Process-Driven Collaboration:

Capacities from Teaching Artistry That Enrich the Work of Collaborative Pianists

by

Juliana Witt

A Research Paper Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Musical Arts

Approved April 2020 by the
Graduate Supervisory Committee:

Andrew Campbell, Chair
Kay Norton
Russell Ryan
Deanna Swoboda

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

May 2020

ABSTRACT

The work of collaborative pianists can vary widely, requiring a large spectrum of musical and foreign language skills. In addition, many non-musical skills are required of collaborative pianists in order to adapt to various types of work, the roles they assume, and the needs of the people they encounter professionally. Collaborative pianists usually develop good habits for survival on the job, but rarely receive preliminary training in capacities such as facilitation, maintaining objectivity in collaboration, asking good questions, and giving feedback effectively. The emerging field of teaching artistry offers a wealth of information for the development of these non-musical skills in collaborative pianists. The skills necessary for teaching artistry and collaborative piano frequently overlap, which is instructive for collaborative pianists as they prepare for their various musical and leadership roles. This paper explores shared practices between these disciplines, how they can enhance the activities of a collaborative pianist, and also help them develop skills as arts advocates. Advocating techniques for new music and audience engagement are addressed, as well as programming, content development and building teams around projects. The idea of the collaborative pianist becoming a teaching artist is also explored, as the diverse activities and experiences of a collaborative pianist can serve as valuable resources. All of these approaches to non-musical skills focus on building strong processes, leading to creative activities that are process-driven rather than product-driven. This study seeks to enrich activities of collaborative pianists through the application of teaching artist capacities and pave pathways for new, more effective professional collaborations.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A special thanks to my committee for helping me write about the topic that I am most passionate about, especially my chair Dr. Andrew Campbell, who has supported my endeavors throughout my time at ASU. I'd like to thank my family for supporting me from early music lessons through this project, especially my parents. Thanks to Nancy Ruth and Gretchen, for always believing in my future and pushing me to get here; John and Laura for their unconditional love; and to my husband, for being my #1 cheerleader.

I am also indebted to Matt Hannen, Paul Lee, Aimee Fincher and Galen Balinski for their help with editing!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER Page

LIST OF TABLES

PREFACE

This document began with the recognition of the many parallels between the discipline of collaborative piano and the concept of teaching artistry, which coalesced for U. S. educators with arts philosopher Maxine Greene and her perspectives on aesthetic education.[1] Although many resources are available about teaching artistry, it is not practical to expect collaborative pianists to comb through them all and fully understand an entirely separate field. Hence, this document is an examination of the capacities that rise to the top and are most applicable to collaborative pianist's work. Hopefully this introduction to teaching artistry will make collaborative pianists more inquisitive about developing the non-musical sides of their profession.

While there are historical articles written on the origins of teaching artistry, June Dunbar from Lincoln Center Institute (now Lincoln Center Education) is often credited with having first used the term "teaching artist."[2] Eric Booth, a protégé of Maxine Greene and currently a highly regarded arts philosopher in the teaching artist community, defines a teaching artist in the following ways:

> A practicing professional artist with the complementary skills, curiosities and sensibilities of an educator, who can effectively engage a wide range of people in learning experiences in, through, and about the arts.[3]
>
> An artist who chooses to include artfully educating others, beyond teaching the technique of the art form, as an active part of a career.[4]

Berklee, a school that promotes teaching artistry as a field, similarly defines a teaching artist on their website:

---

[1] "About Aesthetic Education," Lehman College: The Bronx Education Network, accessed March 1, 2020, https://www.lehman.edu/academics/education/bronx-arts-education-network/about.php.

[2] Eric Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?" *Eric Booth,* accessed January 25, 2020.

[3] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

[4] Eric Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 3.

> Teaching artists are practicing, professional artists who have dual careers as educators. They come from every artistic field—music, dance, theater, visual arts, writing—and work in many settings, from schools and museums to hospitals and prisons.[5]

Teaching artistry is rooted in the principle of teaching by example, whether formally or informally.[6] It is an all-encompassing principle that blurs lines between a performing career and the rest of an artist's life. What makes a musician a teaching artist is the conscious effort to draw from their artistic processes as they teach. Teaching artists also find that their teaching equally informs their performing. According to Eric Booth, the goal is for an artist to teach as artfully as they perform and, in turn, the teaching will make the performing more artistic and meaningful.[7]

In this document, the terms, description and history of teaching artistry in Chapter 2 are presented in order to give an introduction and context to a field that may be new to many collaborative pianists. The uniqueness of the teaching artist lies in the fact that they are neither a music educator nor a teacher of applied skills, but ultimately a facilitator. This study highlights that distinction. Similarly, the role that a collaborative pianist plays in the performing arts sectors is very unique. Few other roles in the performance world require the same kind of adaptability that they are expected to possess.

While this study draws on the field of teaching artistry, which is both artistic and pedagogical in nature, most of the applications are geared towards the performing collaborative pianist. References are made to coaching, which is a form of teaching, but Chapters 1 through 4 apply primarily to the performance-based

---

[5] "Teaching Artist," Berklee, accessed January 25, 2020, https://www.berklee.edu/careers/roles/teaching-artist.

[6] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 3.

[7] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible*, 4

collaborative pianist. It must be acknowledged here that pedagogical practices may have application and meaning in a collaborative context, even though collaborations between musicians are not strictly defined as teaching. This document helps to clarify such nuances.

After the Chapter 1 literature review and the Chapter 2 introduction to teaching artistry, Chapter 3 extracts the most relevant capacities to enhance the work that collaborative pianists already do. Chapter 4 challenges collaborative pianists to take those same capacities and think in innovative ways to advocate for new music, new audiences, and for themselves

Chapter 5 makes a case for why collaborative pianists can make great teaching artists, although it should be mentioned that many collaborative pianists do not desire to teach in any capacity. Alternatively, this discussion may challenge collaborative pianists who do teach to explore teaching in other capacities. For instance, if a collaborative pianist teaches piano lessons for extra income, this discussion may challenge them to pursue school residencies or work in community centers.

Above all, this document challenges collaborative pianists to remain aware of their own artistic interests. Because they are so versatile, they can easily spend their careers facilitating the projects of others. This document inspires them to advocate for their own interests and be effective leaders in their pursuit of fulfilling and sustainable careers. The ideas and exercises presented in this document will serve in helping collaborative pianists determine what will bring spark and passion to the work that they do.

CHAPTER 1

LITERATURE REVIEW

Collaborative Piano Literature

Many of the books and articles written for collaborative pianists address a single aspect or topic of the discipline. Examples include *Song: A Guide to Art Song Style and Literature* by Carol Kimball;[1] *Song* by Graham Johnson;[2] *Opera Coaching* by Alan Montgomery;[3] *Singing in French* by Thomas Grubb[4] or *The Interpretation of French Song* by Pierre Bernac.[5] However, there are a few historical resources that survey the field of collaborative piano with a more comprehensive approach. These resources help pianists grasp the origins and growth of the field in order to understand how the field is progressing.

A brief history that traces the origins of piano accompaniment back to the 16th century can be found in David Fuller's article titled "Accompaniment," in *Grove Music Online*.[6] It is by no means comprehensive, but it contains a brief introduction and history of accompanying. Gerald Moore's 1943 book, *The Unashamed Accompanist,* is generally acknowledged as the first modern resource on the art of accompanying, and also marks the beginning of a movement in which accompanists began to find

---

[1] Carol Kimball, *Song: A Guide to Art Song and Literature* (Hal Leonard Corporation, 1996).

[2] Graham Johnson and Richard Stokes, *A French Song Companion* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000).

[3] Alan Montgomery, *Opera Coaching: Professional Techniques and Considerations* (New York: Routledge, 2006)

[4] Thomas Grubb, *Singing in French: A Manual of French Diction and French Vocal Repertoir*e (New York: Schirmer Books, 1979).

[5] Pierre Bernac, *The Interpretation of French Song* (New York: Praeger, 1970).

[6]David Fuller, "Accompaniment," *Oxford Music Online* (2001), doi:10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.00110.

their equal voices in musical partnerships. He makes an effort to prove that accompanying is a worthy endeavor in and of itself and should not be regarded as a lesser art form than solo playing, or to quote him, "a stepping stone to worthier things."[7] He also includes practical advice on partnership, preparation, practicing habits, rehearsing, performance, and aspects of instrumental collaboration.

Kurt Adler's book, *The Art of Accompanying and Coaching*, published in 1965, gives a comprehensive history of accompanying, even going so far as to cite biblical examples of accompaniment. This resource is likely the first comprehensive history of its kind, since it contains a history of coaching, the mechanics of musical instruments, diction specifics in various languages, different musical styles, program building, and finally, the artistry of collaboration.[8] Adler discusses technique in more detail than Moore, and offers practical perspectives on collaborative artistry.

Philip Cranmer's *The Technique of Accompaniment* published in 1970, is a handbook more like Moore's book, rather than a textbook like Adler's book. Cranmer explicitly discusses the improved treatment of accompanists while acknowledging lingering inferiority complexes in accompanists. He also discusses practical skills, as Moore and Adler do, including transposition, reductions, score-reading, continuo and organ accompaniment.[9]

Robert Spillman's *The Art of Accompanying*: *Master Lessons from the Repertoire* (1985), is intended to be a textbook for more advanced pianists who already possess basic skills of collaborating. Spillman approaches the collaborative skill set through the lens of extensive vocal and instrumental repertoire, enhanced by

---

[7] Gerald Moore, *The Unashamed Accompanist* (New York: Macmillan Company, 1943), vii.

[8] Kurt Adler, *The Art of Accompanying and Coaching* (Minneapolis: Springer: 1965), 182.

[9] Philip Cramner, *The Technique of Accompaniment* (London: Dobson, 1970), 7.

the inclusion of scores in the book so that students need not break copyright law or be burdened with buying dozens of scores in the studying of these works.[10]

Deon Nielsen Price's "Accompanying Skills for Pianists," released in 1991, is a textbook less like Spillman's advanced repertoire study and more similar to the Adler textbook, with a discussion of basic collaborative piano skills for pianists early in their collaborative career.[11] An expanded version of Price's book was published in 2005 with extra chapters containing personal reflections of her career.[12]

When Martin Katz authored his book in 2009 titled *The Complete Collaborator,* it became a gem among these resources, no doubt because of his distinguished reputation as a collaborative artist and pedagogue, coupled with his ability to blend the technical and artistic style of writing so successfully. While the book emphasizes vocal music, it does also discuss instrumental music, and dives deeply into artistry and the refinement of collaborative skills. His high standard of musicianship is demonstrated in his writing, which also vividly depicts the magic of music making. He includes updated language, such as making the needed transition from "accompanist" to "pianist," and avoiding the outdated habit of using masculine terms to refer to everyone, instead alternating pronouns of "he" and "she" throughout the book.

---

[10] Robert Spillman, *The Art of Accompanying* (Schirmer: New York: 1985), vii.

[11] David Jonathan Morgenroth, "Collaborative Crossover: Identifying Classical Vocal Collaborative Piano Practices in Jazz Vocal Accompanying," (DMA diss., University of North Texas, 2015), 37, http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1775393456?accountid=4485.

[12] Dian Baker, "A Resource Manual for the Collaborative Pianist: Twenty Class Syllabi for Teaching Collaborative Piano Skills and an Annotated Bibliography," (DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2006), 43-44, https://search.lib.asu.edu/permalink/f/53hn25/TN_proquest305350903.

The Art of Instrumental Accompanying: *A Practical Guide for the Collaborative Pianist* (2012) by Heasook Rhee, specifically introduces students to instrumental accompanying and offers guidance for teachers. This book is distinct in that there are far less published instrumental collaborative resources than there are in vocal coaching, so it fulfills a need in this body of resources.

The Collaborative Pianist's guide to Practical Technique: Excerpts from Instrumental Duos and Art Songs for Technical Study by Neil Stannard (2015) takes a thought-provoking approach to collaborative education by using collaborative repertoire to develop technical skills, rather than solo repertoire and exercises such as Czerny or Hanon.[13] This topic is highly controversial topic, but worth considering when discussing time efficiency and preparing students for real-world work. This book is distinct in its kind.

Other resources, including academic studies and dissertations, trace the history of collaborative piano by tracing the process of incorporating Accompanying or collaborative piano as an official field of study in academia. Judyth Lippman's 1979 study "A Program in Piano Accompanying" identifies the 14 schools that had accompanying programs at that time.[14] The study confirms the value of collaborative skills in pianists, and also spells out some of the essential skills necessary to be a well-equipped accompanist.[15] Edward Daniel's 1979 document "Rationale for Integrating a Portion of Chamber and Accompanying Instruction with Applied Piano Study at the Collegiate Level" poses different reasons for the same need of

---

[13]Neil Stannard, *The Collaborative Pianist's Guide to Practical Technique: Excerpts from Instrumental Duos and Art Songs for Technical Study* (CreateSpace Publishing, 2015).

[14] Judyth C. Lippmann, "A Program in Piano Accompanying at The Ohio State University: A Feasibility Study" (PhD diss., Ohio State University, 1979).

[15] Baker, "A Resource Manual," 43-44.

collaborative skills presented by Lippman, emphasizing the importance of solo work alongside chamber repertoire.[16] His philosophies are still represented by the fact that most graduate collaborative piano programs require their applicants to develop their skills with solo piano literature before entering a collaborative program. Erma Rose's 1981 study called "Competencies In Piano Accompanying" uses nine academic models and books by professional pianists to offer lists of competencies for teachers to use in their syllabi, taking Lippman and Daniel's statement of need to a practical level.[17] Wendy March's 1988 study identifies the most valuable pianistic skills, and accompanying rises to the top of the list.[18] Her study is written from the perspective of a music educator, highlighting the most practical skills for pre-college students, but the study is currently relevant to the professors who train those music educators in college and pre-college situations. Pei-Shan Lee examined some of these studies and conducted her own in 2009, exploring some trends in academic programs which view collaborative pianists merely as inexpensive staff pianists for academic institutions, thereby a service instead of a field of study. The result is that the students are deprived of the education for which they attend school. Interviews with noted collaborative piano pedagogues such as Anne Epperson, Jean Barr, Jonathan

[16] Edward Lee Daniel, "Rationale For Integrating A Portion Of Chamber And Accompanying Instruction With Applied Piano Study At The Collegiate Level" (DA diss., Ball State University, 1979), http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/302901947?accountid=4485.

[17] Erma Loreen Rose, "Competencies In Piano Accompanying," (PhD diss., University of North Texas, 1981), http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/303157911?accountid=4485.

[18] Wendy March, "A Study of Piano Proficiency Requirements at Institutions of Higher Education in the State of Oregon as Related to the Needs and Requirements of Public School Music Teachers" (DMA diss., University of Oregon, 1988).

Feldman and Margo Garrett are cited, as well as a survey of students from various academic institutions.[19]

Brad Smith's 2015 document, "Don't Listen to Me, I'm Just Your Partner: Ensemble Issues in Duo Settings," examines the pedagogical presentation of Adler, Spillman and Katz's books on the topic of ensemble.[20] Perry Mears presents an interesting 2016 cririque of a book entitled *The Art of Accompanying,* originally published in 1916 by Algernon Lindo, a forgotten author who pre-dates Gerald Moore's work.[21] This recently published document may be one of the most unique pieces of collaborative piano history, because so little about accompanists and their careers is documented before the mid-20th century.

Finally, many current resources are found online. Amy Mertz authored an article on the website Majoring in Music that contains a user-friendly guide for students who may be considering academic programs in collaborative piano.[22] Her various topics include how collaborative piano study is different from solo piano study, a short list of tips for a successful career, graduate work, necessary background skills, and career options. She concludes by noting the rapidly changing landscape of career options, and acknowledging that "Career options in this field

---

[19] Pei-Shan Lee, "The Collaborative Pianist: Balancing Roles in Partnership", (DMA diss., New England Conservatory of Music, 2009), 10, http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/637439700?accountid=4485.

[20] Brad Smith, "Don't Listen to Me, I'm Just Your Partner: Ensemble Issues in Duo Settings," (DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2015), vi-vii, http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1682042611?accountid=4485.

[21] Perry G. Mears II, "Documenting a Derided Profession: Algernon Lindo and the *Art of Accompanying*," (DMA diss., The University of Memphis, 2016), http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1845054033?accountid=4485.

