by that color. Diedra said that no matter how well she did, she "didn't do everything and that felt so discouraging." She also said that there were some things she "didn't see as pertinent." She told me, "If I wrote with a red marker instead of a blue marker, I didn't think about it as a big deal."

Diedra and her cooperating teacher continued to disagree on her abilities as a teacher. One day, Diedra was "so proud" of herself because she had been working on playing the recorder and had taught herself "something like five or seven notes" in half an hour. When her cooperating teacher heard her play, she told Diedra that her tone was "not very good" and that maybe she, rather than Diedra, should "play for the kids." Diedra told me, "I'm not [going to] do elementary music . . . partially because of these types of things." Her cooperating teacher's comments made her "feel very inadequate." Diedra continued:

With her, I felt more defensive than I've ever felt, more uncomfortable, and more disagreeable. . . . The longer I was there, I got meaner. It was kind of scary, honestly, because there were a couple of times when I was just like, "Why did I just do that? That was mean. That came across horribly. . . . [It's] not my personality. That's not what I'm about."

Diedra called her cooperating teacher "the letter of the law" and herself "the spirit of the law." Whereas her teacher was "rigid" and left "very little room for error," Diedra looked at rules and asked herself, "By this rule, what was intended?" She said her cooperating teacher often criticized her discipline "which [was] very effective." By the end of her elementary placement, Diedra told me that she did not "agree with" all of her cooperating teacher's methods, but was beginning to "understand her reasons" for doing certain things.

While at the elementary school, Diedra made changes to her instruction. When the cooperating teacher commented about how Diedra sang with the children, Diedra altered her vocal technique. She commented:

I have to sing much more softly with the elementary kids than I did with the high schoolers . . . When I sing, I model in the way they are used to singing, which tends to be softly. I also give them directions more quietly. This helps them to pay attention because they won't hear me otherwise.

Diedra found it "difficult to keep [students] singing" when new steps like playing instruments or moving were added. She said, "In the past I just sang with them to compensate, but that is no help at all. Now, I stop whatever extra thing we

are doing and go back to the singing. Once that is solidified, I add back in the extra step."

On Diedra's student teaching evaluation, her cooperating teacher wrote that Diedra had "a lovely vocal model with the students" and "very good pacing in her delivery of instruction." She felt, however, that Diedra needed to continue developing her classroom management skills including "following through with consequences" and "privately speaking with students who make inappropriate choices."

After student teaching. When Diedra began her job search, she told me, "I don't want to be in elementary school. It's not fun." She was more interested in high school because she would be doing a "level of music" that would "inspire" her. She did not "want [her] job to be just a job" and felt certain that she would be successful with the high school students. She said:

> I definitely feel very confident that I'm good at what I do, which . . .
> sounds kind of conceited or whatever, but I know how to go into a
> classroom and deal with it and create something really great.

Diedra recognized her weaknesses too. She reminded me, "I don't play [piano] very well" and said, "For most things I'm probably going to need an accompanist at the concerts." Even so, although she got "nervous when people [were] listening" to her play piano in concert, she believed she could "run a rehearsal." She planned to work on her piano skills over the summer but was not worried about them too much. She noted, "My choirs end up pretty strong because they don't have something to lean on all the time."

131

I asked Diedra to share her ideas about her future classroom. She told me that she saw herself as a "likeable person" and liked to "crack a lot of jokes with the kids and try to relate to them on a personal level." Although music was her "area," she believed she was "there for the kids." She said, "It is true that it's more important to have control of your classroom than be liked, but if you are liked, it is a lot easier to control your classroom, and I don't mean in a friendship sort of way." Diedra saw herself as "a mentor." She continued:

> I want them to grow as people. I want them to understand themselves better. I want them to be involved in the music and to be able to be passionate. I want it to be a form of expression for them. . . . I want a kid to come away from my classroom feeling like they have a tool, that they have an outlet, and that they understand who they are better because of me, and they're comfortable with who they are also.

Diedra was called for four job screening interviews, which she felt went well because she was "good at reading people." She was most interested in a high school position that was only "three minutes from [her] house." Although the high school did not have enough students enrolled for a full-time position, Diedra could spend the remaining time at the junior high and "act as [her] own feeder program."

She was offered and accepted the job and began taking courses toward a master's degree in music education over the summer. She explained how she would handle discipline in her new classroom:

I kind of believe in the policy of if you make an example of a couple, the rest of them fall in line. . . . The first day of school, they're going to be handed a syllabus that's going to explain [my] expectations. . . . I don't what to be rigid to the point where I'm unreasonable, but I do want to create the expectation that this is a REAL class, there's work involved, and you're not going to get an A just by showing up.

Diedra said she was "very big into sight-reading" and was "gonna' make little machines" and "create little monsters" out of her students. To do this, she was "going to have to choose quite a bit of music," but not "cutesy music." She wanted her students to "be getting a taste" of "real music" or "good music." She also wanted them to "explore things in other languages" and know the International Phonetic Alphabet "on a basic level."

Diedra taught middle school in the morning and high school in the afternoon. She was the first choral teacher the high school had ever had. Early in the semester, Diedra became frustrated at her new job. She stated:

The school still hasn't gotten some of my music to me even though I ordered it in the first week of school, so the kids have [Xeroxed] copies. . . . The school doesn't even take care of any of my financial needs. I don't even have a stupid trashcan in my room.

Diedra's first concert was coming up and she was "scared." She "just want[ed] to wow everyone" and was "concerned about what everyone else" thought of her. "I want the administration to be impressed," she said, "and I want the kids to feel really successful."

133

Although Diedra felt she was doing an "okay" job at the high school, some things were a struggle. She noted, "I think that I know what I'm doing in the classroom. It's more the other junk that gets to me, like not knowing what forms I need to fill out to do stuff." She said she "always [felt] like [she was] screwing up." One of the students was upset by her "disorganization," but she was "working [her] butt off and never [felt like she was] on top of stuff." As the semester continued, Diedra realized that her main issue was "a lack of organization," which did not allow her to plan lessons the way she should. She also thought she needed "a better way to keep contact with parents."

During my first visit to Diedra's junior high classroom, she handed me a formal, typed lesson plan which was "required by the district," but "not accurate" because she had "fallen behind" on her plans. The room where Diedra taught was in between the cafeteria and the band room and was small and crowded. Although Diedra declared one of the two doors in the room as the "exit door," students entered and exited the room through both. As I scanned the posters covering the walls, I could hear the band playing next door.

On another day, I observed Diedra with high school students. As we ate lunch together at a local deli, she told me that she "really wasn't sure what [she was] going to be doing" with the next class. She quickly decided to review information that would be on the final exam. At the school, a girl walked in late and Diedra told her that she now "owed [her] a detention" because it was "the third time [she had] arrived without a pass."

When Diedra finished reviewing for the final, she rehearsed two holiday songs with the choir. Their singing was loud and inaccurate, but Diedra did not correct them. In the last few minutes of class, Diedra helped students with their auditions for the regional solo and ensemble festival. Diedra required all her students to learn solos as part of their final grade in choir. This, she said, would help them "to be prepared in advance" for the festival.

Veronica

Prior to student teaching. Veronica moved to the southwest from the eastern United States because she and her boyfriend were "looking for a warmer climate and a better job market." After attending an all-girls high school, Veronica earned a bachelor's degree in vocal performance at a school in upstate New York. She enrolled at the university to get her teaching credentials and to begin a master's degree in music education.

Veronica did not come from a musical family. She described her mother as "tone deaf" and said her father fell asleep when he attended her concerts. She did have at least one thing in common with members of her family, however; Veronica and several of her relatives suffered from anxiety. Veronica took medication for anxiety as an undergraduate student, confiding that before she began the medication, she had trouble even breathing in front of a group. I asked her if she experienced the same anxiety performing and she said she could "put up a front for five minutes," but with teaching, her students would be "seeing [her] personality."

Veronica told me that she was "never confident" in her "teaching abilities as an undergrad." She was the leader of a girls' a capella group when she was a vocal performance major and said it was "tough for her" because she "couldn't play [piano] very well." She commented:

> I just sort of realized that it was something I could do. . . . [I] had to get over my anxiety about being in front of people, and when I did, I felt really good about it. I felt like I could get in front of people and help them understand music.

I found Veronica a very pleasant person. The first time I met her, I noticed her dark brown eyes and colorful eye shadow, which she liked to match to her outfits. Dr. Byrd, one of her professors, told me that her outfits were occasionally inappropriate. He said, "She just has to be careful of what she wears because she sometimes would wear things that were a little revealing in class." Aside from that, he called her a "top notch" person and a "good thinker." He also said she had a good attitude in class.

Dr. Langston, Veronica's professor for choral methods, said Veronica had "a very fine voice" but that her greatest weakness was "first and foremost her piano skills." He was also concerned about how she might get along with colleagues, noting, "Her personality is such that it could come across as abrasive to certain people. I don't see her that way, but I could understand how some might." Dr. Gilley, Veronica's conducting professor, told me that he thought her "singing voice [was] a strength" but that she lacked the ability to interpret a musical score.

To understand the subtleties within the score is something that I think she . . . struggled with. To understand how to actually see what wasn't in the notes that were actually on the page, that was difficult for her.

While enrolled in coursework, Veronica described her thoughts about the importance of participation in a school music program. She said, "Music could be the only thing that gives the student a sense of purpose, pride, [and] accomplishment. . . . so even if a student never plays their instrument after high school, they will have gained some sort of appreciation [for it]." She also said that she hoped to "promote an atmosphere of learning" in her classes and wanted to treat her students fairly. Veronica also had ideas about classroom management:

I have always wanted to be a strong leader who models positive behavior. . . . I think teachers tend to blame older students for their actions instead of asking them to be accountable. If you respect your students, they will be more likely to respect you.

During student teaching. Veronica had two student teaching placements. The first was at a high school, where she worked with five choirs, including beginning and advanced women's groups, a men's chorus, concert choir, and a jazz/madrigal group. For the second half of her student teaching placement, she taught at a year-round junior high school. She had done a field experience at this same school a year earlier, and it was then that she discovered she might like to teach middle school students.

At the high school, Veronica had difficulty "working with the men's choir." This was a group of beginning singers and, according to Veronica, four of

137

the fourteen members made it "obvious that they [weren't] excited about being there." Her cooperating teacher could "get them singing," but Veronica could not "motivate them to work." She stated:

> The beginning women sometimes act like they are unmotivated, but they are easier to sway. They are more eager to please and I think I can relate to them more than the boys. My mentor teacher thinks it's going fine but I want them to really be with me and they're just not.

Veronica told me that her cooperating teacher was a "fabulous teacher" who possessed many characteristics she hoped she could "exude as a teacher." Veronica liked that she was "fast-paced and demanding" but found some of her qualities unappealing. "There are aspects of her personality that are . . . just not me and not what I want to be," she said, "She can be very confrontational and bold. . . . While I think it is important to be strong minded, I think you have to choose your battles. I think she chooses all of them."

Although Veronica liked her cooperating teacher, she also described her as "mean" to the students and called her "a piece of work." One day, Veronica was conducting a piece and her cooperating teacher told her to execute a rhythm in a way that Veronica knew was incorrect. "I was sure she was wrong," Veronica said, "I even talked to her after class." Despite knowing that her cooperating teacher had executed the rhythm incorrectly, Veronica taught the pattern to the students in the way she suggested. Later, when Veronica was observed by Dr. Langston, he told her that she had taught the students the rhythm incorrectly. Veronica told Dr. Langston that her cooperating teacher had made her teach it that

way even thought she had told her she thought it was wrong. It was incidents like these that made Veronica refer to her cooperating teacher as "a whack job."

