

partially explain the evolution of some of the myths that are part of Hall's reputation (p. 19).

That Hall's position as a composer of marches is generally held to be second only to that of Sousa and that many band musicians and some writers indicate that Hall was unsurpassed (p. 373) will always remain conjectural. That Hall was a major figure on the American music scene of the late 19th and early 20th centuries cannot be denied. The Bowie dissertation clearly documents this in a thorough and scholarly fashion. Two important books developed by the Sousa scholar and biographer, Paul Bierley, were conspicuous by their absence. They are *Hallelujah Trombone! The Story of Henry Fillmore* and *The Music of Henry Fillmore and Will Huff*. Both books were published in 1982 by the Integrity Press. Certainly, these books rank right along with Schwartz's *Bands of America* and Goldmans' *The Wind Band* cited in the Bowie dissertation.

In toto, this is an excellent dissertation. It should be of great value to those interested in the history of band activities circa late 19th and early 20th centuries in the United States generally and the life, times, and career of R. B. Hall in particular.

Richard Weerts is professor of music at Northeast Missouri State University, Kirksville. His areas of specialization include instrumental music and administration and supervision.

Jere T. Humphreys
Arizona State University
Tempe, Arizona

Sharon Lee Gray: *A History of the
National Catholic Music Educators'
Association, 1942-1976*

DME, University of Cincinnati, 1988
University Microfilms Order No. 8822791

Abstract*

In keeping with her Judaeo-Christian heritage, the Catholic Church has consistently integrated music into her worship and education. This study considers in detail only one movement within the nearly 2,000 years of the church's existence: the National Catholic Music Educators' Association (NCMEA), 1942-1976. Although this organization existed only 35 years, the NCMEA merits careful study for three major reasons. First, the organization developed from an ancient but ever-evolving musical tradition, thus linking old and new. Secondly, the NCMEA enjoyed its greatest importance during the 1950s and 1960s, the years when Catholic schools expanded to embrace their largest student populations. The NCMEA, there-

CRME no. 126 (Fall 1995)

fore, affected the lives and education of millions of persons in all age brackets. Finally, and especially during its final decade, the NCMEA effected in its members an awareness of the needs and responsibilities of the professional music educator.

Ultimately, the NCMEA led its members naturally into more broadly-based organizations, such as the Music Educators National Conference, and more specialized groups, such as the National Pastoral Musicians' Association. That these developments have promoted both a more scientifically-based curriculum and more liturgically appropriate practice is an assumption held by those key people who carried out the dissolution of NCMEA. Whether such growth ever would have occurred without the stimuli provided by NCMEA is doubtful. Thus, the relatively brief history of this significant organization deserves to be better known.

**Author's Abstract Adapted*

Summary

Catholic education in what became the United States was begun by Spanish missionaries in Florida and New Mexico, and eventually spread to California, Texas, and other states. French Catholic missionaries also concentrated on education, as did Catholics in the colonies of the Eastern Seaboard. Catholic education continued after the Revolutionary War, but it made its greatest strides from 1840-1920, exemplified and aided by the founding of the Catholic Education Association in 1904. Music played an important role in North American Catholic education throughout its long history.

Conference sessions were devoted to Catholic music education for the first time at the 1932 convention of the Music Supervisors National Conference. Subsequent conventions of the Music Educators National Conference (MENC) included pre-conference sessions devoted to Catholic music education. This practice continued through 1942, when a committee was appointed during the MENC convention in Milwaukee to investigate establishing an MENC-affiliated Catholic music educators organization. The National Catholic Music Educators Association (NCMEA) officially was founded on August 19, 1942 at a meeting in Detroit, although it never affiliated officially with MENC. The first national meeting of the new organization was held in conjunction with the national MENC convention in St. Louis in 1944.

Much of the NCMEA's work was done through its state and local units, including some Canadian units, and by departments at the national level. Some state units held joint conventions with the respective state and division units of MENC, but some did not.

The local and state units and national departments sponsored clinics, teacher workshops, all-state groups, lectures, demonstrations, and a series of four annual national research conferences (1957-1960). The national office published research projects, course syllabi, handbooks, and other items. The national organization also published a newsletter, which expanded to a quarterly periodical format in 1951. The journal, eventually

named *Musart*, continuing in 1965, the NCMEA's tones and various other activities, including Citations for Leadership of national soloists contest (1970).

Eventually, the NCMEA's decline from MENC conventions began with a Pontific

Beginning in about 1960, membership declined dramatically. By 1970, membership had plummeted also. Between 1960 and 1970, activity, and the national association, the NCMEA had had 5,000 members, attended the 1955 convention with 800 members. As a result, the NCMEA transformed in 1976 into the National Pastoral Musicians' Association, which focused more on parish activities.