[22] Amy Mertz, "A Career for Pianists in Collaborative Piano," *Majoring in Music.com*, accessed June 28, 2019, https://majoringinmusic.com/a-career-for-pianists-in-collaborative-piano.

continue to evolve."[23] In 2016, the Peabody Conservatory of Music published a more detailed list of techniques for emerging collaborative pianists rather than, like Mertz, helping students decide if they want to be a collaborative pianist. This single page of website links covers resources in categories such as Skill Building, Career Building, Literature Resources and Large Ensemble Resources.[24]

The Good Company Blog by Billie Whittaker contains more posts from 2009-2012 than recent years, but the articles may be helpful for a few specific needs: a list of the most played musical theater repertoire for auditions, summer programs (with links), helpful hints for open score reading, how to keep an audition pianist happy, and the like. Unlike the Peabody page, which is specifically for pianists, The Good Company Blog has resources for vocalists and pianists.[25]

Chris Foley's website CollaborativePiano.com provides a combination of the Whittaker and Peabody sites, targeting a large audience, from patrons curious about the collaborative piano field and its origins, to guidance for students weighing academic programs, to skill lists for beginning through advanced collaborative pianists. His one-page guide for beginning collaborative pianists is a short article, followed by a comprehensive list of career options, articles for pianistic improvement for pianists of all levels, and other practical advice. While not always current, the resources are very reliable, with many of them authored by Chris Foley himself.

---

[23] Mertz, "A Career for Pianists."

[24] "Tips for Aspiring Collaborative Pianists," Music Entrepreneurship and Career Center at Johns Hopkins Peabody Conservatory, accessed June 28, 2019, https://peabody.jhu.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/tips_for_aspiring_collaborative_pianists.pdf.

[25] Billie Whittaker, *The Good Company Blog*, accessed January 24, 2020, http://goodcompanybw.blogspot.com/2011/.

For students wanting a very detailed idea of what a graduate degree in collaborative piano would entail, the University of North Texas published a collaborative piano handbook for the 2017-2018 year. It poses various expectations for admission to and completion of their degree, ranging from professional expectations to technique and recital requirements. This handbook would be a next step after reading articles from Foley and Mertz before applying to an academic program.

Teaching Artist Literature

Resources for teaching artistry are more limited, but the body of literature is growing rapidly and readily accessible. Even though it does not yet reflect the term *teaching artist*, the 1989 book *Psychological Characteristics, Teaching Beliefs and Teaching Behaviors of Artist Teachers* by J. Clark and J. Gipe is significant because it displays some of the conflicts that teaching artists were encountering in the 1980s about what to call themselves; in this case, "artist teacher" is used, before the term "teaching artist" took root. Maxine Greene's *Variations on a Blue Guitar: The Lincoln Center Lectures on Aesthetic Education*, is considered a good starting place for a philosophical understanding of teaching artistry as it stems from aesthetic education, and is a thought-provoking series of lectures spanning twenty-five years.[26] Eric Booth, a protégé of Greene, has written several books on teaching artistry, including *The Every Day Work of Art* and *The Music Teaching Artist Bible.* His 2001 book *The Every Day Work of Art* contains aesthetic philosophy derived from arts philosophers

[26]Maxine Greene, *Variations on a Blue Guitar: The Lincoln Center Lectures on Aesthetic Education* (Columbia University: New York, 2001).

of the mid- to late- 20th century.[27] *The Music Teaching Artist Bible,* which followed in 2009, is more practical, as it puts the philosophy into practice, including essential skills of the twenty-first century artist, curriculum development, and school and performance engagement that expand the roles of the music teaching artist.[28]

Teaching Artist Handbook published in 2013 offers some slightly different perspectives on philosophy, such as debates around whether extra-musical goals, like behavior, are legitimate goals of art making, or whether or not the focus should remain on the creative engagement of the participant as an artist. The artist-authors Nick Jaffe, Becca Barniski and Barbara Hackett Cox engage readers through their stories of first-hand experience, and provide practical templates for teaching artists to develop their own curriculum and tools for self-assessment.[29] Nick Jaffe has written a significant amount of material for the teaching artist community, and states in his 2015 overview of the teaching artist field that the constant need for evaluation and assessment is what holds back the creative teaching artistry community from becoming a full-fledged, legitimate field.[30] In *Teaching Artist Handbook*, he and his co-authors make distinctions between tools for self-assessment and assessment for state standards.

---

[27] Eric Booth, *The Every Day Work of Art* (Lincoln, Nebraska: iUniverse.com, Inc, 2001).

[28] Eric Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

[29] Nick Jaffe, Becca Barniskis and Barbara Hackett Cox, *Teaching Artist Handbook* (Chicago: Columbia College Chicago Press. 2013).

[30] Nick Jaffe, "Where Is the Teaching Artist Field?" *Teaching Artist Journal*, (13:2), 71-73, DOI: 10.1080/15411796.2015.997109.

Several resources that more generally define teaching artists and their roles in society include websites from Berklee,[31] Eric Booth,[32] Creative Ground,[33] as well as many other resources that cite Booth's definition of a teaching artist. The Association of Teaching Artists (ATA), founded in 1998, is the oldest persisting teaching artist organization. ATA's Facebook page is extremely active and is a more valuable resource than their website, because it provides news, professional development articles, and professional development opportunities.[34] The ATA also frequently features grant opportunities and other practical resources for staying engaged in a worldwide teaching artist community.

The Teaching Artist Guild, an organization and website formed to support the discipline, has a blog that is very current as well as a quarterly publication, both of which are viewable online. Even though the core of the work focuses on their home state of California, content in their publications showcase teaching artist work all over the United States.[35] Teaching Artists Organized (TAO) in the San Francisco Bay Area is another community that is locally oriented.[36] The peer-reviewed *Teaching Artist Journal* has been published quarterly since 2009 by Columbia College, and

---

[31] "Teaching Artist," *Berklee*, accessed January 25th, 2020, https://www.berklee.edu/careers/roles/teaching-artist.

[32] Eric Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?" *Eric Booth*, accessed January 25, 2020, https://ericbooth.net/what-is-a-teaching-artist/.

[33] "What is a Teaching Artist?" *Creative Ground*, accessed January 25, 2020, https://www.creativeground.org/faq/what-teaching-artist.

[34] "Association of Teaching Artists," *Facebook*, accessed May 1, 2020, https://www.facebook.com/AssocOfTAs.

[35] "The TAG Blog," *Teaching Artist Guild*, accessed January 25, 2020, https://teachingartistsguild.org/blog-2/.

[36] Eric Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 12.

publishes articles about teaching artistry in many disciplines.[37] Practitioner Marit Ulvund published an article discussing the adoption of the term teaching artist in Norway, and reviewed the first two international teaching artist conferences, substantiating the fact that this field has representation around the world.[38]

There are many teaching artist resources that are discipline specific, but many are pedagogically universal and can be applied to various disciplines because they are founded in similar philosophies. Kathryn Dawson and Daniel A. Kelin wrote *The Reflexive Teaching Artist: Collected Wisdom From the Drama/Theatre Field* for the theatre artist, but much of the philosophy presented at the outset of the book can be applicable to any discipline, and offers an additional perspective based on the same philosophical thread upon which Eric Booth's viewpoint is based.[39] A similar resource, *A Teaching Artist at Work: Theatre With Young People in Educational Settings,* published in 2006, is helpful for artists striving to connect their pedagogical and artistic personas. The specific examples that they offer in school settings may be helpful, even if they aren't about music.[40] A similar resource in the field of dance is an article by Avril Huddy and Kym Stevens entitled *The Teaching Artist: A Model for University Dance Teacher Training,* which addresses the difference between dance teachers and dancers who teach. It includes a study about developing dance

---

[37] "Teaching Artist Journal," Taylor & Francis Online, accessed April 5, 2020, https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/htaj20.

[38] Marit Ulvund, "In the Age of the Teaching Artist? What Teaching Artists Are and Do," *Nordic Journal of Art and Research*, 4, no. 1 (October 28, 2015), https://doi.org/10.7577/if.v4i1.1369.

[39] Kathryn Dawson, & Daniel A. Kelin, II, *The Reflexive Teaching Artist: Collected Wisdom from the Drama/Theatre Field* (Chicago: Intellect Ltd., 2014).

[40] Barbara McKean, *A Teaching Artist at Work: Theatre with Young People in Educational Settings.* Portsmouth (New Hampshire: Heinemann, 2006).

teaching artistry with specific communities.[41] The dissertation "Teaching Artist" is a visual artist's project in which the author, Jenny Pembleton, uses the description and development of her exhibition to establish herself as an teaching artist.[42] In another example driven by a visual artist in the context of early childhood education, Angela Eckhoff's "Conversational Pedagogy: Exploring Interactions between a Teaching Artist and Young Learners during Visual Arts Experiences" explores the role of conversational discourse in early childhood arts.[43] All of these resources offer ideas to musicians for developing teaching artist identities and communities using a philosophy-driven approach.

Resources on teaching artist training programs include websites of Teaching Artist Guild,[44] Americans for the Arts,[45] Lincoln Center Education,[46] and Kennedy Center.[47] Sonja Myklebust's documentation of the pilot teaching artist program at

---

[41] Avril Huddy and Kym Stevens, "The Teaching Artist: A Model for University Dance Teach Training," *Research in Dance Education* 12, no. 2 (07, 2011), doi:http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1080/14647893.2011.579596. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/888108109?accountid=4485.

[42] Jenny Pembleton, "Teaching Artist," (MA thesis, State University of New York Empire State College, 2014), http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1564787076?accountid=4485.

[43] Angela Eckhoff. "Conversational Pedagogy: Exploring Interactions between a Teaching Artist and Young Learners during Visual Arts Experiences," *Early Childhood Education Journal* 41, no. 5 (09, 2013), 365-372, doi:http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1007/s10643-012-0567-0. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1651829173?accountid=4485.

[44] "The TAG Blog," *Teaching Artist Guild*, accessed January 25, 2020, https://teachingartistsguild.org/blog-2/.

[45] Eric Booth, "The Field of Teaching Artistry," Americans for the Arts, accessed April 1, 2020, https://www.americansforthearts.org/blog-feed/the-field-of-teaching-artistry.

[46] "The Work of Teaching Artists," Kadenze: Lincoln Center Education, accessed January 25, 2020, https://www.kadenze.com/courses/the-work-of-teaching-artists-iii/info.

University of Washington in 2014-2015 sought to empower students in performance-driven academia with teaching artist skills to be utilized upon graduation.[48]

In a 2015 article entitled *Balancing the Apollonian and Dionysian Dualism: A Look at the Drama/theatre Teaching Artist*, Byoung Joo Kim discusses the balance of teaching work and philosophy in the framework of Apollonian and Dionysian analogies in a South Korean context.[49] The author's idea of using something familiar to the typical theatre artist like Apollonian-Dionysian dualism to help encapsulate teaching artist philosophy is similar to the goal of this document—using familiar, tangible skills as the platform into which these teaching artist principles are infused.

Positioning of this research

Refinements in the two fields of collaborative piano and teaching artistry have intriguing parallels. They are roughly the same age, having formed in the mid-twentieth century, and both fields have developed while struggling to gain recognition as a legitimate field in the eyes of academia and the artistic community.[50] Collaborative piano, however, has had more success in achieving this recognition. Because of the eventual creation and incorporation of collaborative piano programs into academia, collaborative piano has become a more successful formalized field than teaching artistry. While teaching artistry can be found among

[47] "Kennedy Center Teaching Artists," Kennedy Center, accessed April 1, 2020. https://www.kennedy-center.org/teachingartists.

[48] Sonja L. Myklebust, "Beyond the Concert Hall: The Creation and Implementation of a Teaching Artist Training Program at the University Level." (DMA diss., University of Washington, 2017), http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1944510737?accountid=4485.

[49] Byoung Joo Kim, "Balancing the Apollonian and Dionysian Dualism: A Look at the Drama/theatre Teaching Artist," *Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied Theatre and Performance* 20.3 (2015): 302-05.

[50] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

some pockets of music educators and within some music education programs, it has only now just started to infiltrate academia as a cohesive entity. Having a formalized field of collaborative piano means that standards have been established. These standards provide some definition of what being a collaborative pianist entail. Teaching artistry is much more conceptually ambiguous, although its aesthetically-guided philosophies have potential to enrich the collaborative pianist. There is still no clearly agreed-upon standard among the large spectrum of skills under the umbrella of teaching artistry; consequently, a range of opinions about the field's identity have resulted. Despite these challenges, both fields seek ways to keep up with the ever-changing cultural, educational, and economic landscapes.

The collaborative piano resources developed over the last sixty years have been necessary to define and codify collaborative piano as a field. The practical guides and resources on specialties continue to emerge but, like the entire field of Western art music, must also find ways to stay current and relevant in how these skills are applied. To simply write a guide of how to succeed and thrive as a collaborative pianist in the year 2020 would only provide a resource that would be outdated as soon as it is published, due to the development of technology and the speedy growth of a competitive performing arts field. Instead, this document will challenge collaborative pianists with habits of thinking that help them be creative in the absence of traditional standards, while pursuing careers that are both successful and fulfilling.

CHAPTER 2

INTRODUCTION TO TEACHING ARTISTRY

This chapter begins with an informative perspective on teaching artistry and offers a brief introduction to the field. In addition, this chapter explores categories of teaching artistry, and then provides definitions of useful terms. In order to fully explore the nuances of teaching artistry, it is helpful to define various terms specific to teaching artistry that may be new to a collaborative pianist's vocabulary. Some of the terms may be familiar, but definitions are presented in this chapter in order to provide a foundational understanding of teaching artistry. The terms encompass educational capacities, procedures, and address the ontology of the work of art.

Defining a Teaching Artist

Teaching artistry is still growing among the performing artist community. A teaching artist does not necessarily have all of the training of a music educator in philosophies and delivery of education, but they can often be found supporting music educators in partnership roles. Teaching artists should not try to be music educators. They should seek to identify the unique roles they have in relationship to the communities they serve, as well as colleagues and other constituents that may exist in the teaching environment.[1] Sometimes teaching artists can be found in places where music educators are typically not found, such as prisons and retirement communities.

Because teaching artistry has so recently become a formalized field, certifications and degrees in teaching artistry are rare, and it is still largely a field of self-professed practitioners. In any field, it used to be that the quality of an

[1] Nick Jaffe, Becca Barniskis and Barbara Hackett Cox, *Teaching Artist Handbook* (Chicago: Columbia College Chicago Press. 2013).

individual's work, not their credentials, dictated the success of their vocation. Currently, most fields rely on certifications, but the concept of a self-professed vocation still applies in teaching artistry.[2] Because there is no nationally recognized certification requirement to call oneself a teaching artist, the field includes a wide array of abilities in people who call themselves teaching artists. There are two sides to this coin: the lack of qualifications offers experienced artists ambiguous, flexible creativity. However, it can also mean that organizations who hire teaching artists don't always end up with a consistent quality of artists. This reason is one contributor to teaching artistry, as a field, being barely passed its "teenage years," according to Booth.[3]

While anyone can call themselves a teaching artist, the term should imply that the artist has arts learning goals beyond the technical skills of an instrument. Teaching artistry should challenge an artist to dive deep into their work, identifying the essence of themselves as artists and then using their artistic essence to build processes and pedagogy. Many teaching artists derive equal satisfaction from a creative process in their own work as they do from guiding others through a creative process. In other words, they equally enjoy performing and teaching and have chosen to give both equal priority in their careers.

Being a teaching artist involves asking the *why* that is deeper than the technique and even musicianship. In his essay entitled *A Brief, Broad History of the Teaching Artist*, art historian G. James Daichendt states:

> At the foundation of the teaching artist history is an ongoing creative practice that contributes to the curriculum, priorities, identity, values and processes of teaching and making art. Teaching artists understand the world differently,

---

[2] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, *Teaching Artist Handbook*.

[3] Eric Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?" *Eric Booth*, accessed January 25, 2020, https://ericbooth.net/what-is-a-teaching-artist/.

> understand educational problems through their own artistic activity and play an active and nimbly adaptable role in educating the future.[4]

This quote emphasizes the artistic lens through which all teaching, and, as this paper will propose, collaborating is viewed. Artistry comes first, from a personal identity and a value system that informs every aspect of making music.

A Brief History of Teaching Artistry

Teaching artistry speculatively dates as far back as prehistoric times and has been present throughout history wherever the effort for a fusion between theory and practice has existed.[5] G. James Daichendt writes "…the teaching artist, historical or modern, is not a special case of unique identity, but a reflection of the hybridity of art-making itself, and the dual role of all artists as makers and communicators."[6] Its roots in aesthetic education date back to the Greeks and can be traced centuries earlier in other cultures. For the purposes of this study, however, this brief introduction and history will focus primarily on the development of teaching artistry in the United States. Historical essays for further detail can be found in *Teaching Artist Handbook*[7] and on Eric Booth's website.[8]

The philosopher and education reformer John Dewey influenced many teaching artists who emerged from the 1920s through the mid-century, including Victor D'Amico, Natalie Robinson Cole, Florence Cane, Peppino Mangravite, and

---

[4] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 228.

[5] Eric Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 1.

[6] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 200.

[7] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 216.