Her cooperating teacher often discussed her Mormon religion with Veronica and members of the choirs. She made it clear to Veronica that she should dress in "very modest clothes" while student teaching at the high school. Veronica noted, "I was really careful about what I wore because she made a comment to me at the beginning of the semester." A few days before the concert, her cooperating teacher asked Veronica what she was going to wear.

> I told her I owned a black dress that was about two inches below the knee and she said that was not long enough. She said the audience would all be staring at my calves.

Veronica "went out" and "bought a floor length black skirt that cost [her] $60, which [she] couldn't afford." With it, she wore a sleeveless "chiffon top" with a "tank top under it" so that no one could "see under the arms or in the cleavage area." When she arrived at school for the concert, her cooperating teacher said, "You're gonna' wear a sweater over that, right?" Veronica wore a sweater to the concert.

In addition to differences in what they viewed as appropriate attire for teachers, Veronica said she thought she complimented students more than her cooperating teacher did. She said, "I'm probably just not as strict as her and maybe I kind of need to be." She "doesn't have a problem calling on students . . . right to their faces," Veronica said, "Sometimes I will do that if it's something that I feel is . . . not mean," such as helping them improve their vocal technique.

When it concerns poor behavior, however, she had a different approach. She confided:

> I'll have more of like, an attitude towards the whole class. Like, I'll ask them to be quiet and have a harder time actually calling on individual students. . . . I think it's partially because I'm afraid that they will sort of hate me.

Veronica was worried about handling discipline. She could get students to listen if her cooperating teacher was "right there," but said, "I'm just kind of afraid that once I get my own classroom, it's not going to work." She was also concerned about the paperwork involved in teaching, especially after seeing her cooperating teacher complete forms for a field trip, a choir tour, and a competition. She remarked:

> It seems there are five sheets of paper for every little thing she needs and I'll never remember what to do by myself. . . . I am going to struggle with the business aspect of teaching.

At the end of her high school student teaching placement, Veronica told me that she needed "more practice listening to the choir actively and conducting well." She said, "I tend to focus on just one." Her cooperating teacher told her she had "a nice *legato* pattern" while conducting, but "needed to improve her *marcato*" pattern. Veronica agreed, and also believed she had improved her ear, but still had to "do things a couple of times to be able to hear what [her cooperating teacher] could hear in one time." This was a great improvement, considering that she "felt like she had a wall of sound" coming toward her the

first few times she directed the choir. Although Veronica thought her male students "were sort of better by the end," they were still not as responsive to her as they were for her cooperating teacher, even though Veronica "didn't really teach them a whole lot differently" than her female students.

For her second student teaching placement, Veronica taught choir and general music at a junior high school. At first she "didn't want to teach the general music class" because most of the students "did not want to be there." A few weeks into this placement however, she felt good about her teaching assignment. "I like working with these kids a lot," she said.

Veronica admitted that she liked "working with the girls better" than the boys because they were "more receptive" and wanted "to please" her and "do well." She said she was "super enthusiastic with them," describing how she was "just beginning to vary [her] voice more" and would get "really excited" with her facial expressions. Veronica said that she did not "do that as much" with the male students at the junior high because they "just stare" at her "with this look of 'what are you talking about?'" She said it was "more challenging" to work with them because they were "always poking each other." Veronica believed she treated the boys the same way she treated her female students, but thought that "cultural and family-type things" might "affect their attitude toward singing." She admitted that she did not "know how to deal with that yet."

According to Veronica, her cooperating teacher at the junior high school was a "very consistent" teacher who had "strong classroom management skills." One day, an eighth grade student took out her compact at the end of class and was

applying eyeliner. The cooperating teacher told the student to give her the eyeliner, but the student refused. When she "threatened to call the security guard," the student "handed it over." The cooperating teacher reminded the eighth grader that she would not receive her eyeliner until Friday, which was school policy. Veronica said:

> I just . . . don't know if I could have done that. . . . I can't imagine not having my eyeliner for a week . . . but good for her. . . . I don't think that girl will take out her makeup again in class.

When I observed Veronica at her junior high school placement, she had a comfortable demeanor with the students. She appeared prepared and competent and led warm ups while accompanying the choir with block chords on the piano, although the cooperating teacher accompanied the choir when it was time to sing through the entire piece. I was surprised by Veronica's piano skills because a year prior to this, she could not play the piano at her field experience without getting confused. "I remember doing a two part song with the boys," she said, "Something in my brain saw that it was a G clef and I couldn't play it down an octave even though it was the same notes. It just totally messed me up." Veronica told me she was now able to "do two parts if the rhythm is [the same]." She said, "I've gotten a lot better" and could even play it "without practicing." Although her piano skills had improved, Veronica had also developed some strategies for helping students learn their parts if she had trouble playing them on the piano. "If I feel like I'm going to make a mistake, I just sort of stop playing," she said, "I'll

say 'Keep going, find it.'" She also played "block chords on each measure to get them started."

Veronica approached classroom management differently at the junior high school than she did at her high school placement. At the junior high, she addressed individual students by name, which she found "was harder for [her] to do" at the high school because students "were closer to [her age]." She said, "I found my natural tendency [at the high school] was to just kind of address the whole group."

During student teaching, Veronica planned and wrote down "exactly what [she wanted] to say" to her students. She did this because she "did not want to talk too much." She "[chose her] words really carefully" and then tried to "memorize" them so that students were not "just sitting and listening" to her.

At the end of student teaching, Veronica told me that she "sort of felt like a loser" because she normally had "more of a social life," but had not gone out or done anything fun during the semester. She said she had just been "really busy with student teaching." She had also been busy planning her wedding that would take place in October. Although most of the work was done, Veronica felt she needed "to help her family find places to stay" since they would be traveling from New York to attend the wedding. Veronica was also concerned about getting a job in a community "[where she] would like to live."

After student teaching. Although many of the participants in this study attended a job fair, Veronica refused to go because she "was worried" that she might be "put on the spot" and needed time to investigate the districts and prepare

143

for the questions she might be asked. She applied to several districts. Veronica did

not consider a position with one of the districts that contacted her because she was

"not interested in working with" a particular music teacher in the district,

complaining that the woman liked a "yucky ping sound with no vibrato." She

continued:

> My ideal choral tone is a round sound that is free and without tension. I
>
> tend to like a darker, taller sound. I tell my kiddos to sound British . . . no
>
> vibrato sticking out either!

> Eventually, Veronica accepted a position at a middle school, which

involved a 75-minute commute. She taught several choirs, including a mixed

choir, a men's choir, and a women's choir. Within the first few weeks of school,

one of her students told Veronica that she should "work at Hooters®." She "wrote

him up and had him do a self reflection on his behavior." Another student asked

Veronica if she was "going to have sex on her honeymoon." She "reported him to

the assistant principal." Veronica continued to complain that the students were

"very disrespectful."

I watched Veronica teach two of her choir classes. The first was a mixed

choir and, as the students entered the room, there was a great deal of talking.

Veronica got their attention by starting some warm ups that focused on diction.

The lesson continued with Veronica playing vocal warm ups on the piano. The

students had a sound that was focused and mature, but Veronica struggled to keep

their attention throughout the class period. She said, "I'm waiting," and "This is

getting very tiring," but the students continued to be off task for the remainder of

the period. This was also the case with the men's choir, the second group I observed. One of the boys came into the classroom eating food. Veronica did not appear to notice. She spoke quickly when she gave instruction and asked one student who was looking at my video camera to turn around three times. Between warm ups I heard Veronica say, "If I have to warn you again, it's detention." A few minutes later, she looked at a student and said, "Stop." When announcements came over the intercom, a student moved to the front of the class and sat in Veronica's chair. She asked him to get out of her seat. When she returned to the warm ups, the student started shouting instead of singing. Veronica said, "In your real voice," but he continued to shout, turning his head frantically side to side. Veronica rolled her eyes.

At that point, a teacher from the local elementary school came to rehearse with the choir. She was accompanying the choir for their upcoming concert. When the rehearsal was finished, Veronica talked with the accompanist while the students waited for the bell to ring. The young man who was shouting during warm ups walked up to my video camera and pretended to be a world champion wrestler. Veronica told me she was "embarrassed" that I had seen her teach and admitted things were "going horribly" with regard to behavior, but she felt the students were "sounding better."

Chapter Summary

One purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching. In the case studies in this chapter, I have described each participant's experiences at the

145

end of the university music education program and in the following semester. In the next chapter, I will present a cross-case analysis of the participants' music teacher role identities and discuss how they changed during the year of the study.

Chapter Five: Cross-Case Analysis

Introduction

"I wonder if I've been changed in the night? Let me think: was I the same when I got up this morning? I almost think I can remember feeling a little different. But if I'm not the same, the next question is, who in the world am I? Ah, *that's* the great puzzle!" (Carroll, 1974, p. 15)

McCall and Simmons (1978) defined role-identity as "the character and the role that an individual devises for himself as an occupant of a particular social position. More intuitively, such a role-identity is his imaginative view of himself *as he likes to think of himself being and acting* as an occupant of that position" (p. 67). For these authors, a *character* is "a person with a distinctive organization of such personal characteristics as appearance, mannerisms, habits, traits, motives, and social statuses" and a *role* "is the characteristic and plausible line of action truly expressive of the personality of that character" (p. 58). In Chapter Four, I described participants in terms of "the character and the role" that contributed to their music teacher role identities. The data suggest four specific components that appear to be part of these individuals' music teacher role identities. They are: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. In this chapter, I will discuss these four components as they contributed to the participants' music teacher role identities. I will then discuss the changes in participants' music teacher role identities over time.

Changes in the Music Teacher role identities

These beginning teachers' music teacher role identities included four main components: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. I determined these four components by examining what participants discussed when describing themselves in the role of music teacher prior to, during, and after student teaching. Although all of them discussed each of these components at some point in the study, participants did not always mention all four at the same time. For example, some participants focused on certain components prior to student teaching only. For others, a particular component remained a constant focus, often viewed from different angles, at all points of the study. Others were more focused on particular components depending on the context and the skills that were demanded of them in that context. Thus, their discussions of these components included characteristics they believed good teachers possessed and also their self-assessments of their own skills. In the following section, I will discuss each of the four components and how that component changed for each of the beginning teachers in this study.

Musical selves. For the participants in this study, their musical selves seemed to involve primarily musical skills. The musical skills mentioned by the participants included playing the piano, conducting, sight-singing, reading rhythms, the ability to listen to and diagnose choral students, singing, and playing the recorder.

Prior to student teaching, only half of these participants mentioned musical skills when describing themselves in the role of teacher. Diedra told me

148

that she was not a "good musician," and Veronica discussed her poor piano skills while working with a girls' choir. Gia believed she played the piano well, but expressed concern about sight-singing, reading rhythms, and conducting.

As these six beginning teachers began student teaching, they talked about musical skills more frequently. During this time, everyone except Chad mentioned piano skills. Although Gia felt positive about her piano skills, most other participants discussed challenges they faced while playing the piano in a choral setting, including playing more than one part at a time, playing inaccurately, and losing control of the classroom due to poor piano playing. Christine expressed that she felt more comfortable playing the piano at her junior high school placement. Veronica and Diedra described how their piano skills had improved during student teaching. Christine and Diedra justified their weak piano skills by saying that not relying on the piano would help their students develop better listening skills. Perhaps this was their way of justifying their decision to be choral music educators, despite their inability to play piano proficiently.

