her research. The reviewer graphical representation of emise. From the beginning, by the midwestern and eastear to have had no involvegeographically. Of course, han others, but the NCMEA pe, a fact that, if true, should

imary archival and personal exclusively, and she outlined e organization without being ormation on Catholic music accurate, and it is well preesting discussion of Justine tion (a person seemingly dethor provides insightful and Catholic schools. The author direction provided to and by 1EA and the overlapping of as considerable except for the

ble piece of work. It is reancludes most of the pertinent a document of its type. The impetent contribution of new istory of music education.

rizona State University, Tempe. His or education and historical and emJere T. Humphreys Arizona State University Tempe, Arizona

Jeanne Bilger Gross: Benjamin Russel Hanby, Ohio Composer-Educator, 1833-1867: His Contributions to Early Music Education

PhD, The Ohio State University, 1987 University Microfilms Order No. 8804045

## Abstract\*

The study documented Hanby as an unrecognized pioneer educator, a multi-talented

musician who helped spread music education to the masses.

During his brief life-span of only 33 years, Hanby wrote 79 songs, including "Darling Nelly Gray" and "Up on the Housetop." He became famous for his popular sociopolitical music and founded three singing schools. He wrote a music series, singing school books, and materials integrating academic work and music. He used original educational and teaching theories and innovative techniques. The music of Hanby helped to "educate the masses," a goal of early music education, as his songs and series spread throughout the United States.

The music of Hanby was influenced by: (a) his levels of maturity and training, (b) his immediate educational and teaching needs, and (c) his contemporary music scene. A chronology documents Hanby's life revealing his parallel, although unrecognized, involvement with teaching and music education. An annotated study was made of all known music of Hanby, and 79 songs were documented. Lists of Hanby's works were compiled, revealing four distinct groups of music traced from original publications: (a) 11 pieces of sheet music, (b) a song book series of six quarterlies, and (c) two song volumes, one with four editions and the other with three.

The final 2 years of Hanby's life were spent at a prestigious Chicago music publishing firm where his professional career culminated in a combination of teaching, composing, and editing children's works, in addition to serving as a traveling representative for the publishing firm.

\*Author's Abstract Adapted

## Review

Benjamin Russel Hanby (1833-1867) was a composer, school teacher, singing school master, editor, fundraiser, and salesman who lived most of his life in Ohio. The son of a bishop of the United Brethren Church who assisted with the runaway slave "Underground Railroad," Hanby grew up in a time of great political, moral, and economic change. As a youth, Hanby attended singing schools, and at age 16, he entered Otterbein University in Westerville, Ohio. He attended college for the next several years, during which time he began to write songs for his students and for publication, founded and directed a singing school, and studied the piano.

After graduating from Otterbein in 1858 at age 24, he married and worked as an "endowment agent" for the university. Subsequently, he served as principal of a private academy, worked for the John Church Publishing Company in Cincinnati, and served as minister for several churches. During this period, he founded two more singing schools and continued to compose songs.

In 1865, at age 31, Hanby became Children's Music Editor for the well known Chicago publishing firm of Root & Cady. From then until his death at age 33, he served in several capacities at Root & Cady and continued to compose popular songs.

Hanby was and remains best known for his songs, two of the most popular of which are "Darling Nelly Gray" and "Up on the Housetop." Jeanne Bilger Gross's dissertation attributes 79 songs to Hanby, 11 more

than had been attributed to him by previous scholars.

This dissertation chronicles selected accomplishments of an interesting 19th-century composer and music educator. The author attempted to evaluate Benjamin Hanby's musical and pedagogical contributions in the context of the political, economic, social, and religious environment in which he lived, and for the most part, she succeeded. Gross's insights about Hanby's pragmatic approach toward composition and other matters show her concern for the period in which Hanby lived. For example, she addressed the issue of musical quality in a straightforward manner, concluding that Hanby's "popular songs were of the calibre of his day..." (p. 117). Her discussions on the "latitude and liberties taken by compilers and editors of song books in that day" (p. 110) are revealing as well, and again show the author's concern for historical context. In addition, Gross provided a useful analysis of the effects of the great Chicago fire on the subsequent distribution of Hanby's music.

-The author also attempted to relate Hanby's musical activities to certain occurrences and people in the music education profession of his day, such as singing schools, musical conventions, certain school music textbook series, and the work of Lowell Mason, Luther Whiting Mason, and others. Unfortunately, the author was less successful here. Some of her conclusions betray an incomplete understanding of the events and persons involved in music education. For example, she defined 19th-century normal schools as "college level classes and seminars" and a music convention as a "large gathering of teachers or leaders who participated in learning new techniques and music, especially applicable in higher education" (p. xi). Similarly, she provided a simplistic description of "Pestalozzian techniques" as "learning by experiencing" (p. 68). Furthermore, she stated that Hanby "used the new shaped [sic] notes" (p. 145), which were not new at all during his lifetime. On the other hand, Gross made some sound speculations about the relationship between Hanby and George F. Root based on facts known about the lives of both men.