[8] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

Marion Richardson.[9] Arising from a world where educators in the arts were not necessarily specialists, because America had very few requirements for becoming an arts educator, these individuals believed that maintaining an active practice in a discipline made them more effective teachers. This belief fueled the concept of the teaching artist.[10] D'Amico believed that children are artists and that the artist in a child should be developed before technique and instruction are introduced. He, along with Cane, believed in creativity and imagination, feeling that the classroom was stifling to most children in America. These two teaching artists had a great impact on the field of teaching artistry

Outside the schools, teaching artists could be found in settlement houses teaching art history or applied art. Teaching artists were often women, which was interesting since they were still being estranged from their professional fields.[11] In 1933, in response to The Great Depression, the Works Progress Administration (WPA) began to offer programs to tens of thousands of people. Some of these artists, which included many minorities, immigrants and women, became highly influential figures, despite incredible discrimination during that time.[12] These programs gave teaching artists not only new opportunities, but also visibility in the community, infusing America's culture with art in a significant way.[13] WPA teaching artists also found jobs in higher education and help shape teaching artistry,

---

[9] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 216.

[10] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 216-217.

[11] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 218.

[12] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 218-219.

[13] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 218

eventually stimulating organized arts education in the public-school system.[14] These Artists-in-Residence and teaching artists paved the way for full-time faculty and fully developed university departments in the arts.[15]

As school arts programs became more prevalent in the mid-century with large-scale bands and orchestras, teaching artists were sent in to invigorate and spark inspiration in students while contributing to arts education, social development and building of school communities.[16] The Ford Foundation created three-year long residencies for composers like Philip Glass as early as 1959.[17] Leonard Bernstein's Young People's Concerts were another of the first very high-profile examples of teaching artistry. However, it became apparent that not all teaching artists were innately good at teaching beyond their applied art form, and some artists were even bad at that. The need for training became apparent, and professional development workshops and programs began to emerge.

The post-war period and the Civil Rights movement, with goals of social justice and the democratic desire to include everyone in the arts, drove many teaching artists in their careers.[18] The theories of John Cage were very influential on teaching artists during this time. He was very open to influences of all kinds and was very intrigued by different processes of music making. Cage's experimental style carried into the classroom and works such as his famous 4'33" were initiated in a classroom.

---

[14] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 219.

[15] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 220.

[16] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

[17] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

[18] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

The economic crisis and recession in the 1970s and 1980s had an extensive impact on arts education and arts in public schools. However, limited public funding did become available, including the efforts of The National Endowment for the Arts (NEA). Established in 1965, it brought teaching artists into the schools in the 1970s, establishing the model of short-term artist-in-residence programs and arts-based field trips. The Comprehensive Employment Act (CETA) also made much teaching artist work possible, in some ways saving arts education during these years. Many artists worked for CETA or received funding from the NEA.[19] While the funding was good for teaching artists, some educators expressed concern, wondering if the teaching artist was going to replace the music educators in schools, eliminating the long-term relationships built between music educators and students. Teaching artist work was sometimes viewed as a band-aid for the lack of funding, or an addition to the problem instead of a solution. Institutions could hire freelance teaching artists for much less money than hiring full-time art teachers with benefits and salaries.[20] Over the years, teaching artists have fought this kind of exploitation, advocated for their own salaries and benefits, and over time have worked to develop more trustworthy relations with schools and teachers. As a result, tensions have dissipated between teaching artists and music educators. Daichendt encourages partnerships between music educators (or arts specialists, as he calls them) and teaching artists, saying that it "opens up the possibility that arts specialists will be afforded time and space for their own work as artists, and teaching artists will be provided more access to stable employment, should they seek it."[21]

---

[19] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 222.

[20] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 218.

[21] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 224.

Political pressures of the 1990s caused the NEA to withdraw funding for many public art projects. In public schools, the trend of assessment rose in the arts and other subjects, and accountability was prioritized in the curriculum by the creation of national standards for various disciplines of art. Doing teaching artist work in any school, underfunded or not, in some ways was becoming increasingly difficult because funding was consistently linked to academic results in higher test scores. teaching artists began to get involved in assessment and alignment with national standards, partnerships, and even developing curriculum and programs.[22] Also in the 1990s, the first teaching artist resources also appeared: the Association of Teaching Artists; a professional peer-review journal called *Teaching Artist Journal*; professional development workshops; and a few certifications at Universities.[23] Low pay and job security are still concerns as the field is affected by economic recessions and changing culture. However, as arts education moves away from practice and more into theory and aesthetic education, teaching artists are increasingly relied upon to be cultural connectors.[24]

Categories of Teaching Artist Work

Eric Booth with Lincoln Center Education (LCE) uses seven categories or "threads," as LCE calls them, to organize the different kinds of work teaching artists do. Their list captures the breadth of what teaching artists do as well as the goals in their work.[25]

---

[22] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

[23] Booth, "What is a Teaching Artist?"

[24] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 227.

[25] Eric Booth, "A New Framework for Understanding the Field of Teaching Artistry," *Eric Booth*, accessed January 25, 2020, http://ericbooth.net/857-2.

The Seven (plus one) Purpose Threads of the Teaching Artist Field[26]

Name of thread	**Primary purpose of the work**
Work of art	To enhance the encounter with art works.
Art skills development	To deepen the development of art making skills.
Arts integration	To catalyze the learning of non-arts content.
Community	To enhance the life of communities.
Activism	To impact a political or social movement.
Social/personal development	To develop personal or social capacities.
Partnering for non-art goals	To achieve goals important to other institutions.
+Digital	To activate personal artistry in digital media.

Musicians tend to start in the *Art Skills Development* thread, because they have to build skills before they pursue any of these other threads. This thread is where all performers should begin. Most musicians who perform and actively employ audience engagement techniques also make use of the *Work of Art* thread. In theory, every performance exists in the *Work of Art* thread, so that thread would be more of the performer's primary home base. Many musicians find some kind of work in the *Community* thread because that work tends to be fulfilling and rewarding. This kind of work does not always pay, but many artists do it anyways. Music Therapy would also fall under this *Community* thread. Musicians who use their art as a platform in

[26] Booth, "A New Framework."

the *Advocacy* and *Social/Personal Development* threads do so in a variety of ways including championing obscure composers, commissioning new work about a certain cause, and fundraising through concerts. Lastly, the *Arts Integration* thread uses art to teach other subjects. The arts integration trend demands highly collaborative skills and partnership to be successful. Educators can be good resources for the *Arts Integration* thread and for the *Non-Art Goals* category as well.

Defining Terms

- **Habits of Mind**

  In teaching artistry, this term *Habits of Mind* is credited to Arthur Costa and Bena Kallick in their book *Habits of Mind: A Developmental Series* (2000).[27] These author-educators have essentially developed a list of thinking habits to adopt for successful learning, including ideas such as Thinking Flexibly, Persisting, and Managing Impusivity. They propose that a good learner employs these mental habits to allow them to creatively approach problems and new learning experiences. Other philosophers have taken inspiration and developed their own lists of habits of mind, such as Ted Sizer and Debbie Meier in their CPESS *Habits of Mind*, Harvard Project Zero's Studio Habits of Mind, and Eric Booth's five habits of mind in his *Teaching Artist Bible*.[28] This document does not refer to any one of these specific lists when discussing habits of mind, but refers to the general idea of developing good thinking habits for learning in teachers, collaborators and students alike.

---

[27] Terry Heick, "Integrating the 16 Habits of Mind," *Edutopia*, last modified October 19, 2012, https://www.edutopia.org/blog/habits-of-mind-terrell-heick.

[28] Booth, *Teaching Artist Bible*, 67-71.

- **Aesthetic Education**

Since the 1980s, the field of teaching artistry has drawn heavily from the philosophy of aesthetic education. Philosopher Maxine Greene, a key proponent of aesthetic education, states that it is an approach that engages students in learning about works of art through hands-on inquiry, questioning, writing, and art making. This approach requires that learners, in the words of Greene, "look through the lenses of various ways of knowing, seeing and feeling in a conscious endeavor to impose different orders upon experience.[29]

This education philosophy has grown in popularity over the last few decades. Beyond technical skills, it promotes habits of mind, and empowers students to be able to encounter and process an experience in a framework of inquiry and reflection. In order to display some concise principles of aesthetic education, Lincoln Center Education published *10 Capacities For Imaginative Learning* that are used in their programs.[30] Of course, the field of aesthetic education is much larger than Lincoln Center Education, but this list, reprinted below, provides a succinct idea of the values that are championed by this educational philosophy.

[29] "About Aesthetic Education," Lehman College: The Bronx Education Network, accessed March 1, 2020, https://www.lehman.edu/academics/education/bronx-arts-education-network/about.php.

[30] *Lincoln Center Institute,* accessed March 1, 2020, https://imaginationnow.files.wordpress.com/2011/03/capacities.pdf.

10 Capacities for Imaginative Learning[31]

Noticing Deeply	to identify and articulate layers of detail in a work of art or other object of study through continuous interaction with it over time.
Embodying	to experience a work of art or other object of study through your senses, as well as emotionally, and also to physically represent that experience.
Questioning	to ask questions throughout your explorations that further your own learning; to ask the question, "What if?"
Making Connections	to connect what you notice and the patterns you see to your prior knowledge and experiences, to others' knowledge and experiences, and to text and multimedia resources.
Identifying Patterns	to find relationships among the details that you notice, group them, and recognize patterns.
Exhibiting Empathy	to respect the diverse perspectives of others in the community; to understand the experiences of others emotionally, as well as intellectually.
Living with Ambiguity	to understand that issues have more than one interpretation, that not all problems have immediate or clear-cut solutions, and to be patient while a resolution becomes clear.
Creating Meaning	to create your own interpretations based on the previous capacities, see these in the light of others in the community, create a synthesis, and express it in your own voice.
Taking Action	to try out new ideas, behaviors or situations in ways that are neither too easy nor too dangerous or difficult, based on the synthesis of what you have learned in your explorations.
Reflecting/Assessing	to look back on your learning, continually assess what you have learned, assess/identify what challenges remain, and assess/identify what further learning needs to happen. This occurs not only at the end of a learning experience, but is part of what happens throughout that experience. It is also not the end of your learning; it is part of beginning to learn something else.

[31] *Lincoln Center Institute,* accessed March 1, 2020, https://imaginationnow.files.wordpress.com/2011/03/capacities.pdf.

True to the dual ideals of teaching artistry, these capacities apply to artistry as much as education. They are also applicable to various disciplines and are useful for artists who utilize multiple art forms.

- **Work of art: Ontology**

For visual artists, the work of art may seem more tangible. Upon first glance, a work of art is an object, such as a picture, painting or sculpture, but deeper inquisition may raise more questions, especially for the musician. Is a work of art the score, a performance, or a combination of how the two exist simultaneously? The score, of course, cannot be music in and of itself, but needs a performer to make it come alive. Since a performance is one realization of many possibilities of the score, is each performance its own work of art?[32] Can a recording be called a work of art, or is a recording simply the preservation of a work that existed at one point in time? These are philosophical questions that every musician should consider. For the musician, it is likely that a work of art is a piece of music, composition, or an improvisation in some form. A score is a noun of art, but does not amount to actual art unless there are performing artists to bring the music to life—a verb of art.[33] For the purposes of this document, a work of art is a piece of music performed by a musician. The music may be the realization of a score, such as a Beethoven sonata, a performer's creative realization of an open score, or an improvisation by a performer. Since no two performances are the same, a musician could call each performance of the same score its own work of art as well. Similarly, each realization of a song is a work of art, regardless of whether

[32] Theodore Gracyk, "The Aethetics of Popular Music," *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy,* accessed February 15, 2020, https://www.iep.utm.edu/music-po/.

[33] Booth. *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible*, 2.

or not a score exists or was consulted. This philosophy captures art as a verb rather than a noun. Also, the word *art* in work of art is a term that is not limited to visual art, but is used in this document to define any discipline, including music.

- **Point of Entry**

  A point of entry is the starting place for learning about or experiencing something new. Pedagogically, it the knowledge that the learner or audience member already possesses that serves as the starting place for contextualizing new material and new experiences. A good pedagogue will find points of entry before introducing new vocabulary or concepts in order to ease the learning process.

- **Scaffolding**

  This technique, similar to lesson planning, is explored with practical applications in Chapter 5, but the basic definition of scaffolding is the step-by-step strategy used when introducing a concept or designing a rehearsal, starting with something with one known piece of the learner's knowledge (the point of entry) and progressively working more challenges into each step to create a progressive learning process. This method allows the facilitator to slowly expand comfort zones of the learners, gain the trust of the student, and make new territory less stressful for the learner. In essence, scaffolding is the strategic planning behind building a lesson plan.

- **Practice:**

  Musicians often refer to *practice* as learning to perform music, but a teaching artist's definition is more like that of a physician; it extends to any professional activities that they do. Practice can include the work a performer does to learn music, the creativity needed to bring music to life, as well as the creativity involved in teaching and developing a career. It can also include collaborations and habits of a musical mind. It can be as broadly defined as the way music manifests itself in a musician's life.[34]

- **Residency:**

  This broad term can reference traditional artist-in-residence programs, which allow artists to have a retreat from their normal work and reflect, research or work on projects in a new environment.[35] In the context of teaching artistry, a residency usually refers to the artist's relationship with an organization. It can be anything from a single visit to a multi-year contract with a school or community organization in which the artist facilitates experiences around art. A residency refers more to services rendered, not necessarily retreats for the artist, although many teaching residencies are experiences artists find enriching. Very often, residencies involve skills of partnership with administrators, teachers and non-profit organizations.

---

[34] Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible*, 2.

[35] Henri Neuendorf, "Art Demystified: How Do Artist Residencies Work?" *ArtNet News*, last modified September 15, 2016, https://news.artnet.com/art-world/art-demystified-artist-residencies-649592.

- **Creative Aging:**

  Psychology Today defines creative aging as "the practice of engaging older adults (55+) in participatory, professionally run arts programs with a focus on social engagement and skills mastery." [36] Creative aging provides opportunities for learners to contribute to their communities no matter what stage of life the learner finds themselves in. The field encourages the growth of individuals through workshops in a variety of art forms and can be recreational or more skills based. The creative aging movement has provided many opportunities for teaching artists, some of whom chose to specialize in this area as a career. Some arts organizations offer workshops geared toward this population of learners.

To summarize, the introduction to teaching artistry in this chapter is presented in order for pianists to recognize parallels with collaborative piano. The information will hopefully spark the curiosity of the collaborative pianist about deeper ways that these philosophies can inform their collaborative processes. Some applications will be easily contextualized for a collaborative pianist's work. The way that this application works is very process driven, versus product driven, since these capacities are meant to deepen or build the processes for collaborative work, replacing an outcome-based mentality with a learner's mentality. Possible applications will be explored at greater length in the following chapters.

[36] Lawrence R. Samuel, "Creative Aging," *Psychology Today*, last modified September 29, 2017, https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/boomers-30/201709/creative-aging.

CHAPTER 3

TEACHING ARTIST TOOLS TO ENHANCE THE COLLABORATIVE PIANIST'S WORK

An incredible spectrum of skills is demanded of collaborative pianists. Even within specialties, such as art song, instrumental repertoire, or vocal coaching, the collaborative pianist must be proficient in a variety of styles, genres and languages. Additionally, a high level of flexibility and versatility is needed to meet the needs of various collaborators and environments. This chapter explores many of the non-musical skills that are typically demanded of the collaborative pianist. This skill set overlaps with core principles of teaching artistry and many ideas and resources intended for teaching artists are presented here for use in collaboration. These skills tend to be philosophical in nature, transcending discipline and, in this case, the roles of teaching and artistry, reinforcing the duality of teaching artistry. In other words, they can apply equally to teaching and collaborating. These non-musical skills tend to be habits of mind or habits of attitude, rather than tangible musical abilities. The idea of exploring this intersection is not to enter collaborative environments with the attitude of a teacher, but instead to examine elements of learning processes and find parallel applications in the collaborative process. The capacities most relevant to collaborative pianists will be discussed in four categories: Facilitation, Objectivity, Asking Questions and Feedback. The 10 Capacities of teaching artistry listed earlier in this document will also be referenced in the discussion.

The overarching principle here is to consult one’s artistic processes to inform one’s teaching process, and in this case, one’s collaborative process. By approaching the following ideas in the same holistic way, the growth of a pianist as a facilitator will inform not only their collaborating, but also their coaching, teaching and even their individual artistic practices.

Facilitation

The roles collaborative pianists play in collaborative relationships can vary greatly. The collaborative pianist may experience everything from a minimal role with simple accompaniments and almost no collaborative interaction, to having an expectation of leadership placed upon them. The latter is often true when working with younger collaborators, and the planning and execution of the rehearsal falls to the collaborative pianist. Often there is no advance notice of what the situation will be, and it is usually on the shoulders of the pianist to assess what is expected of them, navigating each situation with flexibility and poise. Because of the need to meet multifaceted and often unknown expectations in a collaborative experience, the art of facilitation is embedded into the nature of a collaborative pianist's work.