During student teaching, conducting skills became important to Veronica, Diedra, and Chad. Chad described his conducting skills as weak during student teaching; both Veronica and Diedra felt their skills in this area had improved. Gia did not discuss her personal conducting skills while student teaching, but found it important for her third-grade students to learn conducting during her student teaching at the elementary school. Diedra no longer mentioned conducting once she was at her elementary student teaching placement, and Melanie did not mention conducting during student teaching at all.

During student teaching, Christine and Diedra discussed their struggles with being able to listen to and diagnose singers in the choir. For Diedra, this was more difficult with male students. In addition, at her elementary school teaching placement, Diedra described her need to be able to sing with young students and play the recorder. She did not discuss these musical skills while at her high school placement and once she was teaching in her own classroom.

Christine realized her ability to "fake" keyboard skills once teaching at her middle school job. None of the other participants discussed piano skills after student teaching.

Summary of musical selves. Musical skills were an important consideration as these participants developed their music teacher role identities. The specific musical skills each focused on varied, however. Most of the participants mentioned musical skills as part of their musical selves only when they were struggling with that skill. Further, the skills they discussed were ones they were being asked to use at the time. These beginning teachers mentioned musical skills mostly while student teaching, especially in their choral placements, rather than in their general music settings. They discussed piano and conducting skills most frequently. After student teaching, only Christine and Gia discussed musical skills when describing themselves in the role of music teacher, and both referred to their ability to play piano. The other participants did not mention musical skills after student teaching, although this might be attributed to limited interview and observation time. It may also be because, once they were in

their own classrooms, they were being evaluated on their instructional skills rather than musical skills.

Instructional selves. Like their musical selves, these participants' instructional selves focused on skills and they changed throughout the study. Instructional selves included classroom management skills, the ability to motivate students, lesson planning, pacing, giving verbal directions, and organizational skills.

Prior to student teaching, only Veronica and Diedra mentioned classroom management skills when describing themselves as music teachers. During this time, Christine also discussed her inability to motivate students while working part-time with a choir in a local school district. Diedra discussed her trouble with giving clear, concise verbal directions.

During student teaching, however, all of the participants mentioned instructional skills as important to their music teacher role identity. All six beginning music teachers most frequently discussed classroom management skills. Many expressed frustration with students and described the different steps they took in enforcing rules. Diedra, Gia, Veronica, and Melanie were concerned that students would dislike them or be hurt by them if they acted as disciplinarians, and worried about appearing "mean" to the students. The participants also described using these skills in different ways depending upon the age of the students with whom they were working. Melanie described how it was easier to "control" elementary students than high school students. Veronica expressed fear that she would not be able to control students once she was

151

teaching in her own classroom. Melanie and Veronica discussed their lack of ability to motivate students during student teaching. For Veronica, this was particularly difficult with male students and for Melanie it was a problem at her high school student teaching placement.

Participants also discussed lesson planning during student teaching. Chad talked about his ability to "wing it" while teaching; he knew what his lesson plan was "in general" but thought he did best when he improvised. Gia described how she approached planning differently at her two student teaching placements, saying that she mostly practiced piano for rehearsals at the junior high, but looked through numerous books for a variety of activities at the elementary school. Melanie shared that she did not really do much lesson planning at her high school placement. In addition, several of the participants described challenges with pacing their lessons. Diedra felt she talked too fast, and Christine had to remind herself that the high school students had a shorter attention span than she did. Veronica planned exactly what she wanted to say during instruction and was worried that organizational skills would be a challenge for her when she started teaching in her own classroom.

After student teaching, everyone except Chad, who chose not to teach, continued to discuss classroom management skills. At her long-term substitute position at two middle schools, Melanie was afraid of being a "drill sergeant," but eventually "yelled" at the students and "stopped caring." Once teaching in her own elementary classroom, she expressed concern only over kindergarten students who required "patience and energy."

Diedra and Christine developed strict rules about behavior in their middle school and high school classrooms, implementing consistent management systems. When describing her elementary students, Gia admitted that the "little ones" were particularly difficult and she planned to attend a workshop on discipline in order to get help with managing them. Veronica described her middle school students' behavior as "horrible" and found herself frustrated by her students' lack of respect.

Christine found it difficult to plan as a team-teacher once she was employed at a middle school, and admitted to "flying by the seat" of her pants. Melanie told me she "didn't know" how to plan at her first long-term substitute position. Once she was teaching in her own elementary classroom, her challenges in this area were very specific, however, and related to finding activities for sixth grade students.

Only Diedra and Melanie mentioned organizational skills after student teaching. Diedra felt like she was working extremely hard but could not stay "on top of stuff" and was frustrated that a student quit an organization she was advising due to lack of skill in this area. Melanie felt "disorganized" in her planning while at her long-term substitute position. Although she "would have liked" to have been more organized, she simply was not.

Summary of Instructional Selves Of all the instructional skills mentioned by these participants, classroom management skills were the most frequently mentioned. Prior to student teaching, there was little mention of instructional skills by participants describing themselves in the role of music teacher. During

student teaching, however, these beginning teachers mentioned a variety of instructional skills. Participants seemed to mention specific instructional skills depending on the context and/or the age of the students they were teaching. After student teaching, the participants mentioned fewer instructional skills and discussed them less frequently than during student teaching.

Professional selves. Participants' professional selves included career goals and specific information about who, what, where, and how much they would teach. Prior to student teaching, participants' discussed their decision to teach. Christine was the only participant who had always wanted to be a music teacher. Veronica and Melanie had previous degrees in vocal performance and Chad had a strong desire to perform. Diedra had been a business major and Gia had come back to school after a career working with computers. Christine, Chad, and Gia chose to teach music because of their love for the art. Melanie, Diedra, and Veronica discussed their "joy," excitement, and "ability" to "share" music with others. In addition to discussing their initial decisions to teach, some of the participants shared information about the age of student with whom they wished to work. Gia knew she wanted to teach at the elementary level, and Chad was certain that he did not want to work with elementary students. He had also already begun to question if he really wanted to teach.

During student teaching, Christine, Melanie, Diedra, and Veronica discovered what age group they wanted to teach, and for Diedra and Melanie this decision derived from both positive and negative experiences with their cooperating teachers. During student teaching, Gia's desire to teach elementary

music was also confirmed. Chad's decision to perform rather than teach was solidified at his junior high school placement.

Although Chad decided that he did not want to teach music, the remaining five participants hoped to be employed as music teachers the following semester. Of these five, everyone except for Gia desired a full-time teaching position. Gia was interested in teaching part-time so that she could be home with her young children. She also hoped to begin a master's degree.

After student teaching, the participants continued to discuss their professional selves as part of their music teacher role identities. Four of the five participants who taught the following semester accepted positions that aligned with their career goals that emerged during student teaching. Gia taught part-time at an elementary school in the school district close to her house, but was not accepted into a graduate program. She continued to take private piano lessons at the university and taught ten piano students. She was glad to be "getting experience" and was looking forward to what might come next in her career. Melanie took a position at an elementary school and was "thrilled" with her new job. Diedra began taking graduate courses toward a master's degree over the summer and accepted a combined junior high/high school position. Veronica accepted a position at a middle school. Christine was the only teacher who did not accept a position that aligned with her career goals during student teaching. Although she had once told me that she thought she would teach high school, Christine took a position teaching general music to students in grades four through eight. She accepted the position because, after attending a job fair, she

believed she was "supposed to" teach on the west side of the city. Representatives from districts located west of the city seemed most interested in her application. At her new position, Christine agreed to "go through the motions" until something better came along or her fourth grade students "graduated." She also thought she might pursue a master's degree in choral conducting.

Although Chad did not teach in public schools, he performed and "taught" by directing church choirs. He remained somewhat conflicted about not teaching and admitted he felt "guilt" over not becoming a teacher. Chad explored teaching opportunities "for the cash" but refused to teach full time, seeing it as a "distraction." His career goals continued to include performing, and he starred in several local productions.

Summary of professional selves.

Prior to student teaching, these participants expressed very basic career goals concerning their role as a music teacher. During student teaching, their goals were confirmed, clarified, or became more focused. For example, some discussed the subject matter, grade level, and degree to which they would like to teach. Chad's decision not to teach was confirmed. After student teaching, most of these participants' career goals had been realized and some mentioned additional goals, such as graduate study. Everyone except for Christine and Gia discussed their careers in the present tense. Christine and Gia continued to discuss their careers using future tense verbs.

Ideological selves. In addition to musical, instructional, and professional selves, participants revealed their ideological selves, which included expressions

156

of their beliefs about education, students, teachers, curriculum, and music as a subject. Prior to student teaching, all six participants expressed beliefs about teaching music. Gia, Melanie, Christine, and Veronica expressed beliefs that were focused on what students would gain from being in their music classroom. Chad discussed his beliefs about who he thought a "music teacher" was. Diedra mentioned that she thought a classroom should be "orderly."

During student teaching, Chad described what he believed his role as a teacher should be. He also expressed what he felt were "engaging" activities for his students. While at his junior high school placement, Chad reacted to beliefs of his cooperating teacher that contrasted with his own. Christine expressed beliefs about acting "professionally" as a music teacher. She also discussed her beliefs about when she believed sight singing should be taught to high school students. Veronica verbalized her beliefs about disciplining students, seeing it as a matter of "choosing your battles." Diedra discussed her beliefs about her role as a teacher, saying she wanted to help students "grow as people" and "understand who they are" because of her. Both Gia and Melanie carried over beliefs they had prior to student teaching. Both had wanted their students to be excited about learning prior to student teaching. During student teaching, when Melanie saw students looking bored in her classroom, she told them to "act excited" even if they were not. Gia described a successful lesson at her elementary placement, saying that the students "got excited" when she taught a lesson using scarves.

After student teaching, Gia discussed how much her students "enjoyed music." Describing her current job as "getting experience," Gia revealed that she

continued to believe that teaching was a "continuous learning process." Veronica expressed her beliefs about what she felt was an "ideal choral tone" after student teaching. Diedra discussed her desire to make "monsters" of her students by teaching them to sight-sing, learn quality literature, and the International Phonetic Alphabet, revealing that she believed these things were important.

Summary of ideological selves. The participants in this study discussed their ideological selves by expressing their beliefs about education, students, teachers, curriculum, and music as a subject. They revealed the greatest number and variety of beliefs during student teaching. Some of their beliefs originated prior to student teaching, but others emerged during one or both of their student teaching placements. Beliefs appeared to change as a result of their experiences in various teaching settings and their interactions with cooperating teachers and students. Throughout the study, participants' beliefs concerned themselves, their students, education, curriculum, or music as a subject.

Chapter Summary

The first purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching, whether those role identities changed, and if so, how they changed. After examining what six beginning music teachers discussed when describing themselves in the role of teacher, it became apparent that their music teacher role identities included the following components: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. Each of the beginning teachers' music teacher role identities included a unique combination of these four components

and, as the study continued, change occurred. Throughout the year of study, some components were mentioned with more or less frequency, mentioned with greater variety, or not mentioned at all.