Sharon Gray's dissertation on the organization in the history of Catholic music education is mostly minor, but contains a few typographical errors in chapters and appendices. The book is in different places in the history of Catholic music education throughout the work is puzzling, because documentation of the NCMEA itself did not exist as the Music Supervisors National Association, and the NCMEA was founded to examine the activities of the organization at conventions—Illinois, 1955, 1967, and 1974—Illinois, Iowa, and Ohio. Some of the sources used are entirely of Catholic music education, for example, were available for Catholic music education. The same would have provided the same example, the author did

named *Musart*, continued until the NCMEA disbanded in 1976. Beginning in 1965, the NCMEA also published a research bulletin called *Overtones* and various other publications. Other activities include the awarding of Citations for Music Achievement to American Catholics, sponsorship of national solo contests (1954–1958), and a national composition contest (1970).

Eventually, the NCMEA held annual conventions, usually separate from MENC conventions. The typical free-standing NCMEA convention began with a Pontifical High Mass and lasted 5 days.

Beginning in about 1965, enrollment in American Catholic schools declined dramatically. Beginning in 1970, membership in the NCMEA plummeted also. Between 1970 and 1975, most local NCMEA units ceased activity, and the national organization developed a financial deficit. The NCMEA had had 5,000 members in 1954, and more than 2,000 people attended the 1955 convention, but by March 1975, it retained only about 800 members. As a result of these and other difficulties, the NCMEA was transformed in 1976 into a new organization: the National Association of Pastoral Musicians. The new organization and its renamed journal focused more on parish and church music and less on school music education.

Review

Sharon Gray's dissertation describes an important and interesting organization in the history of American music education. Only a few, mostly minor, criticisms of the dissertation are in order. The work contains a few typographical errors and inconsistencies in terminology (e.g., chapters and appendices are referred to by Arabic and letter names in different places in the document). The inclusion of an apostrophe throughout the work in the title of the organization (i.e., Educators') is puzzling, because documentation in the dissertation suggests that the NCMEA itself did not use the apostrophe, and other organizations, such as the Music Supervisors National Conference and Music Teachers National Association, dropped the apostrophe many years before the NCMEA was founded. Other gremlins occur when the author proposes to examine the activities of three state units and the content of four conventions—Illinois, Iowa, and Michigan, and the conventions of 1944, 1955, 1967, and 1974—but then proceeds to discuss the activities of Illinois, Iowa, and Ohio and the conventions of 1944, 1955, 1967, and 1975. Some of the sources could be criticized, because they consist almost entirely of Catholic materials, even when primary sources, about MENC, for example, were available. The author establishes parallels with non-Catholic music education during each time period, but much more of the same would have provided more context for the NCMEA history. For example, the author did not cite any of the major American music educa-

tion histories that were available at the time of her research. The reviewer also wonders whether or not the uneven geographical representation of the organization may have contributed to its demise. From the beginning, the NCMEA seems to have been dominated by the midwestern and eastern regions of the country. Some states appear to have had no involvement, and convention locations were limited geographically. Of course, some states have larger Catholic populations than others, but the NCMEA seems never to have been truly national in scope, a fact that, if true, should have been discussed.

On the positive side, the author used primary archival and personal interview sources about the NCMEA almost exclusively, and she outlined the major events and provided a sense of the organization without being redundant or tedious. The background information on Catholic music education in North America is cursory but accurate, and it is well presented and documented. There is an interesting discussion of Justine Ward and her contributions to music education (a person seemingly deserving of a major biography), and the author provides insightful and objective reasons for the enrollment drop in Catholic schools. The author also treats frankly the apparent lack of clear direction provided to and by the national-level departments of the NCMEA and the overlapping of responsibilities with MENC. This overlap was considerable except for the NCMEA's strong interest in liturgical music.

Overall, this dissertation is a respectable piece of work. It is reasonably well written and organized, and it includes most of the pertinent information one would expect to find in a document of its type. The author should be congratulated for her competent contribution of new information to the knowledge base on the history of music education.

Jere T. Humphreys is professor of music at Arizona State University, Tempe. His areas of specialization include instrumental teacher education and historical and empirical research in music education.

Jere T. Humphreys
Arizona State University
Tempe, Arizona

The study documented Hanby, a musician who helped spread music education during his brief life-span of 27 years. He founded three singing schools, integrating academic work and music education, as his songs and

immediate educational and teaching documents Hanby's life revealing teaching and music education. A total of 79 songs were documented. The final 2 years of Hanby's professional career culminated in children's works, in addition to se-

Benjamin Russell Hanby was a singing school master, editor of his life in Ohio. The son of a farmer, he assisted with the runaway slave in a time of great political upheaval. Hanby attended singing school at the University in Westerville, Ohio, for 2 years, during which time he published, founded and edited a singing school.

After graduating from the University, he worked as an "endowment" collector, served as principal of a private school, and published a Publishing Company in C