The authors of Mindtools.com, a website offering guidance on the development of career skills, define facilitation as a way to ease a process.[1] Cambridge dictionary defines facilitation as "the act of helping other people to deal with a process or reach an agreement or solution without getting directly involved in the process, discussion, etc. yourself," reinforcing the idea of neutrality in a facilitator.[2] Barbara MacKay of North Star Facilitators begins her essays on facilitators with a delineation between training and facilitation.[3] A trainer is what Mackay identifies as the content expert, and what most musicians would define as the teacher. The trainer is focused on learning and skill building, which is what

---

[1] "The Role of a Facilitator," *Mind Tools*, accessed March 1, 2020, https://www.mindtools.com/pages/article/RoleofAFacilitator.htm.

[2] Robert Cserti, "Essential Facilitation Skills for an Effective Facilitator," *Session Lab*, last modified January 28, 2019, https:www.sessionlab.com/blog/facilitation-skills.

[3] Barbara MacKay, "5 Big Differences between Training and Facilitation," North Star Facilitators, accessed March 1, 2020, https://northstarfacilitators.com/2017/02/5-big-differences-between-training-and-facilitation/.

collaborative pianists have spent most of their lives learning. Training mentalities are largely used for teaching private lessons and coaching, focusing on developing technique, musicianship and other tools needed to express music. MacKay states that, in contrast to skill building as a trainer, a facilitator fosters thinking, decision-making, problem-solving, consensus-building, and planning, which can include envisioning, innovating, strategizing and implementing.[4]

MacKay's principles of facilitation are immediately applicable for a collaborative pianist who assumes the objective posture as facilitator as they, for instance, coach a chamber music group of students. The coach's goal is to provide insight beyond the skill of each instrument and offer ideas for group communication and effective collaborating. While coaching can involve training, for instance, intonation exercises for string players, the coach's goal is to promote group thinking and problem-solving that serves the group in a long-term way.

Even though facilitators are more commonly found working with groups, the principles can apply to any type of collaboration, including vocal coaching or groups as small as duos. The work of the vocal coach is often more like a trainer, making sure elements of music are sufficiently learned, stylistically correct and, in the case of language, properly pronounced. However, the vocal coach could also incorporate capacities of facilitation, encouraging vocalists to build processes rather than always relying on a coach. This approach does not put the coach out of work, but instead offers increased freedom and creativity in coaching for detailed and nuanced music making. It will encourage the coach to go deeply into their own practice in order to continue enriching the processes of their students. The most effective coaching involves building processes for individuals and groups to make decisions, strategize,

[4] MacKay, "5 Big Differences."

and be innovative together. This feat is accomplished through several tools for the coach, including Objectivity, Question Asking and Feedback which are about to be addressed in the next sections.

Beyond the more obvious applications of these principles to coaching, facilitation is also embedded in the work of a pianist when they themselves are part of the group, whether the work be duo, chamber music or another musical ensemble. In these situations, it is also important that the collaborators make a distinction between a trainer and a facilitator mentality. Even though one facilitator may not be designated in the group, adopting these facilitation principles can ease collaborative environments, help to build relationships and enhance the group music making process. This idea is especially applicable when, in the absence of a facilitator, the pianist assumes the role, whether by choice or by default. The most useful element of facilitation for collaborative pianists is objectivity.

Objectivity

While it is impossible to be 100% objective as a member of a duo or group, exercising an effort to be objective can greatly affect many components of collaborating. In equal partnerships, the collaborative partners must decisively leave the trainer (or teacher) mentality at the door in order to achieve objectivity. The teacher-student situation has a hierarchy, with one individual as the expert imparting a body of knowledge to another individual. That model in the standard within which most musicians are trained in their respective instruments, so it makes sense that those teaching instincts can be strong in some collaborative partners. In most collaborations, however, roles of hierarchy are not helpful. Even if the same expert body of knowledge is to be utilized, it needs to be tapped in different way when working with colleagues.

Before anything is said in a rehearsal, the tone of the environment is inevitably dictated by nonverbal communication from collaborative partners. As teaching artists strive to create healthy classroom environments for students, collaborative partners should also intentionally set their work environment, setting an intention to create a neutral space. In such a space, everyone feels included, significant, and valued, promoting risk-taking in a safe space. This means that collaborators are never made to feel demeaned or degraded for their ideas. On the contrary, collaborative partners should inspire creative experimentation in one another, fostering an environment where many possibilities can be explored. Eric Booth's favorite words for an ideal working and learning (or rehearsing) atmosphere are "safe and charged."[5]

Sometimes collaborators will mirror their partner's behavior in the same way a student will mirror their teacher's behavior. If a pianist has a defensive posture, the collaborator might reflect that defensive posture. Other emotions such as anxiety or fear could also be mirrored. Collaborative pianists should strive for a calm and confident stance, or whatever energy they would like to see exemplified in their partner. Ultimately, the collaborative pianist can only control themselves, but they should be aware of how their attitude and demeanor affect others.

In addition, the collaborative pianist should be aware of any inner monologue, if one exists. Unconscious habits of harsh self-criticism can create mental stress, which is proven to be not only less creative, but also detrimental to learning. The *npj Science of Learning* journal states that "While stress around the time of learning is thought to enhance memory formation, thus leading to robust memories, stress markedly impairs memory retrieval, bearing, for instance, the risk of underachieving

[5] Eric Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 31.

at exams."[6] Awareness of one's mental monologue and establishment of good habits of mind lead to a greater efficacy of practice, performing and collaborating.

Howard Gardner, the psychologist-education researcher who proposed the theory of multiple intelligences, also proposed four roles that are crucial to arts learning: *Creator, Performer, Audience,* and *Critic*.[7] Booth explores these roles in detail and expounds on Gardner's idea by saying that a correct balance of these four roles in a musician's life will promote sustainable, fulfilling careers. The *Audience* role is particularly relevant to this discussion of objectivity. While it seems like an absurd idea for a performing musician to take on the persona of an audience member, the traits of an audience member described by Booth such as "the capacity to set aside preconceptions and prejudices and encounter something new with openness"[8] can be extremely valuable, especially in the early stages of building a collaborative relationship or encountering a new musical work. Booth goes on to say that the skills of spirit, emotional memory, attention, and making one's own personal connections can aid in the challenge of entering a musical world together as a performer and audience member, or in this case, as collaborative partners.[9] It is nearly impossible to remain completely free of expectation when entering a new collaborative relationship, but assuming as little expectation as possible can create open space to establish new partnerships.

Beyond setting the environment with a neutral approach, the collaborative pianist can utilize the very simple act of observing. A great way to engage in this

---

[6]Susanne Vogel and Lars Schwabe, "Learning and Memory Under Stress: Implications for the Classroom," *NPJ Science of Learning* 1, 16011 (2016), https://doi.org/10.1038/npjscilearn.2016.11.

[7] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 57.

[8] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 56.

[9] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 56.

practice is to answer the question, "What do you (or I) notice?" This activity is listed first in the list of 10 capacities from Lincoln Center's aesthetic education practice and is defined as identifying and articulating layers of detail in a work of art though repeated interaction with it.[10] Observing avoids sentences that begin with, "I think…" or "I feel that…" postponing conclusions and feedback until the noticing has taken place. This practice should be the first step in most processes from listening to new music to assessing a collaboration. It can happen outwardly as a starting place for discussion or as a first step for internal self-reflection and group assessment.

Identifying patterns is another capacity of teaching artistry that involves observing and finding relationships in the details.[11] This practice is useful for score study individually or collaboratively. Before deciding how one feels about a work, this capacity encourages a curiosity in the musician to understand it first. Identifying patterns allows one to recognize form in a piece, repetition of motives, and harmony, or other organizational frameworks, and other compositional techniques that unify a piece. Collaborators can seek patterns as a pathway to understanding the composer's intention before they engage in questioning and interpretive feedback.

Identifying patterns can also be useful as one seeks patterns or habits in their collaborative partners. Noticing habits, whether they be musical tendencies or personal practices, can help the collaborative pianist plan proactively and adapt accordingly. This capacity is simple and often an intuitive skill for collaborative pianists, but setting intention behind the noticing will bring a deeper understanding of colleagues and music.

---

[10] *Lincoln Center Institute,* accessed March 1, 2020, https://imaginationnow.files.wordpress.com/2011/03/capacities.pdf.

[11] *Lincoln Center Institute.*

Question Asking

Strategies for good facilitation and collaboration center around the skill of asking good questions. In the article *The Surprising Power of Questions*, authors Alison Wood Brooks and Leslie K. John state that questioning "…spurs learning and the exchange of ideas, it fuels innovation and performance improvement, it builds rapport and trust among team members."[12] Brooks and John state that asking questions "unlocks learning and improves interpersonal bonding," something that is crucial to ongoing collaborative relationships. [13] Asking questions is a way that a musician can contribute to an ideal learning environment, create equality for themselves and others, and earn respect. Questions can give pianists a voice, even when a collaborator does not invite input.

In his TEDx talk, Mike Vaughan emphasizes the importance of how questions are asked as much as what is being asked. Asking "What should we do?" versus "What could we do?" elicits two completely different responses from the brain.[14] He states that most common questions lead to what is already known or seen. Good questions go deeper, beyond reactionary thinking to proactive and creative thinking. The tendency in teachers and collaborators is to use questions as a reactionary tool rather than a creative, proactive tool. In addition, the tone and spirit of the inquirer is as important as the quality of the question. The necessity for ease in tone of voice cannot be stressed enough.

---

[12] Alison Wood Brooks and Leslie K. John, "The Surprising Power of Questions," *Harvard Business Review*, May-June 2018 issue, https://hbr.org/2018/05/the-surprising-power-of-questions.

[13] Brooks and John, "The Surprising Power."

[14] Mike Vaughan, "How to ask Better Questions*," TEDx Talks*, uploaded July 17, 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=J8xfuCcXZu8&feature=share.

Good questions are open questions, often with more than one right answer, as opposed to a leading question, which only has one right answer. Using closed questions, like "yes" or "no" questions, can make collaborators feel interrogated and cornered. A closed question would be, "Are the dynamics written here loud or soft?" In that case, there is one correct, written answer, versus an open question like, "Why do you think the composer chose that dynamic in this passage?" Furthermore, the tool of pre-supposition can be used, kindly assuming that the collaborative partner already possesses the skill set to do what is about to be proposed. An example of a presupposition would be, "How can we effectively achieve the dynamics in this passage?" versus, "Is it possible to play the written dynamics in that passage?"[15] The first question implies the ability to carry out the task. Colin Boyd uses the following example in his *How to Ask Good Questions* video: "Is this working?" versus, "How is this working for you?"[16] The latter has a built in implication that there is a solution, and that the person being questioned has the ability to complete the task. Eric Booth calls this tapping competence, and suggests emphasizing what they can do rather than what they can't do." [17] Getting to know one's collaborators and their skill sets is often necessary to tap their competency successfully.

Questions can elicit imagination even as they guide the components of the music that need to be corrected. A closed question such as, "Do you think Bach would want you to use the pedal for a fugue?" versus a more imaginative approach like, "What instrument sounds could you assign to each voice if you were an

---

[15] Colin Boyd, "How to Ask Good Questions," uploaded November 26, 2014, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o00DM0_tOCE.

[16] Boyd, "How to Ask Good Questions."

[17] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 27.

orchestrator and how would you create the sound for each one?" Questions such as "Was it too fast or too slow?" are reactionary and poor follow-up questions. Other examples of open, creative questions might be, "I wonder what the composer was feeling when he wrote that passage" or "What in life would cause someone to write music like this?" or "I wonder why they chose this musical form?"[18] Musicians should ask questions with multiple possible answers that might challenge a point of view. Even with seasoned collaborators and long-time partners, asking creative questions can lead to creative interpretation and thinking outside the box. Questioning should also be for one's own learning as much as for the learning and inspiration of their collaborator.

At times closed questions are necessary and efficient, especially between busy colleagues who have an established relationship, or in vocal coaching where simple correction of pronunciation is the objective. It is important to know when to use open, creative questions versus an efficient transfer of information. A vocal coach is paid to give as much advice as possible in the hour that they are being compensated, which requires a different kind of communication than a collaborative pianist working with a vocalist colleague as an equal. These habits of inquiry apply more to the latter, although vocal coaches may use good questioning to help establish healthy self-inquiry in vocalists and clients.

Lastly, questions should lead to making connections, another capacity which is promoted in teaching artistry and is the follow up to identifying patterns. Making connections in new music and experiences to prior knowledge is a necessary and intuitive component of collaboration. The brain instinctively categorizes new information amongst existing knowledge, but actively recognizing and making

[18] Booth, 34.

connections will make the learning process more efficient and collaboration more meaningful.[19]

Feedback

Feedback is at the heart of collaborative rehearsals, coachings, and ensemble work. Most pianists have experienced musical training by having lessons where they play, and then the teacher offers feedback. This feedback can come in all forms and be delivered in varying manners. It is tied to critique which for some musicians may have negative connotations but is in fact an invaluable tool when utilized well.

In a discussion of Gardner's *Critic* role (from the four arts learning roles mentioned above), Booth explores these roles in detail, writing that "The critic is sharply observant of detail and can remember and compare with accuracy. The critic does not tear down but illuminates the word through a variety of analytic processes."[20] A good critic will apply previous knowledge to bring something new to light. However, many collaborative pianists give feedback the way they received feedback in their training. Those inherited habits and language from teachers, good and bad, spills over into collaborating, coaching and group work, so it is important to bring awareness to one's critiquing style.[21]

Critically offering and receiving feedback is a skill that corporations spend a good deal of time and money on, but in which very few teaching artists and musicians are specifically trained. Receiving feedback from fellow artists involves

---

[19] National Research Council*, How People Learn: Brain, Mind, Experience, and School: Expanded Edition* (Washington, DC: The National Academies Press, 2000), 114, doi: 10.17226/9853.

[20] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 34.

[21] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 176.

high risk and vulnerability, which is why those audience skills of openness in the Objectivity section are so important to establish.[22]

Several formalized processes have been developed for giving and receiving feedback from artist to artist. Liz Lerman developed one such process called *Critical Response*.[23] She teaches entire workshops on this process, but listed below is a synopsis of her step-by-step method involving an artist, responders, and a designated facilitator. She promotes the capacities of observing and neutrality by calling critics "responders," neutralizing their role.

Critical Response Process[24]

Step 1: Statements of Meaning. Responders state what was meaningful, evocative, interesting, exciting, and/or striking in the work they have just witnessed.
Step 2. Artist as Questioner. The artist asks questions about the work. In answering, responders stay on topic with the question and may express opinions in direct response to the artist's questions.
Step 3. Neutral Questions. Responders ask neutral questions about the work, and the artist responds. Questions are neutral when they do not have an opinion couched in them.
Step 4. Opinion Time. Responders state opinions, given permission from the artist; the artist has the option to say no. This step is one of the most fundamental, challenging, and misunderstood steps of Critical Response Process.

This process was designed for groups of artists to collaborate around new work and is also very effective for the development of new works through performances of

[22] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 177.

[23] Liz Lerman, "Critical Response Process," *Liz Lerman*, accessed January 25, 2020, https://lizlerman.com/critical-response-process/.

[24] Lerman, "Critical Response Process."

works-in-progress. The various steps with designated roles can be utilized in chamber group or large ensemble settings. A duo could also carefully take on the listed roles of facilitation and follow the steps.

The difference between Lerman's process and Lincoln Center Education's philosophy is that she begins with emotional response and statements of meaning, whereas Lincoln Center Education saves the meaning for the reflection, assessment and feedback category, the last of 10 capacities. Lerman's approach is to offer positive feedback first, expressing feelings but delaying conclusions about them. This progression is natural, since people will always feel something when they interact with art, but it can be tricky to ask people to separate feeling from interpretation.

A similar process is used by Artist-to-Artist, a collective of teaching artists in Minnesota.[25] This process aligns more with Lincoln Center Education's progression, but is more concise and may be easier to apply for collaborative pianists. Their steps are as follows:

Artist-to-Artist Critical Response[26]

Step 1: What do you notice? Describe without judgement. ("I notice…")
Step 2: What questions does this work, activity, or subject of inquiry raise for you? ("I wonder…")
Step 3: What meaning or understanding is intended or conveyed in this work? Speculate on the meaning behind a work or what an artist, teacher, or presenter wants learners to understand.

All of these models follow an *observation before interpretation* method, which is essential to build a healthy working environment.[27] They allow space in the various

[25] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 177.

[26] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 177.

steps to make every person involved feel recognized and heard, whether the group be two or seven people. It also establishes a standard of perceptiveness and can sometimes challenge artists to think in more detail beyond how they simply feel about it. Please note that it is not always practical to use the same step-by-step method for communicating with one's partners in every situation, but implementing one's conscious process using some of these habits of mind and skills can bring structure and clarity to the collaboration. The larger the ensemble, the more detailed strategies are needed, particularly for chamber groups without a conductor.