A second purpose of this study was to define "music teacher role identity." In the last chapter of this dissertation, I will present my definition of "music teacher role identity," discuss the data explored in this chapter, relate findings to previous literature, and make suggestions for both practice and future research.

Chapter Six: Discussion

Introduction

"Would you tell me, please, which way I ought to walk from here?" "That depends a good deal on where you want to get to," said the Cat. "I don't much care where," said Alice. "Then it doesn't matter which way you walk," said the Cat. "—so long as I get somewhere," Alice added as an explanation. "Oh, you're sure to do that," said the Cat, "if you only walk long enough!" (Carroll, 1974, p. 66-67)

One purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching, whether those role identities changed, and if so, how they changed. A second purpose of the study was to create my own definition of the term, "music teacher role identity."

At the beginning of this study, I had my own working definition of "music teacher role identity," but knew that I would need to further clarify the term for myself and others. As I read the literature, I found that researchers not only define this term in different ways, but also use a variety of terms, such as "role identity," "teacher role identity," and "identity" when discussing it. As I proceeded, it became apparent that I would need to establish my own definition of music teacher role identity based on both previous research and the data gathered from this study. In the pages that follow, I will discuss the challenges of defining "music teacher role identity," as well as offer questions that might guide researchers when studying music teacher role identity. I then propose my own

definition of the term, followed by findings related to previous literature, suggestions for practice, and recommendations for future research.

Challenges in Defining Music Teacher Role Identity

Determining a definition of music teacher role identity, a goal of this study, was problematic. As I reread the literature while conducting data analysis, I found that each of the existing definitions discussed in Chapter Two had limitations for my study. Further, the definitions I examined were not all based on the term "music teacher role identity." McCall and Simmons (1996) used the term "role identity" whereas Roberts' (2000) definition was based on simply "identity." Knowles' (1992) constructed his definition on the term "teacher role identity."

At the beginning of my data analysis, I chose to use McCall and Simmons' *(1966) definition of role identity. They defined it as "the character and the role* that an individual devises for himself as an occupant of a particular social position. More intuitively, such a role identity is his imaginative view of himself as he likes to think of himself being and acting as an occupant of that position" (pp. 67-68). For these authors, a *character* is "a person with a distinctive organization of such personal characteristics as appearance, mannerisms, habits, traits, motives, and social statuses" (p. 58). Although I initially found McCall and Simmons' definition useful, it did not include the musical, instructional, professional, and ideological components that emerged as important for the participants in this study.

Roberts (2000) discussed the difficulty of using sociological terms in music education literature. At one time he saw terms like "role," "identity," and others to be synonyms, but in this later work, he realized that he lacked a clear understanding of the differentiations between terms because he had not kept up with changes in the meanings of terms taking place in the field of sociology. Roberts came to define identity as "something which is actively negotiated by oneself or on behalf of someone" (p. 56). He originally saw the term *socialization* to be a larger category of identity construction, but eventually understood that "one's identity does not necessarily totally conform to the socialization model nor accept all that is being 'taught socially'" (p. 56). Despite his understanding of the term "identity," he warned others to "tread carefully in the murky waters of sociological constructs" (p. 56). I took Roberts' advice to "tread carefully." His definition helped me clarify that identity was not only about a person's perception of him/herself, but also about others' perceptions of that individual (Brewer, 2009).

Like Roberts, Regelski (2007) believed that researchers hold varied meanings for terms like "teacher identity." He described how identity is often organized around "central axes" (p. 16), where individuals see themselves in terms of a "chief identity" with other, lesser, identities surrounding it. The axis can shift, allowing individuals to emphasize one identity over another at different times. The data from this study did not contradict Regelski's statements about teacher identity; however, the focus of this study did not include looking at "chief" versus "lesser" identities. Therefore, I continued to reexamine other

162

definitions that might address the components of identity that emerged from my data.

Dolloff's (2007) statements caused me to think more clearly about the terms "role" and "identity." She explained that "role" is what a teacher does and "identity" is what a teacher is. Dolloff was concerned with how the music education profession makes distinctions between identity, professional identity, and role identity. She believed that music educators see teaching as something they do rather than something they are. She then differentiated ideas about identity using capital and lower-case letters in a way similar to Regelski's ideas about "chief" and "lesser" identities. Identity with a capital "I" is how an individual sees him or herself in general, whereas identity with a lower-case "i" refers to the many identities we assign ourselves based on various contexts in our life. Dolloff calls identities "multiple and complex" and "fluid and ever shifting" (p. 17). Data from this current study support Dolloff's statements about identity being "multiple and complex" as well as "fluid and ever shifting." Further, her statements about music educators seeing teaching as something they *do* offers one explanation of why the participants in this study kept discussing their instructional and musical selves. However, data from this study also included participants' professional and ideological selves, which concern *who they are* rather than what they do.

Bernard used the term "musician-teacher identity" to describe the identities of six elementary school music teachers who were also active musicians. She suggested that "musician-teacher identity" might be understood by

163

looking at professional discourse about music teachers and identity, characterizations of music-making experiences, and personal relevance of those music-making experiences. Bernard believed these three elements interact in a non-hierarchical, non-sequenced way that is different for each "musician-teacher." A year later, Bernard (2006) described identity as "an ever-unfolding process rather than a static entity that is fixed" (p. 70). Like Dolloff (2007), she believed that identity could have several components that may or may not be in conflict with one another. Data from this study support Bernard's definition that identity was not "static" or "fixed," however her study was primarily focused on music teachers who were active musicians and music-making outside of the classroom was not a focus of this current study, except as arose in Chad's case.

MacLure (1993) defined identity as "something teachers use to justify, explain, and make sense of themselves in relation to other people, and to the contexts in which they operate" (p. 312). She elaborated by calling identity a form of "argument." The participants in this current study clearly used their developing music teacher role identities to "justify, explain, and make sense of themselves in relation to" others and to their teaching contexts. Based on what I learned from the participants in my study, I agree with much of MacLure's definition. Although the word "something" is vague, it may refer to words, perceptions, or self-images people use to "make sense of themselves." This study focused on the words the participants used to describe themselves as teachers as indicators of their developing music teacher role identities.

Knowles (1992) discussed the formation of teacher role identities based on beginning teachers' biographies. He defined teacher role-identity as "the way in which individuals think about themselves as teachers" and "the images they have of self-as-teacher" (p. 99). He found that the ways in which beginning teachers managed difficult situations in teaching and the ways in which they thought about problems involved in teaching were related to prior experiences. In other words, an individual's identity is "wrapped in negative or positive orientations" determined by experiences they have in the school environment (p. 143). This helps explain why some of the participants in this current study identified with a particular grade level and/or subject matter after positive or negative experiences with their cooperating teachers during student teaching. For example, the negativity displayed by Diedra's cooperating teacher at the elementary school may explain why Diedra chose to be a secondary choral educator rather than an elementary music specialist. Similarly, the lack of attention Melanie received from her cooperating teacher at her high school placement may account for why she saw herself as an elementary music specialist. The second part of Knowles' definition, "the images they have of self-as-teacher," leaves room for the researcher to interpret whether this "image" is "imaginative" or a reflection of actual practice. I believe this is a strong point of his definition because the participants in my study viewed their identities in both concrete and imaginative dimensions.

As I inched closer to a definition of music teacher role identity that would best reflect the findings of this study, I reexamined one more source, a literature

review, to make sure that I had a broad understanding of how others had identified this term. Beijard, Meijer, and Verloop (2004) reviewed literature concerning teachers' professional identity. In the literature they examined, some of the researchers failed to define "professional identity" and others used a variety of definitions. At the end of their review, the authors determined that the literature they studied viewed a professional teaching identity as an ongoing process, concerned a person and their context, consisted of sub-identities, and involved teachers being part of the process of identity development. These statements summarized other definitions that I have already discussed, and, although I found aspects of all these definitions of identity assisted me in interpreting my study's data, I was left with more questions than answers. In the next section, I will discuss the many questions one might address in researching music teacher role identity, with the hope that a useful and clear definition might emerge.

Studying "Music Teacher Role Identity"

After reading numerous definitions related to the term "music teacher role identity," my search for a clear definition still seemed fuzzy. I began to understand that perhaps the definition was unclear because of the variety of ways in which a researcher might examine music teacher role identity. As I reviewed the various studies included in Chapter Two, I began to categorize the ways through which music teacher role identity has been and might be researched. This made it possible for me to compare research studies in my quest to determine a useable definition of music teacher role identity. To help myself clarify the overlaps and gaps among the various definitions of teacher role-identity, I asked

myself a series of one-word questions: who, what, where, when, how, and why? Although I ask these questions with regard to music teacher role identity, similar questions may also be useful in studying teacher identity in other subject areas.

Who? What kinds of music teachers are being studied? Band directors? Elementary general music instructors? Public or private school music teachers? Private applied instructors? Are the study's participants prospective music teachers who have not yet entered college? Are they enrolled in music teacher education programs or doing their student teaching? Are they already teaching music, and if so, how many years of experience do they have? Who is doing the examining? Are researchers, cooperating teachers, university supervisors, or others looking at beginning music teachers' identities or are the music teachers themselves examining their own identities? Do others influence or impact music teacher role identity development? Who are those influential others? Are they instructors, family members, peers, students, or all of the above?

What? What specific aspects of music teacher role identities are researchers investigating? Are they observing individual components of identities or are their studies more focused on the perceptions particular individuals have of themselves as music teachers? Are researchers including others' perceptions of that individual in their study? Are they studying a specific time period or are they examining a person's identity development across time? Are researchers determining the strength or weakness of one's music teacher role identity? Are they studying music teacher role identities in comparison with, or as aspects of, "musician" or other role identities? Do they account for variations in music

167

teacher role identities such as that of "band director" versus "middle school general music teacher?"

Where? What role does context play in music teacher role identity? For example, is an individual's music teacher role identity different from one student teaching placement to another or, once teaching, from one school to another? Is music teacher role identity different in the classroom than at the grocery store or a church meeting? Where do individuals begin to develop a music teacher role identity? Is it in a public school classroom while observing other music teachers? Is it during internships? Does it happen during student teaching? Is music teacher role identity developed while enrolled in university coursework? Or is it developed through a mix of school classroom experiences, university coursework, and other experiences?

When? At what point in an individual's life does his or her music teacher role identity emerge? Is there a point when it stops emerging/changing/evolving? If so, when? Are there crucial time periods or experiences? When do they occur? At what point do individuals make decisions to become music teachers? Does their music teacher role identity begin at a specific point or does it develop from early childhood experiences with teachers and others in a teaching role? If something about their music teacher role identity changes, when does that change or changes occur?

How? How do individuals and others understand and communicate music teacher role identities? What methods are used to study music teacher role identity? Do researchers look for body language, listen for words, or use other

168

indicators (e.g. Dolloff's pictures)? In what ways do researchers report their findings? Through what philosophical or theoretical lens are they interpreting data?

Why? What is the purpose of the study? Why are researchers studying music teacher role identity? What do they hope to gain or understand from the study? Why do teachers perceive themselves in particular ways or exhibit particular music teacher role identities? Are there cultural, personal, or experiential factors involved in the development of—or expression of—one's music teacher role identity?

The possible ways of examining music teacher role identity appear endless, offering limitless possibilities for continued research. Before offering my own definition of music teacher role identity, I situate my study in relation to the above questions: who, what, where, when, how, and why?