Gross's research on Hanby's songs represents her best efforts. Her search for documentary evidence about those songs was thorough, and the reasoning upon which her decisions were based is sound. In many cases, she verified previously published information about the music and, in a few

cases, was able to correct of the songs themselves. series by Hanby entitled ( of some of his other work research on Hanby's mus Unfortunately, othe

Some of the author's ge supporting documentatic "The music of Hanby wa educational, sociological, more, the author provide secondary sources, for subeen written earlier that occasions, Gross characterinto music, teaching, an search for causation, not ... by his expert use of the first to do this.)" (p. 24 Foster and other early management Again, sources should ha

The dissertation suf technique. Most informa ces, and the author ten sources, resulting in que For example, a speech giof the main sources of i cases, sources of informa sources were neither t source(s) of information other than vague referenthe author mentioned wh State University and Ha use it, and she apparently on music publishing in Gross did cite some inte Blendon Township (Ohic for information on Han confirmed data via inde sources, both necessary mary music sources when

The most serious flated editing. Problems included nouns, mixed tenses with sentence construction, ty

cases, was able to correct earlier mistakes. She also found errors in some of the songs themselves. Perhaps most importantly, she discovered a song series by Hanby entitled *Our Song Birds Series*, as well as multiple editions of some of his other works: *Chapel Gems* and *The Forest Choir*. Gross's research on Hanby's music constitutes the heart of her dissertation.

Unfortunately, other aspects of the dissertation are less positive. Some of the author's generalizations were presented without adequate supporting documentation. There are unsupported statements, such as, "The music of Hanby was found to have been strongly influenced by the educational, sociological, and political climate of his era" (p. 18). Furthermore, the author provided no evidence, other than previously published secondary sources, for such statements as "The song was known to have been written earlier than its use in *The Robin*" (p. 76). On numerous occasions, Gross characterized Hanby as having been "propelled by fate" into music, teaching, and other activities, whereas historians generally search for causation, not fate. She also stated that "Hanby gained his fame . . . by his expert use of the Negro dialect in his compositions. (He was the first to do this.)" (p. 249). This statement ignores the fact that Steven Foster and other early minstrel composers used the dialect much earlier. Again, sources should have been cited or arguments explained more fully.

The dissertation suffers in other ways from substandard scholarly technique. Most information presented was drawn from secondary sources, and the author tended to take an uncritical stance toward those sources, resulting in questionable internal criticism for the dissertation. For example, a speech given to a Chicago civic club in 1967 served as one of the main sources of information for the study. In addition, in many cases, sources of information were not cited, and discrepancies between sources were neither pointed out nor explained. For example, the source(s) of information on Hanby's college experiences were not cited, other than vague references to the "college's records" (p. 36). Curiously, the author mentioned what is apparently relevant material from The Ohio State University and Harvard University libraries, but did not choose to use it, and she apparently failed to draw upon a valuable secondary source on music publishing in Chicago (Thorson, 1961). On the other hand, Gross did cite some interesting and valuable primary sources, such as the Blendon Township (Ohio) Treasurer's Record, dated September 13, 1856, for information on Hanby's teaching salary. In other cases, the author confirmed data via independent sources and discussed the credibility of sources, both necessary techniques of historiography, and she used primary music sources when they were readily available.

The most serious flaws in this dissertation resulted from inadequate editing. Problems include tortured grammar, unclear antecedents of pronouns, mixed tenses within paragraphs, run-on and otherwise awkward sentence construction, typographical errors, use of parentheses instead of

dis-

Reviews

Lee R. Bartel University of Toronto Toronto, Ontario

The purpose of the sa available for church choral States. The churches in the s. Inquiry was also directed at th to ascertain their perceptions Data used to describe p

naires to Mennonite church choral professors.

Findings of the study is choral leaders, it was quite conthe congregation were the set tradition of importance place munity; (b) courses perceived were choral ensemble, conduction of the church choral music warrant the addition of specific encourage young music graduchurch music; (e) college spotthe growth and public relation support their young people splikely to see those students reta greater retention of students included as a mandatory additional transport and the students included as a mandatory additional transport their young people splikely to see those students reta greater retention of students included as a mandatory additional transport their young people splikely to see those students retained to the students of the students o

This study of Menn Roy Leon Klassen who college, Fresno Pacific study were:

(1) to obtain data from out the United States tion of the preparation directors and (2) to a colleges affiliated with

brackets, and inconsistent use of punctuation and versions of proper names. Further, chapters and sections within chapters are frequently disjointed. In one instance, the subheading "Hanby as Music Educator" is used twice in the same chapter. Other redundancies abound.

Most puzzling of all is the citing of sources. Parenthetical references are used that refer to the bibliography at the end of the work, but footnotes appear at the ends of chapters also. Some quotations are not footnoted, page numbers are not always provided in references, and several references cited in the text are not included in the bibliography. The footnotes are also misnumbered in several places, and the term op cit is used in such a way as to render it unintelligible. Problems resulting from inadequate editing are numerous enough to detract from the document. In short, the dissertation would have benefitted immeasurably from two or three additional drafts.

This dissertation provides some scant information about music teaching in small Ohio communities in the mid-19th century, although the information is about one presumably atypical music teacher who composed for his students. The most valuable part of Gross's work is her scholarship on Hanby's music. The attribution of several songs to Hanby is based on speculative, although reasonably sound, evidence. She considered the musical practices of the day and Hanby's relationships with George Root. She also related Hanby's song text material to facts known about his life, including his personal interests. She discovered songs and editions by Hanby, her chronology is reasonably sound, she provided some useful recommendations for further study, and she included a helpful chronology of Hanby's life and an alphabetical list of his songs. She donated much relevant material to the Hanby House Archives and the Historical Society Archives, which should help future scholars. Except for some problems with the source material, editing, and context, this dissertation represents a respectable piece of scholarship. In general, the author applied the established principles of historiography, with the result that the content of the work meets a reasonable standard for scholarship in the field of music education.

## References

Thorson, T. W. (1961). A history of music publishing in Chicago, 1850–1960. Doctoral dissertation, Northwestern University.

Jere T. Humphreys is professor of music at Arizona State University, Tempe. His areas of specialization include instrumental teacher education, and historical and empirical research in music education.