Feedback requires credibility beyond pedigree, which is developed by creating safe spaces, being equally open to feedback as much as giving it, and practicing what one proposes and asks of others.[28] Collaborators can also establish credibility by expressing sensitivity to things regarding their colleague's personal or work life. They should assess when their collaborator is ready for feedback and then strive to offer feedback in as few words as possible.[29] The most helpful observations for feedback should rise to the top, a process that can also be called calibration. [30] The most successful teachers (and it follows, collaborators,) will see far more issues than the feedback they offer.

Listening is the artist's most powerful tool. It is how an artist can cause others to self-assess, which not only leads to more effective learning, but also gives an opportunity to affirm one another, building that safe atmosphere. As the artist

---

[27] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 180.

[28] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 182.

[29] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 182.

[30] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 181.

grows in these capacities, their ability for dreaming up good questions for feedback will grow as well.[31]

Although most education majors learn and master the process of scaffolding in their training, students in applied degrees do not usually receive training in this skill. Scaffolding is the step-by-step strategy, often in the form of a lesson plan, that is used when introducing a concept or designing an activity. The simplest example is to use warmups that gradually become more difficult and prepare the musician for the technical work of the repertoire. It can also involve discussions that contextualize the music being learned, through exploring similar composers and songs, an exploration of world events surrounding composition or a biography of a composer. For the collaborative pianist, it may involve planning questions ahead of time, considering how to generate personal relevance for themselves and their collaborators. In the context of teaching artistry, the scaffolding step is to give the students tools, vocabulary and context before they explore a new concept. Collaborative pianists can utilize this habit for rehearsals and coachings, in order to thoughtfully construct learning processes rather than teach, coach or rehearse reactively. Scaffolding can structure feedback in levels of detail and intensity.

Reflection is an incredibly effective practice for objective feedback from teacher to learner, collaborator to collaborator, or as a self-assessment tool. The philosopher and education reformer John Dewey believed that artists cannot learn from experiences unless reflection takes place.[32] American culture tends to be extremely busy and does not habitually allow space for habits of reflection, especially

---

[31] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 44.

[32] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 160.

in the life of a busy performing musician. Artists must be very intentional to incorporate reflection into their practice.

Reflection can be incorporated into all kinds of learning environments such as private lessons, collaborative rehearsals and chamber ensembles. Reflection is active, intentional and can be experienced when sitting, thinking, talking, jogging, studying, journaling or sketching.[33] It is important to note that everyone reflects differently, which is one reason that listening is so important when asking questions—to leave space so that collaborators can process what they want to say. Some people need to speak out loud, others need to write, others need to physically move, and still others need time to give an articulate response. Taking a personality test like Myers-Briggs Type Indicator may aid in diagnosing one's methods of processing.[34] As a pianist gets to know collaborative partners, they should get to know their best methods of reflection as well.

One of the simplest forms of useful reflection is to record a rehearsal or performance and listen back. It leads to self-teaching, affirmation, and creating an environment for self and others that is safe and charged. Journaling about rehearsals can aid in the reflection process as well as dialogue and thoughtful score study. Reflection can inform scaffolding of future rehearsals for maximum efficiency.

Implied in all of these categories is some degree of leadership on the part of the collaborative pianist. Balancing leadership and respect can be tricky for collaborative pianists in the collaborative context as well as in more administrative roles as well. Gerald Moore was one of the first professionals to state that the pianist

---

[33] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 58.

[34] MBTI® Basics, *The Myers and Briggs Foundation,* accessed March 1, 2020, *https*://www.myersbriggs.org/my-mbti-personality-type/mbti-basics/home.htm?bhcp=1.

has 50% of the responsibility in a collaborative relationship, which should mean that in a collaborative context, half of the leadership and equal respect should belong to the pianist. [35] In an interview with Sarah Green Carmichael in the *Harvard Business Review*, Kristie Rogers, Assistant Professor of Management at Marquette University, discussed two kinds of respect in the context of leader-employee relations.[36] Owed respect is granted on the basis of professionalism. It is given to an artist on the basis of their position, and it provides a baseline of regard for an individual. Acceptance and treating someone with the neutrality discussed in a previous section should be the standard for owed respect. Earned respect, on the other hand, is respect that is granted on the basis of merit. It comprises valued achievements and characteristics that give someone a positive and unique standing with another individual.[37] Owed respect is the basic professional regard given to anybody who walks in the door, while earned respect is given to those who have proven themselves in the eyes of another.

Owed respect, Rogers says, creates a foundation where, "people feel safe, they can be vulnerable, they can try things out, they can be creative."[38] When people are valued, they are in positions of security and as a result tend to do their best work. In an ideal situation, respect should be built so that both or all collaborators feel that they can do their best work. Rogers goes on to discuss the issue of

---

[35] David Hertzberg, "Gerald Moore, 1962: The Unashamed Accompanist - Side 1," uploaded February 17, 2014, www.youtube.com/watch?v=O6De3QqkXk8&t=71s.17 Feb. 2014. www.youtube.com/watch?v=O6De3QqkXk8&t=71s.

[36] Kristie Rogers, "The 2 Types of Respect Leaders Must Show," interview by Sarah Green Carmichael, Harvard Business Review, July 17th, 2018, https://hbr.org/podcast/2018/07/the-2-types-of-respect-leaders-must-show.html.

[37] Rogers, interview.

[38] Rogers, interview.

balancing these kinds of respect in the workplace. With owed respect that is too high, there might not be an incentive to maintain high quality of work or bring some extra dedication if the result will always be the same. If earned respect is too high and owed respect is too low, it creates competition and comparison a which works against effective collaboration.

A high emphasis on earned respect seems to be prevalent in conservatory and university settings among students. While there will always be a healthy competition in both academia and the freelance industry, it is important that collaborations stem from mutual respect and the desire to maintain a healthy balance between owed and earned respect. Approaching collaboration competitively may drive musicians to work hard, but it does not necessarily foster an environment for getting creative and uncovering layers of collaborative possibility together. Maintaining a baseline of owed respect and holding the need for earned respect in balance can aid in maintaining healthy collaborative relationships.

Clearly communicating goals and expectations for the group or duo will support the building of this earned respect. These goals and expectations should not be set forth as a comparison to each other or other people, but as a statement and standard of musical goals. Achieving difficult goals together is the ultimate collaboration and can offer a much more fulfilling results than simply being the best performer in the room. For larger chamber groups, resources on facilitation may be helpful in building and discussing these goals together.

CHAPTER 4

APPLYING TEACHING ARTIST TOOLS TO THE COLLABORATIVE PIANIST'S ADVOCACY

While the previous chapter was about allowing principles of teaching artistry to inform the work that a collaborative pianist already does, this chapter explores how collaborative pianists can use these capacities as tools to pave the way for new work, programs, projects and ideas. Using the capacities explored in the previous chapter, collaborative pianists can activate and develop processes beyond the scope of collaboration itself. By habitually employing those capacities, collaborative pianists can become strong advocates for their unique endeavors to collaborators and audiences alike because of their vast knowledge of repertoire and their extensive network of people. Collaborative pianists can also make great leaders due to their flexibility and well exercised non-musical skills. This chapter will explore how collaborative pianists can be inspired to develop new work as well as lead and advocate through those projects.

In addition to the capacities previously mentioned, having thoughtful processes can aid in the development of distinctive projects. Often these processes have much to do with getting to know oneself as an artist and developing a process, instead of following someone's else's scripted method. Much as the results of a personality test affects perspective, choices and priorities, developing processes should reflect the individual. This approach makes it difficult to offer definitive processes, since ideals change based on individuals, but ideas for developing one's own process are presented here for consideration.

Principles of teaching artistry always start with *art for engagement* strategies.[1] While many strategies of entertainment and audience engagement seem

[1] Nick Jaffe, Becca Barniskis and Barbara Hackett Cox, *Teaching Artist Handbook* (Chicago: Columbia College Chicago Press. 2013), 3.

to start with knowing one's audience and what they want, teaching artistry makes art step #1 and the element of audience engagement step #2. If an artist has spent their entire career trying to make a living as a musician by doing the work that others require, they may not know or have stopped to examine what really excites them. For some collaborative pianists, identifying those interests may be quite simple, while for others, it may be quite complex due to the incredibly wide variety of work in which they might participate. However, doing so will allow the collaborative pianist to maximize their potential.

The Law of 80%

This principle, created by Eric Booth, means that 80% of what a teaching artist teaches is who they are.[2] This is not to say that all artistry is innate and only artists born with talent will perform and teach successfully. Rather, artists are most effective in their work when they teach by example and constantly consult their artistic selves and doing what they love. Tapping this authenticity is both a habit and an art. What follows here is a process for determining that authenticity, or that 80%.

The collaborative pianist should first list the things they do or the things they can do. Identifying one's own expertise and experience in their discipline should be fairly simple. For some collaborative pianists who have chosen a specialty, the list may be as simple as *Repetiteur/Vocal Coach* or *Instrumental Pianist*. For others, it might be extensive and complex, with lots of varying work and roles. Table 1 provides a template for developing that list and may also include activities that pianists have done in the past. A collaborative pianist can then rate which activities they derive the most enjoyment from, which may or may not be the same skills in

[2] Eric Booth, *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 3.

which they are an expert. Enjoyment can vary greatly based on context, which is why more specific sub-categories are listed. After a pianist has rated expertise and enjoyment for each activity, they can highlight areas they would like to study and develop more in this discipline. Hopefully, this exercise is revealing of where a pianist's true fervor lies.

In the instructions below, color coding and addition using the system provided will help amplify the interests that rise to the top. It should be noted that a 10 rating (highest level) for expertise and a 1 rating (lowest level) for enjoyment in the same category does not equal high overall enjoyment level. Also note that if, for instance, all of a pianist's choral collaborating has been with elementary schools, they may find a different sentiment towards choral playing if they collaborate with a professional choir. These possibilities should be highlighted or added in the sub-categories for future endeavors and can thus be included in the last part of the exercise, which is to highlight skills and ideas that they would like to further develop. The pianist may also detail very specific skills in certain categories, such as *French Art Song* under *Art Song* or *Works by Brahms* under *Instrumental Playing.*
There are many variables that affect each pianist's experience, including personalities of colleagues, poor compensation, and overall workload and environment, so it is in the hands of the pianist to factor in those variables. If possible, the artist should try to keep expertise and enjoyment ratings independent from one another. Table 1 was created as an example using a hypothetical person.

Instructions for assessing skill sets and interests using table 1 are as follows and a blank table available in Appendix B. The first step in utilizing this tool is to examine table 1 and add any missing collaborative skills applicable to one's individual career. Next, use the table to assess expertise, experience and enjoyment in various collaborative piano activities. Even though enjoyment will probably parallel

expertise, one should strive to be honest with the enjoyment and engagement factor of the assessment. Generally, people enjoy things they are good at, but a person may really enjoy something that they want to be better at, so the rating can reflect that accordingly. Alternatively, an activity with a high rating in expertise may have a very low enjoyment rating. Add any needed categories, as the list of collaborative pianist activities is not necessarily comprehensive.

Next, highlight categories in yellow that total 18 or more, with at least half the points contained in the enjoyment category. These items should reflect the most enjoyable activities of a pianist's life. Highlight categories in green that total 16 or more, with at least half the points contained in the enjoyment category. These are areas to expand and explore.

Lastly, an expanded version of this exercise would be to list non-musical things that the collaborative pianist enjoys for application in Table 2. An example of this extension is not provided here, but could be informative as non-arts elements are incorporated into projects. This idea is explored in more depth in the content and programming section on page 60 of this document.

Table 1

Assessing Skill Sets and Interests (to determine a pianist's "80%"[3])

Highest levels of enjoyment combined with expertise are highlighted in yellow (ratings totaling 18, 19, 20, with at least half the points in the enjoyment category)

Areas to expand and explore are highlighted in green.

[3] Terminology used by Eric Booth; Booth, Teaching Artist Bible, 37.

Collaborative Pianist Activities[4] (derived from Chris Foley's website. This list is general, not comprehensive)	**Level of Expertise** (1= very little 10=expert)	**Level of Enjoyment** (1= no enjoyment 10=maximum enjoyment)	Totals	Notes and consequential ideas:
Play for Choir				Start a memory-care choir
• Elementary	10	6	16	
• Middle School	10	5	15	
• High School				
• University	9	7	16	
• Community	10	10	20	
• Professional	9	8	17	
Play for Instrumentalists:				
• Specific instruments? Cello, trumpet	9 7	9 8	18 15	
• Orchestral reductions	9	8	17	
• Sonata	8	10	18	
• Other specific Genre/Era				
• Professionals or Colleagues	9	10	19	
• University students				
• Pre-college				
• Community				
•				
Play for Vocalists (Coaching listed separately)				
• Professionals	8	10	18	
• University students	10	8	18	
• Pre-college	10	5	15	
• Community		6	6	
• Opera company				
• Theater company	7	9	16	
Play Chamber music				
• Group size (ex., trio)				
• Genre or era				

[4] Chris Foley, "Career Options in Collaborative Piano," *The Collaborative Piano Blog*, last modified January 9, 2006, ttps://collaborativepiano.blogspot.com/2006/01/career-options-in-collaborative-piano.html.

Contemporary Classical	10 7	8 9	18 16	
• University				
• Professionals or Colleagues	9	10	19	
• University students	10	5	15	
• Pre-college				
• Community				
Play in Large Ensemble				Apply for orchestras
• Orchestra	8	8	16	
• Band	8	6	14	
• New Music Ensemble	9	8	17	
• Professionals				
• University students				
• Community				
Play Ensemble-other				
• Jazz combo	6	9	15	
• Big Band	5	7	12	
•				
• Early Music	6	8	14	
Play or perform in other roles (misc. category)				
• Audition Pianist	8	7	15	
• Competition/Festival Pianist	8	5	13	
• Dance Pianist (ballet, jazz, tap, swing, ballroom, etc..)	7	6	13	
• Conductor	8	9	17	
• Music Director	7	9	16	
• Copyist	4	2	6	
• Arranger	4	9	13	
Vocal Coach				
• Opera	5	8	13	
• Art Song	6	9	15	
• Musical Theater	7	9	16	
• University	7	7	14	
• Community studio				
• High School/pre-college				
Coaching chamber music				
• Specific types (trio, quintet, etc.) Trio, quartet, quintet	7	10	17	

• Specific Genres				
• Specific eras				
• University students	8	10	18	
• Pre-college	9	7	16	
• Community				
Teaching Piano (or other)				
• Group piano	10	9	19	
• Private Lesson	10	9	19	
• Other Class (Music history, Appreciation, Theory, Diction, Sight singing, etc.)	7	8	15	
Church Work				
• Play piano	10	8	18	
• Play organ	8	6	14	
• Direct choir or ensemble	9	9	18	
• Work with Children	6	6	12	
• Planning and administration	7	7	14	
Community work				
• Creative Aging Communities	10	10	20	
• Mentor Youth	6	7	13	
• Humanitarian Causes	7	8	15	
• Social Justice				
• Animal rescue				
• Other Non-arts work (culinary, stylist, nature, outdoor activities, crocheting, anything else that is creative and enjoyable!				
Administration				
• Department Head				
• Pianist coordinator	7	5	12	
• Artistic Director	7	9	16	
• Program Coordinator				
• Non-Profit Employee	7	7	14	
Miscellaneous				
• Web design	4	8	12	
• Software Developer				
• Journalist/blogger	4	8	12	

• Podcaster				
• Multimedia				
• Piano technician				
Solo Pianist	7	7	14	
Other				

Next, form a list of the skills and concepts that rise to the top with the highest ratings. Table 2 lists those activities from the sample exercise in table 1. From this list, extract capacities that are needed to do these tasks. The collaborative pianist can take some of the capacities from teaching artistry presented thus far, but use vocabulary that is familiar to them. The list in table 2 takes the results from the left column of the table 1 exercise and extracts core concepts and skills needed to accomplish those activities. The concepts derived from activities are by no means comprehensive, but rather give ideas for what an individual's table might look like. This table divides the activities into the larger categories of Performing, Teaching and Coaching, Administration/Miscellaneous. Also note that the *Technique and Skills* and *Concepts to Apply* categories range from very practical skills, to social and personal skills.

Table 2

Deriving Skills and Concepts from Collaborative Pianist's Activities

Activity	**Technique and Skills**	**Concepts to Apply** (to teach, develop or program)
Performance Category		
Play for Community Choir	-Listening -Watching -Collaborating -Empathizing	Developing multi-sensory flexibility in challenging art making environments.