Who? In this study, I examined six beginning music teachers enrolled in a music education program at a large university in the southwest. Each of the participants specialized in vocal and/or general music. *What?* The focus of the study was to examine these individuals' music teacher role identities and whether or not those identities changed in the course of a year. *Where?* I investigated these participants' music teacher role identities primarily at the university where they were enrolled, at each of their student teaching placements, and then in each of their music classrooms after student teaching. *When?* This study took place over the course of one year and included periods prior to, during, and after student teaching for each participant. *How?* For this study, I used a variety of techniques

169

to determine these individuals' music teacher role identities, including interviews, observations, video tapes, and electronic communication. I chose to present my findings in the form of individual case studies for each of the six participants. I analyzed the data by using my research questions to compare the individual case studies. *Why?* It is my hope that this study will help music teacher educators better understand how beginning music teachers see themselves. This information may not only improve the quality of education for future music teachers, but may also improve the quality of education for those whom they teach.

Considerations When Defining "Music Teacher Role Identity" The questions above helped me better understand what others (e.g., Deegan, 2008; Dolloff, 2007; Regelski, 2007; Roberts, 2000) meant in saying that music teacher role identity is far more complex than it initially appears to be. As there are varied lenses through which one might view music teacher role identity, as well as different theoretical frameworks, it may be impossible to create a working definition of music teacher role identity that would be useful for all researchers interested in the topic. Nonetheless, I will attempt the task of defining music teacher role identity in terms of perceptions, meanings, components, influences, and development.

Perceptions. I begin by saying that music teacher role identities are comprised of both self-perceptions and the perceptions of others when looking at an individual in the role of music teacher (Brewer, 2009). These perceptions may be based on one's personal experience as a music teacher, one's perceptions of the experiences with other music teachers, images of music teachers in the media, or

170

other factors. Further, individuals' perceptions of themselves in the role of music teacher may or may not align with others' perceptions. Regardless, it is important to consider multiple perceptions when looking at music teacher role identity.

Meaning(s). In addition to perceptions, the term "music teacher" holds various meanings for individuals. For example, the subject matter, the age of the student one teaches and the context in which one teaches can change the meaning of the term "music teacher" for that individual. Specific labels such as "choir director" and "string specialist" also hold meanings that vary between individuals. Therefore, it is important to consider that a person's music teacher role identity is closely tied to the meaning(s) that individual associates with that role.

Components. Along with considering perceptions and the meanings of music teacher role identities, it is important to remember that role identities consist of multiple components. In this study, the six beginning vocal/general music teachers' music teacher role identities included musical, instructional, professional, and ideological selves. Other beginning vocal/general music teachers, more experienced music teachers, and those whose specialty is instrumental music education may have other components as part of their music teacher role identities. Further, some components may have greater significance for one individual than they do for another. Regardless, researchers may want to keep in mind that an individual's music teacher role identity may consist of multiple components.

Influences. While it is important to remember that music teacher role identities may contain multiple components, it is also helpful to understand that

these identities are influenced by a variety of factors. Influences include the

media, music teachers, teachers outside the field of music, family members,

experiences, contexts, and others. Influences may be conscious or subconscious

and may affect an individual temporarily or over a long period of time.

      Development. In addition to considering perceptions, meanings,

components, and influences concerning music teacher role identity, music teacher

role identities may develop and change over time. In this study, I looked at the

music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and

after student teaching. The six participants in this study possessed at least three

"stages" of identities: imagined, transitional, and emergent. Recognizing that the

findings from this study can not be generalized to all beginning music teachers, in

the following paragraphs, I will describe the three "stages" each of these

participants experienced with their developing music teacher role identities.

Stages of Music Teacher Role Identity

      I found that as the participants' music teacher role identities changed over

time, they exhibited several different types and/or stages: imagined, transitional,

emergent, and secondary music teacher role identities.

      Imagined music teacher role identity. Prior to student teaching, the

participants in this study had what could be described as an "imagined" music

teacher role identity (Dolloff, 1999; McCall & Simmons, 1996; Weber &

Mitchell, 1995). They talked about teaching music using mostly future-tense

verbs and were able to speak of themselves only in terms of how they hoped they

would be as a teacher. Some continued to use future-tense verbs even at the end of

student teaching. Although some discussed their musical and instructional selves prior to student teaching, they were not yet using musical and instructional skills in a teaching setting. Therefore, these skills did not appear to be important components of their music teacher role identities at the time.

Transitional music teacher role identity. While participants were student teaching, they each developed a "transitional" music teacher role identity. In two different settings, they began to adapt their ideological, musical, and instructional selves to actual teaching experiences. Many spoke of a tension between no longer being a student and not yet having their "own" teaching classrooms. Some struggled with their own ideology or beliefs versus the beliefs of the cooperating teachers with whom they were working. As the participants experienced teaching in a classroom for an extended period of time, their experiences often conflicted with their "imagined" music teacher role identity.

Emergent music teacher role identity. After student teaching, the participants had a more realistic view of who they were as a teacher. They had gained experience and were now teaching in their own classrooms. At this time, they had what I have chosen to call an "emergent" music teacher role identity. Consistent with the view of identity as a continual process with no real end point, I use the word "emergent" with the image of a hatching chick in mind. During the first semester of the first year of teaching, the beginning music teacher is just discovering the world of music teaching in an authentic way. While their experiences in the "protective shell" of university education and student teaching are important, this is their first chance to see themselves as independent music

teachers. The term "emergent" does not suggest a pending arrival, but, like the baby chick, the beginning music teacher experiences continuous growth and change that likely extend throughout his or her life. Therefore an individual's music teacher role identity is not stable, but is always emerging (Beijard, Meijer, & Verloop, 2004; MacLure, 1993) and ever shifting (Dolloff, 2007).

Secondary music teacher role identity. Because the outcome of his experience was so different from the other participants in this study, it is important to discuss Chad, the one beginning music teacher who decided not to pursue a public school teaching position after graduation. Like the other participants, he appeared to have an "imagined," "transitional," and "emergent" music teacher role identity. When Chad began student teaching at the junior high school, however, he talked less positively about himself as a teacher and was only willing to teach as a means to fulfill his other goals. At this time, Chad's music teacher role identity was becoming "secondary" to his "performer identity" (Regelski, 2007). According to Knowles (1992), an identity evolves and is "wrapped in negative or positive orientations" (p. 143). If a person comes to student teaching with a negative teacher role identity and then has negative experiences in the school environment, they may continue to have a negative teacher role identity. Chad often complained about early mornings, long hours, and having to "perform" for others without the fun of "lights" and "costumes." The reality of having to discipline misbehaving students at the junior high school and work with a cooperating teacher, whom he saw as inferior, finalized his

174

decision to emphasize performance, even as he pursued his need for an occasional "fix" of teaching.

A Definition: Music Teacher Role Identity

Although music teacher role identity is difficult to define, I have outlined some important aspects of it that may guide future researchers in this area. Throughout this chapter, I have purposely avoided the phrase "music teacher role identity is" because a short, dictionary-style definition does not seem sufficient to fully encompass the many facets of the term. Even so, I find it necessary to summarize what I have said in the preceding paragraphs. Therefore, one might view music teacher role identity as an aspect of oneself related to music teaching that develops over time, influenced by various factors, and comprised of particular components. It involves one's own perceptions as well as the perceptions of others, and varied meanings are associated with it. In the next section, I discuss findings related to previous literature and offer suggestions for those who teach beginning music teachers.

Findings Related to Previous Literature

McCall and Simmons (1966) believe

the contents of a person's role identities provide him with criteria for appraising his own actual performances . . . [and] actions that are not consonant with one's imaginations of self as a person in a particular social position are regarded as embarrassing, threatening, and disconcerting; if possible, they will be discontinued and superseded by actions more in keeping with one's view of self (p. 69).

The music teacher role identities of the participants in this study included four main components: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. Prior to and during student teaching, these beginning music teachers discussed their musical and instructional selves mostly in terms of what they believed to be weaknesses. Therefore, they not only mentioned particular skills, but also assessed their skills, presumably by an imagined standard. This finding supports McCall and Simmons' statement that new role-holders' imaginations of self in a role include "high ideal standards" (p. 214). Perhaps the participants in this current study described their weaknesses because the experiences they had with particular skills while teaching did not align with their imagined music teacher role identities. As the study continued, the participants described their attempts to improve weak skills. By the end of student teaching, Diedra and Christine chose to see their weak piano skills as beneficial for their students. This data also support McCall and Simmons' work:

> As the person learns more and more about the role, his imaginations of self in that role come to incorporate a more and more representative range of behaviors and, equally important, some alternative sets of standards for evaluating performances in that role. (p. 216)

In addition to supporting the work of McCall and Simmons, data from this study support previous research in the field of teacher role-identity and music teacher role identity. For example, Beijard, Verloop, and Vermunt (2000) found that teachers identify themselves as subject matter, pedagogical, and didactical experts; sixty-nine percent of the participants in their study indicated there had

176

been a change in their perceptions of their professional identity since they were beginning teachers. The participants in this current study described musical and instructional selves as aspects of their role identities. Although I did not use the terms Beijard, Verloop, and Vermunt did, my terms are similar to the authors' definitions of subject matter and pedagogical expertise. The participants in this study also changed over time, discussing musical selves less after student teaching. Although the findings of these two studies are similar, they are difficult to compare because this current study concerned beginning music teachers and the participants in Beijard, Verloop, and Vermunt's study were at various stages of their careers and reflected on their earlier years. Perhaps another explanation for why the participants in this current study became less focused on their musical selves may be that they no longer received "support" for their "musician identity" once they were student teaching (Bouij, 2004). Another reason for less focus on their musical selves could be that the other components of these participants' identities were challenging for them.

The concept of a "musician" identity vs. a "music teacher identity" was present in this study (Roberts, 1991), although not to the extent as in other studies. Roberts found that music education students seek to be labeled as a "musician" even after graduating and becoming music teachers, but for these participants, this was only true of Chad and Gia. After student teaching, Gia continued to take piano lessons from a professor at the university. Chad decided to perform after graduation, and although music was often part of his performance, he referred to himself as an "actor" rather than a "musician." The other four participants did not

177

express that they wished to be seen as musicians, contrasting Roberts' (1991) findings.

Despite not identifying themselves primarily as a "musician," when these participants described themselves in the role of teacher, it became clear that their views of themselves were different from one another. Bouij (2004) identified four categories of music students: performer, musician, content-centered teacher, and student-centered teacher. Prior to choosing music education, Gia, Veronica, Chad and Melanie had seen themselves as "performers." Diedra described herself as a "musician" and Christine spoke of herself as a content-centered teacher. Once these participants began student teaching, everyone except for Gia and Melanie discussed themselves in a way that could be identified as a content-centered teacher. Gia and Melanie appeared to be pupil-centered teachers. As the study continued, Diedra also appeared to be a student-centered teacher, whereas Chad's role-identity continued to be that of a performer.

In addition to being content-centered or student-centered, the music teacher role identities of these six participants were related to their experiences in childhood (Day & Leitch, 2001; Knowles, 1991; Samuel & Stephens, 2000). Veronica went to an all girls' high school and expressed difficulty being able to motivate male students once student teaching. Melanie had had a bad experience with a teacher who yelled at her as a child and was hesitant to adapt the role of "authoritarian" to her music teacher role identity. Gia had overcome many obstacles as a child, including moving many times and learning a new language. When challenged in coursework, student teaching, and part-time teaching, she

178

maintained an optimistic view of herself as a music teacher and did not seem shaken when she experienced difficulty.