	-Assessing choral needs (i.e. do they need the melody played in accompaniment) -Flexibility	
Collaborate with Cellists on Sonata Work (on a professional level)	-Understanding cello technique and sound production -Listening to the bow sounds -Collaboration and partnership -Achieving balance -Preparation -Varying nonverbal communication for audience engagement	Unifying sounds that are different by finding or creating similarities between different sounds.
Vocalists (on a professional level)	-Listening -Achieving balance -Unified partnership -Varying nonverbal communication for audience engagement -Creating Meaning -Personal Relevance	Partnership in storytelling without words: creating meaning with nonverbal communication.
Chamber Music (Pro and Colleagues)	-Group agreements and Establishing roles -Setting the environment -Scaffolding -Asking Questions -Being a Critic -Using group Reflection	Gaining the fluidity in changing roles in order to find equality in a chamber ensemble
Teaching and Coaching Category		
Chamber Music (University students)	-Group agreements and Establishing roles -Setting the environment -Scaffolding -Asking Questions -Being a Critic -Using group Reflection	-Reflection as a platform for critique through questioning
Piano Lesson	-Finding personal relevance for a student -Using engagement before information -Playing scales -Learning to read -Making choices and noting their impact -Using high-quality questions	-How are gestures in technique and scales are realized in repertoire—creating musical meaning in technical regimen

Group Piano	-Creating a structured environment that involves fun -Using high-quality questions -Reflection -Connections from technical skills to repertoire -Controlling the classroom -Offering individual feedback in group settings -Assessment in group settings	Creating games from technical skills: scavenger hunt for theory, scales competition, etc.…
Conduct Choir	-Separating Observation from Interpretation -Tapping Competence in participants -Having fun in learning -Group reflection -Empathy for others—literally putting oneself in their shoes in order to match their sound -Creating meaning and relevance as a group	Keeping the nucleus and mission the music: separating observation from interpretation
Creative Aging Communities	-Personal relevance for participants: tapping their competence and what matters to them -Using reflection for reminiscing -Teaching that goes beyond entertainment	Using reflection of new experiences with music to connect to memory
Administration/Miscellaneous Category		
Artistic Director	-Maintaining healthy leadership styles -Fostering vision that reflects both you and the community that you are serving directly -Reflection on events before, during and after as a learning process	Creating relevance rather than following existing relevance in the marketplace.

Here are some ways to use this information:

- Be more thoughtful about the capacities of one's work.

- Build rehearsals around techniques and concepts relevant to collaborations.
- Seek deeper ideas of what to teach or coach.
- Use concepts as program and project themes.
- Use concepts as themes for audience engagement, allowing the audience a point of entry into the collaborative process or into a work of art.
- Use concepts to develop ideas for teaching classrooms and communities, especially those with non-art goals.
- Develop a thorough job description/develop an effective C.V., even if one is a free-lance musician. This description can be valuable for grants and job applications. Articulating what one does in their career and the skills involved can be will be helpful when it comes to advocating for oneself, which musicians do much of!

These ideas can activate the creator and leader in the collaborative pianist, allowing them to move beyond the technical, to potentially exploring more enriching creative activity. Artists also need to identify the personal relevance and meaning in their own work in order for teaching, collaborating, and audience engagement to feel significant and meaningful. The *Teaching Artist Handbook* offers twenty questions about what an artist does in order to help them think more deeply about those topics, including, "Do you make art for a specific audience?" "What have you researched the most or what do you like the most in terms of artistic disciplines, genres, styles or technique?" "Are you currently making art [performing]? Why or why not?" "What are questions or topics that compel you as an artist?" "What are

your current concerns as an artist? What are you working on right now?" "Is there a particular teacher or mentor that stands out to you? Why?"[5]

While these questions are fairly basic, it is vital that an artist be able to go beyond describing what they do and develop a vision for what they are teaching, performing or presenting, why they are doing so, and what their goals are. Developing projects in this manner allows collaborative pianists to reflect on what they do, and gives them a deeper understanding of the artistry that they consciously or unconsciously consult on a day-to-day basis.

Advocacy

The topic of audience engagement is becoming so popular that it is now a field of its own. Advocacy involving audiences involves a spirit of entrepreneurship, since the ever-changing culture and audiences require inventive adaptations from the performer. An examination of many of the websites listed in the bibliography of this document reveal that much of the audience engagement and entrepreneurship is led by the entertainment industry, whose budgets support the development of highly appealing content. Knowing what an audience wants is a crucial component for engagement. The job of the performer or teaching artist is to create contexts and encounters with art in which students or audience members can connect with something new and develop a new sense of relevance for a work of art. This approach exemplifies true entrepreneurship, creating new contexts for familiar content or new content for existing contexts. In order to do so successfully, one must know what an audience wants.

[5] Jaffe, Barniskis, and Cox, 29.

In his TEDx Talk, Padraig Hyland discusses the elements for an engaging audience experience: insight, being entertained and feeling good.[6] He uses entertainment on a graph with time and shows the interest level of audiences vary as they gain or lose interest based on both new knowledge and entertainment. Especially for artists in the 21st century, the role of entertainment cannot be minimized despite our dedication to our craft. While Booth's definition of art versus entertainments seem to stand true, the two do not have to oppose one another. A good performance uses both entertainment and art; familiar material as point of entry in order reach audiences and new material as way of challenging audiences. This is the essence of audience engagement.

Advocacy also involves finding platforms and communities with whom to collaborate. It can involve non-arts goals such as community building or social justice. Successful advocacy involves networking, spending time with people who have similar passions, and finding platforms and resources to make projects possible. In some cases, an artist's entrepreneurship may comprise their entire career and in other cases, entrepreneurship may be applied to the contexts where an artist already works. Either way it is crucial to the life and creativity of an artist to persistently develop new ideas around and about music.

Programming and Content Development

Content development and programming is one way that collaborative pianists can engage audiences. *The Art of the Song Recital* by Shirley Emmons and Stanley Sonntag (1979) is a valuable resource for programming that genre; it includes a

[6] Tedx Talks, "How to engage an audience | Padraig Hyland | TEDxTallaght," *YouTube* video, last modified November 14, 2017, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5h0dHhJYx5s.

history of the song recital, a practical method for constructing a program, sample non-traditional programs, and a chapter of over a dozen traditional and specialized programs. The authors also include programs organized by genre or time period, such as new music, ensemble music, the song cycle, folk music and popular music. The tools in this book may prove valuable, even though the repertoire selections reflect that the book was published four decades ago. Some of the sample programs include a Spanish program, a program of Romantic Song, an Evening of French melody and a 20th-century program.[7] Some of the practical considerations they offer for recital construction include variety of historical periods, languages, diversity within a composer's oeuvre, familiar music, tempo and key variety.

A similar resource is *Song: A Guide to Art, Song and Literature* (1996) by Carol Kimball.[8] She lists composers by nationality and name in two separate indices and also provides song sheet templates, which are charts to help categorize and organize information during the program-building process. Even though these resources were designed for younger pianists and vocalists, they can help the professional pianist make new connections and explore new ideas for programming. Creative programming is an opportunity for musicians to build entire programs around the things they are most passionate about. It is also an opportunity to use music to express the non-musical issues for which artists may want to advocate and, in some cases, even fundraise for.

Here are some examples of programs that allow a collaborative pianist to integrate their musical and non-musical interests.

---

[7] Shirley Emmons and Stanley Sonntag, *The Art of the Song Recital* (Waveland Pr Inc, 1979).

[8] Carol Kimball, *Song: A Guide to Art Song and Literature* (Hal Leonard Corporation, 1996).

- *The Lark Ascending:* An art song program about birds hosted at a bird sanctuary. A percentage of proceeds fund a charity that rescues endangered species of birds.

- *Down by the Salley Gardens:* A vocal or chamber music recital about garden themes, hosted at the botanical gardens or on a patio with plants.

- *Kitten on the Keys:* A multi-genre program about cats held at an animal rescue organization to raise money for pet adoption.

- *Music in the Face of Oppression*: songs that emerged from composers who are forced to emigrate during the Nazi regime.[9]

- *The Women of Now:* A lecture recital of women composers in the 21st century with multi-media clips of interviews with each composer (or have them speak live at the performance). Proceeds fund a commissioning project.

- *History in Song at War:* A program of songs that emerged from various wars, hosted at a veteran's center. A percentage of proceeds go to support veterans.

- *A Runway Dance:* An exploration of parallels between music and fashion. Using fashion as a vehicle to mobilize student creativity and vocabulary in music. Takes place at a textiles business in collaboration with a local middle school.

Although some artists have managed to accomplish community building from nothing, advocacy is most effective within communities that already exist, rather than trying to build communities around a cause.[10] Michael Lewis is one such collaborative pianist who has built an arts organization called Aural Compass, which centers around creative programming.[11] Founded in 2018, this organization promotes programs built around causes of social justice and features composers from marginalized communities. Their mission states:

---

[9] "Our 2019-2020 Season," Arts at Nativity, accessed March 1, 2020, http://artsatnativity.org.

[10] Doug Borwick, *Building Communities, Not Audiences: The Future of the Arts in the U. S.* (ArtsEngaged, 2012).

[11] "About ACP," *Aural Compass Projects*, accessed March 1, 2020, https://www.auralcompassprojects.org/about.

> It is our mission to bring awareness to issues and demographics that we believe are underrepresented in the arts through beautiful and provocative performances. We believe that bringing light to these issues while cultivating a space for new music is our duty as artistic ambassadors and is incredibly important for the collective growth of our community and world.[12]

Some of their sample programs include:

- *Much Has Fallen Silent:* Recognizing International Holocaust Remembrance Day with five important composers who deserve to be heard. Composers include Pavel Haas, Viktor Ullmann, Ilse Weber, Mieczyslaw Weinberg & Rosy Wertheim.

- *Songs without Borders:* a song recital featuring works by and about immigrants, refugees, and asylum-seekers in the U.S. This concert is in collaboration with the Immigration Solidarity Committee of the First Unitarian Congregational Society in Brooklyn, NY. Proceeds will be split with the Immigration Solidarity Committee. Composers include: Reinaldo Moya, María Grever, Tania León, Huang Tzu & Ruth Seeger.

- *Lift Every Voice and Sing*: A song recital featuring art songs and spirituals by 10 brilliant American composers. This event is produced in collaboration with the Weaving Social Justice committee of First Unitarian Universalist Congregational Society of Brooklyn, NY. Composers include H. Leslie Adams, Margaret Bonds, John Carter, Jacqueline Hairston, Charles Lloyd Jr., Undine Smith Moore, Robert Owens, William Grant Still, Julius P. Williams.

The organization has connected with non-arts partners such as suicide prevention organizations to extend the impact and scope of their work.[13]

Megan Ihnen is a vocalist who champions contemporary music in a progressive, innovative ways throughout the United States. One such collaboration on a non-arts goal is titled, *Single Words She Once Loved*, a performance that centers around the ideas and effects of memory, dementia, and time. Composers include: David Smooke, Ryan Keebaugh, Daniel Felsenfeld, and Jeffrey Mumford. She is also a founding member of an unconventional chamber ensemble of flute, harp

---

[12] "About ACP," *Aural Compass Projects*, accessed March 1, 2020, https://www.auralcompassprojects.org/about.

[13] "About," *Aural Compass Projects*.

and voice called the Seen/Heard Trio. Other ideas for venues and non-arts partners could include concerts in hospitals, retirement communities, prisons, homeless shelters and community centers.

Some projects are born from collaboration and conversation with musical partners. Even though some pianists have varying levels of financial need that may be tied to the paying gigs, they should make an effort to perform the music and implement the causes they themselves are most passionate about. When given choices, the pianist should accept the projects that they are most personally invested in.

In addition to creative programming and content, advocacy to audiences can be even more effective with the use of program notes, which can offer historical context, composer information, comments on musical form, and translations of foreign language text. Many performers also speak or have a guest lecturer speak about the music either in the performance or in a pre-performance lecture, detailed in the following section. Although speaking before performing requires adjustment of the typical performance focus, research and preparation can help performers excel at both.

Audience Engagement

After programming and content development, the tool that connects performer to audiences is the person-to-person skill of audience engagement. The average musician acknowledges the need for audience engagement in order to create a future for Western art music. Audiences increasingly need unique points of entry to expand their capacity for meaningful experiences with music instead of simply presenting music and expecting the audience members to make all their own connections, which sometimes results in no connections at all. As stated in Chapter

2, points of entry are the pieces of knowledge with which audiences can make a connection to new information.

First and foremost, the best audience engagement will occur when the art in which they are participating has emerged from an artist's 80% authenticity. Audiences are extremely intuitive and can sense the magical energy that surrounds an artist who is engaging in something they love. This energy can be a sense from the performer or a specially designed program or a project that is extremely unique. Audiences love feeling that they know the personalities of artists and celebrities, so using authenticity to share with audiences is the single most effective skill outside of actual facilitation skills.

Secondly, in order for a collaborative pianist to connect with audiences, they must practice being an audience member, themselves. Just as they did when building a collaborative environment, a collaborative pianist should examine all the characteristics they would hope for in their audience would have and ask themselves if they themselves embody those capacities. Assessing this capacity in oneself can occur by making a habit of attending a performance or engaging in a new kind of art making. Having experiences in alternate disciplines is ideal, in order to maintain an open attitudes and observation in a context outside one's familiar discipline-specific lingo. Remembering what it is like to be on the other side of the stage is like a conductor remembering what it is like to play in an orchestra, or a choral conductor remembering what it is like to sing in a choir. In these experiences, the musician should ask themselves how they listen or process. Doing so exemplifies the capacity of embodying empathy discussed previously in the skills of Facilitation. Empathy, noticing deeply, questioning, reflecting, and seeking personal connections are other capacities that one must lean on to be a successful audience member.

After assessing one's audience and embodying capacities of an audience member, the collaborative pianist can begin to scaffold for effective engagement. Programming and content have already been discussed as tools for audience engagement. Next, program notes or pre-concert lectures provide an extra level of information by giving context and history, and an extra avenue of identification with the artist. This form of engagement is likely the most familiar to the collaborative pianist. This informational level of audience engagement may vary in effectiveness with the style of writing or speaking. However, careful preparation and research can enhance both the performer's experience and the audience's experience. Research can be tedious but is rewarding as it provides an enriched understanding of the music. Audiences can sense a musician's connection with and knowledge about a work. Offering one's research to the audience can be a daunting challenge. If audience engagement is all about a two-way dialogue, then how can a musician presenting research be engaging?

Eric Booth demonstrates levels of engagement in his YouTube video of 2012.[14] He models three moderately effective methods of engagement, followed by a fourth method, which yields a high level of engagement. First, he presents a work of art with little to no information, and lets the audience member have the experience on their own, resulting in ineffective engagement. In the second method, he offers information to give context or history, such as program notes or lecture. The third method he employs is to offer a useful way to view the artwork; in other words, what connections he thinks the audience should make with the work of art. Lastly, and most effectively, he engages the audience's imagination to create emotions that will enable them to make their own personal connection with the work of art. The

[14] Carnegie Hall, "Eric Booth: 'The Red Wheelbarrow' - Inspiring Engagement in a Work of Art," *YouTube video*, August 6, 2012, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iq0LXlosrOs&t=329s.

most advanced form of engagement is to create personal value and relevant connections. A simple demonstration of these levels of engagement may be seen in Booth's short video.[15]

In the *Music Teaching Artist's Bible*, Booth talks more about the teaching artist's role in audience engagement by saying, "Teaching artists are the designated experts in the verbs of art. Their skills can support, guide, educate and illuminate people's capacity to individually succeed in creating artistic meaning in our best artistic offerings." A good teaching artist knows how to combine the verbs and the nouns, facilitating experiences that allow each audience member or participant to create meaning in their own way. The desired result is not to elicit a certain emotional or visceral reaction, but to allow each person in the room to have a different experience with the same piece of music. Audience engagement is about helping the audience succeed as audience members, rather than simply inviting them to come and watch the performer succeed. It is also about developing capacities in audiences such as objectively observing, making their own connections and developing empathy for performers. In turn, the artist does the same for the audiences, and a two-way experience is initiated. The true essence of audience engagement lies in a two-way verbal and nonverbal dialogue.

Almost all artists find themselves involved in education in some capacity, whether it is speaking with audiences, engaging in fundraising campaigns, or giving masterclasses, just to mention a few. In these contexts, artists shouldn't expect audience members to become, for example, Wagnerian opera experts, but they can help audiences make connections to Wagner's system of leitmotifs and lead them to find similar techniques in other music. If an artist can focus on giving the audience

[15] Carnegie Hall, "Eric Booth.".

insight into process in their practice, rather than focus on the final product, they open the door to possibilities the audience. A good teaching artist will not dictate every step of what an audience member should think. However, by asking good questions, the performer can challenge audiences to imagine wild possibilities in the same way a performer inspired that imagination in their collaborative partner in Chapter 2. If a pianist is passionate about the work of Bach, they should play Bach, but in doing so, look for ways to bring Bach to new audiences and make Bach as meaningful to the audience as it is to themselves as the artist. They should dive deeply into the *why* of their gravitation toward Bach and use the answers to inform their process of experiencing it with an audience.

Team Building

Lastly, building and leading teams for projects and organizations are other effective ways that collaborative pianists can advocate. Using the capacities of facilitation, objectivity, feedback and question-asking beyond the collaborative setting can have an incredible effect on team success. These capacities are especially successful when funneled into a leadership style. The best team-building skill is to build a sense of community, which is accomplished through facilitating ownership in collaborators, audience members and artistic teams. Utilizing the leadership approaches in Chapter 3 will aid greatly in these endeavors.