Eventually, the participants told me that they began to feel more "comfortable" as music teachers, but this was not initially the case. While student teaching, Melanie found she needed to "switch" to "another" version of herself, an "authoritarian," which for her meant "learning how to become someone else" (Sumara & Luce-Kapler, 1996, p. 79). Other beginning music teachers in this study found it necessary to discard aspects of their personalities which they felt did not align with the idea of being a teacher (Sumara & Luce-Kapler, 1996). For example, Christine was hesitant to show her "silly" side to students until she felt they viewed her as their teacher rather than a friend. Chad said he often "edited his thoughts" that would be appropriate in a theater setting, but were not his "role" as a teacher.

As student teaching continued, the participants in this study defined themselves in new ways. Veronica, Chad, and Diedra each described themselves as "not like" their cooperating teachers. Chad did not agree with his cooperating teacher's view of students, Veronica thought her cooperating teacher was too "confrontational and bold," and Diedra saw herself as having a different personality from her elementary cooperating teacher. Their stories are similar to a teacher in MacLure's (1993) study who defined herself in contrast to those she called "trendies."

Some researchers (Dolloff, 1999; Weber and Mitchell, 1995) suggest that teachers hold a "collective ideal" of what it means to be a teacher. While I did

179

find evidence that these participants had an imagined ideal of their music teacher role identity, they did not discuss this ideal in terms of images of teachers they saw in the media. When participants described themselves in the role of music teacher, they used the words "I" and "me." Further, I did not specifically address this concept in this study.

While studying beginning music teachers' music teacher role identities, I was particularly interested in whether or not they changed. After finding that the participants' music teacher role identities did change, I discovered that Neale and Griffin's (2006) model of work roles and role transitions may be useful in explaining how they changed. This model is based on three components: system requirements, role schemas, and self-concept. System requirements are those things demanded of an individual by his or her employer, whereas role schemas are an individual's preexisting ideas about typical behaviors of one holding a given role in society. Role schemas are based on experience, observations of others in roles, job training, and socialization. A self-concept is "a cognitive schema that filters, stores, and organizes information about the self" (p. 29). According to Neale and Griffin, enacting in a particular role brings forth parts of one's self-concept. Aspects of the self-concept can change in response to various contexts. Neale and Griffin explain the transition of roles as occurring in two stages. First, something happens to change the individual's expectations of behavior, and then the individual goes through a behavior adjustment process. Individuals will change behaviors so that as many behaviors as possible are common to system requirements, role schema, and self-concept.

180

In this study, the participants had two major transitions: from music student to student teacher and from student teacher to music teacher. Smaller transitions took place from one student teaching experience to another. During student teaching, the "employers" were their cooperating teachers. As these participants moved from one context to another, they made adjustments to their music teacher role identities, thereby changing them. Each setting required different musical and instructional selves and their career goals. They also adjusted their professional and ideological selves from one setting to another as well. Neale and Griffin's models of work roles and role transitions offer an explanation of how changes may have occurred in the music teacher role identities of the participants in this study.

Suggestions for Practice

After studying the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers, I determined that their role identities included four broad components: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. I also learned how those role identities changed over the course of a year. Additionally, based on previous literature and the findings from this study, I created a workable definition for the term, "music teacher role identity," in light of my data analysis. I now offer several suggestions for practice in the field of music teacher education: perceptions of self and others, lesson planning, teaching ability, cooperating teachers, experience, and communication.

Perceptions of self and others. In this study, how participants described themselves did not always align with the way that others talked about them. It

181

may be helpful for mentors to identify and acknowledge the differences between their own and others' perceptions of preservice teachers and the perceptions the beginning teachers have of themselves. Study of others' perceptions of individual beginning music teachers may also reveal important information about how those others see themselves as music teachers. In this study, I realized that being able to "do" certain things was an important component of my own music teacher role identity. For example, I have always found my ability to play the piano effectively in a choral rehearsal an important component of my role as a choir director. Perhaps this is why I was able to notice that quality in others. It is important for music teacher educators to be aware of how their own identities, or those of other teachers in the community, might influence the music teacher role identities of future music teachers enrolled in their university programs. It may also be important for them to acknowledge, allow, and encourage differences in the music teacher role identities among preservice music teachers.

Lesson planning. Lesson planning in the choral classroom was generally lacking among these participants during student teaching. Many of these beginning teachers focused on rehearsing; their plans included measure numbers and short notes about sections being covered that day, but no details about how to rehearse those sections. None of the plans included national standards such as improvising and relating music to other arts. Perhaps this was because including national standards in their lesson planning was not stressed in their choral methods course. Or it may have been because some of the cooperating teachers at the schools did all the planning, and did not include the student teachers in

182

planning. Other problems with lesson planning included not knowing where to begin and "winging it" (Schmidt, 2005). Music teacher educators may want to question what is taught about lesson planning in methods courses to determine ways in which lesson planning challenges during student teaching may be prevented or, at least, lessened. They might also investigate how cooperating teachers, with whom student teachers are working, view lesson planning. Identifying cooperating teachers who plan in a way that supports the music department's lesson plan model may help student teachers develop this skill throughout student teaching.

Teaching ability. Dr. Langston, the professor who taught the choral methods course, discussed Christine and Chad's "natural abilities" as teachers. I asked him what he meant by that and, at first, he said they had "confidence." Later, when discussing Christine, he reminded me of her "natural abilities as a teacher" and added the phrase "whatever that means" to the end of his sentence. As a profession, we seem to recognize that some students possess "natural abilities." What do we mean when we say that? We might need to ask ourselves how telling a beginning teacher that he or she is a "natural" teacher affects his or her music teacher role identity. We may also need to consider how comments or beliefs such as "so and so is wired to teach elementary" might influence a beginning teacher's music teacher role identity. When and why are such comments helpful, hurtful, or neutral?

Gia's professors did not describe her as a "natural teacher." Instead, they discussed her lack of ability to sequence instruction and "to transfer knowledge."

What was the relationship between the struggles she experienced as a music education major and her music teacher role identity? Music teacher educators and cooperating teachers encounter situations where they have serious concerns about an individual beginning teacher, and there are few clear lines to indicate when the concerns are serious enough to remove a student from the certification program. We may ask ourselves if there is a way to develop a set of flexible guidelines with clear expectations to allow struggling students chances to improve, while maintaining high standards for future music educators. Some of us may already do this successfully, and perhaps we need to share more of our strategies with each other.

Although Gia received a great deal of negative feedback, it seemed that she chose to hear only the positive remarks. In contrast, Diedra considered some of her teaching "bad," despite positive comments from others. How can music teacher educators help student teachers become more conscious of their language regarding their own teaching abilities, whether they describe themselves as "bad" or "good" teachers?" What can we do to help them gain a more specific, less value-laden view of their teaching?

Cooperating teachers. Chad, Melanie, Gia, and Diedra had highly contrasting experiences from one student teaching placement to another. Melanie and Gia taught regularly with one of their cooperating teachers, but very little with the other, despite being at each placement for equal amounts of time. Chad and Diedra had good relationships and a high level of respect for one of their cooperating teachers, but poor relationships and little respect for the other. The

relationships these participants established with their cooperating teachers, regardless of the amount of teaching experience the cooperating teachers had, appeared to be very important in the development of these beginning teachers' music teacher role identities. Since placing student teachers is often a tedious process, determined by the location of schools, the cooperation of local school systems, the availability of cooperating teachers, and other factors, music teacher educators might consider the kinds of support they might offer those beginning teachers with less-than-ideal placements. This study was in a large metropolitan area with many possibilities for matching cooperating teachers with student teachers. This problem is even more challenging for teacher education programs in smaller towns and rural areas.

Experience. Many of the participants told me that with "time and experience," they would feel more confident in the classroom. How much time do they need and what kinds of experiences do they value? Schmidt (2010) found that the participants in her study valued peer teaching experiences, field experiences, and student teaching, as well as other experiences such as teaching private lessons, assisting with marching band or teaching in the university-based String Project. Further, while beginning music teachers have many experiences while learning to teach, it is the *quality* of those experiences that is most important (Dewey in Schmidt, 2010).

Berliner (2008) found that expertise in pedagogy is "developed slowly over many years by highly motivated individuals" (p. 822). Knowing this, what can we expect beginning teachers to master while enrolled in coursework and

185

during student teaching? Further, how does time and experience factor into skill development? How much about time and experience are music teacher educators able to control? What about experiences outside of the teacher education process (Brewer, 2009; Schmidt, 2010)? What are cooperating teachers' and teacher educators' expectations for change to beginning music teachers' role identities during and after student teaching? We may need to continue to examine our expectations as music teacher educators to see if they are realistic for all students.

Confidence and mastery of skills. Some of these participants lacked confidence in the classroom because they perceived their musical or instructional selves as weak, especially regarding playing the piano and managing student behaviors perceived as disruptive or disrespectful. Although Dr. Stewart, Dr. Gilley, and Dr. Langston required these participants to demonstrate piano skills in each of their methods courses, some of the students still struggled to play the piano well while student teaching. While managing students, these participants expressed that they were afraid of appearing "mean" or hurting their students' feelings. Further, for some of these beginning music teachers, their weak piano skills, which interacted with pace and delivery, were the cause of student misbehavior, bringing their confidence level while teaching even lower. How can music teacher educators help their students develop coping strategies that will help them be successful while they gain experience that will eventually enable them to master these skills? During and after student teaching, some participants gained confidence by proving to themselves they had the skills and/or rationalizing how their lack of certain skills was really an asset. What can teacher

186

educators do to help future music educators feel more confident even when their skills are not at mastery level?

Communication. I learned about the components of these six participants' music teacher role identities by examining what they talked about when describing themselves in the role of teacher. What they talked about was important, but what they did not reveal may also be important. I worked with these beginning teachers for a year and knew each of them prior to that, but there were still things they did not tell me. For example, Gia did not want to discuss her teaching once she was employed as a part-time teacher after student teaching. It may be difficult for some beginning music teachers to reveal information about themselves to others.

Music teacher educators might think about how they could create an atmosphere that allows beginning music teachers to freely share aspects of their music teacher role identities without critique or judgment. Time spent talking directly about identity may be helpful. Many teacher educators and music teacher educators have been successful in providing opportunities for their students to explore their teacher role identities including having them write autobiographies (Day & Leitch, 2001), write emotionally (Deegan, 2008), write about their personal teaching metaphors (Bullough, 1991; Dolloff, 1999; Weber & Mitchell, 1995), write musical biographies documenting important musical events in their lives (Bernard, 2006), write about experiences in music education that were "memorable" (Dolloff, 1999), answer questions about their role identities (Dolloff, 2007), create masks to wear (Day & Leitch, 2001) and draw images of

teachers (Dolloff, 1999; Weber & Mitchell, 1995). In what other ways can we help future music teachers develop their music teacher role identities?