Many times, collaborative pianists are trying to build teams of volunteers and facilitate investment, which is not easy. Finding communities and partners who have mutual interest in the same topics will help to widen the impact of the project and the community which the artist can reach. People will generally show up to support or participate in events because of relationships, thus relationships are the most

important aspect of team building. Staying true to the nature of the two-way discourse of a relationship is paramount to effective advocacy.

The more individuals and communities the artist can involve, the wider scope their projects will have. For example, what if an artist's program about Beethoven involves the local historical society, takes place at a historical venue or on a historical instrument, features a Beethoven performance midway through the program by a young performer, and features samples from a local brewery at the reception? After all, summer symphonic concerts in late-19th-century New York were often held in beer gardens. While this may seem labor intensive, the investment of all these communities will create an experience that encompasses investment from multiple constituents. This example is a case of a project that a collaborative pianist could design and lead. This type of leadership is more short-term that a leadership role in an organization, but the same need for community and capacities apply.

The collaborative pianist will find their best capacities as they practice these habits repeatedly and find various platforms in which to use them. Different skills are needed for different situations, so being able to navigate successfully through each one will make the collaborative pianist a great asset to any situation. The more tools a collaborative pianist possesses, the more success they will find in their work.

CHAPTER 5

THE COLLABORATIVE PIANIST'S PURSUIT OF TEACHING ARTISTRY

This brief chapter is for collaborative pianists who have an interest in learning more about teaching artistry. Booth acknowledges that there is no easy pathway to mastering teaching artistry or philosophies of teaching artistry. Among other reasons to develop these skills are making money, building future audiences and constructing the skills to connect with audiences on deeper levels.[1] Above all, teaching has the potential to produce a better artist as a result.[2]

Not every collaborative pianist needs to be an educator. There are many kinds of collaborative work and many careers that do not involve teaching at all. However, for those who enjoy teaching, or want to try teaching, this short chapter may enhance their work. Collaborative pianists can make expert teaching artists because the skills and capacities of interacting with other humans and facilitating group music making are so similar.

Among the best reasons for collaborative pianists to do this work are the insights that are gained for their own artistry, diversifying their work, and expanding versatility. The principles explored in this document can apply to the private piano lesson, class piano, group music class, as well as community, school and creative aging residencies. A collaborative pianist's diverse experiences and repertoire allow them to provide immense variety in residencies and other teaching situations. The following units will give examples of ways that pianists can design residencies or engaging performance conversations for audience engagement.

---

[1] Eric Booth. *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 42.

[2] Booth, *Teaching Artist's Bible,* 42.

For each unit, a lesson plan is used for structure, which helps to scaffold experiences in effective ways. Table 3 is essentially a simple structure that will help the primary goal to be the guiding force behind every activity, help the artist stay focused, and scaffold effectively.

Table 3

Lesson Plan Template[3]

Goal: what do you want to accomplish?
Line of Inquiry: "How can students…."
Participants: who are your participants, audience or the people you are trying to involve; Participants' needs/desires:(what one have learned from questioning or surveying your audience?
Participants will: what you want participants to do
Points of Entry: things the participants already know that can serve as a starting place to connect to new material
Key Ideas: what are the major themes of the lesson?
Capacities addressed: from the LCE 10 capacities
Contextual Materials: supplies that give context to what you are presenting
Supplies: list anything that will be needed for the teacher or participant
Activities: the actual lesson plan and list of what will be done
Reflect/Evaluate: This can be a few question-responses, journaling, unpacking the experience and activities, to help determine the efficacy of the experience
Conclusion: How the lesson will end

[3] Based on a workshop template from Lincoln Center Education.

This lesson plan template also acts as a tool for assessment by always starting with the participants in mind. Knowing who the participants are, or the people that a teaching artist is trying to involve, may be the most crucial aspect of the planning. Unless one knows their participants, it will be difficult to plan an effective experience. Every step of the scaffolding should come back to what the audience already knows, and what they want. Principles of audience engagement are still at play here, using insight, entertainment and feeling good. If lesson plans are structured to exclusively offer insight, the participant could be overwhelmed, bored, or insulted. If they are exclusively entertained, they won't have the gratification of having discovered something new. All aspects of engagement are still applicable in a workshop, classroom, or pre-concert lecture.

A follow-up assessment will take place in the reflection step of the lesson plan, using a variety of methods to capture the success or failure of the experience from the participants themselves. Building in many possibilities for feedback in this reflection process is a crucial part of gauging the success of the experience. Finding methods that allow for concrete forms of reflection may be useful, such as written reflections, wall journals (posters where participants write thoughts about a certain experience), or recording audio responses. Effective assessment will help a teaching artist plan consequent lesson plans and may be a useful tool for grant-writing as well.

The following lesson plans involve skills that go beyond musical collaboration, and focus on skills of nonverbal communication, teamwork, and engagement. One of the best ways to teach engagement is to model it, especially in the University setting in Model #1. This lesson displays how these approaches can be used in academic settings to help students develop these skills for their future careers. Model #2 shows how audience engagement techniques can be used in a pre-concert setting,

applying many of the principles explored in Chapter 4. Lastly, Model #3 is geared towards community work, involving many constituents for maximum investment, and incorporating both musical and non-musical goals. It focuses on the collaborative pianist as a facilitator and uses pre-recorded tracks rather than live music, under the assumption that a piano may not available at the venue. A pianist could easily substitute their own performance in place of the tracks.

Model #1 Nonverbal Communication for Instrumentalists

A class for university students, both instrumentalists and pianists, about partnership in storytelling without words: creating meaning with nonverbal communication.

Goal: Give students tools for successful nonverbal communication as it pertains to collaboration and performance.

Line of Inquiry: How can students use storytelling as a platform for developing their non-verbal communication skills?

Participants: University undergraduate music majors

Participants will: Utilize storytelling by exploring various nonverbal communication skills

Points of Entry: Non-verbal elements of communication skills; Ways that people tell stories with words

Key Ideas: Collaboration, Nonverbal communication, effective audience engagement and performance

Capacities addressed: Creating Meaning, Embodying

Contextual Materials: Score for the Brahms E minor Cello Sonata

Supplies: Emoji signs

Activities:

- Warmup by playing a reaction game using emojis. A statement is made such as

- "You are failing this course."
- "The sun is shining, and you have been awarded a free coffee."
- "A dog injured its leg."

A volunteer student chooses an emoji reaction. Repeat.

- Similar statements are made, and all students now have to react by embodying an emoji.
- Prompt stories by asking if they have ever had an awkward or scary moment on stage. Or what an awkward or scary moment has been in their life.
- Have a volunteer tell their story.
- Ask the volunteer to tell the story again without words.
- Analyze meaning behind gestures and expressions
- Offer three options for stories printed on paper or listed on a white board. Tell the story without words and have the students guess which story you are telling.
- Tell the same story and this time have students react nonverbally to your reactions.
- Tell a story with no context and no words using gesture and nonverbals and ask them to generate a story line (utilizing audience empathy).
- Ask for a participant to do the same (choose a story and act it out)
- Play the piano part (have someone sing if available) and generate the story line based on the music. Confirm or clarify with the actual text. How is the text painted in the piano part?
- Explore various options for expressing each scene of the story

-facial expression

-gesture

-body movement

- Decide if the nonverbal affects of the pianist and cellist should be united or opposed. For instance, if the piano is depicting water and the vocalist a bird, their nonverbals will be different. In contrast, if they are both communication a storm, their nonverbals will be similar. Yet another possibility might be reacting to one another if they play two different characters.
- Final performance based on the choices the students made.

Reflect: reflect collaboratively.

Conclusion: Students map nonverbal skills in their scores (various repertoire) with their pianists if possible. Could follow up with a session to masterclass their plans for nonverbals in their repertoire.

Model #2 Group Communication of a Unified Musical Idea

Pre-performance workshop: Gaining a fluidity in changing roles in order to find and express equality in a chamber ensemble.

Goal: Audience recognizing the fluidity of roles in a chamber ensemble as a means of deeper noticing and audience engagement.

Line of Inquiry: How can audience members recognize roles morph and flow between chamber ensemble performers?

Participants: Concert Audience

Participants will: Recognize, empathize and connect with performers during the performance.

Points of Entry: Leading skills (use conducting or follow the leader), following skills, partnership skills, supportive skills.

Key Ideas: Unified, equal partnership through understood and explored roles

Capacities addressed: Empathy, embodying

Contextual Materials: Instruments, score for Antonín Dvořák's Piano Quintet No. 2, Op. 81

Supplies: None

Activities:

- Teach the audience a little groove with snapping, clapping, stomping and maybe some vocal sounds
- Designated groups of the audience will have a different assignment (one group snaps, one group claps, etc.)
- Have a system for "mastering" the sound. Could be conducting or motions that mimic a mixing board.
- Play with balance. Make one group louder than the rest of the groups. Repeat.
- Bring up a small group of audience members. Throw around an imaginary beach ball that represents that they are in charge. Make eye contact with the individual that they choose to throw it to next.
- Restart the audience groove.
- Have members of the small group take turns being in charged or balancing the audience groove. Then pass of the role by throwing a beach ball to another member of the small group.

Reflect: This can be a few question-responses, journaling, unpacking the experience and activities.

Conclusion: Empathy for performers and a deeper understanding of chamber music.

Model #3 Aesthetic Education Collaboration

School Residency: This project proposes a collaboration between the City of Tempe, a local textiles company called Fabric, ASU, and Tempe middle schools. This is an interdisciplinary outreach project that increases the accessibility of the music performance and fashion design disciplines.

Goal: Mobilize student opinions about music using vocabulary they already have around fashion

Line of Inquiry: How can students express what they hear in words and feel like they have the authority to have an opinion about music?

Participants: Middle School Students

Participants will: Use language of fashion to make connections to music and examine the idea of choice.

Points of Entry: Fashion opinions

Key Ideas: Vocabulary for aesthetic development

Capacities Addressed: Making connections, identifying patterns, living with ambiguity

Contextual Materials: Soundtracks from Epidemic Soundtracks (a website with free stock songs for use by media specialists.

Supplies: White board or canvas

Activities: Over the course of an 8-week workshop:

- Engage in how fashion choices are made. What elements effect those choices?

- Unpack the process of those choices.
- Discuss music and music choices.
- Unpack the process of those choices. What elements effect those choices?
- Fashion: Use descriptive words to describe a look (texture, variety, layers, symmetry, asymmetry….).
- How are similar elements captured in music: offer tools to asses those features in music.
- Choose music that already exists OR create music that pairs well with each outfit.

Reflect: Reflection will take place in the form of planning the runway show. A few questions may be asked to have students reflect on their experience.

Conclusion: Final Project is a runway with the music that they chose or created. Increased skill in listening to music.

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

So much of teaching artistry centers around building non-musical skills to facilitate artistic experiences, skills that collaborative pianists need on a constant basis in their work. Non-musical skills are the bridge that is often missing between great artistry and actual impact. Academia promotes great artistry in highly trained artists, but it is the job of the artist to find a way to put this great artistry to use for livelihood and success. Great artistry is still appreciated as it once was by most audiences. One reason symphony halls are not selling out is not because people appreciate music less, but rather people are more inundated with choices regarding what kind of art they will consume and how they will consume it. Artists do not need to diminish the quality of art they offer, but they need to know how to persuade people to listen to them. Once the skills discussed in this document are developed in a collaborative pianist, they will have tools to guide and empower people, both colleagues and audiences, toward artistic choices.

It is difficult to find time to develop these skills in applied music degrees, when there is already so little time for actually developing the specialized skill of performance. This document identifies some of the basic skills of teaching artistry for collaborative pianists to develop, and challenges them in three ways: to use these skills to enrich the work that collaborative pianists already do; to think creatively about what collaborative piano careers can look like; and lastly, to consider the option of exploring aspects teaching artistry for themselves. These skills can serve as tools for interdisciplinary work and audience engagement. Where rigorous academic applied training helps collaborative pianists deeply explore music, the processes in facilitation, question asking, objectivity and feedback can help collaborative pianists think in a broader way, identifying core concepts that guide musical experiences in

rehearsals and onstage. In addition to informing music making and enhancing performances, thinking in these broader possibilities may help collaborative pianists stay employed. With fewer and fewer jobs in a market oversaturated with highly qualified individuals, the creative activities that collaborative pianists do must be broader in scope, as well as reach a wider audience than those in the traditional concert hall. Taking time to explore and develop the non-musical skills presented in this document will build bridges from the artist's knowledge to the audience's knowledge and vice versa, creating more opportunities for the vibrant careers of collaborative pianists.

REFERENCES

Adler, Kurt. *The Art of Accompanying and Coaching*. Minneapolis: Springer, 1965.

"Animals in Music." Naxos. Accessed March 1, 2020. https://www.naxos.com/catalogue/item.asp?item_code=8.578281-82.

"Our 2019-2020 Season." Arts at Nativity. Accessed March 1, 2020. http://artsatnativity.org.

Associated Chamber Music Players. Accessed June 28, 2019. https://acmp.net/.

Aural Compass Projects. Accessed March 1, 2020. https://www.auralcompassprojects.org/about.

Baker, Dian. "A Resource Manual for the Collaborative Pianist: Twenty Class Syllabi for Teaching Collaborative Piano Skills and an Annotated Bibliography." DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2006. *http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/305350903?accountid=4485.*

"Become a Professional Pianist: Education and Career Roadmap." Study.com. Last modified March 5, 2020. https://study.com/articles/Become_a_Professional_Pianist_Education_and_Career_Roadmap.html.

Berklee. "Teaching Artist." Accessed January 25, 2020. https://www.berklee.edu/careers/roles/teaching-artist.

Bernac, Pierre. *The Interpretation of French Song.* New York: Praeger, 1970.

Booth, Eric. "The Field of Teaching Artistry." Americans for the Arts. Accessed April 1, 2020. https://www.americansforthearts.org/blog-feed/the-field-of-teaching-artistry.

Booth, Eric. *The Every Day Work of Art.* Lincoln, Nebraska: iUniverse.com, Inc, 2001.

Booth, Eric. *The Music Teaching Artist's Bible.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.

Booth, Eric. "A New Framework for Understanding the Field of Teaching Artistry." Eric Booth. Accessed January 25, 2020. http://ericbooth.net/857-2.

Booth, Eric. "Take-Aways from the World's First International Teaching Artist Conference." *Teaching Artist Journal.* November 6, 2012. https://teachingartistjournal.wordpress.com/.

Booth, Eric. "What is a Teaching Artist?" Eric Booth. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://ericbooth.net/what-is-a-teaching-artist.

Borwick, Doug. *Building Communities, Not Audiences: The Future of the Arts in the U. S.* ArtsEngaged, 2012.

Bos, Coenraad Valentryn and A. Pettis. *The Well-Tempered Accompanist*. Bryn Mawr: Theodore Presser Co., 1949.

Brooks, Alison Wood and Leslie K. John. "The Surprising Power of Questions." Harvard Business Review. May-June 2018 issue. https://hbr.org/2018/05/the-surprising-power-of-questions.

Frost Online. "Building a Successful Career in the Music Industry." Accessed June 28, 2019. https://frostonline.miami.edu/articles/building-career-in-music-industry.aspx.

Cannon, Jesse and Todd Thomas. "Building a Great Team to Support Your Music Career." DIY Musician. Last modified July 10, 2013. *https://diymusician.cdbaby.com/musician-tips/building-a-great-team-to-support-your-music-career/*.

Cannon, Jesse and Todd Thomas. *Get more Fans: The DIY Guide to the New Music Business.* Musformation, 2015.

Carnegie Hall. "Eric Booth: 'The Red Wheelbarrow' - Inspiring Engagement in a Work of Art." *YouTube* video. August 6, 2012. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iq0LXlosrOs&t=329s.

Clarke, Janet Richards and Joan P. Gipe. "Psychological Characteristics, Teaching Beliefs and Teaching Behaviors of Artist/Teachers." 1989. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/63069238?accountid=4485.

Colin Boyd. "How to Ask Good Questions." *YouTube* video. November 26, 2014. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o00DM0_tOCE&feature=share.

Cranmer, Philip. *The Technique of Accompaniment.* London: Dobson, 1970.

Cruice, Valerie. "How a Pianist Begins To Build His Career." The New York Times. Last modified November 26, 1989. https://www.nytimes.com/1989/11/26/nyregion/how-a-pianist-begins-to-build-his-career.html.

Cserti, Robert. "Essential Facilitation Skills for an Effective Facilitator." Session Lab. Last modified January 28th, 2019. https://www.sessionlab.com/blog/facilitation-skills/.

Cutler, David. "Social Networking and Video Sharing." The Savvy Musician. Accessed June 28, 2019. http://savvymusician.com/index.php?page=networking.

Daichendt, G. James. *Artist-Teacher: A Philosophy for Creating and Teaching*. Chicago: Intellect Books, 2010.