Recommendations for Future Research

Longitudinal studies. As discussed throughout this chapter, there are many ways to study music teacher role identity. One purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching, whether those identities changed during that time and, if so, in what ways. Whereas many have studied the music teacher and teacher role identities of those prior to (Bouij, 2004; Dolloff,1999; Isbell, 2008; Roberts, 1991, 2004; Sumara & Luce-Kapler, 1996), during (Bullough, 1991; Deegan, 2008; Knowles, 1992; Samuel & Stephens, 2000), and after student teaching (Beijaard, Verloop, &Vermunt, 2000; Bernard, 2004; Cox, 1994; Day & Leitch, 2001; MacLure, 1993; Weber & Mitchell, 1995), fewer have studied all three time periods or periods beyond the first semester of teaching (Bouij, 1998). Additional longitudinal studies in varied contexts both inside and outside of the music classroom are needed, to examine the music teacher role identity development of beginners beyond this study's participants. Although such studies are time consuming and daunting, more lifelong studies of music teacher role identity, beginning with children possessing a strong musical aptitude and continuing throughout their first several years of music teaching are also needed. Perhaps music education researchers might model these studies after those being done by the Hoenny Center for Research and Development in Teaching (www.hoennycenter.org).

Stages and change. I found changes over time in the components of the

music teacher role identities of the six participants in this study. Researchers

studying teacher role-identity outside of the field of music have also found

evidence that changes in identity occur. For example, the participants in Beijard,

Verloop, and Vermunt's (2000) study indicated that there had been changes in

their professional identity since they were beginning teachers. Sumara and Luce-

Kapler (1996) identified three stages of teacher role-identity development, finding

that they occurred prior to university coursework, during university coursework,

and during student teaching. Samuel and Stephens (2000) differentiated two

distinct selves, shaped by different life stages: a "personal self," shaped by family

and other childhood experiences and a "professional self" shaped by the

university. The music teacher role identities of the six participants in this current

study suggested three stages of development: imagined, transitional, and

emergent. I identified these stages as occurring prior to, during and after student

teaching. More research should be done to investigate various "stages" of music

teacher role identity and when and how they occur for beginning music teachers.

Components. One of the most important findings of this study was

discovering the components of these individuals' music teacher role identities.

These included musical, instructional, professional, and ideological selves. Other

researchers, however, have found different facets of teacher role identities, such

as subject matter, pedagogical, and didactical expertise (Beijard, Verloop, &

Vermunt, 2000). More studies are needed regarding the various components of

189

music teacher role identities, if certain components are stronger than others, and if so, why, and in what contexts?

Influences. In this study I did not look at the origins of these beginning music teachers' music teacher role identities, nor did I specifically address what may have influenced or caused change in those identities. I simply documented what they discussed about themselves in the role of music teacher, whether that changed, and, if so, in what ways it changed. Although some researchers have studied various influences on preservice (Isbell, 2008) and inservice (Cox, 1994) music teachers' role identities, further research is needed to determine the variety of influences that might prompt change in one's music teacher role identity or in the components of that identity.

Conflicts. Roberts (2004) described beginning music teachers as experiencing a war between a "teaching self" and "musician self," seeing their role as a musician as superior to their role as a teacher. Veronica and Melanie both had performance degrees prior to becoming certified to teach and Gia began her music studies as a piano performance major. Chad seemed to struggle between being a teacher and being a performer in musical theater. Christine was not accepted into a saxophone studio so she auditioned for the music education program as a voice major, which forced her to revise her developing music teacher role identity. Diedra entered the music program after initially declaring business as her major field. Audition requirements and other "gate keeping" practices may influence how beginning teachers see themselves as members of the music teacher profession. Bernard (2005) recommended that looking at music

190

teaching in ways other than "musician versus music teacher" was more helpful in understanding music teacher identity. More research needs to be done to examine the conflicting aspects of beginning music teachers' role identities and why those conflicts exist for some and not others.

Personal Narratives. Cox (2004), Dawe (2007), and MacArthur (2005) have provided the field with personal narratives of their own music teacher role identities; however, more personal narratives are needed at various stages of one's development as a teacher. Since my study focused on beginning teachers whose specialty was vocal/general music, researchers might also study the music teacher role identities of instrumental music specialists, those who teach in private or charter schools, private applied music teachers, pre-school music teachers, and those who "teach" music in other settings such as Chad, Gia, church musicians, camp counselors, and daycare providers.

Comparisons of perceptions. Although I made some comparisons between how the six participants in my study perceived themselves and how others perceived them, I did not compare the perceptions of the participants themselves with the perceptions of others regarding their music teacher role identity. I also did not find much current research that addressed this issue. More research is needed to determine similarities and differences between self and others' perceptions of music teacher role identity, as well as reasons for any discrepancies that exist. Further, we might examine how the perceptions of others influence beginning music teachers' perceptions of themselves as teachers.

191

The whole person. Finally, I considered the music teacher role identities of the six participants as they related to other dimensions of their lives. Some researchers have discussed the importance of looking at the "whole person" when studying music teacher's identities (e.g., Dawe, 2007; Dolloff, 2007). This includes examining not only who they are as music teachers, but also other aspects of who they are as people. Further research is needed that addresses the music teacher role identity of individuals within the context of their identities as "whole persons," if we are to truly understand how different individuals see themselves as teachers.

Concluding Remarks

One purpose of this study was to examine the music teacher role identities of six beginning music teachers prior to, during, and after student teaching, whether those identities changed throughout the study, and if so, how. A second purpose was to develop a definition of music teacher role identity that could be used not only for this study, but also for other studies involving music teacher role identity. I discovered that these beginning music teachers' music teacher role identities consisted of four components: musical selves, instructional selves, professional selves, and ideological selves. Concerning change, these participants were focused on musical and instructional selves during student teaching. In addition, the specific skills they discussed were dependent on the context in which they were teaching. Professional selves were more clearly defined during and after student teaching, and the participants expressed their ideological selves more frequently as they gained more experience teaching.

192

These findings, although important, provide only a snapshot of these six beginning music teachers' developing music teacher role identities. Identity is ever-shifting, and changes are based on a variety of factors including context. Therefore, the music teacher role identities of these six participants might be very different if they had attended a different university, had different cooperating teachers, or experienced other circumstances that made them see themselves in other ways. Identities are complex, and examining them is time consuming. If music teacher educators are to truly understand how future music teachers see themselves, perhaps they should begin by closely examining their own music teacher role identities. They might be surprised by what they see.

> "What do you mean by that?" said the Caterpillar sternly. "Explain yourself!" "I can't explain *myself*, I'm afraid, sir," said Alice, "because I'm not myself, you see." "I don't see," said the Caterpillar. "I'm afraid I can't put it more clearly," Alice replied very politely, "for I can't understand it myself to begin with; and being so many different sizes in a day is very confusing." "It isn't," said the Caterpillar. "Well, perhaps you haven't found it so yet," said Alice, "but when you have to turn into a chrysalis—you will someday, you know—and then after that into a butterfly, I should think you'll find it a little queer, won't you?" "Not a bit," said the Caterpillar. "Well, your feelings may be different," said Alice; "all I know is, it would feel very queer to *me*." "You!" said the Caterpillar contemptuously. "Who are *you*?" Which brought them back again to the beginning of the conversation. Alice felt a little irritated at

193

the Caterpillar's making such *very* short remarks, and she drew herself up

and said very gravely, "I think you ought to tell me who *you* are, first."

(Carroll, 1974, p. 44)

EPILOGUE

"I could tell you my adventures—beginning from this morning," said

Alice a little timidly; "but it's no use going back to yesterday, because I

was a different person then." (Carroll, 1974, p. 114)

Almost five years have passed since I began studying Chad, Gia, Diedra,

Melanie, Veronica, and Christine's music teacher role identities. As I grew closer

to completing this dissertation, I decided to contact each of these participants one

last time to see what they were doing and how they now described themselves as

music teachers. I heard from everyone except for Diedra.

A year after graduation, Chad left the southwest and moved to New York

City. For the past year, he has "held a series of contracted teaching jobs" with the

Metropolitan Opera Guild, where he teaches choral music to second and third

graders, junior high, and high school students. Chad has also been working as a

music director, choreographer, and theater teacher with the TADA! Youth Theater

and a theater group in Connecticut. In these organizations, he serves as a voice

teacher and teaches group theater classes as well as "general principles of singing

and performing through musical theater."

Chad recently flew to Ecuador, where he is starting an "arts house" for

street-working children in Quito. He is also developing a website to advertise a

newly-published choral piece he wrote, based on the melodies of an indigenous

community he lived with "a few years ago." He plans to use the proceeds from the

sale of this piece to help preserve that community's culture. Upon his return to

New York, he will continue to teach, but plans to "pursue performing more." Last

year, his teaching load was "imbalanced," because he found himself teaching 400-500 students every week. This year, he thinks he might "try a lighter version of the teaching schedule" in order to "keep [himself] healthy and alive for the students."

Chad told me that he can see himself teaching all his life "to some extent,' but feels he does his best when he teaches "a workshop or a short term contract." He enjoys teaching when he is able to have fun and be creative. He says, "There's magic in fun and magic in creation;" however, his greatest difficulty with teaching is discipline. Chad struggles with finding "discipline tools" that work with the "different cultures" he interacts with in the various neighborhoods of New York City. Some students behaved so violently, he would "walk out" of the classroom. He believed he had that "luxury as a teaching artist," because "the academic teacher was at hand to take over." Eventually, he began to "expect more" from the students in the classroom. Chad now views teaching "less as something that [he is] and more as something that [he does]." He plans to continue pursuing his career "as an actor/performer as well as [begin] more involvement with TV and film."

Gia taught part-time music for three years after student teaching while pursuing a master's degree. She traveled between four schools, taught private piano lessons, and taught a keyboard program at the Catholic school her children attended. After finishing her master's program, she started a piano studio at her home, teaching private piano lessons to 25 students of varying ages. This enables her to "share [her] passion of the piano and music with other children and adults."

Gia sees herself "as continually learning how to be a better teacher" and says "it has been an ongoing 'work in progress.'" She regularly attends piano conferences and workshops and "belong[s] to several music teacher affiliations." She feels the "important thing" when teaching her students "is to always give [her] best and to hopefully get children excited about learning music." She "cares about her students" and "wants each one to succeed and learn and to be motivated and excited about what they are learning." Gia "take[s] pride in being a teacher" and believes music can "enrich [her students'] lives and help build self-esteem, discipline, and many other wonderful qualities."

After receiving her master's degree, Gia applied to an online doctoral program at a major university in the east. She was accepted but "decided to defer the program until next year" so she could "make sure this [was] the best program" for her. She had enjoyed her time at the university where she received her undergraduate and master's degrees, and told me she had "an affinity for the school." She thought she might like to also pursue her doctorate there. She said, "I am taking this year to make sure that this online program is right for me or applying at [this university] would be a better way for me to go."

Melanie is currently teaching at the same elementary school where she taught immediately following student teaching. She "like[s] who she works with" and "really enjoy[s]" her students. She believes her strongest quality as a teacher is her "connection with the kids," and she strives to "make music class relevant to their lives" by incorporating "what they are learning in other areas." Melanie believes her classroom management is "getting a lot better" and feels like she is

197

"really getting into [the] groove" of being consistent with rules. She admitted that she is challenged by "staying totally organized" and "keeping lessons fresh" after teaching the same lesson for "three days in a row."

Melanie thinks she is a "fun" music teacher. She describes herself as "compassionate" and "thoughtful." She says, "I am a teacher that gives students a different perspective on learning." Melanie wants her students "to see life for the rich things that it offers." She also wants them to "enjoy music, not only because it can make them smarter, more disciplined, more well-rounded," but also because she feels like life "is just more enjoyable when you appreciate music."

In addition to "genuinely enjoying [herself]" as a music teacher, Melanie has found a new "fun, creative outlet." For "the last couple of years," she has been baking and decorating cakes. She "gets orders from friends and such" and makes the cakes for special occasions. "It is a fun hobby," she says.

Christine is now teaching three choirs and two piano classes at a high school in the same district where she taught previously. During the summer after her first year of teaching, she learned about an opening for a high school choral position in the district where she was teaching. She "began trying to figure out how to get out of [her] contract" at the middle school and met with the superintendent and human resources to "discuss [her] options." They agreed to "release [her] from [her] contract," but she "had to pay $2,500 and wait until the school board approved [her] resignation."

At the high school level, Christine's "biggest complaint is the extra responsibilities" she has. According to Christine, "meeting the expectations of

198

administrators is always annoying, because it is always changing." These expectations often "have nothing to do with music." Despite this, she sees herself as a teacher "who has high expectations for the students in [her] classes." She feels she is "a strong person" and believes her students "feel comfortable . . . to express themselves and expose their musical talents" in her presence. She has "created a safe, happy classroom" for her students and "can honestly say that [she] enjoy[s] going to work."

Among the many words she uses to describe herself in the role of teacher are "singer," "performer," "comedian," and "role-model." She said, "I quite often make a fool out of myself in order to make my students feel comfortable doing the things I ask of them." This includes "singing about love and fa la la-ing," and "doing crazy breathing exercises." Christine "strive[s] to be someone [her students] can look up to and trust." Her focus is not only on music, but also on teaching her students how to be stellar human beings. "I work very hard to show [the students] how to be good people, even after they have left my choirs," she says.

Veronica continues to teach middle school choir at the same school where she accepted a position immediately following student teaching. She believes she is "a great teacher" and feels her students "sound much better than an average middle school choir." She is "deeply invested" in what she is doing and "is always trying to get better." Despite her confidence, she still thinks she "could do a better job managing" students. She told me that "even if there are just a couple disrespectful students," she feels like she has "failed in that particular class." A

further frustration is that "it takes so much energy" for her "to create the atmosphere" that she wants in her classroom. Veronica also dislikes "calling parents about discipline issues" that arise.

In addition to issues of discipline and communication with parents, Veronica finds paperwork challenging, noting, "There is endless work outside of teaching including site improvement plans, smart goals, career ladder, fund raising, field trip planning, meetings, [and] committees." Veronica believes "all of that takes away time" when she could be "working on [her] other skills."

Veronica holds "high expectations for [her] students to be professional." She "cares about her students academically and personally" and wants "to encourage them to be the best musicians and people they can be while still having fun." Veronica's desire is to help her students reach their highest personal level of musicianship. She says, "I want to help them see their hard work pay off."

Although I contacted her numerous times through email and a social networking site, Diedra did not respond to my request for an update on her professional life. After viewing her public profile on the social networking site, it appears that she gave birth to a little boy about a year ago.

A mutual friend told me that Diedra left her high school position to teach at a school in a nearby district. On that district's website, I discovered that Diedra is currently teaching choral music to seventh and eighth grade students at a middle school. Her teaching philosophy is included on her teacher "homepage." There she writes, "I see the study of music as a way of enhancing one's knowledge of the world, humanity, and one's self." Her class hours are listed as

"7:30-11:00 a.m.," Monday through Friday. After probing the district website further, I found her name listed as a teacher at another middle school. When I followed a link to her homepage, only her name was listed. I suspect she teaches at this second school in the afternoons.

REFERENCES

Alsup, J. (2006). *Teacher identity discourses: Negotiating personal and professional spaces*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Inc.

Anderson, C. H. (1981). The identity crisis of the art educator: Artist? Teacher? Both? *Art Education, 34*(4), 45-46.

Ball, L. (1990). What role: Artist or teacher? *Art Education, 43*(1), 54-59.

Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 20*, 107-128.

Beijaard, D., Verloop, N., & Vermunt, J. D. (2000). Teachers' perceptions of professional identity: An exploratory study from a personal knowledge perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 16*, 749-764.

Bernard, R. (2004). A dissonant duet: Discussions of music making and music teaching. *Music Education Research, 6*(3), 281-298.

Bernard, R. (2005). Making music, making selves: A call for reframing music teacher education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education. 4*(2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bernard4_2.pdf.

Bernard, R. (2006, Spring). Identity work in music teacher education. *The Mountain Lake Reader,* 69-74.

Bernard, R. (2007). Multiple vantage points: Author's reply. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bernard6_2.pdf.

Bouij, C. (2004). Two theoretical perspectives on the socialization of music teachers. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 3*(3). http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v3/Bouij04.pdf.

Bouij, C. (2007). A comment to Rhoda Bernard: Reframing or oversimplification? *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bouij6_2.pdf.

Bresler, L., & Stake, R. E. (2006). Qualitative research methodology in music education. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *MENC Handbook of research methodologies* (pp. 270-311). New York: Oxford University Press, Inc.

Brewer, W. D. (2009). Conceptions of effective teaching and role-identity development among preservice music educators. (D.M.A., Arizona State University).

Bullough, R.V. (1991). Exploring personal teaching metaphors in preservice teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education, 42*, 43-51.

Chapelville, L. (1974). *Alice in wonderland and through the looking glass*. New York: Grosset & Dunlap, Publishers.

Characteristic. 2010. In Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary. Retrieved August 29, 2010, from http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/characteristic

Clandinin, D.J. & Rosiek, J. (2007). Mapping a landscape of narrative inquiry Borderland spaces and tensions. In D.J. Clandinin (Ed.), *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology* (pp. 35-76). London: Sage Publications, Inc.

Cox, P. (1994). The professional socialization of Arkansas music teachers as musicians and educators: The role of influential persons from childhood to post-college years. (Ph.D., University of North Texas).

Cox, P. (2004). Growing into the role: Empowerment of a music educator through application of symbolic interaction theory, *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *3*(3). http://actmaydaygroup.org/articles/Cox3_3.pdf

Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Dawe, N. (2007). Identity and borderland discourse: Bridging the personal and professional in music teacher identity research. *The Canadian Music Educator, 49*(2), 39-42.

Day, C., & Leitch, R. (2001). Teachers' and teacher educators' lives: The role of emotion, *Teaching and Teacher Education, 17*, 401-415.

Deegan, J. G. (2008). Teacher-writer memoirs as lens for writing emotionally in a primary teacher education programme. *Teaching Education, 19*(3), 185-196.

DeLorenzo, L. C. (1992). The perceived problems of beginning music teachers. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *113*, 9-25.

Dolloff, L. (1999). Imagining ourselves as teachers: The development of teacher identity in music teacher education. *Music Education Research, 1*(2), 191-207.

Dolloff, L. (2007). "All the things we are" Balancing our multiple identities in music teaching. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(2).

Glesne, C. (1999). *Becoming qualitative researchers: An introduction.* New York: Addison Wesley Longman.

Isbell, D. S. (2008). Musicians and teachers: The socialization and occupational identity of preservice music teachers. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 56*(2), 162-178.

Knowles, J. G. (1992). Models for understanding pre-service and beginning teachers' biographies: Illustrations from case studies. In I. F. Goodson (Ed.), *Studying teachers' lives* (pp. 99-152). New York: Teachers College Press.

Lortie, D. (1975). *Schoolteacher*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

MacArthur, L. (2005). Principal themes: The shaping of my music teacher identity. *Canadian Music Educator, 46*(4), 28-29.

MacLure, M. (1993). Arguing for your self: Identity as an organising principle in teachers' jobs and lives. *British Educational Research Journal, 19*(4), 311-322.

McCall, G. J., & Simmons, J. L. (1978). *Identities and interactions: An examination of human associations in everyday life*. New York: Free Press.

McIntosh, R. (2000). An artist and teacher. *School Arts, 100*(2), 60.

Neale, M., & Griffin, M. A. (2006). A model of self-held work roles and role-transitions. *Human Performance, 19*(1), 23-41.

Regelski, T. (2007). Editorial: "Music teacher"— meaning and practice, identity and position. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(2). http://actmaydaygroup.org/articles/Regelski6_2.pdf.

Roberts, B. (1991). Music teacher education as identity construction. *International Journal of Music Education, 18*, 30-39.

Roberts, B. A. (2000). The sociologist's snare: Identity construction and socialization in music, *International Journal of Music Education, 35*, 54-58.

Roberts, B. A. (2004). Who's in the mirror? Issues surrounding the identity construction of music educators. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education 3*(2). http://mas.siue,edu/ACT/v3/Roberts04.pdf

Roberts, B. A. (2007). Making music, making selves, making it right: A counterpoint to Rhoda Bernard. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(2). http://actmaydaygroup.org/articles/Roberts6_2.pdf.

Saldaña, J. (2003). *Longitudinal qualitative research: Analyzing change through time*. New York: AltaMira Press.

Samuel, M., & Stephens, D. (2000). Critical dialogues with self: Developing teacher identities and roles-a case study of South African student teachers, *International Journal of Educational Research, 33*, 475-491.

Schmidt, M. (2005). Preservice string teachers' lesson-planning processes: An exploratory study, *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *53*(6), 6-25.

Stephens, J. (2007). Different weather. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(3). http://www.maydaygroup.org/articles/Stephens_3.pdf

Sumara, D. J., & Luce-Kapler, R. (1996). (Un) becoming a teacher: Negotiating identities while learning to teach. *Canadian Journal of Education, 21*(1), 65-83.

Kaplan, L. K., & Campbell, M. R. (2003). Gods, guides, and gardeners: Preservice music educators' personal teaching metaphors. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *158*, 43-54.

Veenman, S. (1984). Perceived problems of beginning teachers. *Review of Educational Research*. *54*(2), 143-178.

Weber, S. & Mitchell, C. (1995). *That's funny, you don't look like a teacher! Interrogating images and identity in popular culture*. London: The Falmer Press.

Woodford, P. G. (2002). The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music education majors. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (pp. 675-694). New York: Oxford University Press.

APPENDIX A

PROFESSOR INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Chad
Gia
Christine
Veronica
Diedra
Melanie

For each of the teachers above, please answer the following questions:

1. In which of your classes was this student enrolled?

2. What has been your impression of this person as a student in your class(es)?

3. What qualities or characteristics about this person "stand out" in your mind?

4. Describe this person's strengths and weaknesses which may influence the success of his/her teaching.

5. Based on what you have seen, how has this person changed with respect to their attitude, approach, and/or ability as it relates to teaching music?

6. How would you describe this individual as a: musician, leader, and person?

7. In your opinion, what degree of success will this person achieve as a music teacher?

8. Are there any concerns or observations about this person that you wish to share?

APPENDIX B

IRB EXEMPTION

ASU ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

To:	Sandra Stauffer
	MUSIC 259E
From:	Albert Kagan, Chair
	Institutional Review Board
Date:	10/18/2005
Committee Action:	**Exemption Granted**
IRB Action Date:	10/18/2005
IRB Protocol #:	0510000287
Study Title:	The Transition from Student Teacher to First-Year Teacher

The above-referenced protocol is considered exempt after review by the Institutional Review Board pursuant to Federal regulations, 45 CFR Part 46.101(b)(1) .

This part of the federal regulations requires that the information be recorded by investigators in such a manner that subjects cannot be identified, directly or through identifiers linked to the subjects.   It is necessary that the information obtained not be such that if disclosed outside the research, it could reasonably place the subjects at risk of criminal or civil liability, or be damaging to the subjects' financial standing, employability, or reputation.

You should retain a copy of this letter for your records.