Daniel, Edward Lee. "Rationale For Integrating A Portion Of Chamber And Accompanying Instruction With Applied Piano Study At The Collegiate Level." DA diss., Ball State University, 1979.

Http://Login.Ezproxy1.Lib.Asu.Edu/Login?Url=Https://Search-Proquest-Com.Ezproxy1.Lib.Asu.Edu/Docview/302901947?Accountid=4485.

Davidhertzberg. "Gerald Moore, 1962: The Unashamed Accompanist - Side 1." *YouTube* video. Uploaded February 17, 2014. www.youtube.com/watch?v=O6De3QqkXk8&t=71s.

Dawson, Kathryn, & Daniel A. Kelin, II. *The Reflexive Teaching Artist: Collected Wisdom from the Drama/Theatre Field*. Chicago: Intellect Ltd., 2014.

D-4 Nguyen. "15 Essential Things You Need to Know to Start Your Music Career." D4 Music Marketing. Last modified February 5, 2018. http://d4musicmarketing.com/start-music-career.

Eckhoff, Angela. "Conversational Pedagogy: Exploring Interactions between a Teaching Artist and Young Learners during Visual Arts Experiences." *Early Childhood Education Journal* 41, no. 5 (09, 2013): 365-372. doi:http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1007/s10643-012-0567-0. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1651829173?accountid=4485.

Emmons, Shirley and Stanley Sonntag. *The Art of the Song Recital*. Waveland Pr Inc, 1979.

Foley, Chris. "Career Options in Collaborative Piano." The Collaborative Piano Blog. Last modified January 9, 2006. ttps://collaborativepiano.blogspot.com/2006/01/career-options-in-collaborative-piano.html.

Fuller, David. "Accompaniment." *Grove Music Online* 2001: Accessed April 6, 2020. https://www-oxfordmusiconline-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000000110.

Gee, Dustin. "Five Essentials of Music Career Success." Berklee. Last modified August 24, 2019. https://www.berklee.edu/careers/essentialsofsuccess.html.

Greene, Maxine. *Variations on a Blue Guitar: The Lincoln Center Lectures on Aesthetic Education.* New York: Columbia University, 2001.

Grubb, Thomas. *Singing in French: A Manual of French Diction and French Vocal Repertoire*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1979.

Heick, Terry. "Integrating the 16 Habits of Mind." Edutopia. Last modified October 19, 2012. https://www.edutopia.org/blog/habits-of-mind-terrell-heick.

"How Do You Network Yourself As a Classical Musician?" Quora. Accessed June 28, 2019. https://www.quora.com/How-do-you-network-yourself-as-a-classical-musician

Huddy, Avril and Kym Stevens. "The Teaching Artist: A Model for University Dance Teacher Training." *Research in Dance Education* 12, no. 2 (07, 2011): 157-

171.
doi:http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/10.1080/14647893.2011.579596.
http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/888108109?accountid=4485.

Jaffe, Nick, Becca Barniskis and Barbara Hackett Cox. *Teaching Artist Handbook.* Chicago: Columbia College Chicago Press, 2013.

Jaffe, Nick. "Where Is the Teaching Artist Field?" *Teaching Artist Journal*, (13:2), 71-73. DOI: 10.1080/15411796.2015.997109.

Jenkins, Lynnel. "The Evolution of Eva Jessye's Programming as Evidenced in Her Choral Concert Programs from 1927-1982." DMA diss., The University of Arizona, 2016. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1850521613?accountid=4485.

Johnson, Graham, and Richard Stokes. *A French Song Companion*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Katz, Martin. *The Complete Collaborator*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 2009

Kennedy Center. "Kennedy Center Teaching Artists." Accessed April 1, 2020. https://www.kennedy-center.org/teachingartists.

Kim, Byoung Joo. "Balancing the Apollonian and Dionysian Dualism: A Look at the Drama/theatre Teaching Artist." *Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied Theatre and Performance* 20.3 (2015): 302-05.

Kimball, Carol. *Song: A Guide to Art Song and Literature*. Hal Leonard Corporation, 1996.

Klickstein, Gerald. "7 Career-Building Strategies for Musicians." Musiciansway.com. Last modified October 27, 2016. https://www.musiciansway.com/blog/2016/10/7-career-building-strategies-for-musicians/.

L. Costa, Arthur. "What Are Habits of Mind?" The Institute for Habits of Mind. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://www.habitsofmindinstitute.org/what-are-habits-of-mind/.

Lee, Pei-Shan. "The Collaborative Pianist: Balancing Roles in Partnership." DMA diss., New England Conservatory of Music, 2009. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/637439700?accountid=4485.

Lehman College: The Bronx Education Network. "About Aesthetic Education." Accessed March 1, 2020. https://www.lehman.edu/academics/education/bronx-arts-education-network/about.php.

Lerman, Liz. "Critical Response Process." Liz Lerman. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://lizlerman.com/critical-response-process/.

Lippmann, Judyth C. "A Program in Piano Accompanying at The Ohio State University: A Feasibility Study." PhD diss., Ohio State University, 1979.

"Lincoln Center Institute Capacities for Imaginative Learning." Lincoln Center Institute. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://imaginationnow.files.wordpress.com/2011/03/capacities.pdf.

MacKay, Barbara. "The Importance of Pauses in Process Work." North Star Facilitators. Accessed March 1, 2020. https://northstarfacilitators.com/2020/01/the-importance-of-pauses-in-process-work/.

MacKay, Barbara. "5 Big Differences between Training and Facilitation." North Star Facilitators. Accessed March 1, 2020. https://northstarfacilitators.com/2017/02/5-big-differences-between-training-and-facilitation/.

March, Wendy. "A Study of Piano Proficiency Requirements at Institutions of Higher Education in the State of Oregon as Related to the Needs and Requirements of Public School Music Teachers." DMA diss., University of Oregon, 1988.

McDonald, Heather. "How to Jumpstart Your Music Career." The Balance Careers. Last modified November 20, 2019. https://www.thebalancecareers.com/five-ways-to-jumpstart-your-music-career-2460787.

McKean, Barbara. *A Teaching Artist at Work: Theatre with Young People in Educational Settings.* Portsmouth, New Hampshire: Heinemann, 2006.

McQuillen, Charles. "10 Capacities for Imaginative Learning Inspire Imaginative Teaching." McQuillen Studios. Last modified October 30, 2014. https://charlesmcquillen.com/10-capacities-for-imaginative-learning-inspire-imaginative-teaching/.

Mears, Perry G.,II. "Documenting a Derided Profession: Algernon Lindo and the *Art of Accompanying*." DMA diss., The University of Memphis, 2016. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1845054033?accountid=4485.

Mertz, Amy. "A Career for Pianists in Collaborative Piano." Majoring in Music.com. Accessed June 28, 2019. https://majoringinmusic.com/a-career-for-pianists-in-collaborative-piano/.

"Mission." Association of Teaching Artists. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://www.teachingartists.com/.

M. K. "Musicians as Entrepreneurs." The Economist. Last modified March 30, 2012. https://www.economist.com/prospero/2012/03/30/musicians-as-entrepreneurs.

Montgomery, Alan. *Opera Coaching: Professional Techniques and Considerations*. New York: Routledge, 2006.

Moore, Gerald. *Am I too Loud? Memoirs of an Accompanist*. London: Penguin, 1974.

Moore, Gerald. *Singer and Accompanist*. London: Thorndike Press, 2008.

Moore, Gerald. *The Unashamed Accompanist.* New York: Macmillan Company. 1943.

Morgan, Brittney. "My Job Description: The Pianist." Business News Daily. Last modified April 11, 2016. https://www.businessnewsdaily.com/8963-job-description-professional-pianist.html.

Morgenroth, David Jonathan. "Collaborative Crossover: Identifying Classical Vocal Collaborative Piano Practices in Jazz Vocal Accompanying." DMA diss., University of North Texas, 2015. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1775393456?accountid=4485.

Myklebust, Sonja L. "Beyond the Concert Hall: The Creation and Implementation of a Teaching Artist Training Program at the University Level." DMA diss., University of Washington, 2017. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1944510737?accountid=4485.

National Research Council*. How People Learn: Brain, Mind, Experience, and School: Expanded Edition.* Washington, DC: The National Academies Press, 2000. doi: 10.17226/9853.

"Networking for Musicians." Last Minute Musicians. Accessed June 28, 2019. https://www.lastminutemusicians.com/articles/musicians/networking.html.

Neuendorf, Henri. "Art Demystified: How Do Artist Residencies Work?" ArtNet News. Last modified September 15, 2016, https://news.artnet.com/art-world/art-demystified-artist-residencies-649592.

Robinson, Sarah May. "Chamber Music in Alternative Venues in the 21st-Century U.S.: Investigating the Effect of New Venues on Concert Culture, Programming and the Business of Classical Music." DMA diss., University of South Carolina, 2013. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1368186325?accountid=4485.

Pembleton, Jenny. "Teaching Artist." MA thesis, State University of New York Empire State College, 2014. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1564787076?accountid=4485.

Rhee, Heasook*. The Art of Instrumental Accompanying: A Practical Guide for the Collaborative Pianist*. Carl Fischer, 2012.

Rogers, Kristie. "The 2 Types of Respect Leaders Must Show." Interview by Sarah Green Carmichael. Harvard Business Review. Last modified July 17, 2018, https://hbr.org/podcast/2018/07/the-2-types-of-respect-leaders-must-show.html.

"The Role of a Facilitator." Mind Tools. Accessed March 1, 2020. https://www.mindtools.com/pages/article/RoleofAFacilitator.htm.

Rose, Erma loreen. "Competencies In Piano Accompanying." PhD diss., University of North Texas, 1981. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/303157911?accountid=4485.

Russell T Hurlburt. "Not Everyone Conducts Inner Speech." *Psychology Today*. Last modified October 26, 2011. https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/pristine-inner-experience/201110/not-everyone-conducts-inner-speech.

Samuel, Lawrence R. "Creative Aging." *Psychology Today*. Last Modified September 29, 2017. https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/boomers-30/201709/creative-aging.

Smith, Brad. "Don't Listen to Me, I'm just Your Partner: Ensemble Issues in Duo Settings." DMA diss., Arizona State University, 2015. http://login.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy1.lib.asu.edu/docview/1682042611?accountid=4485.

"Seen/Heard Trio." Meghan Ihnen. Accessed March 1, 2020. http://meganihnen.com/seenheardtrio/.

Spillman, Robert. *The Art of Accompanying*. Schirmer: New York: 1985.

Stannard, Neil. *The Collaborative Pianist's Guide to Practical Technique: Excerpts from Instrumental Duos and Art Songs for Technical Study*. CreateSpace Publishing, 2015.

Szekely, George. "Uniting the Roles of Artist and Teacher." *Art Education* 31, no. 1 (1978): 17-20. Accessed April 6, 2020. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3192299.

Taylor and Francis Online. *Teaching Artist Journal.* Accessed April 5, 2020. https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/htaj20.

"Teaching Artist Certificate" University of the Arts. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://www.uarts.edu/ce/teachingartist.

TEDx Talks. "How to ask Better Questions | Mike Vaughan | MileHigh." *YouTube* video. July 17, 2015. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=J8xfuCcXZu8&feature=share.

Tedx Talks. "How to engage an audience | Padraig Hyland | TEDxTallaght." *YouTube* video. November 14, 2017. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5h0dHhJYx5s.

"The TAG Blog." Teaching Artist Guild. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://teachingartistsguild.org/blog-2/.

"Tips for Aspiring Collaborative Pianists." Music Entrepreneurship and Career Center at Johns Hopkins Peabody Conservatory. Accessed June 28, 2019. https://peabody.jhu.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/tips_for_aspiring_collaborative_pianists.pdf.

Ulvund, Marit. "In the Age of the Teaching Artist? What Teaching Artists Are and Do." *Nordic Journal of Art and Research*, 4, no. 1 (October 28, 2015). https://doi.org/10.7577/if.v4i1.1369.

Vogel, Susanne and Lars Schwabe. "Learning and Memory Under Stress: Implications for the Classroom." *Npj Science of Learning* 1, 16011 (2016). https://doi.org/10.1038/npjscilearn.2016.11.

Wallace, David. *Reaching Out: A Musician's Guide to Interactive Performance.* McGraw-Hill, 2007.

"What is a Teaching Artist?" Creative Ground. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://www.creativeground.org/faq/what-teaching-artist.

Whittaker, Billie. The Good Company Blog. Accessed January 24, 2020. http://goodcompanybw.blogspot.com/2011/.

"The Work of Teaching Artists." Kadenze: Lincoln Center Education. Accessed January 25, 2020. https://www.kadenze.com/courses/the-work-of-teaching-artists-iii/info.

"Working as a Pianist." Zippia: The Career Expert. Accessed June 28, 2019. https://www.zippia.com/pianist-jobs/.

APPENDIX A

LINCOLN CENTER EDUCATION'S 10 CAPACITIES FOR IMAGINATIVE LEARNING[150]

[150] Lincoln Center Institute. https://imaginationnow.files.wordpress.com/2011/03/capacities.pdf

Noticing Deeply	to identify and articulate layers of detail in a work of art or other object of study through continuous interaction with it over time.
Embodying	to experience a work of art or other object of study through your senses, as well as emotionally, and also to physically represent that experience.
Questioning	to ask questions throughout your explorations that further your own learning; to ask the question, "What if?"
Making Connections	to connect what you notice and the patterns you see to your prior knowledge and experiences, to others' knowledge and experiences, and to text and multimedia resources.
Identifying Patterns	to find relationships among the details that you notice, group them, and recognize patterns.
Exhibiting Empathy	to respect the diverse perspectives of others in the community; to understand the experiences of others emotionally, as well as intellectually.
Living with Ambiguity	to understand that issues have more than one interpretation, that not all problems have immediate or clear-cut solutions, and to be patient while a resolution becomes clear.
Creating Meaning	to create your own interpretations based on the previous capacities, see these in the light of others in the community, create a synthesis, and express it in your own voice.
Taking Action	to try out new ideas, behaviors or situations in ways that are neither too easy nor too dangerous or difficult, based on the synthesis of what you have learned in your explorations.
Reflecting/Assessing	to look back on your learning, continually assess what you have learned, assess/identify what challenges remain, and assess/identify what further learning needs to happen. This occurs not only at the end of a learning experience, but is part of what happens throughout that experience. It is also not the end of your learning; it is part of beginning to learn something else.

APPENDIX B

TABLE 1: ASSESSING SKILL SETS AND INTERESTS

Collaborative Pianist Activities	**Level of Expertise** (1= very little 10=expert)	**Level of Enjoyment** (1= no enjoyment 10=maximum enjoyment)	Totals	Notes and consequential ideas:
Play for Choir				Start a memory-care choir
• Elementary				
• Middle School				
• High School				
• University				
• Community				
• Professional				
Play for Instrumentalists:				
• Specific instruments? Cello, trumpet				
• Orchestral reductions				
• Sonata				
• Other specific Genre/Era				
• Professionals or Colleagues				
• University students				
• Pre-college				
• Community				
•				
Play for Vocalists (Coaching listed separately)				
• Professionals				
• University students				
• Pre-college				
• Community				
• Opera company				
• Theater company				
Play Chamber music				
• Group size (ex., trio)				
• Genre or era Contemporary Classical				
• University				
• Professionals or Colleagues				
• University students				
• Pre-college				

• Community				
Play in Large Ensemble				Apply for orchestras
• Orchestra				
• Band				
• New Music Ensemble				
• Professionals				
• University students				
• Community				
Play Ensemble-other				
• Jazz combo				
• Big Band				
•				
• Early Music				
Play or perform in other roles (misc. category)				
• Audition Pianist				
• Competition/Festival Pianist				
• Dance Pianist (ballet, jazz, tap, swing, ballroom, etc..)				
• Conductor				
• Music Director				
• Copyist				
• Arranger				
Vocal Coach				
• Opera				
• Art Song				
• Musical Theater				
• University				
• Community studio				
• High School/pre-college				
Coaching chamber music				
• Specific types (trio, quintet, etc.) Trio, quartet, quintet				
• Specific Genres				
• Specific eras				
• University students				
• Pre-college				
• Community				
Teaching Piano (or other)				

• Group piano				
• Private Lesson				
• Other Class (Music history, Appreciation, Theory, Diction, Sight singing, etc.)				
Church Work				
• Play piano				
• Play organ				
• Direct choir or ensemble				
• Work with Children				
• Planning and administration				
Community work				
• Creative Aging Communities				
• Mentor Youth				
• Humanitarian Causes				
• Social Justice				
• Animal rescue				
• Other Non-arts work (culinary, stylist, nature, outdoor activities, crocheting, anything else that is creative and enjoyable!				
Administration				
• Department Head				
• Pianist coordinator				
• Artistic Director				
• Program Coordinator				
• Non-Profit Employee				
Miscellaneous				
• Web design				
• Software Developer				
• Journalist/blogger				
• Podcaster				
• Multimedia				
• Piano technician				
Solo Pianist				
Other				